The Spanish Translation: Del ensinamiento del coracon (Salamanca, 1498)

[Link to publication record in Manchester Research Explorer](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Lappin, A., Renevey, D. (Ed.), & Whitehead, C. (Ed.) (2010). The Spanish Translation: Del ensinamiento del coracon (Salamanca, 1498). In *A Companion to "The Doctrine of the Hert": The Middle English Translation and Its Latin and European Contexts* (pp. 238-263). (Exeter Medieval Texts and Studies). University of Exeter Press.

Published in:

A Companion to "The Doctrine of the Hert": The Middle English Translation and Its Latin and European Contexts

Citing this paper

Please note that where the full-text provided on Manchester Research Explorer is the Author Accepted Manuscript or Proof version this may differ from the final Published version. If citing, it is advised that you check and use the publisher's definitive version.

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the Research Explorer are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

Takedown policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please refer to the University of Manchester's Takedown Procedures [<http://man.ac.uk/04Y6Bo>] or contact uml.scholarlycommunications@manchester.ac.uk providing relevant details, so we can investigate your claim.

The Spanish Translation: *Del enseñamiento del coraçon* (Salamanca, 1498)

Anthony John Lappin

The small, anonymous book *Del enseñamiento del coraçon*, published in Salamanca in 1498, has attracted a certain amount of critical attention, but not for its text, which has remained unanalysed, and, for all I know, unread during the twentieth century. Three copies survive of that printing, all in the Iberian peninsula: El Escorial, 31-V-49 (2^o), and Lisbon, Biblioteca Nacional, Res. Inc. 502 and 503. The work was subsequently reprinted in a revised edition with modernized text and attributed to St Bonaventure, by Juan Varela de Salamanca, as *Doctrina cordis de sant buena ventura en romance: nueuamente corregido y enmendado* (Toledo, 1510); this exists as London, British Library, C 63 c 16; Madrid, Biblioteca Nacional, R-31600; Zaragoza, Biblioteca Universitaria, A.30.25¹, and New York, Hispanic Society. The work's popularity was not exhausted by these two editions, and a further Toledo edition was produced in 1525, which would seem to have been printed from the previous Toledo edition (one exemplar, Barcelona, Biblioteca de Catalunya, Esp. 68-8^o); finally, there is a printing from the southern town of Baeza in 1551, *Doctrina cordis del serafico dotor sant buena ventura en romance: muy util y provechoso para todos los fieles christianos: nueuamente corregido y emendado* (last seen nearly a quarter of a century ago and now in private hands). The translation adheres very closely to its Latin model, and the second edition merely modernizes the language and corrects some readings of the first.¹

¹ Although my establishment of the critical text is only partially advanced, and a full statement must wait for the publication of the critical edition, the Toledo

The subject matter of ascetical prose has few devotees in post-Francoist Spain, and those who occupy themselves with the late medieval/early Renaissance period of the reign of the Catholic monarchs are, unsurprisingly, more interested in the reception of classical, and the diffusion of secular, literature. Critical interest has centred exclusively on the endpapers, fols 118v and 119r, since they may show by whom the book was printed, or even who may have been involved in its printing and translation. I will come to these in due course, as well as to later printings of the work, after considering the nature and purpose of the translation.

Readership, real

The Escorial exemplar of the first printing of the translation does not offer many clues to the attitude of its readers to the text. It is signed, on fol. 118r, as having been checked by an inquisitor: ‘expurgado./fr. A. â S. J.’ Yet, since there are neither blottings nor crossings out, one may presume that he found nothing offensive, whether or not he actually read the text. One reader underlined the chapter headings; another (or at least a different pen) drew a line beside an early passage on pacific humility (fol. 9r, beginning ‘ca alguna cosa ha en si mas la mansedumbre que la paz. porque mas es estar assossegado que apaziguado’). The copy of the 1510 Toledo edition in the British Library, furthermore, has no marks other than the library’s own. But the Madrid exemplar shows a vibrant reading culture surrounding the book. The copy was read enough for one reader to think it worth writing the following, at the bottom of fols kiv–kiir and upside-down in relation to the text:

fray Rodrigo de burgos tom oelabbito
a 17 defebrero de 1572 años (fol. kiir)
por tanto Ruegen adios porel porque
dios depare quien Ruege por
ellos (fol. kiv)²

1510 (*T*) edition generally suppresses the definite article before possessive adjectives (although this may only be due to the typesetter in parts of Salamanca 1498 (*S*)), often but not consistently represents *e* or *7* as *y*, renders the termination second person present plural of verbs as *–ays* or *–eys* rather than *–ades* or *–edes*, and varies some words (e.g., *S* apostura/apostamiento, *T* compostura; *S* escusaça, *T* escusacion; *S* remasajas, *T* reliquias; *S* aberturas, *T* puertas).

² (Fray Rodrigo de Burgos took the habit on 17 February 1572 / therefore may they pray to God for him so that God may provide someone who may pray for them).

Although Burgos is in northern Spain, and there are numerous monasteries in the vicinity, it is not possible to locate the copy as having been in a religious house thereabouts. The title page of the Madrid copy is missing, but two short poems have been written on the flyleaf, each in a different ink and hand. The first offers an expression of the battle between the mind and desires (quite suitable for the subjects covered in *De doctrina cordis*); the second praises the act of 'memento mori', perhaps as an answer to the syntactically challenged tortured soul of the first poem, who wonders how he may be freed.

la ley de mi carne siento
 En mis mienbros que repugna
 la ley del entendimiento
 no obstante cognoscimiento
 que de fonderse propugna
 o yo hombre desdichado
 a mi quien me librara
 dela muerte del peccado
 Con que mi sen es cercado
 antes fue, y despues sera.

Es tan buena la memoria
 dela muerte bien temida
 que es freno para la vida
 7 espuelas para la gloria.³

The interest in resistance to temptation is found in the annotations to the text itself. Thus a passage on the necessity of keeping the belt of chastity tightly bound around oneself is noted in the margin, with particular emphasis upon 'no solamente nos refrenemos dela torpedad dela obra'.⁴

Other annotations emphasize elements in the text which speak of the necessity for the gentle correction of subordinates: noted in the margin at fol. kivr, ll. 2–3, 'el castigo se haze alas vezes malamente por la grandeza dela

³ (I feel that the law of the flesh in my limbs repels the law of understanding despite recognition that proposes to sink deeper. O, unhappy man, I! Who will free me from the death of sin with which my mind is besieged. It was once and after will [also] be.// The memory of the well-feared death is so good that it is reins for life and spurs for heaven).

⁴ fol. g [v]r, ll. 30–31 (not only should we hold ourselves back from the obscenity of the deed).

aspereza', an opinion elucidated by the following example, again highlighted in the margin: 'Ca los que quieren castigar a los otros con señoría 7 autoridad son semejables a los que adoban las sartenes viejas 7 quieren atapar vn agujero 7 hazen otros muchos agujeros con el golpe del martillo 7 quebrantan la sarten.'⁵ The final annotations regarding the text are found on fol. ciiiiv, and concern the sin of gluttony, in particular the lure of food for the lustful, and the rejection of the temptations and wiles of the devil ('el luxurioso dessea hinchir fuviembre dela vianda delos puercos con el fijo dessgastador', ll. 3–4; '7 fazer lo has partir de ti confundido porque se atreuio a poner delante ti vianda tan desconuenible', ll. 9–11).⁶ A bookmark was left between fols i[vii]v and i[viii]r long enough for an impression of it to be taken by the page; the book was also placed open upon another text, receiving an impression of now illegible words from that other text, at fols e[viii]v–fir. Pencil annotations to the bottom corner of the margin to fol. miiir have been erased; indeed, the only visible letters are Y^O.

From these annotations and other marks, it is clear that the Spanish *De doctrina* was a relatively well-thumbed work from a monastic or conventual library; perhaps, as in the case of the mid- to late-sixteenth-century Fray Rodrigo de Burgos, it was given to novices or younger monks. From the poems inscribed at the beginning of the work, it would seem that *De doctrina* was found to be useful in such an ascetic setting, particularly in its encouragement to resist temptation. Rodrigo de Burgos, and the reprintings of the work (Toledo, 1525; Baeza, 1551) show that the text was still in demand for monastic and conventual library shelves many years after its first printing, and the spiritual reading it offered continued to be appreciated beyond the early Renaissance circles in which the translation was composed, into the very different atmosphere of the Tridentine Catholic Revival. A classic of western spirituality, then, whose solid good sense married to the systematic structure given by the author's scholasticism allowed it to be appreciated for centuries after it was written. Appreciation of the literary value of the treatise is scant, although this has been more due to lack both of sympathy with the scholastic style of division and of appreciation for the very different style of reading required by a text

⁵ (Correction is sometimes carried out badly through the excess of harshness ... For those who wish to correct others with haughtiness and authority are like those who fix old pans and wish to close up a hole and they make many more holes with the hammer blow and they break the pan).

⁶ (The lustful man desires to swell his belly with the food of the swine [along] with the prodigal son ... and you are to make him leave you defeated since he dared to place before you such unfitting food).

such as this than to any deeper judgement.⁷ The author's Latin is clear while being complex and well articulated. The divisions and explanations are constantly enlivened by striking metaphors, similitudes and allegories drawn from daily life. Even though the text is ostensibly destined for the reading of a woman religious, the author does not shirk from including military and masculine comparisons, not so much to gender the text as both male and female as to provide incidentally yet another example of the general medieval unfussedness about the application of gendered metaphors and allegories to and for the opposite sex. The academic learning is impressive, but worn lightly: the wisdom of the Church Fathers (Augustine, Gregory, Cassiodorus, Chrysostom) rubs shoulders with the insights of Boethius, Seneca, Plato, and with up-to-the-minute citations of Aristotle. The structure heads resolutely but by careful increment towards a goal of union with God – one very similar, in fact, to that of works of the so-called Spanish 'mystics' of the sixteenth century, Juan de la Cruz and Teresa de Ávila – ending with a remarkable comparison between melancholic sexual love and union with the divine through spiritual love. *De doctrina* was not conceived of as a 'good read', nor should it be unfairly compared *a pari passu* with works composed in the vernacular from later centuries, but, in its uniting of that remarkably fecund scholastic means of understanding the world, the developing medieval tradition of affective piety, and the at times rather recherché world of allegorical biblical exegesis, it does bring together spiritual profit with 'divertissement' – indeed, even 'jouissance'.

The second, third and fourth printings of the Spanish translation ascribe the work to St Bonaventure. This is quite different from the *Del enseñamiento*, which is anonymous in all senses: no names are given for printer, translator or original author. Indeed, the translator's one statement about the work simply links the identity of the author of the prologue with that of the treatise as a whole.

Aquí comienza el libro que es llamado enseñamiento del coraçon. 7

⁷ The lead in this negative judgement was given by Sister M.P. Candon (ed.), 'The Doctrine of the Hert, Edited from the Manuscripts with Introduction and Notes' (unpublished doctoral dissertation, Fordham University, 1963), p. lxxix: 'After spending considerable time on a particular work there is something dissatisfying about classifying it as mediocre and if some future student of literary style should find in it hidden beauty and artistry, no one would rejoice more than I at the inaccuracy of the first judgment. Its [*scil. De doctrina's*] weakness stems mainly from the monotony of the constant mathematical [*sic*] divisions and banal repetitions.'

primeramente es puesto el prologo del que fizo el libro enel qual enseña tres cosas que deue guardar el predicador enla su amonestacion.⁸

Unlike the self-professedly clerical translator (or perhaps abridger) of the Middle English translation, the Spanish translator claims no particular authority; the work was probably anonymous already when it reached him. Subsequent attribution to St Bonaventure may simply have been a marketing ploy by Juan Varela, the work's second printer. The attribution may, however, have come about through Varela's (or someone else's) discovery of the text in a miscellany volume that also contained works by (pseudo-) Bonaventure, possibly in the library of the Dominican convent of St Peter Martyr, whose friars had brought Juan Varela only recently to Toledo from Seville. The adoption of the Latin title, *De doctrina cordis*, does support the supposition that the attribution to Bonaventure was through a now-lost manuscript.⁹ The Latinate title and the attribution to the thirteenth-century Franciscan master also invested the text with an authority it was previously lacking, and signalled it as particularly suitable for those buying for mendicant libraries. Nevertheless, Bonaventure, or rather pseudo-Bonaventure, was a popular writer during this period, and numerous texts bore his name.¹⁰ The attribution to St Bonaventure was not reversed by subsequent printers of the Spanish *De doctrina*, although the Baeza printer sought to widen the appeal of the book, claiming that it was 'muy util y provechoso para todos los fieles christianos' (very useful and profitable for all faithful Christians) on his title-page, indicating that the resolutely monastic slant of the text was no barrier to its marketing for laypeople. The fifteenth-century evidence for the circulation of the Middle English translation among laywomen and

⁸ (Here begins the book which is called Teaching of the Heart, and first of all is placed the prologue [written] by he who wrote the book in which he teaches three things that the preacher should observe in his admonitions.)

⁹ See G. Hendrix, 'Deux textes d'attribution incertaine à saint Bonaventure, restitués à Gérard de Liège', *RTAM*, 45 (1978), 237–8.

¹⁰ After 1500, the *Psalterium in honore Virginis Matris* attributed to Bonaventure saw two editions (Burgos: Fradrique de Basilea?, 1511?; Valencia: Juan Joffre, 1515); as did *La vida de nuestro Redentor* (Valladolid: Diego de Gumiel, 1512; and see J.M. Abad, *Post-incunables ibéricos* (Madrid, 2001), p. 151, no. 244). In addition, devotional texts attributed to the saint abounded: *El regimiento de la conciencia que se llama fuente de la vida* (Seville: Juan Pegnitzer & Magno Herbst, 5 Sept. 1502); *Soliloquio de sant Buenaventura* (Burgos: Fradrique de Basilea, 1517); *Espejo de disciplina, o libro de las cosas pequeñas para los novicios* (Seville: Estanislao Polono, 1502); *Estimulo de amor de sant buena ventura* (Toledo: Sucesor de Pedro Hagembach, c. 1505; repr. Burgos, Fradrique de Basilea, 1517).

women religious, then, is not to be wondered at, nor need we assume that laywomen were unlikely to read the text.¹¹

Readership, implied

What can be reconstructed of the printing history and actual readership of *Del enseñamiento* is mirrored by the translator's idea of his future readers, who are envisioned as male religious. Thus the oft-appearing 'charissima' of *De doctrina*¹² is rendered as 'hermano' in *Del enseñamiento*,¹³ if it is not simply omitted.

Possible criticism of religious superiors is toned down or omitted completely. Criticism of abbots and superiors for observing none or few of the obligations they lay upon their subordinates is reduced. Thus, from *De doctrina*, 'Ita multi Abbates constitutiones, *et* statuta ordinis, *et* caetera onera claustris, sic super claustrales, *et* alios subditos distribuunt, quod sibi nullam, vel modicam partem retinent',¹⁴ *nullam* is not translated, so that it might not be thought that abbots were completely off the leash: *Del enseñamiento*, 'E ansi fazen algunos abades 7 priores que ordenan sobre sus subditos muchas constituciones: 7 ellos retienen para si muy pequeña parte dellas'.¹⁵ The insulting comparison of such superiors to gaolers, checking on the state of the inmates of their prisons only to ascertain the condition of their restraining devices, is registered much more simply, with a biblical echo: '7 no deciden a las carceles a los visitar sino por ver si tienen sanas

¹¹ See D. Renevey, 'Household Chores in *The Doctrine of the Hert*: Affective Spirituality and Subjectivity', in C. Beattie, A. Maslakovic and S. Rees Jones (eds), *The Medieval Household in Christian Europe, c. 800–c. 1550* (Turnhout, 2003), pp. 167–85 (170); M.C. Erler, *Women, Reading and Piety in Late Medieval England*, Cambridge Studies in Medieval Literature 46 (Cambridge, 2002), pp. 76–7.

¹² References to the Latin text of *De doctrina cordis* are to Gerardus Leodiensis, *Speculum concionatorum ad illustrandum pectora auditorum, in septem libros distributum* (Naples, 1607). Oxford, Bodleian Library, 8° L 12 Th. BS, pp. 114, 286, for example. Henceforth cited as *De doctrina*.

¹³ Fols 44v, 113v. Folio references to the Spanish translation are to the Escorial copy of *Del enseñamiento*.

¹⁴ *De doctrina*, p. 198 (And so many Abbots give out constitutions and statutes of the Order, and other demands of the cloister on monks and others beneath them, of which they keep little or nothing themselves). My italics.

¹⁵ *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 77r (And so some abbots and priors act who establish for their subjects many constitutions and they themselves keep a very small part of them).

las prisiones en que estan'.¹⁶ The despective use of a proverb to describe such abbots' and priors' lack of solidarity in the manner of the lavishness of the table they keep is avoided, and reference is rather made to the common dress of the habit: 'ca aun que sean hermanos en la manera del habito: no son pero hermanos enel mantenimiento'.¹⁷ Later in the treatise, prelates who judge harshly are compared to tyrants: this comparison is silenced by *Del enseñamiento* (*De doctrina*, 'Tales Praelatos, imo certe tyrannos reprehendit Dominus'; *Del enseñamiento*, 'Onde alos tales reprehende el señor'¹⁸). Furthermore, the possibility that the subordinates should rebel (and rebel with reason) is equally silenced: *De doctrina*, 'Noli asinum Domini tui, curae tuae commendatum sine sella agere, ne contra te recalcitrans refiat, et dicat Dominus tuus: hoc est ad bonum ius',¹⁹ becomes a longer but much less incisive passage in *Del enseñamiento*:

E por semejable manera si tu has demandar atu subdito algun officio trabajoso no ayas en desden de gelo encargar con algunas palabras mansas 7 de humildad: 7 avn con allegacion del amor diuinal porque el subdito pueda leuar mas ligeramente la carga que le pusieres. 7 no quieras cargar la bestia sin enxalmos o albarda.²⁰

¹⁶ *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 77r (and they do not come down to the prison to visit them but rather to see if the manacles that hold them are firm). My italics. Cp. *De doctrina*, p. 199, 'nec descendunt ad carcerem, nisi ad videndum si prisiones sui bene teneantur, ne scilicet compedes laxentur, aut vincula' (they do not come down to the prison, apart from to see if their bonds are holding them properly, lest namely the shackles or chains should become loose).

¹⁷ *Del enseñamiento*, fols 77r–v (although they may be brothers in the style of the habit, they are not however brothers in their style of life). Cf. *De doctrina*, p. 199, 'Vnde, licet vocent se omnes fratres, non tamen omnes scutellae sunt sorores' (So, although they all might call themselves *brothers*, not all are sisters when it comes to eating from the same dish).

¹⁸ *De doctrina*, p. 252, my italics; *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 99r (So the Lord criticises such as these *who are without doubt tyrants*).

¹⁹ *De doctrina*, p. 252, my italics (Do not use your Lord's ass commended into your care without a saddle [i.e., mercifully], lest it should be disobedient to you, and your Lord may say: That is right and good).

²⁰ *Del enseñamiento*, fols 99r–v (And in a similar way if you have to order one of those under you to undertake some hard task, do not disdain to load him with it accompanied by some gentle and humble words, and even with the addition of divine love, so that he may carry the load you put upon him more lightly, and do not try to load the beast without padding or cushioning).

The most that can be said of those that do not follow their superiors' instructions, is that, in an addition, 'se van por mal cabo'.²¹ The avoidance of criticism of superiors provides a distinct parallel with the attitude of the Middle English translator: 'in which the authority of the ecclesiastical hierarchy is carefully shored up'²² – both products no doubt of a wider European conservatism (which was only encouraged by the débâcle of the Great Schism), rather than of simply local anxieties.

Despite holding off on religious superiors, criticism is introduced specifically against the (wrong kind of) monks or friars. Thus, the waste of time in futile entertainment, 'a *fatuis* recreationes appellantur' (are called 'recreations' by the foolish), but these 'fatui' become, specifically, '*religiosos* locos' (foolish religious) in the Spanish.²³

However, given that the evident target audience for the translation was resolutely situated within the cloister, numerous decisions made by the translator show a concern with basic scriptural education, and perhaps an anxiety that biblical texts would not be as familiar as is assumed in the Latin *De doctrina*. A particularly revealing example concerns the story of the Good Thief on the cross, which is used as an allegory for the gifts of grace within the soul:

Horum quinque fructus collegit ille latro poenitens, qui iuxta Iesum pendens in Cruce socio ex altero latere pendenti dicebat, Lucae .23. Neque tu times Deum: Ecce correctio. Quod in eadem damnatione es: Ecce instructio. Et nos quidem iuste, nam digna factis recipimus: Ecce sui ipsius accusatio. Hic vero nihil mali gessit: Ecce boni commendatio. Memento mei Domine cum veneris in regnum tuum: Ecce oratio. Potes ergo concludere ex omnibus supradictis illud verbum Salomonis Prouerb. 19. Mors, et vita in manu linguae.²⁴

²¹ *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 99v (they end up badly). On the subject of the abandonment of vows, see F.D. Logan, *The Runaway Religious in England c. 1240–1540*, Cambridge Studies in Medieval Life and Thought, 4th series, 32 (Cambridge, 1996).

²² D. Renevey and C. Whitehead, "Opyñ þin hert as a boke": Translation Practice and Manuscript Circulation in *The Doctrine of the Hert*, in J. Jenkins and O. Bertrand (eds), *The Medieval Translator 10* (Turnhout, 2007), pp. 125–48 (134).

²³ *De doctrina*, p. 13; *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 15v.

²⁴ *De Doctrina*, p. 115 (The penitent thief picked those five fruits, he who hanging next to Jesus on the cross said to his fellow hanging on the other side, 'And you do not fear God – here is correction, – for you suffer the same punishment – here is instruction, – and we receive this punishment justly for what we have done – here is

Rather than following this structure of allusion to an element in the biblical text followed by its immediate interpretation, the translation first expounds the story, and then revisits the elements in turn, producing, in effect, a passage twice as long as the original. Here, perhaps, we see an anxiety over the readers' knowledge of the biblical text; the vernacular translation serves as a means of presenting this information, which is maintained as uncluttered by immediate allegory or interpretation as possible. The method was not an accident, and can be seen repeatedly throughout the text.

More help is provided for the reader in making sense of the allegories and metaphors used than in *De doctrina*. Thus the image of Christ on the cross as the grape being crushed to provide the wine of his blood – 'Christus in cruce fuit quasi vva pressa in torculari, vt vinum sui sanguinis nobis propinaret'²⁵ – is reinforced: 'Ca jhesu christo *fue estrujado* enla cruz ansi como es estrujado 7 *pisado* el razimo enel lagar porque diesse a nos el vino dela su sangre, *en beuer de redempcion*'.²⁶ The parallel between Christ's crucifixion and the winepress is made clear by the insertion of 'fue estrujado' (was crushed), the process of crushing the grape is emphasised by the expansion, 'estrujado 7 pisado' (crushed and trodden), and the wine of the most holy blood is given a theological gloss, absent from the Latin, which makes clear the association with the Eucharist: 'en beuer de redempcion' (to drink for [our] redemption).

A similar effort to ensure that all parts of the allegory are clear is found in a related area of sustained metaphorical enology within the prologue. Here, the words of God are like grapes 'multa faecunditate repletae',²⁷ expanded by *Del enseñamiento*, 'que estan llenas de gran abastança *de vino*';²⁸ these grapes, too, must be pressed, 'vnde oportet vnam exprimere, quod est, verbum diligenter exponere vt vinum spiritualis intelligentiae vsque in cellarium cordias fluat',²⁹ which is expanded again to produce a

self-accusation; he, however, has done nothing wrong – here is the commendation of the good. Remember me, Lord, when you come into your kingdom – here is prayer.' You can therefore conclude from all of what has been said above that phrase of Solomon: 'Life and death are in the hands of the tongue' [Prov. 18:21]).

²⁵ *De doctrina*, p. 57 (Christ on the cross was like the grape in the vine press, so that he might offer us the wine of his blood).

²⁶ *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 32v, my italics.

²⁷ *De doctrina*, p. 1 (full of much fecundity).

²⁸ *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 1r (full of great sufficiency of wine).

²⁹ *De doctrina*, pp. 1–2 (thus it is necessary to press the grape, that is, to diligently expound the word so that the spiritual wine of understanding should flow unto the wine cellar of the heart).

completely parallel structure. The grapes have to be crushed *and well trodden* and the wine must flow from them, *just as* the divine words are declaimed and the wine of understanding will flow from them into the wine cellar of the heart:

E ansi como es menester que sean *bien pisadas* 7 espremidas las vuas *para que salga el vino dellas*: ansi es menester de declarar con diligencia la palabra diuinal: porque el vino del entendimiento spiritual pueda entrar ala bodega del coraçon.³⁰

These are small, almost finicky, changes, but designed consistently to tighten the allegory and articulate all of its parts. A particularly fine example of this method is found when a hunting metaphor is used to distinguish different types of prayer. To emphasise the necessity of *ascent* in prayer (rather than descent), the translator reinforces the message by manipulating the vocabulary used and slightly altering the comparison. The Latin in question reads ‘Vae illis, qui ad modum milui post macellum volitantis in istis inferioribus, tripas, *et* viscera capiunt’.³¹ The Spanish reads ‘Guay de aquellos que descenden a manera de bueytres 7 de milanos alas carnes mortezinas 7 alos cuerpos delas animalias que yazen muertas enel campo’.³² The most significant change in order to strengthen the allegory by the avoidance of any contradiction is the alteration of the verb, ‘capiunt’ (seize), to ‘descienden’ (come down), since the idea of descending is picked up within the allegorical reading of the scene; moreover, *De doctrina*’s use of ‘capiunt’ is rejected as, according to the Latin, the scavengers do not *seize* their prey but are drawn down to lifeless corpses, as we learn as the allegory is played out: ‘Isti ad praedam non ascendunt, sed descendunt, *nec praedam capiunt*, sed a praeda capiuntur; dum carnis, vel mundi delectationibus illaqueantur’.³³ The Latin is translated as ‘Ca estos tales no suben ala prea mas ellos son tomados della inclinandose alas delectaciones del mundo 7 del

³⁰ *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 1r, my italics.

³¹ *De doctrina*, p. 264 (Woe unto those who, like kites hovering over these lower things, seize tripe and entrails after the butchering of animals).

³² *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 104v (Woe to those who come down like vultures and kites to butchered meat and to the bodies of animals that lie dead in the countryside).

³³ *De doctrina*, p. 264, my italics (These do not rise up to the prey, but go down; *nor do they seize the prey*, but are captured by the prey, while they are ensnared by the flesh and the delights of the world).

[sic] carne.’³⁴ Repetition of the idea of descent would be otiose. Furthermore, the scavenging kites are placed in the unattractive company of the even less respectable vultures; the description of the pickings of the shambles are evoked, but without the detail of body parts, and the picture is widened to make the inclusion of vultures rather more believable, with the addition of the corpses of wild beasts and those which have died from disease.

Much of the expansion of similes is designed to emphasise doctrinal or moral points. The gloss on the names for the beloved in the *Cantica canticorum* is subtly expanded to emphasise the moral and doctrinal meanings of the terms:

1	Ecce quatuor nominibus eam
appellat, Sororem, Amicam,
Columbam, <i>et</i> Immaculatam;	nombra la por quatro nombres.
Conuiene saber hermana 7
amiga paloma 7 sin manzilla.
2	<i>quasi diceret: Aperi mihi soror</i>
in incarnatione propter
naturae humane humanal
communione,	porque es hermana por la
participacion dela natura
que <i>por nos recibio el</i>
<i>saluador</i> enla su encarnacion.
3	Amica mea, in passione,	E llama la amiga por la passion
<i>que por ella recibio.</i>
4	Columba <i>mea</i> , in Spiritus
sancti <i>missione</i> .	E paloma por <i>la gracia del</i>
espiritu sancto <i>con que la</i>
<i>alimpio.</i>
5	Immaculata, in glorificatione.	E sin manzilla por <i>la pureza</i>
<i>dela gloria</i> con que la glorificara
<i>enla vida que siempre ha de</i>
<i>durar.</i>
6	Aperi mihi cor tuum ad
orationem, os ad confessionem,
spiritum ad amorem, brachia
ad amplexus, manus ad
operationem bonam, <i>et</i>
eleemosynarum largitionem.	<i>E dize abre conuiene saber el</i>
coraçon al oracion. 7 la boca
ala confession. 7 la voluntad
al amor 7 los braços para
<i>me abraçar.</i> 7 las manos para
dar largamente limosnas <i>alos</i>
<i>menguadaos.</i> ³⁵

³⁴ *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 104v (For such as these do not rise to the prey but are taken by it, inclining themselves to the pleasures of the world and of the flesh).

³⁵ *De doctrina*, p. 206; *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 80v. In the quotations and following translations, italics display the differences between the two versions, while

Moral specification is also found in the expansion given to the meaning of the ‘cingulum castitatis’ (belt of chastity); this ‘cintura de la castidad’ is bound tightly, not only ‘vt ab operibus incontinentiae, sed etiam ab appenditiis abstinenceamus, et a delectionibus immundis nosmetipsos restringamus’.³⁶ In *Del enseñamiento*, the ‘works of incontinence’ are concretized as doing and touching and looking, and the belt is tied ‘en manera que non solamente nos referenemos *dela torpedad dela obra* 7 *de todo tañimiento* 7 acatamiento no casto: mas aun delas delectationes delos pensamientos malos’.³⁷ Similarly, the ‘delectiones immunde’ are clarified as sins of thought: ‘pensamientos malos’.

The style may also be simplified. Rhetorical questions are occasionally avoided, as in the following citation of St Augustine – ‘Eligis tibi cibos, quos comedis, et cur similiter non eligis verba, quae dicis?’³⁸ – which is rendered in reported speech and in a more digestably sententious phrasing: ‘E segun dize san agustin Ansi como el hombre escoge las viandas que dessea gostar ansi conuiene que escoja las palabras que quiere fablar’.³⁹ The desire to clarify the allegorical structure of the section being translated and an avoidance of distracting rhetorical colours come together in the following sentences: ‘Nonne ad turres, et munitiones tempore hostilis vastationis hominum multitudo fugere consuevit? Aperuit [Christus] igitur tibi latus suum, tanquam fortalitiam suam, vt ibi, tanquam in loco securo

untranslated elements in the Latin are also provided with square brackets. (1. He names her by four names, *that is* sister and lover, dove and without stain. 2. [*as if he said*, ‘Open to me’] *because she is* sister through participation of human nature *that the saviour received for us* in his incarnation. 3. *And he calls her* lover through the passion that *he received for her*. 4. And [*my*] dove for [*the sending*] *the grace of the Holy Spirit with which he cleansed her*. 5. And spotless for the *purity of the glory with which he will glorify her in the life which will never end*. 6. *And he says* Open, *that is*, open your heart to prayer, and your mouth to confession, and your will to love and your arms to embrace *me* and your hands to give alms generously *to the poor*.)

³⁶ *De doctrina*, p. 133 (that we hold ourselves back from the deeds of incontinence, but also from the appurtenances, and from unclean enticements).

³⁷ *Del enseñamiento*, fols 52r–v, my italics (such that not only it holds us back from the shamefulness of the deed and from all unchaste touching and looking, but even from the pleasures of evil thoughts).

³⁸ *De doctrina*, p. 176 (You choose the foods you eat, and why similarly do you not choose the words which you say?)

³⁹ *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 68r (and as St Augustine says, just as a man chooses the foods that he desires to taste so does it behove him to choose the words that he wants to speak).

valeas latitare.’⁴⁰ *Del enseñamiento* removes the erotema (‘Nonne’ being substituted by ‘Onde’ [wherefore]), and collapses the ‘turres *et* munitiones’ (of the real world) and the ‘fortalitium Christi’ (of the spiritual world) into the one concept: the ‘fortaleza’ (‘turres’ and ‘munitiones’ could have been literally translated as ‘torres’ and ‘defensiones’). The allegorical articulation of the metaphor is further aided by the reminiscence of Job 7:I, ‘militia est vita hominis super terram’. One should also note the care in rendering ‘tempore hostilis vastationis’ as ‘los tiempos 7 lugares delos guerras’, the translator makes changes not through incompetence but through a clear conception of the essential nature of the translator’s task.

Onde los hombres acostumbran alos tiempos 7 lugares de las guerras a coger se alas fortalezas. E como toda esta vida sea ansi como vna continua pelea abrio te ihesu christo el su costado ansi como vna fortaleza porque ansi como en lugar seguro te puedas asconder 7 amparar enella.⁴¹

Some insertions further imply that the reader is expected to have a low standard of ecclesiastical education. The ‘aureola’, the crown offered to virgins in heaven (‘Nam Virginibus illa Corona decoris promitteitur, quae aureola *consuevit* appellari’⁴²) is translated almost directly, ‘ca a los virgines es prometida aquella corona de fermosura’, apart from the second half of the sentence, in which ‘learned men’ or ‘doctors [of the Church]’ are invoked to give currency to the term, ‘que es llamada *delos doctores aureola*’.⁴³ Later, on the same page, the Latin’s ‘aureola’ is repeated, but with a explicatory gloss, ‘aureola *e guirnalda*’— a crown of flowers, as *De doctrina* had previously described it. In a parallel motion, but perhaps surprising given Salamanca’s prowess in the field of education, the explicit phrasing that evokes university teaching is removed: the ‘cathedra’ becomes the school (‘Haec est facilis lectio. Dilectio lectio saepius recitanda est,

⁴⁰ *De doctrina*, pp. 247–8 (Are not a crowd of men wont to flee to the towers and fortification in the time of enemy invasion? [Christ] therefore opened his side to you, like his stronghold, so that there, as in a safe place you may hide.)

⁴¹ *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 97v (Whence men are accustomed at times and places of warfare to take refuge in fortresses. And as all of this life is like a continual struggle, Jesus Christ opened for you his side just like a fortress so that in this way, as in a safe place, you can hide and shelter there.)

⁴² *De doctrina*, p. 150, my italics (Now that crown of beauty is promised to Virgins, which is usually called ‘aureola’).

⁴³ *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 58v, my italics.

de qua sponsus tuus *in cathedra Crucis* scholas tenuit, vbi mortuus est prae amore'; 'El amar por cierto es vna lecion ligera 7 mucho de repetir: porque avn enla *escuela dela cruz* a do el nuestro esposo murio por amor: touo escuelas de aquesta lecion'.⁴⁴ However, these are but touches, minor inflexions that pale into insignificance before, for example, the Middle English translator's excision of all classical authors from *The Doctrine of the Hert*.⁴⁵

The translator's linguistic and cultural preferences

De doctrina cordis offers a depth of linguistic reference, where medieval Latin, translation and direct citation of the vernacular and awareness of etymology all have a role in the unfolding of the text. The translator's attitude to this depth in his translation is marked by a desire to both domesticate and modernize, as we shall see, first considering the reproduction of linguistic levels in the translation, and secondly the preservation or alteration of cultural references.

The etymological meaning of a word is glossed as coming from Latin: 'porque mes *es dicho en latin* de menos que quiere dezir mengua enla nuestra lengua'.⁴⁶ More importantly, ecstatic love is glossed in *De doctrina* by reference to vernacular phrasing: 'Iste autem affectus multus, *et inusitatus* comparatur amori ecstático, *qui amare per amores vulgariter appellatur*. Ecstáticus enim ab ecstasi: vnde amor ecstáticus dicitur, qui mentem alienat, qui non sinit cor aliud cogitare, nisi circa rem dilectam'.⁴⁷ However, in *Del*

⁴⁴ *De doctrina*, p. 106 (This is easy reading. Love is a reading to be repeated often, regarding which your spouse held lessons in the chair [of learning] of the Cross); *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 41v (Loving is certainly an easy lesson and one to be repeated many times; because even in the school of the cross where our spouse died for love, he taught on this lesson). Very possibly linked to this downplaying of education is the omission of the learned adjectives applied to Christ as advocate for the soul: 'Considera Christum *peritum, et eloquentem* aduocatū tuū'; 'E piensa en como ihesu xpo el qual es tu abogado' (Consider the *learned and eloquent* Christ your advocate), *De doctrina*, p. 22; *EC* fol. 9r.

⁴⁵ Candon, *Doctrine*, pp. lx–lxi.

⁴⁶ *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 42r, my italics (since 'mes' (month) is formed in Latin from 'menos' which means 'diminution' in our language); cp. *De doctrina*, p. 107, 'eo quod mensis a mene dicitur, quod defectum sonat'.

⁴⁷ *De doctrina*, p. 278, my italics (This intense and uncommon emotion is to be compared to ecstatic love, called 'amer pour amours' in the vernacular. Ecstatic is from ecstasis, and so it is called ecstatic love, which numbs the mind, which suffers the heart to think on naught else other than the beloved object.)

enseñamiento this description is limited solely to the Latin, and no idiomatic vernacular phrase is provided:

E este talante *no nombrado* es comparado al amor *que es llamado en latin* extatico de extasi, *que quiere dezir sobrepujamiento porque sobrepuja a todos los otros amores* ⁊ alça ⁊ enajena el coraçon de si mesmo por vn *sobrepujamiento marauilloso*: ⁊ no lo dexa pensar sino en aquella cosa que ama ⁊ dessea la su voluntad.⁴⁸

The reference to Greek as the origin of the term for ecstatic love made by *De doctrina* is completely reworked. The Latin work then moves on to place the etymological origins of 'heroic love' with Cupid, 'scilicet amor apud Graecos 'añuò appellatur',⁴⁹ and provides a description of love's dreadful and fearsome effects – 'Est autem amor, 'añuò, magnum desiderium, cum magna concupiscentia, *et* afflictione cogitationum'⁵⁰ – before suggesting that the Greek word for 'noble' is also descended from Eros: 'Heri dicuntur viri nobiles, qui semper mollietatem, *et* delicias vitae quaerunt, *et* subiecti sunt huiusmodi passioni'.⁵¹ In what can only be a correction, *Del enseñamiento* places 'heroic love' within medical discourse, explaining its etymological origin via the Greek word for 'noble', while adding a play on words between the 'nobility' of the sufferer and the humiliation that the disease implies ('passion *mezquina*'). All mention of Eros is suppressed:

⁊ a este tal amor llaman *los fisicos* erreos: porque engendra enel coraçon grandes cobdicias ⁊ desseos con tormento de pensamientos diuersos. Ca los varones nobles son llamados *en griego* erces [sic] porque por las blanduras ⁊ deleytes de aquesta vida son subiectos a aquesta passion *mezquina*.⁵²

⁴⁸ *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 110v, italics indicate changes from the Latin (And this unnamed emotion is compared to the love *that is called in Latin* extatic, from extasis, which means excess because *it exceeds all other loves and raises and alienates the heart from itself*, and allows it to think only on that thing which it loves *and which its will desires*). Note further, the collapse of mind and heart: '*mentem alienat ... non sinit cor aliud cogitare nisi ...*' into the simplified concentration upon the heart: 'enajena el coraçon de si mesmo ... ⁊ no lo dexa pensar sino ...'

⁴⁹ *De doctrina*, p. 279 (namely love among the Greeks was called 'Eros').

⁵⁰ Ibid., p. 279 (And love, 'Eros', is a great desire, with great longing, and affliction of the thought).

⁵¹ Ibid., p. 279 (Noble men are called 'Heri', who ever search for softness and the pleasures of life, and are subject to this type of suffering).

⁵² *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 114v, my italics (and *physicians* call this type of love

The Aramaic cited in a Gospel passage is also not taken over into the translation: 'dixit: *Ephpheta, quod est, Adaperire*';⁵³ 'diziendo. Sed abiertas'.⁵⁴

Nevertheless, it is the frequent citation in *De doctrina* of vernacular phrasing which receives most reinterpretation. Mostly the invocation of the 'vulgo' in the Latin work is paralleled by the citation of a 'refrán' (proverb) in *Del enseñamiento*, which sometimes does have the stylistic form of a vernacular proverb. I give but one example: '(sicut vulgo dicitur) ad modum serui sibi teneri pedem super guttur; alioquin nunquam faciet bonam dietam';⁵⁵ 'porque segun se dizen communmente nunca fara buena jornada *nin buena lauor* el sieruo si no le fuere puesto el pie enel pescueço'⁵⁶ (assonance on *-é-o*: 'sieruo', 'puesto', 'pescueço'). However, 'refran' ?? refrán ?? is at times used for non-proverbial expressions: 'illud vulgare canticum' (that vernacular song) becomes 'el refran'.⁵⁷ The 'refran' ?? refrán ?? in question does not have any assonance and is an literal translation of the exemplar: 'El tu acatamiento sea simple 7 amoroso 7 tal que faga amoroso al tu amigo'.⁵⁸ Similarly, 'iuxta vulgare, ostede eis ostium oris tui in confessione'⁵⁹ becomes the citation of another proverb: 'E segun dize el *refran*: muestra les la puerta. *conuiene saber la manifestacion dela confession*'.⁶⁰

Direct citation of French in *De doctrina* is most often omitted; examples include the omission of any translation of 'Et vulgariter dicitur: Qui vit

'erreos', because it engenders great longings in the heart and desires with the torment of diverse thoughts. For noble men are called *in Greek* 'erces' [*sic*], because, through the comforts and pleasures of this life, they are subject to this ignoble suffering.)

⁵³ *De doctrina*, p. 149 (he said, '*Ephpheta*', which means 'Be opened' [Mark 7:34]).

⁵⁴ *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 58r.

⁵⁵ *De doctrina*, p. 18 (as the people say, [the flesh] must be kept like a servant with a foot on its throat, otherwise it never does a good day's work).

⁵⁶ *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 8r (because, as is commonly said, the servant will never do work for a whole day or do good work if a foot is not placed upon his neck).

⁵⁷ *De doctrina*, p. 267; *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 106r.

⁵⁸ *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 106r (Let your look be simple and loving and such that it should make your lover love you).

⁵⁹ *De doctrina*, p. 116 (as the common folk say, show them [sins] the door of your mouth in confession).

⁶⁰ *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 45v, my italics (And as the proverb has it: show them the door – that is to say, by making confession).

á conte, ne vit à honte',⁶¹ or of the French found in this later passage: 'Bonus vultus huius amici est consolatio spiritualis: *et* multum perdit, qui bonum vultum, *Gallice bonne chiere* amici sui perdit';⁶² 'E el acatamiento alegre de nuestro amigo ihesu christo es la consolacion spiritual que te el da. E porende no pierde poco el que pierde el acatamiento claro de aqueste amado'.⁶³ Here, the 'bonus vultus' has been reinterpreted as 'acatamiento alegre' or 'cheerful look/gaze').

The avoidance of French phrases is of one cloth with other elements of domestication in the translation. In a citation of Augustine, the complaint of monks frequenting 'theatra et spectacula' is rendered as the same wandering around the squares ('plaças'),⁶⁴ as it would be some time before public theatres were once again a feature of Spanish life and a draw for Spanish religious.⁶⁵ Another citation of Augustine, this time a condemnation of sporting pastimes, is modernized via reference to contemporary Spanish ballgames, although the references to bloodsports are maintained: 'Heu quam dolendum, quam pudendum delectat, *vt cuppa impleatur, vt pila iaciatur, vt fera capiatur, et non delectat, vt Deus acquiratur!*';⁶⁶ 'O quanto es digno de confusion 7 verguença deleytarse el hombre *en pecar* 7 en jugar a la pelota 7 en andar aça 7 a monte 7 no delaytarse en buscar 7 servir al señor'.⁶⁷ A further pastime was, for the nobility, the tourney, which is described on the same page of *De doctrina*: 'Nonne bachelarij, torneatores ad sibilos fistularum, *et* sonitus tympanorum, clamores histrionum, exhortationes hiralorum inter gladios constituti sufferunt, *et* inferunt

⁶¹ *De doctrina*, p. 9 (and it is said in the vernacular, 'He who lives in within their means will not live in shame').

⁶² *Ibid.*, p. 286 (the good face of this friend is spiritual consolation; and she loses much who loses the good face, *in French* 'bonne chiere', of her friend).

⁶³ *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 113v.

⁶⁴ *De doctrina*, p. 25; *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 10v.

⁶⁵ 'Plaça' is elsewhere used as a synonym for the outside: 'Cor vagatur *foris, et* corpus per se remanet in choro', *De doctrina*, p. 258 (The heart wanders outside and the body remains by itself in the choir); 'esta el cuerpo en la claustra: 7 el coraçon en la *plaça*.' *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 102r (the body is in the cloister and the heart in the square).

⁶⁶ *De doctrina*, p. 37, my italics (Alas, how much to sorrow, how much to be ashamed that one delights that a barrel is filled, that a ball is thrown, that a wildbeast is taken, and does not delight that God is to be acquired!)

⁶⁷ *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 15v, my italics (Oh, how much is it not worthy of shame and abashment that man should delight in sinning and playing *pelota* and in riding out hunting and into the wilderness and should not delight in searching for and serving the Lord).

duros ictus?’⁶⁸ The ‘fistulae’, ‘timpani’, ‘histriones’ and ‘hirdi’ are reduced to ‘ministriles’, ‘albardanes’ and, damningly, ‘ribaldos’, which renders *Del enseñamiento*’s view of this form of entertainment more hostile: ‘Muchas vezes aceasce que al tañer delos ministriles. 7 alos bozes delos albardanes 7 alas amonestaciones delos ribaldos entran los caualleros mancebos en armas 7 torneos 7 dan 7 sufren grandes golpes’.⁶⁹

Nevertheless, imagery of fighting is shifted up a register when it is applied to Christ. Thus, Jesus as the ‘pugile’ or boxer becomes a ‘caballero’ or knight: ‘Quis pugilem suum de victoria redeuntem gloriosum, aspersum sanguine, liuidum, confossum, vulneratum in domo sua gratanter non reciperet? item, cum honore non reciperet?’⁷⁰ ‘E quien no recibira alegremente en su posada al cauallero que peleo por el 7 vencio gloriosamente en la batalla. 7 viene todo cubierto de sangre 7 magullado?’⁷¹ In another passage, ‘strenuitas’ (martial vigour) becomes ‘nobleza’ (nobility).⁷² The ‘stomachosus epulator’ (short-tempered gourmand), who throws sub-standard food in his servants’ faces, becomes an ‘ombre de gran linaje’ (man of high birth).⁷³

Yet, on the other hand, and moving in the opposite direction with regard to the register, the classical-sounding ‘quadriga’, pulled by horses, becomes a cart pulled by oxen.⁷⁴ This is perhaps to make the passage fit more closely to the previous simile, which linked the prelates’ subordinates to asses (although the animal is rather decorously unnamed in the Spanish): ‘Qui vult asinum suum onerare, mollia supponere consuevit, ne summa superposita laedat asinum, et eius dorsum excoriet’;⁷⁵ ‘el que quiere cargar alguna bestia primero le echa *buen albarda bien adobada*: 7 avn algunos

⁶⁸ *De doctrina*, p. 37 (Do not the young men at a tourney, to the whistling of the pipes and the sound of drums, and the shouts of the performers and the encouragement of the heralds, bearing swords, receive and give fierce blows?)

⁶⁹ *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 15v (Many times it befalls that, at the playing of the minstrels and the shouts of the fools and the encouragement of the ruffians, young knights put on arms and enter tourneys and give and receive great blows).

⁷⁰ *De doctrina*, p. 3 (Who would not thankfully receive into his home his fighter, returning gloriously victorious, covered with blood, bruised, pierced and wounded?)

⁷¹ *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 3r (And who would not receive cheerfully into his home the knight who fought for him and conquered gloriously in the battle, and comes all covered with blood and bruised?), omitting ‘confossem’, ‘vulneratum’.

⁷² *De doctrina*, p. 35; *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 14v.

⁷³ *De doctrina*, p. 47; *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 19v.

⁷⁴ *De doctrina*, p. 252; *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 99r.

⁷⁵ *De doctrina*, p. 252 (He who wants to burden their ass usually put soft things under the load, lest it injure the ass and strip off its skin).

cabeçaleros si la carga es pesada por que no sea la bestia *matada* 7 desollada'.⁷⁶ As can be seen, *Del enseñamiento* increases notably the information on the padding required by the beast of burden, as well as the dangers of not providing the cushioning, in that the beast may die – but does not suggest, as indicated above, that the beast of burden (i.e., the overburdened monk) might justifiably complain, which comprises an important part of *De doctrina*'s balance of responsibility between superior and simple monk. We are best to conclude that the intended audience is most probably more composed of monks than their abbots. Indeed, the simple food of monks becomes not just 'piso et olere' (peas and cabbage), but 'ortaliza 7 legumbres 7 passas' (greens and vegetables *and* sultanas).⁷⁷

Looking to his description of women, we find the translator toning down the actions of virtuous women when faced with an improper suitor: *De doctrina* suggests that they are rather violent, and advises its readers to deal with the devil in the same way: 'Fac ergo sicut casta mulier, quae non solum solicitatorem suum non audit, imo cum indignatione eijcit, *et* verberibus, *et* conuicijs eijcit, *et* expellit'.⁷⁸ Yet the 'muger casta' would seem to leave both rolling pin and 'pandero' to one side: 'Pues ansi como la muger casta no solamente no oye al que la affinca 7 demanda: mas aun lo desecha con desden 7 impaciencia';⁷⁹ the 'verberibus' and the 'conuiciis' have been omitted from the translation. In a related fashion, for *De doctrina*, all illegitimate children born of adultery are to be rejected: 'Tolle ergo opera peccatorum, tanquam filios de adulterio natos';⁸⁰ for *Del enseñamiento*, it is only the bad products of such illicit unions that require rejection: 'Pues echa de ti las obras delos pecados ansi como vnos hijos malos engendrados en adulterio'.⁸¹ However, an allusion to cuckoldry in *De doctrina* – 'Et in quibusdam speculis vultus prospicientium *cornuti*

⁷⁶ *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 99r, my italics (he who wishes to load a beast first throws over a well worn-in packsaddle, and even some cushions if the load is heavy so that the beast may not be killed and skinned).

⁷⁷ *De doctrina*, p. 199; *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 77r.

⁷⁸ *De doctrina*, p. 90 (Do, then, as does the chaste woman, who not only does not give ear to her would-be seducer, but rather throws him out with an angry outburst and with blows and with noisy reproaches, and utterly rejects him).

⁷⁹ *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 36r (So just as the chaste woman not only does not give ear to he who encourages her and requests her [compliance], but furthermore rejects him with disdain and impatience).

⁸⁰ *De doctrina*, p. 116 (reject the works of sinners, like sons born of adultery).

⁸¹ *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 45v (So throw from yourself the works of the sins just like some *bad* children conceived in adultery).

videntur'⁸² – is bowlderized, and the faces become merely ugly: 'E ansi como parescen muy *feos* en algunos espejos los gestos delos que se acatan enello.'⁸³

Horses, however, caused a certain amount of difficulty. As noted above, the four 'equi' drawing the 'quadriga' are turned into oxen. A mistranslation also occurs relating to horses. 'Equi *umbratici*', which are described as being 'qui ad aus volatum, aut motum folij terretur, aut resilit, trepidant, vbi non est timor',⁸⁴ are translated as 'cauallos *sombrios* que se espantan e saltan al bolar delas aues o al mouimiento delas fojas delos arboles' and again as 'cauallos *sombrios* e harones'.⁸⁵ Now, 'sombrió' is not otherwise found with this meaning in Spanish; its post-medieval use is to indicate the dark pigmentation of a horse's coat. 'Harón' does exist, and is taken from the Arabic 'harûn' (حرون), which specifically means a horse (or mule or donkey) which stops short and cannot be moved. 'Umbratici' has cognates in Italian and French ('ombroso', 'ombrageux'), but the similar word in Spanish, 'asombradizo', is not witnessed in any medieval text. However, 'sombrió' is given in Nebrija's *Vocabulario hispano-latino* as being the equivalent of 'umbraticus'.⁸⁶

The translator rendered the criticism of excessive eloquence in preachers from the very start of *De doctrina* ('Veritatis enim praedicatorum non decet huiusmodi verborum compositio per rhythmos consonantium'⁸⁷) as 'Ca no conuiene al predicador dela verdad delas escripturas diuinales fablar rimado 7 por consonantes'.⁸⁸ Nevertheless, there is a stylistic concern shown

⁸² *De doctrina*, p. 30 (and in some mirrors the face of one looking into them is seen to have horns).

⁸³ *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 12r (and just as the faces of those who look in some mirrors seem very ugly).

⁸⁴ *De doctrina*, p. 238 (who, at the flight of a bird, or the movement of leaves, are terrified, or shrink back; they fear where this is no [cause for] fear).

⁸⁵ *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 93v (shadowy horses that are frightened and jump at the flying of birds or at the movement of the leaves on the trees).

⁸⁶ Antonio Nebrija, *Vocabulario hispano-latino* (Salamanca, 1495), fol. 94va.

⁸⁷ *De doctrina*, p. 3 (composition of these [divine] words through rhythmical eloquence is not fitting for the preacher of truth),.

⁸⁸ *Del enseñamiento*, fol. iv (For it is unfitting for the preacher of the truth of the divine scriptures to speak in rhythmic *cursus* and through *homoioteleuton*). The phrasing of *Del enseñamiento* cannot but recall the famous verses of the thirteenth-century *Libro de Alexandre*, ed. by J.C. Rigall (Madrid, 2007), p. 130, ll. 2cd: 'fablar curso rimado | por la quaderna vía, a sílabas contadas, | que es grant maestría' (to speak in rhythmical *cursus* through the four-fold way, with counted syllables, for it is a great show of skill); regarding the meaning of these

within the translation. This may in part be ‘rimado 7 por consonantes’, presumably from mnemonic motives. Thus, in a citation of Gregory the Great – ‘Cogitatio praemij minuit vim flagelli’⁸⁹ – the loose translation is marked by a rhythmical assonance in –ó: ‘El pensamiento del galardón / amengua el *dolor* / del açote *dela tribulacion*’.⁹⁰ Another example may be found from the addition to *De doctrina*, ‘inimicus lucis Diabolus expellatur, *et* lucis amator Christus introducatur’.⁹¹ (an example of antistrophe itself): ‘el diablo enemigo dela luz sea desechado: / 7 sea hospedado / ihesu christo amador / de toda luz 7 *resplendor*’.⁹²

The insertion of words derived from ‘bastar’ produces a *traductio* (the repetition of a key word or syllabic sequence) which draws the following passage in *Del enseñamiento* together:

Mas los moros 7 los judios sienten cosas no dignas de dios 7 del su poderio: por que los judios esperan de dios riquezas 7 *abastança* temporal creyendo que aqui avran avn la cipdad de iherusalem *doblada* 7 *abastada* de toda gloria mundanal. E los moros esperan rescibir en galardón *abastança* de deleytes carnales. 7 esta tal *abastança* es de ombres bestiales que resciberon en vano sus animas. como el anima que es substancia no veyble 7 assi ha de ser *galardonada* de bienes no veybles.⁹³

[Check fn
for italics
– none
given?](#)

One also finds a concern with the balancing of phrases. Thus, in a

lines (where ‘rimado’ is used to evoke both rhyme and rhythm) see idem, pp. 45–6; A. Arizaleta, *La translation d’Alexandre. Recherches sur les structures et les significations du ‘Libro de Alexandre’* (Pais, 1999), pp. 152–79, and I.U. Maqua, *Panorama crítico del mester de clerecía* (Madrid, 2000), pp. 36–51. I am of course merely guessing as to the translation of the relevant part of *Del enseñamiento*.

⁸⁹ *De doctrina*, p. 38 (thought of the reward lessens the force of the whip).

⁹⁰ *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 16r.

⁹¹ *De doctrina*, p. 40 (is the enemy of light, the Devil, to be thrown out, and the lover of light, Christ, brought in?)

⁹² *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 16v (the devil, enemy of the light is to be thrown out, and Jesus Christ is to be welcomed, lover of all light and brightness).

⁹³ *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 91v, italics indicate additions or changes to the Latin, as usual; underlining, the *traductiones* (But the Moors and the Jews accept unworthy things of God and his power, since the Jews expect riches and temporal wealth from God, believing that here they will yet have the city of Jerusalem double and wealthy with all worldly glory. And the Moors expect to receive as reward a wealth of carnal delights, and wealth like this is for bestial men who received their souls in vain, since the soul is an invisible substance, and so is to be rewarded with what is both good and invisible.)

description of the sick who have lost their taste for food – ‘quibus cibus quantumcunque sapidus sit, eis videtur insipidus, et amarus’⁹⁴ – *Del enseñamiento* describes ‘los enfermos *que han perdido el apetito*. 7 fallan desabrida la vianda 7 amarga quantoquier que sea sabrosa 7 bien guisada’.⁹⁵ The order of the phrase is inverted, and ‘bien guisada’ is added to provide a binary phrase (‘sabrosa’: ‘bien guisada’) which balances their antonyms ‘desabrida’: ‘amarga’ (>‘insipidus et amarus’).

To conclude, we may summarise our knowledge of the translator. Skillful, with a clear programme and motive for his translation and a consistent view of his target audience, with a knowledge of enough Greek and medical sources to correct the text he was translating, but a rather more questionable knowledge of horses which displays, nevertheless, an important link with Antonio Nebrija, the leading Spanish humanist of his day, professor at Salamanca when the *princeps* was published, author of the first grammar of a modern vernacular language and numerous other works, and who, as we shall see, has been identified as the publisher of *Del enseñamiento*.

The *princeps*

Del enseñamiento del coraçon forms part of a small group of incunabula of ascetico-mystical interest produced in Salamanca. It is a small group in comparison to other genres of books printed in Salamanca, and in comparison to the book market as it developed during the sixteenth century, where such devotional treatises made up roughly a third of all titles produced. In Salamanca, the middle-aged private lay individual in need of spiritual guidance, and wishing to read about it, had not been identified as a potential buyer, and production of ascetic works was destined primarily for the monastic market. As has been outlined above, it was most definitely for this wealthy, discerning and ascetically minded client that *Del enseñamiento* was prepared.⁹⁶

⁹⁴ *De doctrina*, p. 29 (howsoever tasty their food might be, it seems to them tasteless and bitter).

⁹⁵ *Del enseñamiento*, fol. 12v (the sick *who have lost their appetite* and find their food tasteless and bitter however tasty and cooked with herbs and spices it may be).

⁹⁶ There is no space here for a full study of *Del enseñamiento*’s place within Salamanican book production, but a comparison of percentages for types or genres of titles published in Salamanca up to 1500 gives 13% for devotional treatises, compared to 37% for booksellers’ stock in Toledo and between 31 and 38% for

The endpapers display a woodcut of St Gregory's Mass, which had previously been used on Sebastián de Horta's *Tractatus de confessione* (1497).⁹⁷ The final leaf is adorned with a printer's shield, which was a relatively common device at the time. Between the years 1500 and 1510 Pedro Hagenbach, for example, used a shield with a representation of St Ildefonsus, archbishop of Toledo, receiving a heavenly alb from the Blessed Virgin; in itself unsurprising, since he was publishing in Toledo.⁹⁸ Guillén de Brocar identified himself with the interlaced letters *AG* underneath a boar in his editions of Fernán Pérez de Guzmán, *Cronica del Rey d. Juan II* (Logroño, 1517), Pedro Ciruelo, *Dexameron theologal sobre el regimiento medicinal contra la pestilencia* (Alcalá de Henares, 1519) and *Epistola Ferdinandi de Enzinas* (Alcalá, 1524).⁹⁹

The shield of *Del enseñamiento* is divided into two; the left field bears the five wounds of Christ; the right, a haloed eagle. The shield is further topped by a crown and surrounded by the belt of St Francis. In the point of the shield is a gothic miniscule *y*. Haebler thought that the shield was the emblem of the printer, and, when he wrote, the main printing press of Salamanca was completely anonymous.¹⁰⁰ Now we have rather more details concerning the development of printing in Salamanca.

The right-side eagle of *Del enseñamiento*'s shield is a representation of St John the Evangelist. If this is a printer's shield, then we may assume that the printer's name was Juan. And so springs to mind the name of Juan Porras, who had inherited the Salamanican printing business from his father in 1487 and who continued publishing until 1520.¹⁰¹ Yet the other elements of the

the contents of private libraries in Cuenca during the sixteenth century (for these figures, see S.T. Nalle, 'Literacy and Culture in Early Modern Castile', *Past and Present*, 125 (1989), 65–96 (p. 84). The incunabula from Salamanca are listed in F. Vindel, *El arte tipográfico en España durante el siglo XV*, 10 vols (Madrid, 1945–51), II: *Salamanca, Zamora, Coria y Reino de Galicia* (1946), pp. 3–220; and VIII: *Dudosos de lugar de impresión. Adiciones y correcciones a toda la obra* (1951), pp. 135–88.

⁹⁷ Vindel, *El arte*, II, pp. 133–4.

⁹⁸ F. Vindel, *Escudos y marcas de impresores y libreros en España durante los siglos XV a XIX (1485–1850)* (Barcelona, 1942), pp. 46–8, nos 51–3.

⁹⁹ Vindel, *Escudos*, pp. 27, 30, nos 27, 30.

¹⁰⁰ C. Haebler, *Bibliografía ibérica del siglo XV. I: Enumeración de todos los libros impresos en España y Portugal hasta el año 1500 con notas críticas* (La Haya & Leipzig, 1903); II: *Segunda parte* (La Haya & Leipzig, 1917) [Facsimile reprint: Madrid, 1992], I, p. 113.

¹⁰¹ M.A.V. García, 'Identificación de la primera imprenta anónima salmantina', *Investigaciones históricas*, 14 (1997), 25–33; J.M. Abad, *Los primeros tiempos de*

shield may point in another direction. There was another John working in Salamanca during this period, the German Juan Giesser, first witnessed as sole printer of a book in 1500.¹⁰² In his printing of the *Vita y procesus Sancti Thome Cantuarensis* (Salamanca, 1506), there is an almost identical reproduction of Hagenbach's alb within a shield (mentioned above). The difference in Giesser's printing is the presence, in the upper part of the page above the shield, of St Francis in his habit receiving the stigmata from a crucifix.¹⁰³ The presence of St Francis would explain both the belt of St Francis around the shield of *Del enseñamiento* and the wounds of Christ in the shield itself. The predilection for Franciscan imagery thus inclines the identification of the printer of *Del enseñamiento* towards Giesser, a German printer, born in Silgenstadt, Hassia.¹⁰⁴ It also places *Del enseñamiento* within a Franciscan sphere of influence, as in late medieval England and Italy, and in the attribution of the later printing of the work to St Bonaventure. The *y* at the point of the shield may be understood as another allusion to Giesser's name: *y* for Yohannes.

However, Vindel, on the basis of the use nearly forty years later of a *Y* in various anonymously printed publications in Granada, one of which, while still silent over the name of the printer, claims to have been published 'Apud inclitam Granatam, in aedibus Antonii Nebrissensis',¹⁰⁵ linked *Del*

la imprenta en España (c. 1471–1520), Arcadia de la letras 19 (Madrid, 2003), pp. 67–8.

¹⁰² Vindel, *El arte*, II, pp. 190–91.

¹⁰³ Vindel, *Escudos*, p. 79, no. 76.

¹⁰⁴ When might Giesser have started working in Salamanca? Vindel, *El arte*, II, pp. xvi–xvii, supposes that a foreign printer used the second roman type, first seen in Nebrija's *Introductiones latinae* in 1495 (see pp. 73–5, no. 48) and continuing to be used until 1499 (in Petrus Pentarcus, *Ars constructionis*; see pp. 157–8, no. 103).

¹⁰⁵ (In noble Granada, in the house of Antonio Nebrija). According to the reproductions in Vindel, *Escudos*, the *Y* (a distinctly humanist form of the letter, different to the Gothic miniscule *y* of *Del enseñamiento*) was initially used twice in the frontispiece to Tomás Torquemada, *Copilacion de las instrucciones del Officio de la Santa Inquisicion* (1537), reused in Nebrija's *Habes in hoc volumine ... rerum a Fernando et Elisabe Hispaniorum* (1545), and later in *Cédulas provisiones y ordenanzas de los Señores Reyes de Castilla ...* (1551) (Vindel, *Escudos*, p. 105, nos 129–30). Another style of inclusion of the *Y* in the printing design is found in Nebrija, *Habes in hoc volumine* (1545) (*ibid.*, p. 104, nos 127–8), together with an end page possessing a much more complicated design that also contains the *Y*, similar to that in Nebrija's glossed edition of Virgil, *Opera cun A. Nebrissensis familiaribus phrasibus* (1546); both designs contain the same motto (*ibid.*, p. 106,

enseñamiento to Nebrija: as professor of the university, he would have found it convenient to hide his direct involvement in the production of books, although his phrasing in his prologue to his *Dictionarium latino-hispanicum* ('como mas copiosamente dispute en el primero libro de aquella obra que publicamos de la castellana gramatica'¹⁰⁶) would indicate direct involvement in the business of publication, and a late-sixteenth-century author described Nebrija's printworks, presumably in Salamanca, as something of common knowledge.¹⁰⁷

Further linguistic work on the text will be necessary before any judgement over Nebrija's direct involvement in the translation can be offered. However, one may note that the translation appeared the year after Nebrija was relieved of his teaching duties to concentrate upon his researches (in essence, a five-year sabbatical funded by the archbishop of Toledo). It is probably impossible to prove that the translation was carried out by him, although in its accuracy and fidelity to the text, its sober vernacular style which shuns the Latinate syntax and diction previously so favoured for the Spanishing of texts, and the possible use of his dictionary for the translation (in the matter of 'umbraticus'/'sombrió', discussed above), *Del enseñamiento* would seem to come from his circle. This deduction does not exclude Haebler's view of the authorship (which is not very much more than an uninspired guess), 'Este curioso libro con ninguna palabra acusa el nombre del autor que debió ser un religioso de Salamanca'.¹⁰⁸ The significance of the *Y* in Juan Giesser's shield, then, remains to be unravelled. The answer to that may well be the same as that

nos 131–2). Another style is found in Sancho de Salaya, *Repertorio de los tiempos* (1542) and *Aesopi fabulae* (1545) (ibid., p. 103, no. 124). Pedro Mercado, *De febricum differentiis* (1583) offers yet another version (ibid., p. 103, no. 126). It is the latter which is claimed to have been published in Nebrija's own house. The *Aesopi fabulae* may have been a reprint of the Salamanca edition of a work with the title of *Fabelle Esopi* (1491), for this latter work, see Vindel, *El arte*, II, pp. 39–40, no. 26.

¹⁰⁶ fol. rvb, my italics (as I discoursed more fully in the first book of that work that *we published* about Castilian grammar).

¹⁰⁷ Vindel, *El arte*, II, p. xxi. The work in question, as cited by Vindel, is Agustino Gerónimo Román, *Repúblicas del mundo* (Medina del Campo, 1575), fol. 214v: 'Esto se puede decir lícitamente porque en la oficina del maestro Antonio de Lebrixa parecen ciertas paginas de metal con todas necesarias y se imprimieron antes con ellas.' (This we can correctly claim because in the workshop of *maestro* Antonio de Lebrixa [i.e. Nebrija], there are certain metal forms with all their appurtenances and in earlier days they printed with them).

¹⁰⁸ Haebler, *Bibliografía ibérica*, I, p. 112 (This book gives no indication at all of the name of its author, who must have been a religious from Salamanca).

supplied by my Wexford-born grandmother, who would reply to a four-year old's incessant (and anaphoric) questioning with the unyielding response 'Y is a crooked letter and ye can't straighten it.'