A Methodist Perspective on Aid-dependency in Haitian Protestantism

A thesis submitted to the University of Manchester for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in the faculty of humanities.

Doctor of Philosophy (Missiology)

2019

Marcus Torchon

School of Arts, Languages and Cultures
# List of Contents

List of Abbreviations and Acronyms ................................................................. page 8
Abstract ............................................................................................................... page 9
Introduction ...................................................................................................... page 14

Section One: Exploration of Aid-dependency’s Features .................................. page 18
Chapter 1. Literature Review ............................................................................. page 18

1.1 Literature on General Aid-Dependency ....................................................... page 18
   1.1.1 Pre-1949 Aid-Era .................................................................................... page 19
   1.1.2 1950-2000 Aid-Era ................................................................................ page 22
   1.1.3 Post-2000 Aid-Era ................................................................................ page 32

1.2 Literature on Aid-Dependency in Haiti ......................................................... page 39
   1.2.1 Precursor to Aid-Dependency – Slavery ................................................. page 40
   1.2.2 Precursor to Aid-Dependency – Economic Disempowerment ............. page 45

Conclusion ......................................................................................................... page 51
Chapter 2. Article

The Interplay between Aid-dependency, Church Growth and Holistic Mission in Haitian Protestantism

Introduction

2.1 What is Going on in Haitian Protestantism?

Descriptive-empirical Task

2.1.1 Historical Narrative 1

Aid-Dependency, a Functional Praxis, 1817-1950

Theoretical Category I (TCI): Aid Embodies Characteristics of Empowerment

2.1.2 Historical Narrative 2

Aid-Dependency, a Potentially Inhibitive Praxis, 1950-2017

Theoretical Category II (TCII): Aid-dependency Fosters Socio-economic Disempowerment

2.2 Mission Engagement

2.2.1 Positive Mission Engagement

Theoretical Category III (TCIII): Aid-dependency Has Contributed to Ineffective Poverty-alleviation

2.2.2 Supplementary Positive Mission Engagement

2.3 Why is this Going on in Haitian Protestantism?

Interpretative Task

Conclusion
Section Two: Application and Outcome of Research Methodology

Chapter 3. Research Design, a Multi-Disciplinary Methodology

Introduction

3.1 Proposed Field of Study and Thesis Question

3.2 Methodology of Inquiry

3.3 Methods of Data Collection

3.4 Procedures for Data Analysis

Conclusion

Chapter 4. Report and Analysis of Empirical Datasets

Introduction

4.1 Quantitative Description

4.2 Qualitative Description

4.2.1 Core Theme A. Positive Contribution of Aid

4.2.2 Core Theme B. Inhibitive Outcome of Aid-dependency

4.2.3 Core Theme C. Expression of Disempowerment

4.2.4 Core Theme D. Alternative Responses

Conclusion
Chapter 5. Hypothesis Claim Discussed page 174

Introduction page 174

5.1 First Lens: page 175

Foreign presence in Haiti has primarily contributed to the reality of aid-dependency in Haitian Protestantism

5.2 Second Lens: page 191

Aid-giving is an essential component of integrated mission in contrast to aid-dependency which disempowers.

5.3 Third Lens: page 205

The practices and modalities of aid-dependency have become tools of economic disempowerment in Haitian Protestantism

5.4 Fourth Lens: page 221

For all FMDs’ aid-work in Haitian Protestantism the outcome is consistently overshadowed by a disempowering culture of silence which inhibits poverty-alleviation initiatives

Conclusion page 235
Section Three: Shaping the Church of the Future
Towards Self-sufficiency

Chapter 6. A Dreamed Church
What Ought to be Going on in Haitian Protestantism?
Normative Task

Introduction

6.1 Theological Imperative

6.2 Theological Scrutiny

6.3 Theological Vision

Conclusion

Chapter 7. Re-imagining Haitian Church
How Might We Respond?
Pragmatic Task

Introduction

7.1 Phase One: Foreign Expertise and Recalibration

7.2 Phase Two: Seeking an Agreed Consensus

7.3 Phase Three: Potential Agreed Consensuses

7.4 Phase Four: Empowering Strategies

Conclusion
Bibliography page 278

Appendix 1: Pilot Questionnaire page 306

Appendix 2: Pilot Interview Questions: Leaders of Local Churches page 309

Appendix 3: Pilot Interview Questions: Leaders of Foreign Missions page 310

Appendix 4: The Questionnaire for Ministers and Teachers page 311

Appendix 5: Interview Questions: Leaders of Local Churches page 314

Appendix 6: Interview Questions: Leaders of Foreign Missions page 315

Word Count 81500
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ASPACREP</td>
<td>Association des Parents des CREP (Parents Association of CREPs)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EPER</td>
<td><em>Entraide Protestante des Églises Reformées de Suisse</em> (Protestant Mutual Aid of Reformed Churches of Switzerland)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESRs</td>
<td>Enslaved St. Domingue Residents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FP</td>
<td>Foreign Presence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FMDs</td>
<td>Foreign Missionary Developers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross Domestic Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HICs</td>
<td>High Income Countries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIPC</td>
<td>Highly Indebted Poor Countries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HMC</td>
<td>Haitian Methodist Church</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEBSH</td>
<td><em>Mission Evangélique Baptiste du Sud d’Haïti</em> (Haiti Southern Evangelical Baptist Mission)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMF</td>
<td>International Monetary Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LICs</td>
<td>Low Income Countries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MCB</td>
<td>Methodist Church in Britain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MCCA</td>
<td>Methodist Church in the Caribbean and the Americas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDGs</td>
<td>Millennium Development Goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGOs</td>
<td>Non-Governmental Organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RAED</td>
<td>Report and Analysis of Empirical Datasets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAPs</td>
<td>Structural Adjustment Programmes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SDGs</td>
<td>Sustainable Development Goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UMCOR</td>
<td>United Methodist Church of Relief</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USAID</td>
<td>United States Agency for International Development</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Abstract

Aid-dependency in Haitian Protestantism attracts a diverse range of views which either endorse or dispute its usefulness in alleviating the suffering of the economically poor. This debate is equally recurrent, globally, in secular as well as church settings. As part of the debate, this thesis portfolio studies aid-dependency as a research problem, that is, an intellectual stimulus, calling for an answer in the form of a research inquiry. The inquiry delineates a multidisciplinary research methodology with a distinctive focus on the qualitative characteristics of a case study in Haitian Methodism and the tasks of practical theology. The methodology is further constituted by both a literature review which provides etic data and fieldwork which welcomes emic data. The outcome generates a hypothesis which is constructed as ‘Aid-dependency has disempowered Haitian Protestantism by inhibiting self-sufficiency’. Continuing with this, etic data embodies the hypothesis in three literary-based theoretical categories: (1) ‘aid embodies characteristics of empowerment’, (2) ‘aid-dependency fosters socio-economic disempowerment’, and (3) ‘aid-dependency contributes to ineffective poverty-alleviation’. Furthermore, emic data sustains the hypothesis in four core themes: (1) ‘positive contribution of aid’, (2) ‘inhibitive outcome of aid-dependency’, (3) ‘expression of disempowerment’, and (4) ‘alternate response’. Altogether, on the pivot of aid-dependency, the themes socio-economic disempowerment and empowerment encapsulate the telos of the portfolio. Pragmatically, this advocates the empowerment of the Haitian majority. To achieve this, empowerment narratives and strategies invite aid-providers to validate aid-receivers’ informed consent and distil their paternalistic objectifying perspective. This empowerment alternative requires agreed institutional and national consensuses to break disempowering cultures of silence and epitomize the Haitian collective dream of prosperity in a context of needed change. The portfolio explores aid-dependency’s features, creates the awareness of its functionality and advocates empowerment as a contribution to scholarly knowledge.
Declaration:

I declare that no portion of the work referred to in the thesis has been submitted in support of an application for another degree or qualification of this or any other university or other institute of learning.

Copyright Statement:

COPYRIGHT STATEMENT The following four notes on copyright and the ownership of intellectual property rights must be included as written below:

i. The author of this thesis (including any appendices and/or schedules to this thesis) owns certain copyright or related rights in it (the “Copyright”) and s/he has given The University of Manchester certain rights to use such Copyright, including for administrative purposes.

ii. Copies of this thesis, either in full or in extracts and whether in hard or electronic copy, may be made only in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 (as amended) and regulations issued under it or, where appropriate, in accordance with licensing agreements which the University has from time to time. This page must form part of any such copies made.

iii. The ownership of certain Copyright, patents, designs, trademarks and other intellectual property (the “Intellectual Property”) and any reproductions of copyright works in the thesis, for example graphs and tables (“Reproductions”), which may be described in this thesis, may not be owned by the author and may be owned by third parties. Such Intellectual Property and Reproductions cannot and must not be made available for use without the prior written permission of the owner(s) of the relevant Intellectual Property and/or Reproductions.
iv. Further information on the conditions under which disclosure, publication and commercialisation of this thesis, the Copyright and any Intellectual Property and/or Reproductions described in it may take place is available in the University IP Policy (see http://documents.manchester.ac.uk/DocuInfo.aspx?DocID=24420), in any relevant Thesis restriction declarations deposited in the University Library, The University Library’s regulations (see http://www.library.manchester.ac.uk/about/regulations/) and in The University’s policy on Presentation of Theses.
The Author:

In 2007-2008 I conducted research works on the mission of the Holland Methodist Church, based in Holland. This was a Caribbean immigrant-built church where 30 members volunteered to fill out an open-ended questionnaire. Twenty-five questionnaires were filled and returned. I went on analysing and synthesising the data into an MA dissertation.

Similar research works have been conducted in the current thesis. This time, the scope was expanded to include 4 strands of data collection methods, namely questionnaire, interviews, archival data and focus groups interviews. Whereas the MA research work covered a period of two years, the timeframe for the current research has been seven years.

In both cases I gained richer experiences in the field of research.
Acknowledgements:

I am distinctly honoured to acknowledge the enthusiasm with which a number of people have generously contributed to the realization of this research portfolio, dedicated to redesigning and expanding the path of Protestantism’s socio-economic recovery and deepening its faith in God.

Firstly, I acknowledge the dedication and diligence of the staff at Cliff College. Moreover, I greatly benefitted from the doctoral guidance of my three supervisors, Stephen Skuce, Justin Thacker and Ben Pugh whose academic insight has sharpened and provided depth to the outcome of this research for which I am grateful. I am particularly indebted to Justin, my main supervisor, whose expertise and encouragement have boosted my confidence.

Furthermore, I am appreciative of the time and depths of experience that 153 participants, more dominantly from Haiti, have invested in this work. In fact, in this gesture of acknowledgement, I offer this thesis as a gift to the Haitian community, more specifically, the Haitian Church.

The invaluable work of a number of persons whose editing skills have sharpened the language and prose is recognized. They helped to alleviate the pressure of writing within the constraints of deadlines. Equally, the financial support I received from the Methodist Church in Britain made my financial obligations significantly more bearable.

I thank God for the emotional and technical support provided by my family, my wife, Sylvia and son, Jean-De-Luc. They have shared every moment with me as I have occupied their accommodating space throughout my commitment to this study.

Finally, I ascribe all glory to God in Christ for filling me with strength and resilience which He sustained throughout.
Introduction

In the second half of the 1980s, I was employed as an accountant-evangelist by a Haitian Protestant Church wherein it occurred to me that its existence was predominantly contingent on assistance from foreign partners. Salaries of staff, together with funding for schools and micro-credit projects, were all financed, continuously, by foreign grants. Other evangelists known to me, in Protestant churches, witnessed similar trends. In fact, they further acknowledged that there had been a sustained active presence of foreign philanthropic organizations and church-missions in their local churches. Aligned with biblical principles on giving to the impoverished, I initially concluded that, ultimately, the overriding ethos of these kinds of funding initiatives purported, but was not limited, to expanding the kingdom of God in words, deeds, signs, and wonders. Furthermore, in my estimation, those church-missions intended to create a sustainable socio-economic state of wellbeing for the Haitian church.

However, as time wore on, I began realising that foreign-aid, funding and support, of varied kinds, was invariably connected to dependency. I further observed that aid-dependency had been at the heart of the missional ministry of Haitian Protestantism [hereafter HP] whose kingdom initiatives have been defined by foreign aid-modalities. My suspicion of the church’s situation of dependency on foreign-aid prompted me to address aid-dependency as a research question. I therefore ask: What is the nature of aid-dependency in HP? In saying this, my primary focus is not to demonstrate the reality of aid-dependency, but rather to explore its features.

The experiences I gained in that employment and my interest in missiology and ecclesiology in Haiti triggered the necessity for me to explore, through the methodology of a case study, the reliability of my suspicion and equally further examine the extent to which dependency on foreign-aid is an existential reality in HP. To be at the centre of the case study, I select the Église Méthodiste d’Haïti [Haitian Methodist church, hereafter HMC], a pivotal arm of HP. I
equally obtain relevant data from other Protestant churches in Haiti. This is with a view to both strengthening the rigour of the study and broadening the scope of the Methodist perspective. Consistent with this selection, the research question asks: what is the nature of aid-dependency in HP with a focus on a Methodist perspective?

This scholarly inquiry will require a multi-disciplinary research design of which the outcome will be compiled into a portfolio of three Sections and seven Chapters. In the application of this structure, Section One will explore aid-dependency’s features in two Chapters from which I aim to identify a central hypothesis. Chapter 1 will be constituted by a literature review and Chapter 2 by an Article. The literature review will focus on aid-dependency in general, the Article will develop this to analyse the literature surrounding aid-dependency in HP. Whereas for reliable etic\(^1\) data I will probe into researchers’ findings on aid-dependency, I will solicit, from an emic\(^2\) perspective, in-depth knowledge from Haitian writers and writers with Haitian affinity.

I will make use of four analytical tasks of the pastoral cycle in practical theology.\(^3\) They will help to analyse, discuss and therefore shape the structure of the portfolio. Referring to the Article, the first two tasks of the pastoral cycle will sustain its framework. They are the descriptive-empirical task which asks the question as to what is going on in HP and the interpretative task which addresses the question as to why this is going on in HP.

I will anticipate theoretical categories to emerge from the descriptive-empirical task which will

---


\(^2\) This perspective will galvanize the voices of Haitian Protestants as insiders. Their local perception will be instrumental to understand and explore the aid-dependency reality. Fetterman, *Ethnography*, p.20

incorporate descriptions and evidences of the reality of aid-dependency, covering its nature, functionality, ethos, impact and future existence in HP. Subsequently, in the interpretative task, these descriptively based theoretical categories will be analysed and synthetized with emerging data from the literature on general aid-dependency with a view to elaborating on the hypothesis.

This initial hypothesis will further be the object of an empirical scrutiny which will be undertaken in dialogue with field-data arising from a multi-disciplinary method of data collection. With clarity, I will embed this method in Section Two, consisting of Chapters 3, 4, and 5. Whereas the outcome of Section One will culminate in a literature-based hypothesis, the outcome of Section Two will provide empirical-based core themes to confirm or refute the hypothesis in order to arrive at a rigorous conclusion in response to the research question.

Finally, Section Three will comprise Chapters 6 and 7 in which I will return to the remaining tasks of the pastoral cycle. I refer to the normative task which asks the question: What ought to be going on in HP? and the pragmatic task which addresses the question: How might we respond? At this point, in Chapter 6, I will carry out a theological reflection on aid-dependency’s practices and the envisaged transformational possibilities. Subsequently, I will consider in Chapter 7 a pragmatic response to the existing reality of Chapter 1. This means, I will engage in a discussion on the hypothesis, considering the solution-based recommendations of writers and the participants’ hope-built clamours for change through the lens of my reflexivity. This discussion will embody freedom as a pivot, that is, freedom for aid-positivity from the entanglements of inhibitive aid-modalities, freedom for HP from aid-dependency’s practices and by extension freedom for Haiti from a disempowering socio-economic paradigm.

The subject of aid-dependency has attracted the rigour of this multi-disciplinary methodology. I will therefore proceed to bring these scientific components of the research study into focus
with a view to exploring the nature of aid-dependency in HP with a particular focus on a Methodist perspective.
Section One: Exploration of Aid-dependency’s Features

Chapter 1. Literature Review

Introduction
I approach the literature review as a qualitative methodological analysis of aid-dependency which, from my initial observation, co-exists with varied factors, namely disempowering socio-economics and growth, scarcity and prosperity, and oppression and liberation. It further creates an unavoidable but uneven partnership between the rich and the poor, globally. This academic exercise assists me in analysing relevant scholarly publications which interweave these varied factors as interchangeable variables in the significant existence which aid-dependency has, in my observation, acquired. It provides me with a catalogue of discourses, concepts, languages and modalities which are both integral to the search for the functionality of aid-dependency and, thus, are instrumental in helping to answer the research question.

In order to analytically study writers’ arguments in these selected publications and to identify aid-based conceptual categories that underpin aid-dependency, I delineate the literature on the subject in two subdivisions of datasets. They are (1) the literature on general aid-dependency and (2) the literature on aid-dependency in Haiti. In the ensuing paragraphs, I examine the first subdivision.

1.1 Literature on General Aid-Dependency

Introduction
In this subdivision, I analyse arguments, adopted by writers, to elucidate the intricacies of the nature and impact of aid-dependency and follow the trajectory of its activity to determine, at every stage, the rationale which has substantiated its meaning, purpose and crystallization.
Writers advocate ending aid-dependency,\(^4\) local sustainability,\(^5\) the welfare of the whole rather than of a chosen few,\(^6\) change to aid’s systemic problems,\(^7\) and aid-generosity.\(^8\) Others conceive aid-dependency as the silent killer of growth\(^9\) and planners’ failure in contrast to searchers’ success.\(^10\) Altogether, whatever their advocacy, they equally concur on the importance of alleviating immediate sufferings from natural disasters and human-driven crises.

This means, I analyse aid-eras chronicled and substantiated by writers whose essential contributions subsume key features of aid-dependency as a world’s reality. They are (1) pre-1949 aid-era, (2) 1950-2000 aid-era, and (3) post-2000 aid-era.\(^11\)

\(1.1.1\) Pre-1949 Aid-Era

In this feature there is a limited repertoire of historical literature, in comparison with post-1949’s emerging aid-literature, to substantiate activities of aid-giving prior to 1949. However, the existing repertoire appeals to my academic curiosity to consider applicable aid-related initiatives as historical underpinnings of this aid-era. Based on these initiatives I analyse and discuss two sectors of aid-providers, namely the church and the church’s overseas missions.

The Church - Within the first century, the Early Church had consistently been predisposed, as prompted by the Spirit, to showing compassion and care for people in need. Caring through aid was a dominant motivating factor of the believing community. Notwithstanding the

\(^4\) Yash Tandon, *Ending Aid Dependence* (South Africa: Fahamu, 2008)
\(^5\) Glen Schwartz, *When Charity Destroys Dignity, Overcoming Unhealthy Dependency in the Christian Movement* (Milton Keynes, UK: AuthorHouse, 2007)
\(^6\) Justin Thacker, ‘From Charity to Justice: Revisited’, *Transformation* 32:2 (2015), pp.112-127
\(^7\) Roger C. Riddell, *Does Foreign Aid Really Work?* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008)
\(^9\) Dambisa Moyo, *Dead Aid: Why Aid is Not Working and How There is Another Way for Africa* (London: Penguin, 2009)
significance of aid-generosity in the Old Testament theology, in fact guided by it, the substance of Acts 2:43-47 and 4:32-37, in the New Testament, attests to its acts of generosity and compassion towards those in need. In addition to its regular charitable giving, the Church attended to emergencies such as the famine in Jerusalem for which Paul took up collections (1 Corinthians 16:1-4) of which the context is 2 Corinthians 8:1-15. The Church then considered ‘remembering the needy’ to be among its most basic moral and theological imperatives of existence (Galatians 2:10).

As time went by, religious organizations pioneered aid-giving and placed huge emphasis on charitable services. As I will later demonstrate, there are indications, however, that the motivation of this typology of aid was distinct from the aid ethos of the modern aid-era. Meanwhile, under Pope Cornelius (251-253), the Church supported hundreds of widows, orphans and needy people, providing them with episcopal alms in the substance of daily bread, coins, and clothes, ‘hostels for the poor’ accommodations. In the medieval period (500-1500), charities were administered through the Church or through church-based organizations known as confraternities. Still, social welfare programmes were handled through a variety of intermediate agencies, including guilds, lay religious groups and monasteries.

After the Reformation (1517-1648), Protestantism, alongside Roman Catholicism, gave continuity to works of charity all the way into the late nineteenth century and even the twentieth century. The examples of medieval monasteries and of the Reformation showed that dealing

---

12 Leviticus 25, Deuteronomy 14:28-29 & 15:7-11 & Isaiah 58:6-7
14 Finn, Almsgiving, p.76
15 Ellen Decraene ‘Religious Confraternities and Spiritual Charities in Early Modern Aalst’ in Diana B. Presciutti (ed.), Space, Place, and Motion: Locating Confraternities in the Late Medieval and Early Modern City (Netherlands, Leiden: Brill, 2017), pp.88-89
16 Finn, Almsgiving, p.24
with poverty involves more than just feeding the poor; it requires economic structures that promote human flourishing holistically.

However, the Church was not the sole institution which gave systematic and consistent aid-assistance to the poor. Aid-literature confirmed, for example, that secular aid-organizations and governments followed suit with their public display of compassion. However, from the days of the Early Church, and in many places in the world, the world church has been at the forefront of poverty relief. In fact, the Scriptures demonstrate that aid-giving was the domain of the church first before it has become a tool of service to secular aid-institutions.

The Church’s Overseas Missions - Writers argue that the need for aid has been exacerbated by the behaviour of foreign missionaries who ensured that imported infrastructures and the message they epitomized yielded the envisaged transformation. In their affluence, foreign missionaries established and financed churches, schools, theological institutions and charitable projects which, rightly so, functioned according to their managerial identity and structure of governance. As such, Glen Schwartz argues that western missionaries took with them to Low Income Countries [hereafter LICs] a very expensive structure or ‘box’ of church governance.

21 The box includes foreign policies and traditions as constituents of local churches. Schwartz, When, pp.8-15
Whenever indigenous missions in LICs had been expanded and needed to be sustained within this structure the LIC churches could not afford.

Glen Schwartz contends that ‘Many church leaders in mission-established institutions have almost an unmanageable legacy without sufficient local funding to successfully carry it on’.\textsuperscript{22} Customarily, the LIC Christians turned to Christians in High Income Countries [hereafter HICs] for aid-support with a view to sustaining the mission establishments, legacies and missional paths, which the HIC Christians had created. Glen Schwartz claims that ‘It is immoral to create an unchangeable “box”, turn it over to local leaders, and then blame them when they fail to manage it successfully’.\textsuperscript{23} Consequently, as part of new propositions of the emerging nature of aid, in addition to being an offering to the poor, aid-giving was used to pay salaries of missionaries and sustain the mission infrastructures of HICs at the heart of the LICs’ cultures.

However, in this aid-era, Ragumamu reminds us that, largely, up to 1949, ‘aid-giving was an unstructured affair’.\textsuperscript{24} It was a distinctive ministry of the kingdom of God.\textsuperscript{25} With time, new insights became integrated into aid-giving such that it has become subservient to dependency. These insights conceptualized the transition from the pre-1949 aid-era to the 1950-2000 aid-era.

\subsection*{1.1.2 1950-2000 Aid-Era}

In the second half of the 20\textsuperscript{th} century, I find the defining characteristics between church-based organizations and governments to be less well-defined. In fact, many church-based organizations gradually got re-designated Non-Governmental Organizations [hereafter NGOs]

\begin{itemize}
\item\textsuperscript{22} Schwartz, \textit{When}, p.34
\item\textsuperscript{23} Schwartz, \textit{When}, p.10
\item\textsuperscript{24} Ragumamu, \textit{Lethal}, p.41
\item\textsuperscript{25} Finn, \textit{Almsgiving}, p.174
\end{itemize}
such that, altogether, in the 1970s the number of NGOs increased at an unprecedented rate. Many of them have become more and more dependent on government subsidies and were increasingly entrusted with responsibilities formerly borne by governmental agencies. Notwithstanding the dominant ethical nature of aid, writers reveal that aid-giving, during that period, became entrepreneurial, institutionalized, regulated and commercialized. President Harry Truman’s (1945-1953) speech provided a contour for industrialized-aid. From this perspective I offer the following analyses by referencing the Marshall Plan, development aid [hereafter DA], effectiveness of DA, and church and 1950-2000 aid-era.

The Marshall Plan - Aid-literature revealed that central to the Marshall Plan were injected aid-transfers via loan investments from the United States into major European countries whose socio-economic standing was receding in the wake of the Second World War’s devastation. Writers observe that these aid-transfers were at the heart of the reconstruction process that certainly contributed to the economic centre that Europe has become.

Thus, aid was received as a tool of infrastructural reconstruction within a shared and reciprocal socio-economic system characterised by western civilization and economic and political aspiration and, therefore, took on the nature of growth capital investment among socio-economic partners in which lenders and borrowers were benefiting industrialized investors.

---

26 For example, the religious organizations which began works in Zimbabwe as relief religious organizations in the 1960s and 1970s have become World Vision and Christian Care. Erica Bornstein, *The Spirit of Development: Protestant NGOs, Morality, and Economics in Zimbabwe* (New York: Routledge, 2003), p.14
However, what has become obvious to me from the literature is that the Marshall Aid did not appear to generate the crystallization of aid-dependency in HICs. Rather, it empowered the European aid-recipients to become distribution centres of DA.

\textit{Development Aid} - By the end of the 1950s, Europe joined the United States to apply the experience of the Marshall Plan in LICs under the pragmatism of development. Purposefully, development, designed in part by the HICs’ market ideology,\textsuperscript{31} obviously, became a focus of HIC governments in the aftermath of both the Second World War and the political independence of former European colonies. A dominant aim was that the former colonized lands would ‘modernize’, ‘develop’ and take their place alongside the nations earlier industrialized.\textsuperscript{32} However, according to Freeman, Bonk and Tandon the concept ‘development’ was not then a new market discourse; it dated far back to slavery.\textsuperscript{33} The question is: Will ‘development’ deliver this time?

With the upsurge of NGOs in the 1970s poverty aid-related initiatives entered, more calculatedly, the discourse of DA to which many aid-investment conditionalities were attached.\textsuperscript{34} In this respect, DA was initially subscribed to investments into nation building, with repeated emphases on the socio-economic, infrastructural and industrial development of LICs.\textsuperscript{35} Thus, DA, with a particular focus on poverty-alleviation and growth, took on the nature of financial loans, technical assistance and economic interventions, aiming to ease skill


\textsuperscript{34} Easterly, \textit{The White}, pp.31-38; Moyo, \textit{Dead}, pp.15-17; Tandon, \textit{Ending}, pp.25-27

\textsuperscript{35} Glennie, \textit{The Trouble}, pp.10-11
shortages and address weak institutional capacity in poor countries.\textsuperscript{36} Since poverty-alleviation initiatives could only be for the long-haul, DA has found in poverty-stricken countries the right bedding in which to mushroom into aid-dependency.

On the premise of poverty-alleviation initiatives, Africa and Latin America borrowed, from HICs, large sums of money so that their debt to transnational lending-agencies and banks increased at a cumulative rate of 20.4 percent.\textsuperscript{37} Freeman remarks that ‘Most African countries took loans in the 1970s to fund large infrastructural projects in the quest to develop their countries.’\textsuperscript{38} Furthermore, the total external debt of Brazil, Kenya and Pakistan was respectively 3.3, 0.2 and 3.1 billion dollars in 1970. By 2000, this had risen to 238, 7.5 and 32.1 billion dollars respectively – an average increase of nearly 4,000 percent.\textsuperscript{39} Meanwhile, Africa’s debt service reached around US$8 billion in 1982.\textsuperscript{40} In this trend, Moyo argues: ‘The debt crisis threatened to undermine the very foundations of global financial stability’\textsuperscript{41}

However, owing to poor infrastructure and scarce resources which limited their capacity to honour their debts, LICs defaulted.\textsuperscript{42} In their interventions, HICs resolved to the implementation of debt-relief or debt-cancellation offers and reduction in foreign-aid. This debt-relief, combined with the massive increase of DA, underlined growing donors’ efforts at ‘capacity building’ in Highly Indebted Poor Countries [hereafter HIPC] called the ‘Big Push’ in the 1950s and 1960s.\textsuperscript{43} In the terms of the HIPC Initiative, launched in 1996, multilateral

\begin{thebibliography}{99}

\bibitem{Glennie} Glennie, \textit{The Trouble}, pp.116-123
\bibitem{Moyo} Moyo, \textit{Dead}, p.18
\bibitem{Freeman} Freeman, ‘The Pentecostal’ in \textit{Pentecostal}, p.4
\bibitem{JamesCypher} James Cypher, \textit{The Process of Economic Development}, 4\textsuperscript{th} ed. (Oxford: Routledge, 2014), p.616
\bibitem{Thacker} Thacker, \textit{Global}, p.73
\bibitem{Moyo2} Moyo, \textit{Dead}, p.18
\bibitem{Moyo3} Moyo, \textit{Dead}, p.18
\bibitem{Besides} Besides, in the 1970s OPEC countries raised the price of crude oil. Resulting from this, increased funds became available to western banks for spending and LICs became their ideal investment targets which went into excess borrowings. Dewi Hughes, \textit{God of the Poor, a Biblical Vision of God’s Present Rule} (Milton Keynes: OM Publishing, 2006), pp.162-163; Riddell, \textit{Does}, pp.32-33
\end{thebibliography}
transnational lending-agencies and governments worked together to reduce the external debt burdens of the most HIPCs to sustainable levels.\textsuperscript{44}

HICs resolved to carry out intensive fiscal measures. Enforced by Structural Adjustment Programmes [hereafter SAPs], these measures were carried out by indebted nations in their fiscal spending.\textsuperscript{45} Debt-relief, thus, has been transacted as DA and therefore was further subject to tight aid-conditionalities.\textsuperscript{46} For Riddell, ideological conditions tied to these concessionary loans and grants, treated as DA, affected the value of aid-giving. He concludes that aid was no longer aid but a business trade tool as the total cost of the commercialization of aid consistently went higher.\textsuperscript{47}

Alongside DA, poverty-reduction and growth, aid-as-political expediency was a goal of HICs. Aid-giving, grants and intergenerational debt-relief, on the axis of aid-dependency, were commodified in the cause of political and national interests. These aid-as-politically-motivated tools effected donor countries’ investment motivations, secured political alignment during the Cold War and justified, in addition to SAPs, interventions in poor countries.\textsuperscript{48} Tandon adds ‘Military or political aid is self-serving; it serves the interest of the provider of military hardware and military interventions’.\textsuperscript{49}

Meanwhile, apart from a few examples of success, which I will later analyse, DA, in its varied nature, has not generated the aggregate anticipated growth outcomes; it did not ‘modernize’ nor ‘develop’ former colonized lands, in brief, it has not yet delivered. The complexities of the

\textsuperscript{45} SAPs ensured that countries liberalized and integrated their economies into the global economy. Freeman, ‘The Pentecostal’ in Pentecostal, p.4; Charles Gore ‘The Rise and Fall of the Washington Consensus as a Paradigm for Developing Countries’, \textit{World Development} 28:5 (2000), pp.789-804
\textsuperscript{46} Tandon, \textit{Ending}, pp.25-27; Riddell, \textit{Does}, pp.94-100
\textsuperscript{47} Riddell, \textit{Does}, pp.100-101
\textsuperscript{48} However, this motivation changed after the Cold War. Moyo, \textit{Dead}, p.14; Glennie, \textit{The Trouble}, pp.22-23; Riddell, \textit{Does}, pp.91-106
\textsuperscript{49} Tandon, \textit{Ending}, p.29
conditionalities of these aid-investments with which the impoverished LICs’ infrastructures and human resources could not cope, heightened the need for HICs’ political, economic and structural interventions. Consequently, Easterly indicates that, ‘Failed intrusions of the West provided the motivation for the West to become even more intrusive’.  

In a context of perennial and intensified poverty, the creeping failure of HICs to recognize and affect the root causes of poverty threw, as highlighted earlier, LICs, in the 70s and 80s, into an unprecedented debt-crisis. Thus, in the name of development, the impoverished LICs, further disempowered by hefty debts, have been constantly turning to HICs for debt-relief and more emergency and DA-types. This process has become a foundational pillar of aid-dependency.

Effectiveness of Development Aid - I now return to evidence of success generated by aid. Despite writers’ accounts and experiences of partial reforms and recurrent failures in DA circles, it must be noted, that aid-literature substantiated the effectiveness of secular aid-modalities in this aid-era. Certain non-profit organizations which often operated in opposition to nation states used DA to promote human rights, peace in post-war contexts, sustainable development and environmental objectives. They represented a new empowering force for democracy, social and economic justice. They offered opportunities to nations to engage in creating their own civil societies. Equally, transnational NGOs have been linked with indigenous organizations outside HICs in Europe and America. Their capacity to give voice to victims of authoritarian regimes, to protest economic exploitation and to resist the powers of western corporations and governments and the local elites has highlighted the effectiveness of global aid-giving policies. 

50 Easterly, The White, p.239
Further studies within aid-effectiveness look at links between aid and wellbeing outcomes and high-quality public institutions in countries with sound fiscal foundations.\textsuperscript{53} Other well-known and influential aid-growth studies generally concluded that per capita growth in recipient countries would be lower in the absence of aid. This outcome is contingent on the quality of recipient country’s policies, structural vulnerability, institutions, climatic conditions and political stability.\textsuperscript{54} However, McGillivray argues that more generally, the potential impact of aid on population subgroups within aid-recipient countries is still substantially absent in the aid-effectiveness literature. Very little is known about these impacts.\textsuperscript{55} Aligned with this argument, writers advise that many Latin American and Sub-Saharan Africa countries have not seen the expected results in terms of poverty-reduction and growth in this aid-era.\textsuperscript{56}

\textit{Church and 1950-2000 Aid-Era -} Meanwhile, the church response to the HICs’ policies of DA and poverty-alleviation initiatives, followed by the debt-crisis, has been manifold.\textsuperscript{57} However, I limit my discussion on the following theological exchanges and realities.

--


\textsuperscript{55} McGillivray, \textit{Achieving}, p.85


In this aid-era, firstly, this poverty aid-driven alleviation met the support of large groups of churches and Christian NGOs worldwide.\textsuperscript{58} In fact, having been brought into the HICs’ principle of development and poverty-alleviation, churches and church NGOs in former colonising countries adopted similar strategies, aiming to develop their counterparts in the world.\textsuperscript{59} As I alluded to earlier, their aid-investment aimed both to give continuity to established missional church structures and projects and to gradually effect, in a generic sense, development growth and poverty-alleviation initiatives.

Secondly, theologians, dominantly from LICs, had difficulties assimilating and applying the principles of the theology of development as designed by HICs, even though church-based development agencies continued to work through development themes.\textsuperscript{60} LIC theologians argued that the theology of development began with HICs and therefore has been imperialistic and imposed and as a result led to partial reforms, hefty debts and re-colonization.\textsuperscript{61} The Federation of Asian Bishops’ Conferences in 1970:

\begin{center}
Stressed from the very beginning the importance of being ‘the Church of the poor’ and has criticized development approaches that seem biased towards the elite and widen income differences.\textsuperscript{62}
\end{center}

\textsuperscript{60}Gutiérrez, ‘The Meaning’ in \textit{In Search}, p.152; Cooper, \textit{Controversies}, p.69
\textsuperscript{62}Robert Calderisi, \textit{Earthly Mission, the Catholic Church and World Development} (London: Yale University Press, 2013), p.151
Dussel further opines that DA has been concerned with partial reforms which ‘were worthless, causing more harm than good’.  

Furthermore, LIC theologians establish that their underdevelopment has been the direct effects of HICs’ development strategy and ethos. Consequently, Gatu requests the withdrawal of HIC Christians from the Third World church for a period of at least five years. He argues:

We cannot build the church in Africa on alms given by overseas churches, nor are we serving the cause of the Kingdom by turning all bishops, general secretaries, moderators, presidents, superintendents into good enthusiastic beggars, by always singing the tune of poverty in the churches of the Third World.

In response, Buhlmann implies that mission development was in crisis:

The missions in Africa have for many years been in the crossfire of criticism. In an earlier age they were much admired, but nowadays they are attacked and accused, by radical Christians, by cold atheists and by black nationalists.

Buhlmann’s assessment is somewhat a mistaken judgment. Missions were not much admired but tolerated until viable alternatives sprang up. For example, resulting from their hesitation to fully embrace foreign missions’ initiatives, the African church had a modest growth spur in missions’ times. Increasing growth was rather registered in the post-independent church.

The probing question then was: should LICs spend their energy, fulfilling the terms and loan-modalities of DA, drafted by HICs?

Thirdly, in response to that question the debate, which polarized HIC/LIC theologians and churches in general, gave rise to at least one stream of theological praxis. Christians in LICs, 

---


66 In recent years, Christian resurgence seemed to proceed without western organizational structures. Lamin Sanneh, *Whose Religion is Christianity?* (Cambridge: William B.Eermans Publishing, 2003), pp.55-76. However, while some form of western structures has been broken, it is an illusion to confirm the absence of western influences while DA continued to sustain the African Church.

particularly in Latin America, called for liberation from oppression of systemic and structural
evil that caused poverty, thus, creating the need for DA.68 These concerns for liberation
emerged from the experience of the poorest, linked directly to their faith, theological reflection,
and contextual missional practices. Given their oppressive conditions, these concerns were not
addressed by HICs’ partial reform message advocated by the theology of development.69

However, aid-literature indicated that due to an emphasis on ‘preferential option for the poor’
and ‘social gospel’70 in liberation theology, many Christian leaders, Protestant and Roman
Catholic, began to view with deep suspicion the theology of liberation as evidence of attempts
to procure salvation by works rather than as evidence of social concern in the church.71
Moreover, other writers, while situating themselves within the liberation movement, criticize
it for its lack of concrete projects on-the-ground and opt for a ‘theology of reconstruction’, the
‘next step beyond mere liberation’ and the ‘need to adjust the market’ towards benefitting all
human beings.72

In this aid-era, the nature of aid-giving has consistently evolved to become a business trade
tool and a dependable bargaining mechanism applied by HICs to mitigate or exert political,
military and commercial influence.73 It has equally become a variable stimulus to facilitate
democratic rights and good governance in LICs in the 1990s. As the debate went on, for
Cooper, Boffs and Gutiérrez, aid is a relatively well-meaning but clearly misguided approach

68 See: Gustavo Gutierrez, A Theology of Liberation (Maryknoll: Orbis Books, 1973); Cooper, Controversies,
pp.43-66; Jules Casséus, Théologie de la Libération (Port-au-Prince, Presse Evangélique, 2004); Gifford,
Christianity, pp.131-144
69 Cooper, Controversies, p.44
70 However, in Rerum Novarum (15 May 1891), Roman Catholicism advocated equitable distribution of goods,
‘just wage’, and ‘better distribution of natural wealth’. This suggests that social teaching is not a new
dispensation of ministry, Calderisi, Earthly, pp.50-56
71 Bradley & Lindsley, For, p.54
2006); Jesse N. K. Mugambi, From Liberation to Reconstruction (Nairobi: East African Educational Publishers,
pp.97-98
73 Tandon, Ending, pp.25-27; Riddell, Does, pp.94-100
to the problem of poverty. It may even be counter-productive because it distracts us from the real task of economic and political revolution. All in all, aid, as we have seen throughout this aid-era, did not lose its worth, despite aid-misuse attempts, as an instrument of positivity, conceptualized in God’s compassion and economics.

The constant shift in aid-nature and aid-focus in aid-literature and the debates it triggered suggest that DA has not yet sufficiently fulfilled its mandate. I will carry forward this argument into the post-2000 aid-era for further in-depth analyses.

1.1.3 Post-2000 Aid-Era

In response to a sharp awareness of consistent global poverty, determined nations agreed to pursue the substantive aim of the Millennium Development Goals [hereafter MDGs] to halve acute poverty by 2015. Furthermore, the Sustainable Development Goals [hereafter SDGs], an expansion of MDGs, advocated an unprecedented poverty-eradication drive through the outline of a blueprint for development priorities until 2030. These two aid-development initiatives, MDGs and SDGs, have dominated this aid-era. I, therefore, propose to analyse the extent their existence has been subject to persistent global poverty and the extent aid-dependency has been the instrumentality of their strategy.

I further analyse their interdependencies and convergences which are crucial in evidencing their common strategy. One of these interdependencies consists of injecting more aid into the

---

75 One hundred and eighty-nine countries signed, in June 2000, MDGs. To materialize these goals, quantified aid-targets have been detailed in the following: income poverty, hunger, disease, lack of adequate shelter, exclusion and promoting gender equality and education. Available: http://www.imf.org/external/ns/search.aspx?NewQuery=MDGs+2015andsubmit= (accessed 1 July 2016)
LICs’ economies such that MDGs and SDGs have been a demonstration of the HICs’ and LICs’ renewed belief in the capacity of DA to generate poverty-reduction and growth. In this analysis, I bear in mind these two interlacing questions: Have the initiatives of MDGs and SDGs been a justification that DA in the 1970s, 1980s and 1990s did not meet its poverty-alleviation target? Judging from past experiences, the second question asks: Has DA been an inherently comprehensive socio-economic instrumentality to materialize poverty-reduction and growth?

This renewed belief has, therefore, solidified continuity with the previous aid-era. In this respect, the post-2000 aid-era has become the era of aid-optimism which has projected an aid rise, globally, from US$80 billion to US$195 billion by 2015.77 Calls for more Official Donor Assistance echoed in various parts of the UN transnational lending-agencies. The MDG proponents suggested that aid can be expected to improve outcomes across a wide variety of wellbeing indicators and across countries.78 As the fulfilment prospect of MDGs peaked in momentum and aid fund-raising campaigns79 got on the way, increase in aid-giving received a positive nudge.80 With the inclusion of debt-relief, the figures from Official Donor Assistance nearly tripled aid to Africa since 1999. Glennie and Tandon observe that this aid-era has seen the largest expansion of Official Donor Assistance since the committee was formed in 1960.81 Riddell further highlights that in 2005, the total quantity of aid provided by HICs topped the US$100bn mark for the first time ever, nearly doubling the amount of official aid given in the year 2001.82

---

77 Glennie, *The Trouble*, pp.12-13; Riddell, *Does*, pp.44-45
78 McGillivray, *Achieving*, p.85
80 ‘Jubilee 2000’, available: [http://advocacyinternational.co.uk/featured-project/jubilee-2000](http://advocacyinternational.co.uk/featured-project/jubilee-2000) (accessed 15 July 2017); ‘Drop the Debt’, available: [https://www.oxfam.org.uk/media-centre/press-releases/2013/05/make-poverty-history-and-g8-promises-was-it-all-really-worth-it](https://www.oxfam.org.uk/media-centre/press-releases/2013/05/make-poverty-history-and-g8-promises-was-it-all-really-worth-it) (accessed 15 July 2017). These campaigns generated waves of public opinions and protests which eventually led to favourable considerations being given to HIPC.
82 Riddell, *Does*, p.2
However, recent studies have confirmed that increases in aid generated unproductive outcomes and dysfunctional effects.\(^8^3\) It is argued that it has facilitated neo-patrimony, that is, the vertical distribution of resources that gave rise to patron-client networks based on a powerful individual or party.\(^8^4\) Alongside neo-patrimony it can be argued that increases in aid generated a form of resource curse, that is, unearned income undermines incentives to build local institutions and perhaps a social contract with the population.\(^8^5\) Based on these arguments, writers conclude that increases in aid could be viewed as not only a crutch delaying institutional development, but as potentially undercutting those efforts. Interwoven with onerous aid-modalities, evidence suggests that increases in aid have been a valid reason why large volume of aid devoted to capacity building has not had a bigger impact on improving these public institutions and transforming them into economic prosperity producers.\(^8^6\) This aid-optimism has challenged the workability of DA programmes and the materialization of MDGs. McGillivray gives this update:

> Each of these goals [MDGs’] is defined in terms of a specific target to be achieved by 2015. While there has been tremendous progress in many countries, overall global progress towards achieving the MDG targets has been mixed, with many countries well behind the schedule for 2015.\(^8^7\)

While acute poverty and human suffering have continued to defy world’s morality, the focus in this aid-era has been on more effective use of increases in aid.\(^8^8\) However, the mixed records


\(^8^7\) See also McGillivray, Achieving, p.1

\(^8^8\) Riddell, Does, pp.1-4
of success of the previous aid-era provided neither incentives nor guarantee that DA, this time, would bring to pass the anticipated goals. This said, referring to 1950-2000 aid-era, indexes of unchanged variables remained in force in the context of this aid-optimism.

I analyse three of these indexes which challenged the workability of DA. They are the debt-massage, imperialistic approach to debt-crisis, and heartfelt imperative.

The Debt-Massage – Aid-literature explained:

HIPC Initiative in Africa has little to do with enhancing human development, reducing poverty, or even increasing economic growth in the debtor countries. Rather, it is designed to massage debt figures down to a level where they would be deemed ‘sustainable’ again according to the criteria of the International Monetary Fund [IMF].

The argument is that if in 2002, Africa still had US$295 billion in debt, then the HIPC Initiative has been a strategy to keep poor countries sufficiently solvent so that they can continue paying their debts to international creditors. In support of this argument, a research conducted by Jubilee (2000) showed that the first five recipients of HIPC Initiative assistance would continue paying more than half a billion dollars every year to external creditors. Furthermore, while, between 2008 and 2011, there was a modest drop in total international net debts, since 2011, they have increased from US$11.3 trillion to US$13.8 trillion in 2014. The estimate given was that in 2015, this figure would rise to US$14.7 trillion.


Furthermore, Sub-Saharan Africa makes a net loss of around US$58 billion each year to the rest of the world.\textsuperscript{94} While it receives around US$134 billion each year in official aid, government loans, remittances and foreign direct investment, it pays out around US$192 billion over the same period. US$21 billion of this is in debt service payments, not that much less than the US$30 billion. I therefore ask: Is this regulated debt-massage the right tool for economic justice? In response, the literature rather proposed that, alongside resource curse, neo-patrimony, and excess borrowings, debt-massage has been a potential cause of disempowerment of more than half of LICs’ populations. Ironically, this has been the LICs’ economic context of indebtedness in which the targets of MDGs were expected to be met.

\textit{Imperialistic Approach to Debt-Crisis} - Referring to the debt-crisis in the 1970s and 1980s, SAPs were a strategy of HICs to regulate and assess the LICs’ competencies and qualifications for funding with a view to fulfilling MDGs.\textsuperscript{95} SAPs had been built on western values\textsuperscript{96} such that the western aid-centred plan was portrayed as the solution.\textsuperscript{97} Tandon contends that these values should not be imposed on LICs from outside, and certainly not loaded on to the wagon called DA, followed by sanctions against those who fall short of western donor expectations.\textsuperscript{98} Thacker further substantiates the argument:

\begin{quote}
We can see the same neo-imperialistic attitude at play when the West demands that African countries adopt the same human rights agenda as they, or when the World Bank and IMF demand that other countries adopt the same social and political institutions as the West has done.\textsuperscript{99}
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{95} In order to receive funding for SDGs, governments have been asked to create a sound macroeconomic environment and robust, sustainable growth. Available: \texttt{https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/post2015/transformingourworld} (accessed 25 August 2017)
\textsuperscript{97} Aidan Foster-Carter, ‘From Rostow to Gunder Frank: Conflicting Paradigms in the Analysis of Underdevelopment’, \textit{World Development} 4:3 (1976), pp.167-180
\textsuperscript{98} Tandon, \textit{Ending}, pp.128-153
\textsuperscript{99} Thacker, \textit{Global}, p.161
The message is that the rest of the world will be developed once it has aped this western model of economic, ethical and political modernisation. ‘Good governance is nothing less than an institutional embodiment of the values of the western enlightenment’.100 Witham expresses it this way: ‘The attempt to squeeze all human behaviour into one economic model has been called “economic imperialism”’.101

Aid, alongside aid-dependency, has changed its nature to acquire the characteristics of an imperialistic strategy. In this, HICs applied set rules which, as evidence suggests, undermined the poor’s self-determination and worth. Despite indicators of aid-dependency’s effectiveness, acute poverty and imperialistic measures continued to defy world’s morality. It is perhaps fair to suggest that as top-down economic planning solutions and hefty debts to HICs continue, new sets of goals, on the axis of aid-instrumentality, will potentially succeed SDGs in 2030.102

Heartfelt Imperative - In some circles, DA arises from a perceived spiritual/heartfelt imperative. Harries posits ‘As in the activity of sharing the gospel, the continuation of development interventions is not dependent on their success, but arises from a perceived spiritual/heartfelt imperative’.103 This suggests that despite concerns raised over oppressive and systemic root causes of economic deprivation and the inequity of the imperialistic approach, there is a branch of the HIC Christians for which poverty-eradication in LICs is not a pragmatic resolve but interpreted through the lens of a perceived spiritual/heartfelt imperative. This underwrites the attitude of missionaries who approached their mission to the impoverished with the notion that ‘The poor you will always have with you’.

103 Jim Harries, Vulnerable Mission (California: William Carey Library, 2010), p.100
In contrast, Christian proponents of increases in aid heavily emphasized longer-term objectives, especially economic growth.\textsuperscript{104} They argued that aid is a fundamental part of the development of poor countries. It helps them to reach adequate levels of domestic mobilization in education, food security, health, public infrastructure development, agriculture and rural development over an appropriate time horizon. It paves the way for robust growth.\textsuperscript{105} Writers with similar mission affinity espouse development as an economic antidote to poverty.\textsuperscript{106}

However, there is much resonance between those two motivations - aid-driven heartfelt imperative and aid-based economic growth - as both are rooted in the perpetuation of an aid-system that fosters dependency. In fact, with its limited degree of success, DA, in religious and secular fields, has given agency, diffidently, to the heartfelt imperative model.

**Conclusion**

Aid-literature provided evidence that aid within the pre-1949 aid-era sustains the livelihood of the poor. In contrast, and consistent with the foregoing historical aid-conditionalities, aid-dependency within the last two aid-eras, in a generic sense, arguably disempowered the impoverished.

Therefore, the discourses of a dominant number of churches and church-writers, in support of aid-centred development - Europeanized and Americanized - unconsciously endorse neo-imperialistic motivations which sustain disempowerment as a characteristic of aid-dependency. In fact, churches may have not yet realized that the ethos of the theology of development,

\textsuperscript{104} Corbett & Fikkert, *When*, pp.161-172; Rowell, *To Give*, pp.199-212
\textsuperscript{105} Glennie, *The Trouble*, p.17; Gifford, *Christianity*, pp.90-106
rooted in HICs’ economic ingenuity, is arguably a replica of a secular approach to
development. In this context, the response to global poverty, either from secular or church-
based writers, has been articulated, arising from a heartfelt imperative, to accommodate the
economic aid-surplus of HICs. On evidence, the outcome has disempowered the socio-
economic thrust of the economically poor.

It can be further suggested that until a Christian response has been initiated as a redemptive
empowering paradigm to HICs’ secular aid-based model, the positivity of aid, as an instrument
of God’s kingdom, will consistently be overshadowed by narrow personal and national
interests.¹⁰⁷ Therefore, based on foregoing aid-literary evidence, I proceed to identify a central
hypothesis for the thesis portfolio. It is: Aid-dependency has disempowered LICs. I now turn
to the literature on aid-dependency in Haiti to potentially describe other features of the
hypothesis.

1.2 Literature on Aid-Dependency in Haiti

Introduction
My analytical study of writers’ aid-literary works on Haiti, including Haitian-writers,
scrutinizes the mercantile activities of foreign presence [hereafter FP] in Haiti.¹⁰⁸ FP has been
defined by leveraging of typical foreign interventions - military, commercial, political and
economic - which in the long-term, destabilized the corporate socio-economic capital of Ayiti’s
and Haiti’s residents.¹⁰⁹ Arising from this literary study I identify two precursors to aid-

¹⁰⁷ However, the current ‘Pentecostal Explosion’ in Africa offers an alternative. It does not separate religion
from development but sees development in terms of ‘What God wants for Africa’ and Gospel Prosperity.
Freeman, ‘The Pentecostal’ in Pentecostal, p.4
¹⁰⁸ For more on FP, see ‘First Lens’ p.175
¹⁰⁹ Ayiti was the indigenous Taíno-Arawak name for Haiti prior to the arrival of Columbus. Later, in 1697,
France renamed the west of Hispaniola St. Domingue. Henry Deschamps (ed.), Histoire d’Haïti (Port-au-Prince:
Frères de l’Instruction Chrétienne, 1942), pp.17-21
dependency, namely (1) slavery and (2) economic disempowerment. They generated fertile conditions for dependency to flourish. I highlight their impacts in the ensuing paragraphs.

1.2.1 Precursor to Aid-Dependency - Slavery

Writers report that Spanish adventurers, Christopher Columbus and his acolytes, operating as FP took possession of Ayiti which they renamed to Hispaniola [Little Spain] in 1492.\textsuperscript{110} FP’s complete dominance immediately ensued. Later, in the 16\textsuperscript{th} century, its continued supremacy, through the chains of slavery, went unabated while the foundation for a socio-economic deprivation, peculiar to Haiti, was laid. Within this socio-economic context, slavery ushered in three intricately interwoven elements. They are wealth extraction from St. Domingue, aid-dependency in St. Domingue, and mental dependency in Haiti.

**Wealth Extraction from St. Domingue** - The advent of slavery is synonymous with FP’s consistent extraction of wealth from St. Domingue.\textsuperscript{111} Published literature has confirmed the claim that the extraction of St. Domingue’s natural resources impoverished its residents and Haitians for years to come. This will be explored subsequently.

Writers point out that St. Domingue was France’s richest colony, in fact, one of the richest places in the world, in the eighteenth century.\textsuperscript{112} With an estimated population of 30,000 whites, 30,000 freed mulattoes\textsuperscript{113} and 450,000 slaves\textsuperscript{114} in 1791 the territory produced US$800


\textsuperscript{111} Prior to the slave trade, Spanish adventurers extracted natural wealth from Hispaniola. Deschamps, *Histoire*, pp.20-25


\textsuperscript{113} Mulattoes were Haitians who were born of white and black parents or of two mulatto parents. Deschamps, *Histoire*, pp.45-50

million in exports in today’s equivalence. St. Domingue brought more revenue to the French exchequer than all of Britain’s overseas territories put together.\textsuperscript{115} Nicknamed, ‘pearl of the Antilles’, St. Domingue provided 60 percent of the world’s coffee and 40 percent of the sugar imports of France.\textsuperscript{116} St. Domingue consisted of natural resources, people and free labour and was a socio-economic colonial stronghold, a type of HIC. Rather ironically, St. Domingue was then France’s chief ‘aid’ provider or ‘wealth’ creator, all at the expense of the sweat, blood, dignity of life of the enslaved St. Domingue residents [hereafter ESRs]. This ‘aid’, which included mineral resources, was forcefully extracted, leaving St. Domingue/Haiti in economic despair.\textsuperscript{117} In economic terms, ‘St. Domingue did not exist for the welfare of its inhabitants but for that of outsiders’.\textsuperscript{118}

It is in this epistemological socio-historical context that writers explain how St. Domingue/Haiti has been partly disempowered by FP’s capacity to dominate and plunder it in such a manner that, stripping St. Domingue, then, of its natural resources and its people of their livelihood has been normatively accepted by world powers.\textsuperscript{119} Impoverished St. Domingue, which was once an HIC, has become today’s Haiti, an LIC, a partner on the international scene, surviving on FP/NGO aid-conditionalities.

\textit{Aid-dependency in St. Domingue} - Wealth extraction in St. Domingue coexisted within a culture of dependency. Writers draw attention to view dependency as a colonial construct which shaped the lives, culture and mind-sets of ESRs. The dependency construct resulted from slave-owners’ dehumanising and fatal treatments which brought ESRs to a state of total

\textsuperscript{115} Thomson, \textit{Bonjour}, p.3; Griffiths, A View, p.69
\textsuperscript{116} Dorsainville, Manuel, p.1
\textsuperscript{117} André Louis, \textit{Voodoo in Haiti, Catholicism, Protestantism and a Model of Effective Ministry in the Context of Voodoo in Haiti} (Mustang, OK: Tate Publishing and Enterprises, 2007), p.27
\textsuperscript{119} Lionel R. James, \textit{The Black Jacobins}, 2nd ed. (New York: Vintage Books, 1989); Frantz Fanon, \textit{The Wretched of the Earth} (New York: Grove Press, 1963)
submissiveness, silence and dependency. Shilliam, for example, notes that enslavement ‘places humans in opposition to less-than-human natives and negroes’.

The more FP inflicted these fatal treatments on ESRs, the more ESRs, distinct and separate from the rebels and maroons, became, in their own eyes, less human and dependent objects and possessions of their owners. FP utilised silence as a tool of disempowerment and dependency. Resulting from this, ESRs lived on FP’s alleged aid-goodness. While there have been variations and distinctions in ESRs’ welfare, aid-goodness over the 400 years of enslavement, from one plantation to another, in most instances, constituted a mere subsistence livelihood. Their welfare consisted of inadequate food, clothing, shelter, medical care and poor lodging facilities in windowless, over-crowded, case à nègres [slaves quarters]. For all intents and purposes, it is safe to say that FP’s provisions of aid-goodness, on which ESRs solely depended, was a precursor to modern aid-dependency.

A perhaps less overt objective of the colonial agenda was to muffle ESRs and make them blank. This latent agenda was, with some exception, extremely successful. Shilliam explains that ‘making ‘‘blank’’ is a historical practice of colonial rule’, a mark of psychological torture.

---

121 Shilliam, ‘Race’, Millennium, p.23
123 Bellegarde, La Nation, pp.58-59
125 According to Kenechukwu ‘During slavery the scraps and leftovers of food and apparel went to the enslaved Africans. Today the crumbs, the fat from the used bones of western propaganda still are staples of the diet of the subaltern’. Available: http://spiritanfellowshipfortrugeglobalpeace.blogspot.co.uk/2018/01/professor-jideofokenechukwu-danmbazue.html (accessed 15 September 2016)
126 Shilliam, ‘Race’, Millennium, p.6
The fatal treatments aimed to do just that. They weakened the mental strengths and the coping techniques of ESRs to a point where the assimilation of dependency, for many of them, was perceived as a tolerable, thus, acceptable part of life. They became mentally blank and disempowered such that their ability to effect self-determination and to adapt, either consciously or unconsciously, was often hindered, and transferred to self-identification with their owners’ actions. In those experiences of mental blankness, though, the ESRs constantly battled to regain their true selves. This battle left them with permanent psychological scars.

Moreover, in their submissiveness, ESRs were inculcated with the notion of short-sightedness through an ingrained, need-driven, aid-dependency culture which was aid-dependency in a colonial mould. The owners preconditioned ESRs’ minds to live in the here-and-now socio-economic and physical need, with no vision for the future. This short-sightedness precluded the prospect of a generative future based on the fruit of their labour. Altogether, enslavement created a lifestyle of dependency for ESRs in which a colonial type of aid-dependency sustained by their owners’ alleged kindness and dominance was as a matter of life and death.

Mental Dependency in Haiti – Sequels of slavery in Haiti, nurtured by folklores, maxims and perennial slavery-driven circumstances, have mentally conditioned Haitian minds to self-disparage, self-destruct and therefore depend on foreigners for a menial existence. I highlight the following four examples, namely ‘Koupe tèt boule kay’ [behead then burn houses].

127 The majority seemed to have settled down to their labours with a tragic sense of psychological abandonment broken by their perceived hopeless situation’. Hilary Beckles, *Black Rebellion in Barbados: The Struggle Against 1627-1838* (Bridgetown: Antilles publications, 1984), p.6
128 See unsuccessful ERS’s rebellious attacks in Bellegarde, *La Nation*, pp.56-60
133 This was Jean-Jacques Dessalines’ tactic which culminated in the Haitian Revolution in 1804. It has today been practiced in Haiti’s socio-politics as a weapon of destruction in public mass protests, leaving Haiti in more deprivation. Theus, *ONG*, pp.73-79
‘Degage pa peche’ [getting by is not a sinful action],134 ‘Se sa nou leve jwen’ [This is what we have been taught],135 and ‘Nèg pa fè nèg konfyan’ [Haitians don’t trust other Haitians].136 Theus, Casséus, and Chanson recognize in these maxims constituents of socio-cultural realities which convey negativity in local relationships and embed residues of mental slavery, distrust and divisiveness. They fill the Haitian mind with the propensity for irresponsible attitudes towards their civic duty and, therefore, stimulate short-sightedness. As a result of this localized distrust and divisiveness, local mentalities customarily seek refuge in and reliance on foreign interventions.137

Theus further observes:

Physical liberation from the chains of slavery is one thing; getting rid of psychological imprints and sequels of slavery is another thing. Physical liberation, the first, had been realized after about three centuries. Is it also necessary that Haiti waits for three more centuries to free itself from the psychological imprints and sequels of slavery that are engraved in the spirit of many and remain, at the mental level, the new slavery chains which tie up this new nation, after its independence?138

Wah adds:

Historical circumstances and events of external origin, including the heritage and the psychological trauma of colonialism and the isolation of Haitian ideas and goods are specific causes of these problems in Haiti.139

Evidence suggests that Haitians have been historically independent but kept mentally enslaved - by internal, external and self-imposed forces - and therefore exist in ESRs’ world of aid-dependency.140 Writers call on the current and subsequent generations of Haitians to break the

---

134 This maxim permits the mind to pursue self-seeking goals at the expense of community well-being.
135 Socio-traditional values and activities must not be questioned nor changed.
137 Casséus, *Éléments*, pp.254-256 ; Louis, *Voodoo*, pp.70-73
138 Theus, *ONG*, p.72
140 See ‘Breaking the Disempowering Silence of Low Self-esteem’, p.261
disempowering mental chain which the heroes of independence did not or could not do. This mental chain still binds the Haitian population.\textsuperscript{141}

Therefore, based on literary evidence, altogether slavery and its attendant machinations of wealth extraction in St. Domingue, aid-dependency in St. Domingue and mental dependency in Haiti paved the way to the second precursor.

\textbf{1.2.2 Precursor to Aid-Dependency - Economic Disempowerment}

Economic disempowerment has been underpinned by early wealth extraction and modern wealth extraction from Haiti.

\textit{Early Wealth Extraction from Haiti} - Wealth extraction from Haiti is the extension of wealth extraction from St. Domingue. In either case, they represent a major challenge to Haiti’s economic growth.\textsuperscript{142} The literature highlighted different strategies of wealth extraction. These include (a) independence indemnity, (b) trade deals, and (c) United States Occupation (1915-1934). Each created albeit unique setbacks.

\textit{a. Independence Indemnity}

In the immediate aftermath of Haiti’s political independence, the emerging nation was denied state recognition until the President Jean-Pierre Boyer’s led-government sealed a treaty to agree an indemnity of 150 million gold francs payable to France.\textsuperscript{143} Farmer argues: ‘Imposing an indemnity on the victorious slaves was equivalent to making them pay with money that which

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
\item[\textsuperscript{142}] As a generic trend ‘Huge amounts of capital were generated by colonial extraction and nascent international trades’. Freeman, ‘The Pentecostal’ in \textit{Pentecostal}, p.17
\item[\textsuperscript{143}] Haiti’s new status was only recognised by France in 1825, Vatican in 1860, and United States in 1862 following the signing of the indemnity. Thomson, \textit{Bonjour}, p.133; Dorsainville, \textit{Manuel}, p.149; David Nicholls, \textit{From Dessalines to Duvalier, Race, Colour and National Independence in Haiti} (New Jersey: Macmillan Publishers, 1996), p.247; Paul Farmer, \textit{Haiti after the Earthquake} (USA: PublicAffairs, 2011), pp.xi-xii
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
they had already paid with their blood’. 144 This wealth extraction both set the precarious socio-economic foundation on which the embryonic nation started and initiated the creation of a poverty-centre to experiment aid-dependency. 145 Wah and Péan both argue that the inculcation of short-sightedness was the only thing that could have justified Boyer’s decision. 146 

I too, to some extent, concur with Wah’s and Péan’s criticism of Boyer. Nonetheless, even with the benefit of the hindsight, they have not identified, in that context, an alternative diplomatic and economic growth solution. Moreover, neo-colonial agendas proved quite early, to be a tool of wealth extraction from the emerging nation. Haiti has not only endured one of the longest periods of colonialism in modern history, but at the end of its colonial period, it has been made subject to neo-colonialism. 147 Therefore, it is not to be ruled out that Boyer’s decision was an economic strategy, albeit a very costly one, aimed at preventing pressurising neo-colonialists from regaining Haiti’s political control. 148

b. Trade Deals

Writers argue that Haitian leaderships allowed wealthier nations to play an imposing role in Haiti’s history of continued dispossession and disempowerment. 149 Wah for example explains:

---

144 Paul Farmer, ‘Who Removed Aristide’, The London Review of Books 26:8 (2004), pp.28-31; Although the indemnity was later reduced to 60 million francs, it sapped the national treasury and affected funds for education. Mercer Cook, Education in Haiti (U.S Office of Education, Bulletin No.1, 1948), pp.13-14
The economic leaders’ blinkered vision allowed the Germans to control and exploit 80 percent of Haiti’s international trade from 1883 to 1915. This short-term vision further led to the occupation of the island for 20 years, from 1915 to 1934, by the United States.\footnote{Wah, A la, p.53}

Further to this, and with specific reference to forestry resources, Béliard and Norris argue:

The timber trade was practiced during the 19th and the first half of the 20th century.\footnote{The establishment of the SHADA (Haitian-American Society of Agricultural Development), from 1941 to 1952, exploited 2/3 of Haiti’s Pines Forest, reaching nearly 102,000 hectares in 1943. Haiti exported in 1951, 843 tonnes of timber and 4258 tonnes of precious wood. Béliard & Norris, La Dégradation, p.8; Dyewood was harvested and exported from Haiti throughout the 19th century and has not been replaced. L. Dubois, ‘Who will speak’, available: https://www.nytimes.com/2016/10/18/opinion/who-will-speak-for-haitis-trees.html (accessed 21 May 2017)} From 1492 to the present day, the process of economic exploitation has developed at the expense of the country’s natural resources. It has resulted in a considerable regression of this heritage which today is largely destroyed.\footnote{Béliard & Norris, Dégradation, p.19. The destruction of Haiti’s forests has been going on for centuries. When the French colonized the island starting in the 17th century, they cut down trees for lumber and fuel, and mahogany for furniture. Dubois ‘Who’, https://www.nytimes.com/2016/10/18/opinion/who-will-speak-for-haitis-trees.html}

De-forestation and extraction of natural resources have engulfed Haiti in a culture of silence while the environment has consistently cried out for civic and political interventions.\footnote{In 1954, less than 9 percent of Haiti remained forested; it dropped below 7 percent in 1989. Before Columbus, forest had covered more that 75 percent of the land. Amy Willentz, The Rainy Season (London: Simon & Schuster, 1989), p.249} Again, Péan argues that, in their mental dependency, the inexperienced Haitian governments opted for the familiarity of foreign dependency and control by handing over, cheaply, thoughtlessly, Haiti’s political governance, natural resources and wealth to foreigners.\footnote{Péan, ‘L’Economie’ in Buteau, Saint-Éloi & Trouillot, Refonder, p.214}

\textit{c. United States Occupation (1915-1934)}

Thomson explains that:

In 1915, before the indemnity was acquitted, the United States, for political and security reasons, occupied Haiti and, as expected, tightened the influence of its presence over the nation’s future.\footnote{Thomson, Bonjour, p.3. For more on the Occupation see: Hans Schmidt, The United States Occupation of Haiti, 1915-1934 (New Jersey: Rutgers University Press, 1971); Roger Gaillard, Les Blancs Débarquent 1918-1919 (Port-au-Prince: Le Natal, 1982)}
The Occupation prompted Péralte to respond.\textsuperscript{156}

We demand our rights, unrecognized and flouted by unscrupulous Americans who by destroying our institutions, deprive the Haitian people of all their resources, and thrive on our name and our blood. With cruelty and injustice, the Yankees have for four years cast ruin and destruction on our territory.\textsuperscript{157}

This tenure of FP’s supremacy drove Haitians out of the country in search of livelihood in what were ironically, inhumane and fatal conditions, in neighbouring countries.\textsuperscript{158} The United States’ departure in 1934 signalled that Haiti, as in 1804, had once more, controlled its collective destiny. Certainly, that control was the anticipated hope, except that it came on the heels of another economic setback.\textsuperscript{159}

Writers agree that neo-colonialist pressure influenced Haitian leaders’ ill-advised political and commercial decisions which have, consequently, stripped Haiti, and its foundational institutions, of its socio-economic vitality.\textsuperscript{160} In this regard, Schuller reports the word of a Haitian participant, describing FP’s work in Haiti:

\begin{itemize}
\item We used to have Creole pig, they destroyed that.\textsuperscript{161}
\item We used to have factories that used to make tomato paste, they destroyed that.
\item We had factories that produced milk, they destroyed that.
\item Well we used to have factories to refine sugar, they destroyed that.
\end{itemize}

\textsuperscript{156} The nineteen years of American occupation introduced draconian schemes of forced labour which evoked the spectrum of slavery. In November 1919, the resistance leader Charlemagne Péralte was executed by the Americans, his body was roped to a door as a warning. The event only encouraged the wide-spread belief that the messianic Péralte had been crucified. Thomson, \textit{Bonjour}, p.61

\textsuperscript{157} Nichols, \textit{From}, p.149

\textsuperscript{158} For example, in 1920, the number of Haitian sugar workers in Cuba had reached some 36,000. Thomton, \textit{Bonjour}, pp.158-159. In 1937, the President Fulgencio Batista of Cuba began to expel Haitians after 100,000 of them had been settled there. Thomson, \textit{Bonjour}, p.27; Elizabeth Abbot, \textit{Haiti, the Duvaliers and their Legacy} (London: Robert Hale, 1991), pp.48-50

\textsuperscript{159} Despite some measurable progress, historians assert that the Occupation has economically and psychologically exploited Haiti. Schmidt, \textit{The United}, pp.154-188; Abbot, \textit{Haiti}, pp.48-50

\textsuperscript{160} Haitian institutions, besides the church, have been foreign aid-dependent, namely the police, the judiciary and the electoral commission. Available:
\url{https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=OCmycPirqHcCandpg=PA25andlpg=PA25anddq=aid+for+Haitian+policeandsource=blandots=F9UwO270Aeandsig=9Gv6HeyKw9PyZjc7JyaNKGBHIsMandhl=emandsa=Xandved=0ahUKEwjk-Ov-icvZAhlFbLAKHW0FCcQQ6AEIUuZAFr=v=onepageanddq=aid%20for%20Haitian%20policeanddf=false (accessed 10 March 2014); Buss & Gardner, \textit{Haiti}, pp.52-53


48
Let me ask you a question Mark if they are truly helping us, if it’s aid they give why don’t they support our national production instead so they can assure that the money goes toward production?\textsuperscript{162}

In compensation, Haiti has been presented with an aid-dependency package.

*Modern Wealth Extraction from Haiti* - Consistently impoverished, literary evidence showed that Haiti has, for a long while, relied on assistance and loans supplied by FP and transnational lending-agencies.\textsuperscript{163} Consequently, a feature of modern wealth extraction has emerged. It is the perennial debt-crisis which I proceed to examine.

- *Perennial Debt-crisis in Haiti*

Haiti’s perennial debt-crisis paralysed its economy. Again, in response to this economic paralysis, literary evidence showed that FP has prescribed DA and, therefore, aid-dependency to be Haiti’s economic redemption.

Soon after the indemnity to France was cleared, Haiti’s foreign debt skyrocketed from a modest US$4 million under President Dumarsais Estimé (1946-1950) to US$52 million under President Francois Duvalier (1957-1971). Furthermore, the external debt, which stood at US$52 million in 1957, increased to US$750 million in 1986 and then continued to grow, peaking at US$1,884 million in seven years. In addition, Haiti paid US$221 million for servicing the external debt between 1995 and 2001.\textsuperscript{164}

In the context of these huge debts which deepened Haiti’s poverty and therefore ushered in the reality of aid-dependency, FP was generous to President Jean-Claude Duvalier (1971-1986).


The United States alone rose its assistance to US$4.3 million from 3.8 million in 1971. Since that year, aid-assistance to Haiti rose every year until 1975 when it skyrocketed to US$35.5 million from US$9.3 million in 1974. Foreign-aid has since become Haiti’s major source of income. For example, while in 1980 aid to Haiti was about US$131 million, in 1983, the UNDP estimated foreign assistance to Haiti to be at least US$167 million, the United States Agency for International Development [hereafter USAID] placed it higher at US$200 million. In fact, assistance was meagre before 1990 by post-2000’s standards. From 1990 to 2003, Haiti received allotments of more than US$4 billion in aid-assistance from bilateral and multilateral sources. The World Bank has estimated that between 1969 and 2004 Haiti has received US$8.3 billion.

In 2009, Haiti had US$1.2 billion of its debts cancelled as a result of debt-relief campaigns. Other debts however, stood at US$900 million. In Haiti’s deadliest earthquake in 2010, Haiti’s debt had already been increased to US$1.15 billion. Further impoverished by the quake, public outcries led FP and transnational lending-agencies to drop all of Haiti’s outstanding debts. The belief was that this debt-relief, invested as DA, would increase the resources available to Haiti in order to eradicate poverty.

Meanwhile, these intergenerational debts and accumulated interests had to be settled. As a result, aid-dependency deepened as Haiti’s debt-crisis became unmanageable. In the 1980s,

---

165 Abbott, *Haiti*, pp.170-171
166 Buss & Gardner, *Haiti*, pp.48-67
167 Similar subsidiaries in financial aid have been received since the earthquake in 2010. Péan, ‘L’Économie’ in Buteau, Saint-Éloi & Trouillot, *Réfonder*, pp.217-234
170 ‘Decision’, https://www.imf.org/en/News/Articles/2015/09/14/01/49/pr06261
171 In part, because of these debts, 500,000 children did not have access to school. Gunewardena & Schuller, *Capitalizing*, pp.204-205
Haiti’s economy had begun to deteriorate under the impact of SAPs. These caused agricultural production to decline along with investment, trade and consumption. Under Duvaliers’ administration, for example, even starving peasants were forced to contribute to debt repayment. Ridgeway argues: ‘Poverty became still more terrible’ as Haiti remained tied to FP’s hefty debts. As such, Timothy Schwartz observes that aid-dependency became Haiti’s default setting by 1970.

Conclusion

FP has made positive contributions to Haiti. I justify this positivity with aid-relief - material, physical, educational, infrastructural, and medical care - from which Haitians have benefitted. For example, in medical care, the dependable presence of Médecins sans Frontières has epitomized such effectiveness. Writers endorse the view that certain aspects of the FP’s activities have been, to some extent, a positively impacting change. Published literature has overtly acknowledged this fact, citing that FP has released, through multi-lateral sources, billions of US dollars in foreign assistance to Haiti.

Furthermore, aid-dependency has transformed specific individuals’ and groups’ lives through scholarship grants, employment in NGOs, the establishments of overseas-funded hospitals, the construction of wells and bridges, the financing of hand-picked schools, zonal reforestation,

---

172 SAPs produced some positive results in the substance of tighter accounting measures and gesturing towards women’s equality and decentralization but yielded too much control to the HICs. Gunewardena & Schuller, Capitalizing, pp.204-206. In fact, SAPS ‘were in most cases not been able to transform poor countries into high growth performers’. Christian Schabbel, The Value Chain of Foreign Aid (New York: Physica-Verlag Heidelberg, 2007), p.v
173 Ridgeway, The Haiti, p.12
174 Timothy T. Schwartz, Travesty in Haiti: A True Account of Christian Missions, Orphanages, Fraud, Food Aid and Drug Trafficking, 2nd ed. (South Carolina: BookSurge Publishing, 2010), Kindle Location 1131
175 In May 2015, they opened the clinic of Pran Men’m in Delmas 33, Port-au-Prince, to provide emergency medical care to victims of sexual and gender-based violence, and by the end of that year, had treated 787 people, including 438 young women and girls under the age of 18. Available: http://www.msf.org/en/where-we-work/haiti, (accessed 18 March 2016)
176 Theus, ONG, pp.143-145
injection of food-aid and numerous small grants. It might be argued that this is a positive account of aid which co-exists with aid-dependency. The transformation, however, has been selective, palliative and of little significance to a nation of impoverished people. For example, in a school where a limited number of pupils are hand-picked to be on the FP’s sponsorship list, the vast majority remain un-served.

Still, the release of food-aid to Haiti’s post-earthquake communities, in desperate need of food and water, was a gesture of solidarity in accordance with the welfare of our common humanity. However, food-aid has contributed to undermining the sustainability of Haitian farming.

However, a part of the reason for the exploration of aid-dependency in HP has been rooted in FP’s inability to help to alleviate, and more radically, eradicate poverty in Haiti. While there are indicators, albeit modest, of aid-dependency’s effectiveness, aid-dependency has failed Haiti. Theus posits that:

NGOs’ aid balance sheet [in Haiti] is negative and the results after half a century of aid are not at all satisfactory. The different interventions and operations carried out by NGOs do not affect the poverty that hurts the poor in the shanty towns and the disadvantaged rural areas of the country.

Dubois adds:

Haiti’s proud independence has been eroded by the thousands of foreign organizations that have flocked to the country over the years with projects

---

177 For FP’s recent humanitarian and developmental contributions to Haiti’s welfare, see: Buss & Gardner, *Haiti*, pp.48-67; Peter Hallward, *Damming the Flood Haiti, Aristide, and the Politics of Containment* (London: Verso, 2007), pp.1-9


181 Theus, *ONG*, pp.272-273
for improvement and reform. For all their work, though, hunger, poverty and
disease still stalk much of the population.\textsuperscript{182}

Casséus concludes:

Many international organizations have come to our rescue. They have indeed
prevented many Haitians from dying of hunger and being engulfed in despair,
but alas! They have not managed to take them to the solid ground of self-
sufficiency. If we come to grips with the problem on a global front, it would
clearly show that our economic condition, far from being improved,
worsens.\textsuperscript{183}

The point is that aid has been affected by complexities of aid-conditionalities, creating in the
process, over time, new sets of realities, including a paradigm of disempowerment. Wealth
extraction activities, namely hefty loans, the debt-crisis and SAPs, predicated on aid-
dependency, are key elements of a continued disempowerment thrust. As aid-literature pointed
out, due, in part, to FP’s continued out-pouring of aid through inhibitive aid-conditionalities,
the socio-economic reality of Haiti, has not improved. In fact, they have reduced and continued
to lessen aid’s potential development and welfare effects,\textsuperscript{184} and therefore widen the scope of
Haiti’s disempowering space.\textsuperscript{185} Aligned with this disempowering theme, Thomson posits:
‘Haiti is probably one of the most stable countries in the world because nothing has changed
there for the two hundred years since independence’.\textsuperscript{186} On account of these wealth extraction
initiatives, socio-economic disempowerment has become a by-product of aid-dependency in
Haiti.

\textsuperscript{182} Laurent Dubois, \textit{Haiti, the Aftershocks of History} (New York: Henry Colt and Company LLC, 2012), p.11
\textsuperscript{183} Jules Casséus, \textit{Haïti, Quelle Eglise... Quelle Libération?} (Limbé, Haïti: Séminaire Théologique Baptiste, 1991), pp.99-100
\textsuperscript{184} Riddell, \textit{Does}, pp.106-107
\textsuperscript{185} I refer to HP’s disempowering space as the typology of ideological, colonial, spiritual and cultural
conditioning by which Haiti is defined and, by extension, kept impoverished. Such conditioning is embodied in
HP’s socio-political, economic and physical environment which gives it a forum to expand. See: Casséus, \textit{Haïti},
\textsuperscript{186} Thomson, \textit{Bonjour}, p.317
Therefore, it is perhaps fair to suggest that ‘literature on aid-dependency in Haiti’ supports the central hypothesis identified by ‘general literature on aid-dependency’. In this context, the hypothesis becomes ‘Aid-dependency has disempowered Haiti by inhibiting self-sufficiency’.

The literature-based central hypothesis represents an attempt at synthetizing descriptive facts which inform the nature and functionality of aid-dependency. In fact, it equally helps me to formulate a working definition for aid-dependency. Firstly, from a global standpoint, aid-dependency presupposes the consistent reliance of wealth-deprived nations on the wealth-surplus of high-income nations, distributed and received in diversified typologies and methodologies which in practice, despite its limited success in individual countries, further impoverishes or dis-empowers the dependent-nations. Secondly, predicated on this presupposition, Haiti’s aid-dependency, however, is the colonial residue of deficits in self-hood, self-determination, mental strength, human skills, literacy, socio-economic capital and mutual trust which HICs have chosen to overcome with their reliable injection of essential goods and services.187

These overlapping definitions of aid-dependency share a common constant ‘aid-dependency disempowers’. They will form the operational connections and interdependencies in the various strands of disempowerment which this portfolio aims to uphold as a central hypothesis. They will equally provide indicators of the kinds of descriptive concepts the Article on aid-dependency in HP will generate to enable further discoveries.

---

Chapter 2. Article

The Interplay between Aid-dependency, Church Growth and Holistic Mission in Haitian Protestantism

Introduction

Varied types of published literature substantiated the claim of aid-dependency’s functionality and embodiment in Haitian society. Further to this, the literature claimed that aid-dependency’s functionality has disempowered residents of LICs, including Haitians. Central to writing this Article is my exploration of the interplay between aid-dependency, church growth and holistic mission in HP in the light of these claims. The Article will develop these claims to analyse the literature surrounding aid-dependency in HP. In a dialogue with the methodology of practical theology I therefore examine the church literature for evidence which will potentially expand or refute these claims.

In reference to practical theology Ballard and Pritchard give this insight:

> Practical theology is a descriptive, normative, critical and apologetic activity. It is the means whereby the day-to-day life of the Church, in all its dimensions, is scrutinized in the light of the gospel and related to the demand and challenges of the present day, in a dialogue that both shapes Christian practice and influences the world, however minimally.

Arising from this insight, I emphasize, as my underpinning literary framework, four methodological tasks of practical theology. These tasks will be instrumental in delineating the interplay. Osmer gives this summary:

1. The descriptive-empirical task gathers information that helps discern patterns and dynamics in particular contexts. It responds to the question: what is going on?

---


2. The interpretative task turns to the theories of the arts and sciences to explain why these patterns and dynamics are occurring. It answers the question: why is this going on?

3. The normative task uses theological frameworks to interpret particular episodes, situations, contexts, and constructs ethical norms to guide responses while learning from good practice. It answers the question: what ought to be going on?

4. The pragmatic task determines strategies of action that will influence situations in ways that are desirable. It answers the question: how might we respond?^{191}

The tasks place practical theology in a framework of inquiry which is driven by the desire to create the circumstances for radical transformation. However, in this Article I build an impetus on providing an outcome for the first two, descriptive-empirical and interpretative, tasks. The other two, normative and pragmatic, tasks will be incorporated into the latter parts of this portfolio.

The descriptive-empirical task is concerned with the description of HP’s current aid-reality from the perspective of published literature. It looks for answers to the question: What is going on in HP? In response, theoretical categories emerge, covering the nature, functionality, ethos, impact and future existence of aid-dependency in HP. Subsequently, in the interpretative task, I analyse, discuss and interpret the functions of these categories which authenticate aid-dependency and mission engagement within HP with a view to addressing the question as to why this is going on in HP. Furthermore, my critical analysis of this mission engagement calls for the application of holistic mission and, therefore, offers a supplementary mission pathway. This will be attuned to my pursued objective in this Article which consists of exploring, on the pivot of aid-dependency, the interplay between church growth [quantity of members] and holistic mission [effectiveness of members’ mission] in HP.

I proceed in respect of the task at hand with an emphasis on (1) what is going on in HP, (2) mission engagement, and (3) why this is going on in HP.

^{191} Osmer, Practical, p.4
2.1 What is Going on in Haitian Protestantism?  
Descriptive-empirical Task

To provide a response, I engage with two literature-based historical narratives of HP. They are, as I will later demonstrate, descriptive evolutions of aid-dependency’s functionality in as much as both HP and aid-dependency share an integrated existence in Haiti. In the first narrative, I examine the dynamics of the implantation of Protestantism together with three emerging aid-necessities which consolidated its mission structure and goal and a theoretical category which underpins the significance of aid-necessities.

2.1.1 Historical Narrative 1:  
Aid-Dependency, a Functional Praxis, 1817-1950

Protestantism had formally been introduced to Haiti as early as 1817 at the invitation of President Alexandre Pétion (1806-1818).\(^{192}\) Inherent to Protestantism’s introduction were both streams of foreign church-missions and their corresponding predisposition towards aid-dependency.\(^{193}\) This manifested itself, initially, in church-missions’ initiatives which designed and maintained an imported structure, the ‘box’, on which the local church solely depended. Moreover, 13 years following its political independence, Haiti was beginning to endure the constraints that colonial deficits and disempowerment imposed. Furthermore, based on Haitians’ familiarity with aid-dependency in a colonial framework, the writers argue that aid-dependency and structural dependency, in an ecclesiastical tradition, had quickly and fully become integrated constituents of HP’s missional existence.\(^{194}\)

According to Pressoir, distancing dependency from HP, at the time, would then prove to be both an antithesis to church-missions’ role and a capital loss to the embryonic dependent HP whose survival had increasingly become rooted in that aid-based foundation and imported mission structure. In other words, Haiti provided an environment to streams of foreign missionaries, as God-sent ambassadors, such that sustained dependency was received as an integrated part of their evangelistic message, thus, a divinely appointed capital gain to HP.195

Consistent with structural dependency, local Protestant churches had been conditioned to function as dependents of their parent church-missions. For example, within church-missions’ and HP’s relationships, there has existed a foreign ecclesiastical path which has structured and given identities to the local church. Between them, the path is recognized in the shared theological character, faith traditions, evangelistic visions, practice of governance and emphasis on the socio-economics.196 Moreover, the path has shaped the existence of HP into such a mission paradigm that its governance structure has become a replica of the expensive structure [according to Haiti’s standard] of its foreign counterparts. In other words, HP has been a clone church-version of, and therefore, deferential to the mission ethos of foreign churches.197

The ecclesiastical path has been authenticated in HP in three typologies. They are the inherited’, the Baptist movement, and the Pentecostal and mixed church movement. The inherited typology, characterised by a traditional theological line in Methodism and the Episcopal Church, offered a coherent organizational system, well detailed and structured in

---

195 For example, from the moment of its arrival in Haiti the Lott Carey Convention (1874-1911) subsidized many churches: Jacmel (US$1000), Port-au-Prince (US$600), Trou (US$700), and Cap-Haitian (US$600). When this financial support ended it became difficult for Groves, the resident superintendent minister, to adapt. Pressoir, Le Protestantisme (1977), p.215
196 Romain, Le Protestantisme (1985), pp.84-85
accordance with the church governance of their European-American counterparts. According to Romain and Hurbon this organizational system suited the Haitian intellectual elite.198

Secondly, the typology of the Baptist movement emphasized spiritual regeneration. The common history of mission structure between the Haitian Baptists and their foreign counterparts have constituted, as in the inherited typology, the bedrock for the theological formation of their leaders and the governance of the Baptist church. Thirdly, there existed the typology of the Pentecostal and mixed church movement, characterized by the American charismatic Pentecostals, which have exhibited a fluidity of structure through which various branches emerged as independent ecclesiastical units.199 The ecclesiastical path, activated through typologies, has crystallized structural dependency in the local and foreign church relations.

However, proponents of the three-self theory criticized this approach.200 They viewed this as a disempowering paternalistic support since it was potentially creating dependency in the embryonic church.201 This implies that from their inception, newly planted churches should be self-governing, self-supporting, and self-propagating. However, this was not the empirical experience of HP with foreign church planters. The three-self theory has over the years

---


199 Romain, Le Protestantisme (1985), pp.175-180; Guiteau, Le Pentecôtisme, pp.29-56. There are instances where schisms originated from advocacies, more and more accentuated and inspired, by the indigenization of the gospel. Le Protestantisme (1985), pp.77-79


generated lengthy debates.\textsuperscript{202} Recently, however, Rowell, Corbett and Fikkert have had a positive attitude towards this approach where it does not create unhealthy dependency.\textsuperscript{203}

As I will later demonstrate, in that path, operationally, aid-necessities, gradually associated with dependency, have, over the years, preserved their claim as constitutive components of HP’s imported mission structure. I note and study in the succeeding paragraphs the following aid-necessities which undergirded the nature and functionality of dependency in this narrative. They are presence of foreign missionaries, training of indigenous leaderships, and financial assistance.

\textit{Presence of Foreign Missionaries} - The missionaries were the corporate presence of church-missions in order to fulfil the command of Christ to go as the embodiment of the gospel to be incarnated in the cultures of near and distant lands with a view to sharing the Christian message.\textsuperscript{204} However, referring to the advocacy of the three-self theory, Romain points out that from 1817 to 1966 the presence of foreign missionaries affected the governance fabric of the major churches to varying degrees. He stresses that their active presence nourished the dichotomy between foreign and indigenous cultures, the superiority and inferiority mind-sets, and maturity and apprenticeship in theological and biblical formation.\textsuperscript{205}

However, other writers, including Romain as well, gratefully recognized that the gospel has been proclaimed by missionaries who ventured into the unknown.\textsuperscript{206} Equally, based on financial support, Christian fellowship and mission experiences, writers describe their presence


\textsuperscript{203} Rowel, \textit{To Give}, pp.27-55; Corbett & Fikkert, \textit{When}, pp.161-218. However, as a psychological setback to human dignity no type of aid-dependency is healthier than another. See ‘Descriptive Theme 10’, p.166

\textsuperscript{204} Pressoir, \textit{Le Protestantisme} (1945), pp.51-75; Romain, \textit{Le Protestantisme} (2004), pp.16-19; Guiteau, \textit{Le Pentecôtisme}, p.30

\textsuperscript{205} Romain, \textit{Le Protestantisme} (1985), pp.300-307

as essential to the development of the embryonic dependent HP. This said, the conditions were then set for the emergence of certain trends of adaptability and the creation of missional paradigms of operation, giving rise to both unintended consequences and the fulfilment of anticipated goals.

As such, training of indigenous leaderships, classified as another aid-necessity, had increasingly become imperative as relevant data show in the following paragraphs.

Training of Indigenous Leaderships - Pressoir and Griffiths explain that the subtleties of Haitian life, expressed especially in language, required of visiting missionaries functional linguistic equivalents in order to minister. Their responsibility towards acquiring these equivalents was no less consequential. To complement their staff, the missionaries resorted to training, in foreign cultures, indigenous leaders. However, Romain contends that dependency on theological, ethical, spiritual, cultural and biblical knowledge was at the expense of the trainees’ indigenous realities. For example, local leaders’ adoption of the ecclesiastical path, preaching and singing in French and English, testified to this fact. These, among other factors, conditioned indigenous leaders to function as local aliens, being at times socio-economically oblivious to the indigenous realities of the poor. Nonetheless, the task at hand would have to be better advanced through the systematic theological formation of indigenous leaderships in the hope that they would contextualize their acquired knowledge in active service.

However, Romain further reminds Haitian Protestants [hereafter Protestants] that the financial autonomy of our churches would engineer the collapse of many barriers and enable them to be free from the intricacies of foreign theological formation and doctrinal supervisions in a context of co-responsibility.\textsuperscript{212} The following aid-necessity will be financial support, the nexus of HP’s dependency.

\textit{Financial Assistance} - Besides costs related to training, the running costs towards the upkeep of the ‘box’ have attracted foreign missions’ financial assistance.\textsuperscript{213} Another example of financial support included, in 1866, an annual financial subsidy of US$6,000 from the Missions Committee to their counterpart, the Haitian Episcopal Church. The subsidy secured the continuance of various socio-economic projects and of salaries for the church’s leaderships, from the bishop to the organists. This structure of governance was a replica of its counterpart’s, the Church of England. Pressoir notes that in the long-term, the desire for secured employments outweighed genuine ministerial vocations within the Church.\textsuperscript{214}

However, Griffiths and Pressoir reveal that foreign missions always insisted on financial sustainability in HP. They also admit that the financial and managerial inabilities of HP to self-support and self-govern had been perennial.\textsuperscript{215} Therefore, church-missions’ options tilted in favour of consistent aid-assistance in the belief that HP would, in the long-term, secure its sustainability.

Out of these early experiences with aid-necessities, the seeding of a dependency culture took roots. This demonstrated that the non-application of the three-self theory had partly

\textsuperscript{212} For example, in a Methodist chapel ‘Only those doctrines that were in accordance with the New Testament and John Wesley’s sermons were to be preached’. Griffiths, \textit{History}, p.60. Next, the adoption of a Haitian church was conditional on its full acceptance of the parent church’s doctrinal standards. Guiteau, \textit{Le Pentecôtisme}, p.49 ; Romain, \textit{Le Protestantisme} (1985), p.320
\textsuperscript{214} Pressoir, \textit{Le Protestantisme} (1976), pp.31-32
\textsuperscript{215} Griffiths, \textit{History}, p.121; Pressoir, \textit{Le Protestantisme} (1976), p.57
disempowered HP. However, while disempowerment has been a common trend of aid-dependency, the literature emphasizes the theological worth of aid. Consequently, at this point, I turn to the first theoretical category.

_Theoretical Category I (TCI): Aid Embodies Characteristics of Empowerment_

I proceed to examine the scope of TCI in the following feature:

_Feature 1. Aid’s Intrinsic Worth_

Aid-assistance, integrated into aid’s intrinsic value, has inherently been a welcome gift to the embryonic HP, striving towards self-sufficiency. Whereas, within this narrative, HP had already and persistently received aid-assistance, Pressoir concludes that the intrinsic value of aid transcended church-missions’ aid-motivations.\(^{216}\) The church’s history in published literature has emphasized the biblical significance of aid in a context of mutual sharing and care for members within the family of God.\(^ {217}\) This positive worth of aid has been so welcomed in HP’s socio-economic conditions that it predisposed aid-providers and aid-receivers, as the literature will further demonstrate, to construe its use into aid-dependency.\(^ {218}\)

Despite its misuse attempts in aid-literature, ‘aid’s intrinsic worth’ points me to another observation. Aid is a nebulous term, describing a complex range of charitable, economic, social, financial and political transactions. From tiny contributions to local NGOs, churches and church-NGOs to huge disbursements to governments, aid has implicitly and explicitly been predominantly provided for developmental purposes in respect of the last two aid-eras. All in all, ‘aid’s intrinsic worth’ determined the rationale for which aid has been allocated and the procedures in which it has been provided.

\(^{216}\) Pressoir, _Le Protestantisme_ (1976), p.17

\(^{217}\) See ‘The Church’, p.19

\(^{218}\) Jeanty, _Le Christianisme_, p.42
Eventually, this praxis of an aid-based structure gained ascendency within HP and was in fact predisposed to internalising and domesticating new definitions of aid-dependency. In this light, the second narrative, spanning the years 1950-2017, facilitated dependency to potentially become inhibitive to the spiritual vibrancy, dignity and freedom of HP. It received its expanded meaning in the 1950-2000 and post-2000 aid-eras.

I now focus on the second historical narrative and two theoretical categories which it underpins.

2.1.2 Historical Narrative 2
Aid-Dependency, a Potentially Inhibitive Praxis, 1950-2017

Former aid-necessities, (for example, presence of foreign missionaries and financial assistance), expanded in significance, worth and reputation, have arguably become suitable to accommodate church-mission partners’ renewed enthusiasm in those aid-eras. For example, as the literature will later demonstrate, patterns of aid-giving to sustain aid-necessities were gradually formalised into the mainstay of an aid-dependency culture. Then, they began to generate new aspirations within the mission mind-sets of local churches. In fact, HP gradually concluded that these partners had been among them as foreign missionary developers [hereafter FMDs]. Strangely, church-missions did not dissuade HP from this conclusion, in fact, as I will later describe, they demonstrated that they were. I proceed to highlight the descriptive role and mission focus of FMDs.

Upon their arrival in HP’s disempowering space, FMDs exhibited their financial capacity, expertise and willingness to assist. As the role and purpose of aid kept changing, FMDs then took on the responsibility for buttressing poverty-alleviation and -eradication initiatives in

---


220 FMDs differ from FP. FMDs come as church representatives and partners, very often, serving in or sponsoring mission projects. Pressoir, *Le Protestantisme* (1945), pp.51-75
From that moment onward, writers clarify that FMDs and local missionaries of the three typologies passionately competed in the mission field.

From mid-1960 to the end of 1980, Louis recounts that Haiti was the mission field for several church-missions emigrating from the United States. Among them, the Body of Christ Church stood out. It offered significant material advantages, development projects, even the promise of US visas, to believers and leaders alike. They swiftly attracted members of local churches and Voodoo. The Church numerically thrived, in fact exceedingly grew, on the momentum of this enticing strategy. Meanwhile many private churches, secular charities and church-based businesses sprang up as developmental agencies.

Beauzile, endorsing Louis’ account, explains that foreign Protestants, upon their arrival, went to disadvantaged rural communities to develop their work. They, very often, offered them food and/or clothing, not neglecting to promise them improvement of their life’s situations, especially with foreign-aid called ‘Compassion’. This mission approach radically contrasted the culture of bilateral partnership highlighted and promoted, in the 1817-1950 narrative, by Griffiths and Pressoir.

From literary accounts, the ecclesiastical typologies considered above, at varying levels, have benefited from FMDs’ generosity through the capitalization of their recurrent budgets and the multiplicity of sponsored social projects and scholarship grants. As such, the local church

---

221 Fontus, Les Églises, pp.96-105
222 Louis, Voodoo, pp.216-219
223 Voodoo is a predominantly Creole-ancestral religion with an infectious vitality in the Haitian culture. Louis, Voodoo, p.246-247; Laënnec Hurbon, Dieu dans le Vaudou Haïtien (Paris: Payot, 1976), pp.73-100
224 Jeanry, Le Christianisme, p.42
225 Beauzile, Une Etude, pp.57-58
began to believe that FMDs had readily accepted the God-given responsibility to assist them financially and continuously.\textsuperscript{227} Meanwhile, church pastors, in their anxious wait for foreign-aid to capitalize the church enterprise, maintain the ‘box’, and sustain development projects, strengthened the baseline of idolatry as FMDs have been held with divine esteem.\textsuperscript{228}

I continue with this narrative and its analysis in the next theoretical category.

\textit{Theoretical Category II (TCII): Aid-dependency Fosters Socio-economic Disempowerment}

TCII generates three interlacing features. They are paternalism and the ‘papa’ culture, \textit{Bondye-bon}, and scapegoating. Let us consider each one separately.

\textbf{Feature 2. Paternalism and the ‘Papa’ Culture}

Jeanty cautions the local church to not invest much trust in FMDs who may choose to, at short notice and without their approval and redress, end sponsored projects and withdraw their presence, but to place their trust in God.\textsuperscript{229} To justify this caution Jeanty supplies the evidence of a sudden halt in a paternalistic relationship which did not precipitate the sudden collapse of the \textit{Mission Evangélique Baptiste du Sud d’Haïti} [hereafter MEBSH], but disempowered its future mission thrust.

In July 1985, the World Team, quite peacefully, withdrew their support from MEBSH. The World Team believed that after three generations, it was time that MEBSH takes care of its own destiny without the interference of foreigners.\textsuperscript{230}

\textsuperscript{227} Casséus, \textit{Haïti}, p.89 & p.102
\textsuperscript{228} However, in Haiti’s context the crystallization of DA affects genuine faith. The vernacular belief ascribes divine prominence and power to FMDs such that the white man’s God and the white man as a god set the tone and the agenda for development in HP. Jeanty challenges HP to be constantly dependent on Jesus, who is neither white nor black. ‘Is not Christianity something that has become a “White” business? Is it not that to be a “good” and “great” pastor, one must go to the countries of the “Whites” in quest of a partner for one’s church? Is it not that the God that many serve is a white god?’ Jeanty, \textit{Le Christianisme}, p.42
\textsuperscript{229} Jeanty, \textit{Le Christianisme}, p.42
\textsuperscript{230} Jeanty, \textit{Le Christianisme}, p.94
Jeanty criticizes this decision as being patronising as damaging to HP’s image and mission. In the same spirit, Guiteau narrates another experience:

Having been largely dependent on international leaders, who now have redirected their focus to Eastern Europe, the International Pentecostal Church of Holiness in Haiti was left to experience increasing decline - from 24 schools in 1990 to 6 in 2003.  

Furthermore, as a derivative of slavery, the inevitability of paternalism to emerge as an influential constituent of aid-dependency has settled in HP as an integral practice. Casséus argues that with time wealthy secular and religious leaders actualized themselves as ‘papas’ [fathers] of disempowered Haitians on the axis of aid-dependency. This is a colonial vestige in which prominent local leaders who replicate the image of former colonialists are held in featherlike esteem.  

A great landowner, a boss who gives jobs or alms to the poor functions as a ‘good papa’. A political leader - president, senator, Member of Parliament, magistrate - or a religious leader - pastor, priest [Voodoo and Catholic] - is seen by the Haitian poor in the role of a 'papa'.

Therefore:

In grateful responses to almsgivings from people, street beggars do not hesitate to say 'thank you papa' to someone who could be their son. Haitians in their 40s, 50s, and 60s are fretting at having neither a father nor a mother.

That means, in HP, the average Protestant had been predisposed to accommodating paternalism on the axis of aid-dependency.

These episodes of abrupt ending of mission projects - with no redress - and the paternalistic disposition of influential Haitians demonstrated that HP has been witnessing in an unchallenged paternalistic framework which further disempowered and belittled aid-recipients.

231 Guiteau, *Le Pentecôtisme*, p.55
232 Colonialists have been replaced by indigenous elites and government authorities. Casséus, *Quelle*, p.41
233 Casséus, *Eléments*, p.106
234 Note that they are not biologically orphans.
235 Casséus, *Eléments*, p.106
236 See ‘Imperialistic Approach to Debt-crisis’, p.36
The more this framework persisted the more HP applied the Bondye-bon attitude.

Feature 3. Bondye-bon

This is a philosophical and socio-cultural Haitian concept which emerged from two Haitian Creole\textsuperscript{237} words Bondye (God) and bon (good). It translates as the ‘benevolent good God’. The writers’ reflection on this socio-cultural and religious indicator embedded the attitude that, for the average Haitian, everything stems, rightfully so, from God’s will and God’s doing.\textsuperscript{238} However, on the basis of God’s goodness, the attitude disempowers and therefore absolves the average Haitian believer of any responsibility - social, civic and environmental - for their intrinsic world.\textsuperscript{239} Protestants accept situations, repeated or sporadic and progressive or regressive, as a \textit{fait accompli} while lethargically waiting on the Lord.\textsuperscript{240} Thus, Haitians’ well-being is solely dependent on God whose goodness is fulfilled in FMDs’ generosity and influential Haitians. Consequently, the attitude potentially gives birth to fatalism.\textsuperscript{241}

Writers connect this Bondye-bon with FP’s indoctrination of ESRs which discredited their ability and self-worth.\textsuperscript{242} Equally, colonial missionaries taught ESRs to passively accept their atrocious conditions as the will of God.\textsuperscript{243} In compliance, many Haitians did.\textsuperscript{244} As a result, Bondye-bon has become a psychological blockage towards fruitful productivity. As mentally colonized individuals, Haitians, within their society, navigate through life in the shadow of

\textsuperscript{237} See ‘Haitian Creole’, p.250
\textsuperscript{240} Johanne Tremblay, \textit{Mères, Pouvoir et Santé en Haïti} (Paris: Karthala, 1995), pp.146-153
\textsuperscript{241} Griffiths, \textit{A View}, p.71; Casséus, \textit{Haiti}, pp.90-95; Romain, \textit{Le Protestantisme} (1985), pp.225-229
\textsuperscript{242} Williams, \textit{Caribbean}, pp.31-38; Ormonde McConnell, \textit{Mission Extraordinary, Haiti Diary 1933-1970} (Ohio: Service Center, 1977)
\textsuperscript{243} Casséus, \textit{Haiti}, p.40. ‘Low expectations on the part of those who were meant to be encouragers and trainers became self-fulfilling prophecies’. Mary Lederleitner, \textit{Cross-cultural Partnerships, Navigating the Complexities of Money and Mission} (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, 2010), p.82
\textsuperscript{244} Casséus, \textit{Eléments}, pp.50-56
their self-confidence, believing that they are disabled entrepreneurs. Casséus concludes that this lethargic attitude has further been nurtured by the dependability of foreign-aid.

**Feature 4. Scapegoating**

Meanwhile, according to FMDs and local churches, Voodoo has been the cause of Haiti’s poverty, under-development and economic misery. Prichard argues: ‘Remove the Papaloi [male Voodoo priest] and the Manmanloi [female Voodoo priest] then superstitious observances would, to a large extent, die out, and the land will shake off the influence which holds it in degradation’. In FMDs’ wisdom, Voodoo has been likened to a backward and cannibalistic religion, the cause of Haiti’s eternal misery. This belief, among other religious factors, has led HP to be in solidarity with Haitian Catholicism to eradicate Voodoo. Thomson explains: ‘There were Baptists, Methodists, Jehovah’s Witnesses, and Seventh-Day Adventists - all were devoted to efface Voodoo and scorn this religion’. Recently, Schuller reports that ‘Protestant groups killed forty-five traditional Voodoo chiefs in December 2010 on the pretext that this “worship of the demon” had caused the epidemic of cholera’.

The issues at hand have been that foreign missionaries [Catholic and Protestant], past and present, deflected the attention of Haitians, particularly Protestants, from aid-dependency, a tool of economic disempowerment, solely to Voodoo. Therefore, the conversion process to HP has relied on tactics and rationale which targeted the social, material and spiritual vulnerability

---

245 Chanson, ‘Haïti’ in Rainhorn, Haïti, pp.215-227
246 Casséus, Haïti, p.88
247 Hesketh Hesketh-Prichard, Where Black Rule White (St Albans, London: Prae Wood, 1910) p.133
249 The eradication was the work of the Catholic clergy and the Haitian elite, seeing Voodoo as a symbol of under-development, a Haitian shame on the international scene. Hurbon, Dieu, pp.19-20; Desmangles, The Faces, pp.52-53; Carl E. Peters, La Croix Contre l’Asson (Port-au-Prince: La Phalange, 1960), pp.107-111, 125-148 & 225-295
250 Thomson, Bonjour, p.107
251 Mark Schuller, Cette Charité Qui Tue, Haïti, l’Aide Internationale et les ONG (Haïti: Éditions de l’Université d’État, 2015), p.263
of Voodoo to such a level that Voodooists have not been deemed to be worthy companions of Protestant in the fight against poverty, neither have their worldviews been compatible with development.\textsuperscript{252} Whereas numbers of writers support this argument,\textsuperscript{253} other writers equally believe that aid-dependency has played a significant role in Haiti’s under-development.

Notwithstanding those three features, there is evidence of mission engagement in HP to which I now turn.

\textbf{2.2 Mission Engagement}

I propose to study two aspects (1) positive mission engagement and (2) supplementary positive mission engagement.

\textbf{2.2.1 Positive Mission Engagement}

In the historical narratives so far, writers delineate aid’s functions in response to aid-necessities in two theoretical categories, TCI and TCII. Neither has described aid and aid-dependency to be triggers of collective economic growth. Nor have they heightened the poor’s right to self-dignity. Other writers, nonetheless, value aid-dependency’s positive mission engagements and argue that HP has benefited from it in a multiplicity of ways.\textsuperscript{254} A demonstration of this argument juxtaposes evangelical proclamation, church growth and social transformation as signposts of positivity in furthering the task of responding to the question: What is going on in HP?

\textsuperscript{254} ‘They meet urgent needs’, without which ‘the nation would disappear’. Theus, however, contends that meeting individuals’ urgent needs does not cause the collective misery of the poor to disappear. Otherwise, ONGs and FMDs would have equally disappeared from Haiti. Theus, \textit{ONG}, pp.144-145. See also Harmon A. Johnson, \textit{The Growing Church in Haiti} (Florida: Coral Gables, 1970), pp.66-67
Evangelical Proclamation - HP’s evangelical proclamation has, normally, been underpinned by three main themes, namely the authenticity of biblical revelation, the centrality of the cross of Christ and power in the ministry of the Holy Spirit. Social holiness, however, has only been the preaching theme of a few local churches. Their evangelical proclamation has been as heavenly driven as it has been eschatologically spiritualized. Casséus explains that ‘Faithfulness to foreign Protestant traditions which promise abundant life of an eschatological vision conditions Protestants to neglect significant aspects of socio-economic life’.

Nevertheless, with the emphasis being on personal salvation made effective through the forgiveness of sin and acceptance of Jesus as Lord and personal Saviour, HP has, generally, highlighted the primacy of the evangelical proclamation. Writers confess that foreign aid-led-missions and the embryonic HP have fully set in motion the imperative of the truth-telling story of the life and ministry of Jesus, fully God and fully human, to individual Haitians in their contexts. It has brought to pass in their souls the accomplishment of the works of prevenient grace initiated by the Holy Spirit. As the evangelistic story penetrates Haitian souls and Christ’s forgiveness is received, the outcome has been the fruit of repentance from sin whereby Haitians confessed: ‘The Spirit bears witness with our spirit that we are the children of God’ (Rom. 8:16).

255 Louis, Voodoo, pp.207-210; Fontus, Les Églises, pp.90-94
258 John Wesley invokes the prevenience of grace to affirm that every salutary human action, from the earliest expression of faith to the highest degree of sanctification, is grounded in the prior empowering of God’s grace. Randy L. Maddox, Responsible Grace, John Wesley’s Practical Theology (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1994), pp.83-84
Contextually, the evangelical proclamation denounced Voodoo practices, polygamy and all forms of family relationships outside marriage, describing them as devil-driven activities. Power evangelism, made evident in words, deeds, signs and wonders and pragmatic social works in schools, development projects and in the streets, further characterised the proclamation. Pressoir, Jeanty and Louis recount that from the Second World War onward, Haiti has become one of the world’s harvest fields as a result of its receptivity towards this Protestant message. In fact, HP has registered numerous converts. As the literature indicated, church growth has been a spin-off of the intensification and crystallization of aid-dependency in Haiti. The primacy of evangelical proclamation, supported by overseas dependable aid-subsistence, has borne manifold fruit.

HP has built on previous missionary enterprises to spread the gospel, with relentless intensity. Although its expansion progressed at a slow pace during the first century of HP’s witness (1817-1917), it expanded its geographical dominance for more than five decades. It is not evident that this slow space was due to low-keyed aid-giving compared to increased aid-giving in this era. However, in the long-term, the socio-economic, political and religious circumstances which ensued during the first half of the twentieth century served as a catalyst to an exponential growth of an unprecedented occurrence.

Consequently, HP has gained momentum in its thrust to become, alongside Voodoo and Haitian Catholicism, a religious movement worthy of such a claim. Writers offer this

---

259 Casséus, Haïti, pp.5-6; Tremblay, Mères, pp.146-153; Vivian G. Panton, The Church and Common-law Union (Jamaica: Ebony Business Printers, 1992)
260 ‘Most Haitians come to the Lord because of needs, especially when they are afflicted by demonic activities’. Louis, Voodoo, p.278; Griffiths, History, pp.265-266
262 Fontus, Les Églises, pp.88 & 91-93
263 Romain, Le Protestantisme (2004), pp.11-71
264 Hurbon speaks of ‘Pentecostalism and its Triumph’. Laënnec Hurbon, ‘Religions, Politique et Mondialisation en Haïti’ in Rainhorn, Haïti, p.135
trajectory of its growth movement as resulting from mission positivity.

Church Growth - Griffiths retraces the early trends of HP’s membership growth. He explains: ‘In the 1920s the total rose to 13,212, the 1930s saw this figure more than triple to reach 40,245 by 1940’. By 1990, Casséus notes that Protestants, having consistently used various methods of evangelization, represented 33 percent of the national population. Seven years later, Houtart’s and Remy’s findings highlighted a membership decline by concluding that 28 percent of the population was Protestant. Hurbon’s findings refuted Casséus’ and Houtart and Remy’s conclusions and stated: ‘From 15 percent in 1960s, the Protestant membership has increased to 39 percent in 1980 and 50 percent in 1997’. In 2001, Fontus did not consider it an exaggeration to appreciate HP’s growth as exponential, citing the Protestant population as over two million believers, representing 35 percent of the national population. Romain, in 2004, concluded that HP’s population had surpassed four million, that is, 44 percent of the national population.

The rhythm and fluidity of HP’s growth since the 1940s exceeded missiologists’ research momentum to present conclusive statistical figures in any given decade of HP’s witness. Consequently, these statistical trends refute any suggestion that HP’s growth has been stationary. However, I must point out that unlike other researchers Romain’s data broaden the prescriptive denominational criteria for church membership to accommodate the category of

265 Griffiths, History, p.259
266 Jules Casséus, Perspectives Missionnaires, Hier, Aujourd’hui, Demain (Port-au-Prince: La Presse Evangélique, 1997), p.170
267 Houtart & Remy, Haiti, p.90
268 Hurbon, ‘Religions,’ in Rainhorn, Haiti, p.137
269 Fontus, Les Églises, p.88
Protestant population. On this account, a population of four million Protestants is therefore the working figure I utilize in this research.

As I analyse this positivity, those membership growth figures raise a relevant question for the interplay which I explore. What have been the socio-political and economic characteristics of Haitian society that rendered such receptivity to the Protestant message? The response, as various sources have pointed out, is shrouded in Haiti’s protracted socio-political and economic disempowerment. Haiti, ‘the poorest in the western hemisphere’, has constantly been further impoverished. This means Haiti has continued to be a compassion-triggered environment such that ‘Conversion to Protestantism has been a catalyst to financial and socio-economic mobility’. Metraux explains this by pointing out that the austere life of many Protestant families has resulted in a certain ease which they attributed to their conversion. Tremblay further clarifies that ‘The church’s programmes of sponsorship, schooling and health development appeal to peasants whose conversion also gives them access to them’. On this account, writers question the motives and spirituality of Haitians who, on the axis of conversion, migrated from Voodoo and Haitian Catholicism to HP.

---

271 This category encompasses children and youth of the church who have not yet been baptized nor confirmed and church adherents who were not married. Within the Caribbean colonies, by 1820, acceptance into church membership was shifted to legal marriage as an imposition from the church-missions. Panton, The Church, pp.30-31
272 This means Haiti has continued to be a compassion-triggered environment such that ‘Conversion to Protestantism has been a catalyst to financial and socio-economic mobility’. Metraux explains this by pointing out that the austere life of many Protestant families has resulted in a certain ease which they attributed to their conversion. Tremblay further clarifies that ‘The church’s programmes of sponsorship, schooling and health development appeal to peasants whose conversion also gives them access to them’. On this account, writers question the motives and spirituality of Haitians who, on the axis of conversion, migrated from Voodoo and Haitian Catholicism to HP.
HP’s aid-necessities and aid-dependency testify to the authenticity of Haiti’s impoverished status. Referring to numerical church growth, Noelliste posits the question: How can so many Christians and so much poverty co-exist so comfortably and for so long?277 The incisive question which challenges such positivity is this, notwithstanding numerical growth, has this relentless intensity been adequately resilient to serve as the springboard of in-depth social transformation through holistic mission? Given the positivity of mission engagements, these questions facilitate the transition from evangelical proclamation to social transformation as I continue to discover what is going on in HP.

Social Transformation in Haiti - Aid-dependency has not simply facilitated the spur of church growth,278 it has also designed a service-to-the-poor culture in a context of consistent material aid-necessities. This said, I examine the relational dynamics between the material conditions of HP’s disempowering space and its redeemed community. It is an analysis of how an ever-increasing number of Protestants has understood themselves to be the herald of their own liberating change.

In the literature, the concentration of HP’s mission workforce has rightly been expended on the two blades of holistic mission: evangelical proclamation and social transformation. The former has been successful as it contributed to numerical church growth and spiritual renewal. The second blade, according to writers, has equally been successful as HP’s focus has been on these missional activities: education, health care and numerous pragmatic social responses.279

277 In fact, Noelliste concludes that when the shares of the two religious sectors of Christianity (Protestantism and Catholicism) are added up, we have a Christian presence of over 80%. Dieumeme Noelliste ‘Poverty and the Gospel: The Case of Haiti’, Evangelical Review of Theology, 34:4 (2010), pp.313-315
278 Aid-sponsored schools, clinics, hospitals and other social services have been catalysts to Christian conversion. New converts from Haitian Catholicism and Voodoo to HP have been attracted by both the gospel of Christ and church social services. Tremblay, Mères, p.148, Beauzile, Une Etude, pp.57-58
279 Under this sub-heading, Louis, Casséus and Fontus, besides health care and education, refer to a multiplicity of micro-social projects. However, these missional activities do not equitably correspond to the in-depth social transformation which I advocate. Louis, Voodoo, p.294; Casséus, Perspectives, p.170; Fontus, Les Églises, pp.96-106
However, as I will later demonstrate, these activities have been limited in proportion, depth, and intensity compared to the gravity of poverty in these mission fields. In the ensuing paragraphs, nonetheless, I consider the effectiveness of HP’s missional activities in the light of God’s economics.

Firstly, it is worth noting at this point that, from a Methodist perspective, I refer to social transformation as the intended consequences of *missio trinitatis*²⁸⁰ to liberate communities and institutions from systemic and cultural sins.²⁸¹ It is the enactment of societal sanctification, the worthiness of life and the creation of positive patriotism and altruism towards a large-scale socio-economic and political transformation, predicated on believers’ righteousness in Christ.²⁸² It results from hard social analysis through prophetic visioning and reverberates with the prophetic admonition: ‘Let justice roll down like waters, and righteousness like an ever-flowing stream’ (Amos 5:24). In *missio trinitatis*, the Godhead comes to and is experienced by humanity as the divine community in human communities and by their residence therein, people and their habitats are liberated equally.

Taken as described, I ask: Has HP’s growing membership proffered any form of resistance to this endemic poverty? In other words, has this resistance, if any, produced this kind of holistic transformation? Nonetheless, noting positivity in the following areas is paramount at this stage.

*a. Let us Consider Education:* Protestant schools have been as widely dispersed as Protestant church buildings in communities. Louis notes that ‘Protestants have more schools in the

²⁸⁰ The redemptive work of the Father, Son, and Holy Spirit.
country than any other group involved in education’. 283 This is not, then, a surprising development since HP began with education. 284 Furthermore, Bird sustains the view that:

The opening of the eyes of the masses, by means of Christian primary education in early life, is the great hope in such cases. If, therefore, ignorance is a nuisance in a Christian Republic, then let the education of every child in the nation be obligatory. 285

In respect of continuity, Griffiths singles out McConnell as pioneering HP’s literacy programmes. He further encouraged Creole literacy by translating into Creole Luke’s Gospel, producing a Protestant magazine and conducting worship, in Creole. 286 Griffiths concludes ‘If McConnell accomplished nothing else during his years in Haiti, he would be remembered for his contribution to literacy and the illiterate masses among Haiti’s population’. 287

b. Let us Consider Health Care: HP has dispensed health care provisions through its own hospitals and clinics. 288 Louis and Fontus confirm that 15 hospitals - excluding clinics, dispensaries and nutritional centres - had been established by Protestants, over the last 75 years. 289 Comparatively, these medical centres have attracted an annual attendance rate which is 30 percent higher than those controlled by the government. 290 Their success has been reliant on foreign partnerships. 291

c. Let us Consider Pragmatic Social Responses: Generally, HP has tried to be everything to all people regardless of their needs. It has legitimized its calling to serve in various fields, in addition to education and health care. HP has provided orphanages, nutritional and canteen

283 Louis, Voodoo, p.213. See also Fontus, Les Églises, p.96
284 James Catts, a British Methodist missionary, opened and managed the first Protestant school in 1817. Pressoir, Le Protestantisme (1945), p.90
286 Griffiths, History, p.256
287 Griffiths, History, p.257
288 In 2008 ‘53% of the population had access to primary health care’ and ‘life expectancy was 59.3’. J. C. Fouron, ‘Santé Publique et Population’ in Pierre (ed.), Construction, p.338
289 Fontus, Les Églises, pp.96-97; Louis, Voodoo, p.214
290 Louis, Voodoo, p.214
centres, school sponsorships, housing schemes, nursing homes, agricultural mobility and cooperative centres, reforestation and farming programmes and water shortage alleviation. In this trend, in almost every Protestant church there is a social project, funded by foreigners, aiming to alleviate poverty and suffering in communities.292

However, despite such positivity, writers become as well the voice of a local Church, crying out for freedom from aid-dependency’s entanglements as, in their assessment of these development projects, the aid-subsistence, being the choice of FMDs’, has been prone to perpetrating dysfunctional economics in HP. Whereas Voodoo practices have been depicted as a catalyst to Haiti’s socio-economic set-back, rightfully so, HP’s aid-dependency practices, however, have not yet emerged as a competent alternative.293

It is in this context that a third theoretical category has emerged. Therefore, joining the writers’ analyses of the arguably positive effects of aid-dependency in HP permits me to articulate the category in the following words.

*Theoretical Category III (TCIII): Aid-dependency has Contributed to Ineffective Poverty-alleviation*

This category is not solely the product of limited transformational effects of social projects. Rather, it is interconnected with TCII and, holistically, poses a theological challenge to TCI. Both, TCII and TCIII, point to the necessity for a broader understanding of holistic mission in the sense that TCIII has been described by three features of disempowerment. They are aid-dependency’s incompatibility with LICs’ productivity, palliative economics, and socio-political absenteeism. To provide an expansion to the scope of aid-dependency’s functionality, I pursue the analysis of these features.


Feature 5. Aid-Dependency’s Incompatibility with LICs’ Productivity

Referring to evidences in aid-literature, a sense of powerlessness has been instilled, to varying degrees, in governments, parliaments, civil society and the church in LICs. This has resonated with aid-dependency’s incompatibility with high productivity. In Haiti, for example, the debt-crisis and the resource curse are cases in point. Haiti’s productivity stalled as its government’s fiscal adjustments further dis-incentivized local productivity.

By implication, in HP, aid-dependency has been an obstacle to high productivity as described in Noelliste’s question: How can so many Christians and so much poverty co-exist so comfortably and for so long? The point is that HP has been characterized by a lack of initiative in empowering strategies and policies and, in general, a reactive rather proactive form of church governance.

There is some evidence, as discussed earlier, that DA has produced economic growth, albeit modest. For example, the positive impacts of MDGs on poverty have not been a unified consensus of achieved goals. Neither have they been an obvious failure as there exist positive results that DA has produced in Haiti as well as in LICs. An earlier example consisted of the significance of aid-positivity as described in TCI. However, a way that aid effectiveness should be judged is in relation to its ability to make an immediate and concrete long-term difference to poverty levels in aid-recipient countries. Ironically, this has not been the case in Haiti.

Feature 6. Palliative Economics

HP’s social responses, although enacted in a paternalistic framework and a defeatist atmosphere, are generically invaluable regarding humanitarian praxis. Cooper equates this kind of praxis with pragmatism, ‘an effort to change small elements within the system now, to

---

294 ‘The Millennium Development’, available:  
(accessed 10 May 2017)  
295 Riddell, Does, pp.1-4
relieve the suffering of the poor’. 296 However, they ‘temporarily relieve certain symptoms of “Haitian social evil” without pursuing its eradication’. 297 Therefore, writers contend that in terms of prophetic aspirations, altogether, these pragmatic missional activities, standing alone, are bereft of collective theological reflection and the application of vision. Whilst these should continue as components of a definite and godly relief-mission plan, without paralleled intentional works of in-depth transformation, they, in the long-term, will serve as palliative economics and disparage aid-recipients’ dignity. 298 Maggay further observes that while these social services are always good in themselves:

> They are stirrings towards lifting the poor. They mostly manage to merely keep the heads of the poor above the water but cannot substitute for hard social analysis and confront the power structures that hold so many hostages to poverty. 299

They have been a temporary financial and psychological relief for them who carry the heaviest burdens of the effect of poverty as outlined in these social responses but do nothing radical to dismantle the structure of economic injustice that oppresses and makes the effect of the socio-economic challenges irresistible. 300 If anything, the outcome helps to postpone the need for transformative justice while the threat of identity and dignity loss solidifies itself. In this way, they have potentially served as both fertile grounds for the crystallization of an aid-dependency pattern and a distraction to recipients’ vision aiming to hasten the materialization of a prophetic orthopraxis. 301

---

296 Cooper, *Controversies*, p.174
297 Casséus, *Quelle*, p.10
301 Cooper, *Controversies*, p.174; Reinert, *How*, p.240
**Feature 7. Socio-political Absenteeism**

Alongside palliative economics stands socio-political absenteeism. Nicholls notes that ‘No government in the history of Haiti had done anything significant to improve the lot of the masses and this was not the criterion by which a regime was judged’. Furthermore, Buss and Gardner point out that ‘Donors funded just about everything in Haiti, except democratization, governance, and public sector reform’. It is within this relatively socio-political inactivity, therefore, that HP’s mission pattern has somewhat excluded in-depth transforming debates on socio-political issues from its public engagement. It has rather been grappling with its faith allegiance to holistic mission in a context of primacy to evangelical proclamation. Fontus observes that the gospel is concerned with the first set of realities, personal salvation and pragmatic missional services since the second set, that is, confronting the power structures towards in-depth social transformation is alien to their orthopraxis.

Casséus further points out that this is a church which, through evangelical proclamation, has denounced the devil’s activity through idolatry, Voodoo practices and immorality, but remained prophetically timid on the work of the devil in the context of exploitation, political and socio-economic oppression, injustice, self-centeredness and systemic corruption in Haitian society. In response, Noelliste indicates that, ‘The net consequence of this stance is the abandonment of the political domain to its own devices. It contributed to the emergence of a public square bereft of evangelical witness and prophetic challenge’. In this context, the apparent absence of HP on the socio-political scene, to address the cause of the dehumanising

---

302 Nicholls, *From*, p.247
303 Buss & Gardner, *Haiti*, p.5
304 HP has built schools, health care services and managed a multiplicity of micro-social projects. Precisely, HP has been publicly visible and active but in palliative terms. Its absence is noticeable at the level of consistent public conscientization, prophetic visioning and righteousness in political affairs in the direction of a comprehensive social transformation. Noelliste ‘Poverty’, *Evangelical*, p.317; Fontus, *Les Églises*, pp.106-116
305 Alain Rocourt, ‘The Challenge of Development in Haiti’ in Mitchell (ed.), *With Eyes*, pp.71-81
306 Fontus, *Les Églises*, pp.113-116
307 Casséus, *Haïti*, pp.5-6
308 Noelliste ‘Poverty’, *Evangelical*, p.317
conditions of Haitian people, is unintentional but is a statement of the Church’s missional inexperience and acceptance of the tantalizing power of aid-dependency.

I now turn to the necessity for a supplementary positive mission engagement.

2.2.2 Supplementary Positive Mission Engagement

Throughout this Article, the emphasis of the dialogue has been to stimulate critical reflections on the missional interplay between holistic mission and numerical church growth on the axis of aid-dependency. According to Stone and Heitzenrater, in holistic mission, the proclaimed gospel is spoken to diverse communities of people for whom, as the grace of God abounds, the existing sinful social life has become gradually dehumanising to them, hence the yearning for transformation.309 Furthermore, with an emphasis on the Methodist perspective, the proclaimed gospel in Haiti ought to result in the creation of a redeemed community whose righteousness as a paradigmatic alternative socio-political existence aids to transform Haitian society.310 Precisely, the Haitian redeemed community, through the evangelical consequences of its social involvement, has borne witness to the transforming grace of Christ towards the redemption of humanity in our anthropological composition. However, on literary evidence, the pragmatism of an in-depth social transformation continues to be an aspirational target in HP.

Such an evangelical consequence finds its rootedness in the 1974 Lausanne Covenant311 and the subsequent report of the Grand Rapids Summit, held in 1982. The Covenant advocated the co-existence of evangelical proclamation and social transformation so that the restoration of

---

309 Brian Stone, *Evangelism after Christendom, the Theology and Practice of Christian Witness* (Grand Rapids, MI: Brazos Press, 2007), pp.178-190
311 It advocates ‘the whole church to take the whole gospel to the whole world’. Available: http://www.lausanne.org/en/?option=com_content&view=article&catid=26&Itemid=296 (accessed 25 May 2013)
humanity could be all-encompassing. The Grand Rapids report went further to note that evangelism and social action are partners like the two blades of a pair of scissors. Within the context of HP, a question arises: of the two aspects of mission - evangelical proclamation and social transformation - which one embodies primacy? With the knowledge that the Christian faith finds its rootedness in missio trinitatis, a corresponding question emerges: What definite theological legitimacy is given for the ascription of primacy to one aspect of mission versus the equality of both aspects? In this instance, the necessity to integrate these two blades in missional praxis has triggered the appearance of the Micah Declaration which adopted the concept of holistic mission.

Holistic mission juxtaposes the outcome of evangelical proclamation with the enactment of social transformation into practices which underpin the telos of abundant living. These practices then reciprocally bear witness to the need for inward spiritual changes with the capacity to keep society transformed. The Covenant defined it in these words: ‘Integral mission or holistic transformation is the proclamation and demonstration of the Gospel’. Therefore, holistic transformation interweaves the spiritual and the material, the proclamation and demonstration of the gospel, and loving God and loving neighbour in accordance with God’s activity in creation.

314 Micah Declaration explains, ‘It is not simply that evangelism and social involvement are to be done alongside each other. Rather, in holistic mission our proclamation has social consequences as we call people to love and repentance in all areas of life. And our social involvement has evangelistic consequences as we bear witness to the transforming grace of Jesus Christ’. Available: https://www.micahnetwork.org/sites/default/files/doc/page/mn_integral_mission_declaration_en.pdf (accessed 27 May 2013)
316 Certain missiologists advocate that mission and evangelism are neither to be polarized nor to become dichotomous; mission is by definition, holistic. Jean Paul Heldt, ‘Revisiting the Whole Gospel: Towards a Biblical Model of Holistic Mission in the 21st Century,’ Missiology 32:2 (2004), pp.149-172 [166]; Tim Chester,
In the context of this Article, a reference to the creation of a redeemed community points to HP’s numerical growth which peaked at 44 percent of the national population. Admittedly, in holistic mission, the co-existence of these large numbers of converts and the poverty-stricken conditions in HP’s space is causing friction because ‘Personal salvation must mean at the same time a commitment for structural social change’.  

_Theological Reflection_ - The activity of delving into the ethos of holistic mission raises theological issues for HP. For example, should a better quality of life, that is, a socially transformed Haiti, arise in direct proportion to this exponential numerical growth? In support of numerous writers, I answer in the affirmative. My affirmation raises another issue: How has the increasing number of Protestants demonstrated the qualitatively transformed life which would require them to radically transform Haitian society? Again, in support of numerous writers, they have not yet. The ‘not-yet’ of this transformed life is not unique to Haiti as Maggay observes, ‘For decades now there has been considerable church growth in many Two-Thirds World countries, but this has yet to impact the level of corruption in governance’.  

Given the primacy of its evangelical proclamation, evidence suggests that HP has been conditioned to safeguard its eschatologically spiritualized faith. Its orthopraxis has therefore lacked the missiological knack to replicate and translate these peripheral and essential successes into a large-scale sustainable transformation, particularly in matters of political ideology, religious mind-sets and social worldview. Cooper adds:

> Charity is only needed when a situation of injustice exists. On its own, charity is not enough; it leaves the person ‘giving’ with the power. It does not ask how to achieve a just system, where no one holds greater economic, political, racial, gender, or other types of power over another human being.  

---


317 Williams, *Caribbean*, p.xi  


319 Cooper, *Controversies*, p.175
In this context, a distance between these types of pragmatic missional activities and prophetic-driven visioning is incongruous to in-depth economic and political transformation in HP’s disempowering space.

Continuing with this argument, Thacker appreciates William Wilberforce’s intriguing choice.\(^\text{320}\) Having been faced with the noble possibility of raising fund to free thousands of slaves from the physical and mental bondage of slavery, he resolved to campaign for the abolition of the mercantile slave trade itself as the ideology underpinning the physical and mental bondage of slavery.\(^\text{321}\) Both initiatives, ‘raising fund’ and ‘abolition campaigns’ are integrated components of holistic mission. However, in HP, the literature revealed that there is a disproportionality in the amounts of time, ideas, energy, theology and visions invested in ‘raising fund’, ‘palliative economics’ and ‘political absenteeism’ compared with the negligibility of the said resources being invested in ‘abolition campaigns’ and ‘development economics’.

The imperative of a paradigm shift will therefore engage the church to revisit the limited positivity of its orthopraxis in its missional representation of the telos of missio trinitatis through an ongoing theological scrutiny. This further requires that the ever-increasing numbers of Protestants strive for equilibrium between attending to the symptoms of systemic evil and eroding with urgency, but patiently, its foundational strength.


\(^{321}\) Thacker, ‘From’, Transformation, p.112
2.3 Why is this Going on in Haitian Protestantism? 

Interpretative Task

To formulate answers by solely adhering to arguments drawn from published literature, at the exclusion of impoverished aid-recipients’ and local people’s experiences, serves to perpetuate the imperialistic model in which aid-dependency thrives. Nonetheless, pending contributions from empirical data, the distinctive point-in-focus in this task provides a theological, economic, political and sociological interpretation of issues highlighted in published literature. Precisely, in parallel with the previous two definitions of aid-dependency, I propose that in HP aid-dependency is the world church’s sustained biblical pragmatism of aid-generosity, distributed and received, through secular aid-modalities, within the partnership of givers’ empowered paternalism and receivers’ disparaged dignity which turns out to be palliative economic care within the family of God. Therefore, this is going on in HP because disempowering aid-dependency’s modalities inhibit poverty-alleviation initiatives.

Conclusion

The interplay between aid-dependency, church growth and holistic mission demonstrates that aid-dependency is a dominantly recurrent theme in aid-literature in HP. With an emphasis on Haiti in which, according to Thomson, nothing has really changed since its political independence, this question arises: Has Haiti [HP] been better off as a result of increased aid-injections? Ironically, evidence produced by the overlapping theoretical categories TCII and TCIII confirms Thomson’s argument. Moreover, it supports the claim that aid-dependency’s functionality has disempowered HP. Therefore, Haitian writers’ contributions help to

---

322 See ‘Conclusion’, p.54
323 Rowell, To Give, pp.15-16. Core Theme B, p.134 & Core Theme C, p.152
324 Thomson, Bonjour, p.317
acknowledge the definite reality which moves them from romantic idealism to a desired paradigm shift through praxis.

Jeanty refers to aid-dependency in terms of the required catalyst towards an upward financial mobility with foreign missionaries’ affluence being the aspirational target. Casséus describes it as paternalistic and patronising. Guiteau and Louis pitch it unto a platform of partnership which interlaced HP’s mission dreams with those of foreign believers. They posit that, in this partnership, FMDs’ amplified immaturity in HP to justify their need for coaching, companionship and governance experience. Romain re-joins Jeanty to classify aid-dependency as a cyclic phenomenon fuelled by financial pressure and leadership promotion. Griffiths depicts it as the relevant and intriguing history of one Connexional Church community caught in a dyadic governance structure undergirded by corresponding cultural dynamisms which are alien to both the foreign and the local churches. In this light, Romain gives his understanding of the scope of dependency in the indigenous church:

61 percent of Protestant churches nurtured dependent ties with outsiders. They are practiced in financial, statutory and organizational terms, under various terminologies like affiliation, collaboration, cooperation, liaison, and fellowship.

In this aid-dependency culture the missional impulse of a growing Christian community has been, in ecclesiastical terms, controlled by a minority of foreign Christians on the missional worth of aid. In fact, this missional praxis has persistently deferred the in-depth transformation of HP’s space which has been prone to enduring continuous economic set-backs to the disadvantage of the economically poor. In this light, a supplementary positive mission engagement will require the discontinuance of the current disempowering aid-dependency’s

326 Casséus, *Haiti*, p.89
328 Griffiths, *History*, p.72
functionality towards a new orthodoxy which will empower HP and help to transform the reality in the descriptive-empirical task.

In its evolution, the central hypothesis is enhanced by contextual realities. It moves from being ‘Aid-dependency has disempowered LICs’ to being ‘Aid-dependency has disempowered Haiti by inhibiting self-sufficiency’. In this context, therefore, the hypothesis gets re-designated ‘Aid-dependency has disempowered Haitian Protestantism by inhibiting self-sufficiency’.

A question arises: how does this portfolio define self-sufficiency in the context of the research? In response, at the consciousness level, self-sufficiency is the increasing capacity to transform disempowering ideological, theological, missiological, economic, and cultural conditioning by which Haiti [HP] is defined, and by extension, consistently conscientized to reduce its colonial deficits and strengthen emulation determinations. Procedurally, it presupposes the normalisation of aid-receivers’ ‘informed consent’ to determine in co-responsibility with aid-providers the path of their economic well-being. In this instance, self-sufficiency in economic terms proceeds from self-worth affirmation. Pragmatically, self-sufficiency refers to HP’s sustained capacity to acquire and invest, through multi-lateral partnerships, contextually needed-assets towards economic profitability which exceeds aid-necessities. Consequently, HP will exhibit co-responsibility towards, eventually, cutting itself off, at the appropriate time, from unhealthy dependency as a participant in the redemptive missional mandate worldwide.

In the next Section, I explore the potential connection of the hypothesis with on-the-ground realities.

---

330 For colonial deficits, see p.54
331 For emulation, see ‘Foreign Expertise and Recalibration’, p.252
332 See ‘Breaking the Disempowering Silence of Low Self-esteem’, p.261
333 Casséus, Haiti, p.101; Romain, Le Protestantisme (1985), p.320
Section Two: Application and Outcome of Research Methodology

Chapter 3. Research Design, a Multi-Disciplinary Methodology

Introduction
This research design carves an empirical pathway for the exploration of the nature of aid-dependency in HP from a Methodist perspective. To do this, I propose to examine the field research in the light of the aim of the research inquiry and the research question. The pathway will, therefore, juxtapose etic and emic findings and combine essential components of the research into an effective theory generating and testing sequence. By etic finding, I refer to the literary aid-based hypothesis and the emerging TCI, TCII and TCIII as described in Chapter 2. For emic finding, I rely on the outcome of the empirical enquiry which this Section pursues. Next, I delineate the empirical pathway and justify the application of a multi-disciplinary research strategy, a case study methodology and practical theology. This feeds into methods of data collection and procedures for data analysis. Throughout, I elucidate the dynamics of the limitations of the research inquiry.

In what ensues, I delineate the evolution of the design.

3.1 Proposed Field of Study and Thesis Question
The ecclesiastical typologies, as outlined earlier, overlap on the pivot of aid-dependency so that HP’s culture of dependency is, in fact, a macrocosm of HMC’s. By implication, the Methodist perspective on aid-dependency will be a summation of HP’s perspective because it resonates with aid-dependency’s features of HP’s ecclesiastical typologies.

An established consensus of a scholarly or empirical statement of HP’s perspective on aid-

dependency has neither fully captured HP’s interests nor has it been the focus of HMC. In the absence of pre-determined sets of written propositions, a Methodist perspective contextualizes HP’s range of perspectives and is dissected in the chemistry of the components of the research inquiry of which I highlight six:

1. My perspective as a Methodist researcher, even in its stickiest objectivity, will replicate an aspect of Methodist ethos in the search for, as a contribution to, a more objective and all-embracing Protestant ethos of aid-dependency.  

2. The perspective is rooted in core Methodist materials, including its constitution, literary works on John Wesley and Methodism, and the archives of HMC. Further afield, it is underpinned by published literature.  

3. A number of non-Methodist research-participants of the Methodist workforce share their experiences with aid-dependency within a Methodist perspective as an enfolding reality of their interaction with HMC. Besides, Methodist participant-workers evidence a sharper and thicker Methodist perspective of aid-dependency in their responses.  

4. Therefore, a Methodist perspective becomes a critical analysis of Methodist social ethics, mission, and ministry in dialogue with diversified sources in order to articulate a new missiological imperative and re-imagine an ecclesiastical pathway.  

5. ‘Methodist ecclesiology is characterized by the making of exceptions’ as expressed

---

335 See ‘Researcher’s Reflexivity’, p.114  
337 These include: Bird, The Black; Pressoir; Le Protestantisme (1945); Jennings, ‘Good News’ in Logan, Theology; Wilson, Doing; Thomas C. Oden, Ethics and Society, John Wesley’s Teachings (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2014); See also ‘Theological Reflection and Action Practice’, p.119  
339 See Chapter 1 & Chapter 2  
340 See Chapter 4  
341 See Chapter 6  
342 See Chapter 7
in its distinctive identity. As such, existentially, HMC believes that:

God has raised up the Church to liberate Haitians from all forms of prisons which prevent them from realizing their full potential as children of God and to give a voice to the silent majority.

Development for us is a set of life-changing tasks which aims to affect the real needs of individuals and communities. It is concerned with not only ‘elementary’ needs [food, work and housing] but also includes the right of people to express themselves, to share ideas and demonstrate their desires to participate in the shaping of their own existence and to help to determine the future of the Haitian community. This will be through both their awareness of the causes that dehumanize their lives and the awareness of the consequences which will result from critical interrogation.

For us, the participation of the Church in development is not specifically at the 'technical' level but more fundamentally at the consciousness level of human beings.

However, a Methodist perspective on social witness differs from those of its local counterparts. Romain and Fontus explain: Protestants have had no say in politics apart from praying for those in authority. ‘They are foreigners and travellers on this earth and must focus on their heavenly home’.

6. The perspective does not flow from the largest numerical church and mission operations in HP. Its missional work illustrates this fact. From 29 members in 1818, HMC’s membership has peaked at 17,908 in 2008. It owns 110 chapels and is constituted of 125 local churches and served by a staff of 16 ministers. It owns and manages 82 schools, 5 health centres and 2 centres for the formation of agricultural agents and a multiplex socio-economic, learning and resource centre. Currently, in its social witness, it employs project managers, teachers, micro-credit agents, nurses and doctors,

---

343 Mark W. Stamm, *Let Every Soul Be Jesus’ Guest, A Theology of the Open Table* (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 2006), pp.28-31. However, Methodist distinctive emphasis on social justice is largely shared by churches of the inherited typology.
344 MDC-HMC1979
346 Fontus, *Les Églises*, p.107
347 For comparison, see ‘Baptist Typology’, p.105
348 In a report to England in 1818, James Catts and John Brown wrote: We have entered into our class register 29 names worthy of our entry. This is the number we graciously ask to be registered in the minutes. *Pressoir, Le Protestantisme* (1945), p.90; MDC-HMC2009
agronomists and agricultural agents, farmers, and architects, engineers and construction workers.\textsuperscript{349} However, 65 percent of its recurrent budget is financed by foreign counterparts.\textsuperscript{350}

However, the scope and intensity of HMC’s mission and the corresponding aid-dependency’s features it generates represent HP’s.

Drawing from the above realities I confirm that HMC affords HP a platform from which to launch the research inquiry in order to articulate its perspective on aid-dependency. The field of study, therefore, intersects HMC and HP in such a way that the particularity of the Methodist context, in a generic sense, is chosen more for convenience and practical reasons in which to explore the research question.

\textbf{3.1.1 Aims of the Research Inquiry} - Inquiring into aid-dependency’s functionality within HP is equated with utilising the required research methods to generate empirical data from participants and archival materials. Continuing with this aim, the inquiry will further explore aid-dependency’s features in respect of the thesis question, namely: From the perspective of the Methodist Church, how does aid-dependency function in HP? These features and concepts, having helped to identify the central hypothesis, include:

2. Aid-dependency’s relationship with theology and socio-economic development
3. Economic self-sufficiency and socio-political transformation
4. Relationships between the providing and receiving churches
5. Exploration of the \textit{Bondye-bon} theological attitude
6. The purpose of foreign-aid

\textsuperscript{349} MDC-HMC2009
\textsuperscript{350} MDC-HMC2009
The exploration will aim to expand and test the central hypothesis and potentially generate on-the-ground functionalities of aid-dependency within HP’s empirical praxis. It will potentially delineate other manifestations of the hypothesis.

3.2 Methodology of Inquiry

Instead of focussing on a specific method, Creswell advises that it is more practical to emphasize the research problem. Such an emphasis will provide me with the latitude to embrace the methods which are applicable to the Haitian context. Arising from this emphasis, I resolve to use a mixed-methods research which integrates qualitative and quantitative strategies in this epistemological task. These strategies will be mutually illuminating and complementary and will allow their various strengths to be capitalized upon and weaknesses offset somewhat. The goal is to produce similar results using methods with different strengths. This approach is also known as triangulation or cross-validation. Despite some scholars’ arguments about the existence of incompatibility within the mixed-methods research, the prevailing scientific view is that the mixed-methods research becomes both feasible and desirable. The point is that according to Hammersley there are more overlaps than differences within the mixed-methods research.

355 I do not propose to carry out the debate in this work.
356 Bryman, Social, p.603. In fact, qualitative and quantitative results should complement each other to create a meaningful whole according to the object and purpose of the investigation. Adrijana B. Starman, ‘The Case Study as a Type of Qualitative Research’, Journal of Contemporary Educational Studies 1 (2013), pp.28–43
I now seek to integrate the mixed-methods research in a (1) case study methodology and (2) practical theology.

3.2.1 Case Study Methodology

In a mixed-methods research a case study is frequently a site for the application of both qualitative and quantitative research design.\(^{357}\) Exponents of the case study methodology often favour qualitative research methods as they are particularly helpful in the detailed examination of a case.\(^{358}\) However, Gillham observes that ‘Case study research does not equate qualitative methods and data only. They are predominant, but quantitative data and its analysis can add to the overall picture’.\(^{359}\) Because the case study methodology is predominantly qualitative, the research will tend to take an inductive approach to the relationship between theory and research.\(^{360}\)

In qualitative strategy, the combination of multiple methodical practices, empirical materials and the perspectives of the researcher in a single study is best understood as a strategy that will add rigour, breath, complexity, richness and depth to this theory testing and generation process.\(^{361}\) It will therefore subject to a comprehensible exploration the theoretical assumption of the research inquiry, namely aid-dependency and its working in HP.\(^{362}\)

The case study, with a specific reference to HMC, will investigate a case in considerable

\(^{357}\) Case study methodology may also be quantitative or contain a combination of qualitative and quantitative approaches. Starman, ‘The Case’, \textit{Journal}, p.31
\(^{358}\) Bryman, \textit{Social}, p.53
\(^{360}\) Bryman, \textit{Social}, p.55
As Bryman observes ‘What distinguishes a case study is that the researcher is usually concerned to elucidate the unique features of the case’. It will be detailed, open-ended and exploratory in character and will be concerned with holistic orientation, facilitation of theory generation and stimulation of further reflection, optimising readers’ opportunity to learn. The case study will aim to capture the particular, indeed the unique, in its complexity in order to reveal its own story of the phenomenon. Thus, it implies the collection of unstructured data and qualitative analysis of these data and, therefore, aims at analytical and not empirical generalization or veridical representation.

However, in this context of a shared dependency culture, I adopt Bryman’s concept of ‘exemplifying case’, that is, HMC exemplifies a broader category of which it is a member and a study of its case will provide a suitable context for the research question to be answered. Precisely, in this context, the case study will aim to generalize findings into substantive and definitive functionalities of aid-dependency within HP.

This means the inquiry will not necessitate cumulative and comparative case studies from several churches at different times in order to generalize. The case study will be carried out within the perspective of HMC, serving as a frame of reference and a dialogue partner on behalf of HP. This is on the literary evidence that the aid-dependency culture is not unique to a specific Protestant church but a permanent feature of the entire HP. Thus, the focus of the case study

---

364 Which will include both idiographic and nomothetic elements in that they are concerned with generating statements regardless of time and place. Bryman, Social, p.54
365 Stake ‘Case’, in Handbook, p.41
368 Bryman, Social, p.56
will be on HMC and its content will be aid-dependency.

According to Paton, the case study will be focussing on descriptions and the essence of shared experience and aim at gaining a deeper meaning of the participants’ everyday experiences. Anything in relation to aid-dependency that presents itself to consciousness will be significantly of interest to the theoretical framework of the case study methodology. Consequently, my task consists of collecting data to develop theoretical analyses while I seek to learn what is occurring in the field of research and capture the message participants’ experiences is sending.

These experiences will be bracketed, analysed, and compared to identify the essences of the phenomenon. The process will assume commonalities in those human experiences and will rigorously use the method of bracketing to search for those commonalities. This will imply that I make sense of participants’ experiences and how they interpret what they experienced in relation to the research problem.

The case study will generate data which I will study, separate, and synthetize through qualitative coding. Coding distils data and therefore will give me a handle to sort masses of raw data and compare segments of data. Through studying the data, comparing them and writing memos on them, I will define ideas that best fit and interpret them as analytical categories. The process will help me to determine alternative meanings and the working scope

$^{371}$ Patton, *Qualitative*, pp.104-105
$^{372}$ Patton, *Qualitative*, p.106
of the phenomenon. As a qualitative method of data collection and analysis, a case study is rich in meaning and rewarding for analysis.\textsuperscript{375}

The theoretical framework of the case study puts an emphasis as well on the hermeneutics of situations. What aid-dependency means depends on the socio-cultural and economic context in which it was originally experienced as well as the cultural context within which it will subsequently be interpreted.\textsuperscript{376} For example, foreign wealth extraction in Haiti, the dire socio-economic conditions and the church’s culture of reticent advocacy vis-à-vis the politics of the country will provide a broader reading context to augment the quality of findings on the subject.

The case study aims to generate substantive theoretical propositions because it addresses research problems in specific comprehensible methods. Consistent with this analysis, a completed case study meets the following criteria: a close fit with the data, usefulness as contribution to knowledge, and conceptual density, durability over time, modifiability and explanatory power.\textsuperscript{377}

However, in order to broaden understanding and strengthen the rigour of the case study with a view to generating substantive and definitive aid-functionalities, the incorporation of quantitative data will be solicited. This is where a questionnaire will essentially be incorporated. Whereas the research questionnaire will generate a broad, generalizable set of findings presented succinctly and economically, it will help to explain, affirm or expand the qualitative data. Furthermore, it will provide the inquiry with quantitative description of opinions of a population of the HP’s membership and network of friends towards enriching, understanding and deepening the exploratory process of the research question.

\textsuperscript{375} Starman, ‘The Case’, \textit{Journal}, pp.28-43
\textsuperscript{376} Patton, \textit{Qualitative}, pp.113-115
Furthermore, in this mixed-methods research the case study will engage in dialogue with principles of practical theology.

3.2.2 Practical Theology

Regarding practical theology, relevant dialogues will enable and guide the descriptive and interpretative processes of priestly listening and enacting sagely wisdom. While I apply them as a technique to the literature review in Section One, they will nonetheless be essential to the field research as participants tell and write their experiences in Section Two. Adhering to the core tasks of practical theology is equated with the art of priestly listening to participants’ thick experiences with aid-dependency. Such listening will facilitate theological trends to emerge. Also, practical theology will aim to exercise constant scrutiny of the process of testing the central hypothesis. As Swinton observes, practical theology is critical reflection on the actions of the church in the light of the gospel and Christian tradition.378

Furthermore, in Section Three the dialogue will equally stimulate theological reflections on HP’s missional norms and will create a new culture of listening, conversation, active theologising and transformational action in response to the descriptive-empirical task in Section One. Section Three will create space for visioning and co-responsibility.

The outcome of the exploration will aim to encompass the envisaged theological framework of reflective and focused activities in the direction of social transformation through Christ who inhabits our history. This Section will also generate strategies towards transforming the current orthodoxy and orthopraxis in HP.379 Protestants then will be required to generate social

379 Mission requires both orthodoxy, a concern for the integrity of the gospel and right rules and orthopraxis, a concern for right practice and the way such practice is carried out. Samuel Escobar, The New Global Mission, the Gospel from Everywhere to Everyone (Downers Grove, Il: InterVarsity Press, 2003), p.25

98
transformation through their transformed lives, thus transforming, by their being in the world, Haitian society into a new Haiti.

The mixed-methods approach will adopt an exploratory embedded strategy. This strategy will require the use of one data collection phase during which both quantitative and qualitative data will be simultaneously collected and brought in together for data processing, analysis and scrutiny.\(^\text{380}\) Whereas the primary guiding method for the research inquiry will be qualitative, the secondary database which provides expansion will be quantitative.

In conclusion, the resulting empirical data will aim to fulfil the objective of testing the hypothesis and generating aid-based substantive functionalities through the lenses of existing concepts of disempowerment.\(^\text{381}\) I therefore proceed to integrate the strands of the qualitative and quantitative research strategies into data collection methods.

### 3.3 Methods of Data Collection

The mixed-methods research seeks not to understand one, but multiple realities.\(^\text{382}\) This will therefore provide me with the latitude to choose the methods, techniques and procedures of research that will best suit HP’s context and the aims of the research.\(^\text{383}\) The process will embrace the idea of bricolage which acknowledges that in exploring a particular phenomenon the multi-perspectives are unpicked and examined, and this requires a range of methodological approaches to ensure that many viewpoints are expressed.\(^\text{384}\) In brief, the inquiry will exclude pre-determined theories, open-closed questions, but include multi-forms of data drawing on all

\(^\text{382}\) Creswell, *Research*, p.195
\(^\text{383}\) Creswell, *Research*, p.11
\(^\text{384}\) Fulton, Kuit, Sanders & Smith, *The Professional*, p.52
possibilities.\textsuperscript{385} The emerging type of data will be text information, recording and reporting the voice of the participants.\textsuperscript{386} In this pursuit, I, therefore, apply the following four research methods. They are (1) interview, (2) questionnaire, (3) focus groups, and (4) archival materials.

It is worth pointing out, at this juncture, that seeking congruence and coherence in the application of the mixed-methods and techniques will be pivotal in the research inquiry process. The first step in the research design will be a demonstration of the appropriateness of these methods in their application to the Haitian reality within which aid-dependency has been embedded. I begin the said step with (a) the application of a pilot study, (b) the application of methods and samples, and (c) outcome of effective pilot.

\textit{a. Application of a Pilot Study:} In order to avoid or minimize epistemological pitfalls, the actual wording of the questionnaire and interview questions were of paramount importance such that pretesting was crucial to the inquiry process. In response, a pilot became an empirical necessity. It sought to test the reliability, validity and practicability of the questionnaire and interview wordings and schedules, eliminate ambiguities and provide feedback on the formats of questions. It further helped me to discern whether or otherwise the research question was missing the point in the light of this methodological undertaking.\textsuperscript{387} It provided me with a fair idea of the time to be taken to complete the questionnaire. As Cohen, Manion and Morrison outline, the pilot helps to determine whether the questionnaire is too long or too short, too easy or too difficult, too engaging, too threatening, too intrusive or too offensive.\textsuperscript{388} The outcome of the pilot also helped me to test the coding or category system for data analysis.\textsuperscript{389}

\textsuperscript{385} Creswell,\textit{ Research}, p.15  
\textsuperscript{386} Creswell,\textit{ Research}, p.16  
\textsuperscript{387} Helen Cameron & Catherine Duce, \textit{Researching Practice in Ministry and Mission, a Companion} (London: SCM Press, 2013), p.47  
\textsuperscript{388} Cohen, Manion & Morrison, \textit{Research}, pp.260-261  
I then welcomed the responses of the pilot questionnaires and the interviews of 20 participants of whom 10 were former Haitian Methodist ministers, 5 were employees of HMC and the other 5 were undergraduate students of an interdenominational seminary in Cap-Haitian, in the North of Haiti. The research inquiry benefitted from those data collecting methods.

In respect of episcopal leadership, I solicited the experiences of Fède Jean-Pierre, a former Chairman [bishop] of HMC. His contributions have equally enabled me to restructure the pilot interview questions. Furthermore, I solicited the participation of Sandra Lopez, a British Methodist foreign leader, who had been appointed to receive grant application portfolios on behalf of the Methodist Church in Britain [hereafter MCB] from Church partners across the Americas. In regard to focus groups, however, owing to geographical distance and group dynamics issues, the inquiry did not pilot interview questions in the identified focus groups in Haiti.

b. Application of Methods and Samples: The inquiry will engage the services of 4 population units. The first population unit will include the episcopal and lay leadership of HP with a particular focus on 5 bishops/presidents and 3 project managers. The second population unit will consist of 2 opinion leaders and 2 leaders of foreign missions. The third population unit will comprise employees, namely 12 ministers and 40 school teachers. The fourth unit will focus on 3 church-based focus groups of respectively 15, 70, and 29 participants. In summary, 178 participants have agreed to share their experiences with aid-dependency. In addition to those populations, archival materials will consist of 5 emails, 12 project reports and 12 conference minutes. See Chart One below for more detail.

---

390 See Appendix 1, p.306
391 See Appendix 2, p.309
392 See Appendix 3, p.310
Procedurally, the research inquiry will involve a mix-methods approach:

- the episcopal leadership, managerial lay leadership, opinion leaders and leaders of foreign missions will be interviewed through a semi-structured interview method,

- employees [ministers and schoolteachers] will complete a questionnaire,

- the church-based groups will be interviewed via the focus groups method of data gathering, and finally

- archival materials will be treated qualitatively.

As was stated earlier, in these procedures, both qualitative and quantitative data will enrich the results.\(^3\)

---

\(^3\) Creswell, *Research*, pp.214-215
c. *Outcome of Effective Pilot:* The use of a pilot was instrumental in helping me to fine-tune the questionnaire and interview materials in five ways. In Appendix 1, feedback on the length of time taken by participants to complete the pilot questionnaires prompted me to reduce the instrument to 14 questions. Additionally, the need for a condensed questionnaire arose when I noticed similarities in responses to a few questions, namely 2, 3 and 6 then 4 and 5. Thirdly, I thought it more feasible to point participants’ thoughts to three overlapping focal aid-based ministries, namely the ‘Haitian Protestant Church’, ‘your local church’ and ‘your local school’ by emphasising impact on self-worth, poverty-alleviation, self-sufficiency and other ministries. Fourthly, for an easier flow of communication I needed to change the way I initially phrased the questions. Fifthly, in Appendix 2, focal point 3 became superfluous, given the objectives of focal points 1 and 2. Regarding Appendix 3, I removed focal points 3, 6, 9 and 11 because in Sandra Lopez’s response to focal points 2 and 4 the informant expanded her response to cover 3 and 6. Overall, the pilot was technically and substantially useful.

### 3.3.1 Interview

Semi-structured interviews will be applicable to the inquiry.\(^\text{394}\) It is then fitting that I examine closely the interview method. I am aware that semi-structured interviews are time consuming for the participants and further rely on their ability to accurately and honestly recall the circumstances about their experiences which relate to the research questions. Furthermore, on my part, in addition to the tape-recording of the sessions, the interview method requires that I accumulate direct quotations from the participants about their thoughts, feelings and knowledge.\(^\text{395}\) Nonetheless, semi-structured interviews are a pivotal instrument in qualitative

---

\(^{394}\) Clough & Nuthbrown, *A student*, p.25

\(^{395}\) Fetterman, *Ethnography*, p.39
they solicit information and therefore help to generate new categories of meaning.\textsuperscript{397}

Questions, thus, will initially aim to shape the participants’ responses to test the central hypothesis. However, they will be phrased within the perspective of the insiders in line with the theoretical assumption.\textsuperscript{398} Interviews will be conducted in French, Haitian Creole and English according to the participants’ linguistic preference. They will also create the type of fieldwork context which will enable live interaction with participants. As an interviewer it is imperative that I am a skilled observer, sensitive to how the interview setting could affect what will be said. I will need to note nonverbal messages and other aspects, namely: tone, stresses, and facial expressions which are crucially valuable in conveying meaning in the Haitian culture.\textsuperscript{399} I will carefully be attuned to the nuances of the interviewer-interviewee interaction and relationship.\textsuperscript{400}

Interviews will occur through face to face encounters, except one which will be conducted via telephone. They will be tape-recorded via digital devices, namely smart phones and tape recorders which, for practical reasons and local familiarity, will be friendlier and less cumbersome.\textsuperscript{401} Adequate provisions of batteries and battery charging facilities for the digital devices will be included as power supply sources are not always available in all places in Haiti.

\textit{Episcopal Leadership} - I will solicit the participation of bishops from the three ecclesiastical typologies. To reiterate, their participation will add scope and depth to the case study methodology of the inquiry.

\textsuperscript{396} Cameron & Duce, \textit{Researching}, pp.81-92
\textsuperscript{398} Fetterman, \textit{Ethnography}, p.39
\textsuperscript{400} Patton, \textit{Qualitative}, p.27
\textsuperscript{401} This is recommended by Wellington, \textit{Educational}, pp.84-86
a. *Inherited Typology* – Three Methodist episcopal leaders will be interviewed:

- Gesner Paul, in his capacity as the sitting HMC president.\(^{402}\)
- Raphael Dessieu, a former HMC president (2000 - 2009).\(^ {403}\)
- Junie Hyacinthe, a medical doctor and a non-stipendiary Methodist minister.\(^ {404}\)

b. *Baptist Typology* – The episcopal leaders to be interviewed from the Baptist Movement will be:

- Luders Erasme, a former president of MEBSH.\(^ {405}\) He led MEBSH for nine years. It comprised 282 churches with a membership of 40,000.\(^ {406}\)
- Jules Casséus, a prolific writer. He served as rector and dean of the Haitian Baptist Theological Seminary and president of the Haut-Limbé Baptist Church in Haiti.\(^ {407}\)

c. *Pentecostal Mixed Typology* – Representing this typology will be:

- Edgard Louissaint, an evangelist-bishop. The streams of social services his mission provides include orphanages, nursing homes, primary schools, scholarship grants, artesian wells and farming projects.\(^ {408}\)

Due to geographical and financial challenges, I will solicit information from him via a telephone interview. Aside from its relative accuracy, Frankfort-Nachmias and Nachmias observe that telephone interviews tend to increase the quality of the data.\(^ {409}\) They put participants at ease to answer questions and therefore generate greater volume of data in the

---

\(^{402}\) The Methodist president in this context assumes episcopal responsibilities.

\(^{403}\) MDC-HMC2002; MDC-HMC2009

\(^{404}\) Hyacinthe is not in an episcopal function. I justify her interview in this category on the basis that she is the sole local presbyter (female) of HMC. Furthermore, she received and administrated foreign resources in her private hospital in which she has built and nurtured a church. See: Junie F. Hyacinthe, *Vivre Beaucoup Mieux, Manuel d’Éducation pour la Santé* (Port-au-Prince: Haiti, Imprimerie Méthodiste, 2013), p.3


absence of a physical presence sharing the interviewee’s space. Despite this volume of data, however, I will miss reading the participant’s body language. The assurance is that in the telephone interview the quality of the data will not be lost.\textsuperscript{410} I expect his interview to reflect the hermeneutics of this church movement which is shaping his vocation.

\textit{Managerial Lay Leadership} - Managerial lay leadership refers to project managers. They often prepare budgets, administrate funds, coordinate projects, employ and supervise local people. Depending on the projects, managers and local people often work alongside or under the supervision of foreign missionaries. Within this population unit the following lay leaders will participate:

- Inette Durandis, an agronomist, who is a former director of \textit{Coordination du Development}\textsuperscript{411} in HMC.

- Eric Clarke and Samuel Abicher, engineers. Clarke built the Lévêque Methodist School\textsuperscript{412} and Samuel began the reconstruction of the Nouveau College Bird.\textsuperscript{413}

\textit{Opinion Leaders} - These are local leaders who have become the voice of HP in public forums, seminars, roundtables, consultations, and on burning issues. They influence opinions in both churches, both local and foreign. I will solicit the input of two opinion leaders:

- Charles-Poisset Romain, a Baptist theologian and scholar in development science. He has been a prolific writer.\textsuperscript{414}

\textsuperscript{410} Bryman, \textit{Social}, pp.457-458  
\textsuperscript{411} This church organization coordinates a range of diversified development projects.  
\textsuperscript{412} See ‘Local Entrepreneurialism’, p.172  
\textsuperscript{413} See ‘Fourth Lens’, p.221  
- Rosny Desroches, a Methodist lay preacher and a former vice-president of the Methodist Church in the Caribbean and the Americas [hereafter MCCA].

*Leaders of Foreign Missions* – There will be two participants in this sub-population:

- Leslie Griffiths, a British Methodist missionary. He spent 10 years of his ministry in Haiti. In one of his books he describes his relationship with Haiti as ‘a love affair’.

- James Gulley, an American Methodist missionary. He is coordinator for both Global Ministries and United Methodist Church of Relief [hereafter UMCOR] in Haiti.

In summation, this inquiry will aim to concur with Barker’s and Johnson’s argument that the interview method is a particular medium for displaying people’s knowledge of cultural forms as questions are couched in the cultural repertoires of the participants, indicating how they make sense of their social world and of others.

The logistics for these interviews will be arranged far in advance. I now turn my focus on the questionnaire method.

### 3.3.2 Questionnaire

The third population unit will be studied utilizing a questionnaire which will be word-based and open-ended. The questionnaire will be constructed in a manner that facilitates the exploration of the research problem from a different angle. It will enable me to attract meanings for the phenomenon and determine whether the experiences of the participants have been

---

415 MDC-HMC2009
416 Griffiths, *History*, (back cover page)
418 UMCOR is a non-profit organization dedicated to alleviating human suffering around the globe. Available: [http://www.umcor.org/UMCOR/About-Us](http://www.umcor.org/UMCOR/About-Us) (accessed 28 August 2014)
painful, regressive or beneficial. Corbin and Strauss maintain that to ascribe qualitative meaning to a studied phenomenon, in this case, aid-dependency, is to be able to name it, reflect upon it, discuss and write on it.420

The open-ended questions will enable participants to do just that on their own terms. They will explain and qualify their responses without the limitations of pre-set categories. In other words, the open-ended questionnaire will aim to attract honest answers through open-ended responses. I will phrase the questions in such a qualitative framework that these responses will contain the essence of information, categories of findings and the impact of aid-dependency that otherwise might not be identified in a closed-ended questionnaire. However, I am aware of the limitations to questionnaires. For example, questions may be misinterpreted, visual cues are not available to researcher, and participants may exaggerate their responses and not provide sensitive responses of their experiences with aid-dependency.421 Despite these limitations, however, the opened-ended questionnaire is essential to research; it puts the responsibility for and the ownership of the data into the participants’ hands. It will provide the research inquiry with data relative to the practice of aid-dependency from the perspective of church employees in HP.422

In summation, the questionnaire will potentially catch the authenticity, richness, depth of response, honesty and candour which are the hallmarks of qualitative research.423 In the Haitian context where the literacy rate is unsatisfactory,424 the questionnaire will be administered with the knowledge that participants are sufficiently capable of articulating their thoughts in writing.

**Employees** - The ministerial staff and the school teachers will constitute the employee population which I will choose to complete the questionnaire.

---

420 Corbin & Strauss, *Basics*, p.33
421 Wellington, *Educational*, pp.100-107
- HMC’s ministerial sub-population consists of 12 ministers in active work. It includes superintendent ministers to whom the administrative leadership of a circuit is entrusted and circuit ministers who work alongside superintendent ministers. They receive and manage foreign aid-assistance and project funding on behalf of HMC. Their salaries are paid by foreign grant providers. Questionnaires will be emailed to the ministers who will complete and return them to me.

- Altogether, the teachers numbered 491 in population. They constitute the largest body of employees under the influence of HMC. I will send questionnaires to 40 teachers chosen by convenience and random cluster sampling, representing just over 8 percent of the Methodist teacher population. This sample will be drawn from 5 schools of which one will be urban, two will be sub-urban and the other two will be rural. The HMC’s school accountant will deliver questionnaires to the teachers at the administrative office of the church. The accountant will also be the person to whom the teachers will return completed questionnaires at confirmed return-by dates.

3.3.3 Focus Groups

The fourth population unit will point the inquiry to focus groups with a view to harnessing oral life’s stories. This method of data collection is a form of semi-structured interview with a backwards and forwards dynamic of feedback between groups of participants and myself. The groups’ constituents will be the predominantly poor. Decisions have often been negotiated and made on their behalf. As such, my approach will be multi-dimensional to enable their

---

425 A circuit is a network of churches in a specific geographic area constituted as required by the discipline of the church for missional ministry. MDC-HMC2015
426 MDC-HMC2009
427 MDC-HMC2009
participation. I will translate the information sheet and the consent form in Haitian Creole and circulate it to participants who can read. My gatekeeper will read it out to those who are non-literate. The circulation will precede my arrival to the interview settings.

This semi-structured interview method will collect data from three groups of participants in settings that will be conducive for them to reconstruct the phenomenon, describe trends and attitudes and reflect on the kind of effect the research question has had on their lives. The first focus groups will consist of an existing Baptist women’s fellowship of 15 members. They meet regularly at their church building for fellowship, informative discussions, Bible study and prayer. They agree to meet on a different day to accommodate my visit. The arrangement is that, following their usual introductory prayer, I will raise for their informative discussions the concept aid-dependency and Bondye-bon. They promise to share in the discussions with comments and life’s stories.

This is an example of what to expect. After my intervention, the group leader will invite members to share in turn and as often as they wish. I will politely intervene to guide the flow of the discussion. Their views in an atmosphere of courteous sharing will be directed towards me in a backwards and forwards dynamic of feedback while the secretary of the group will assist me with note taking. I will intervene, seeking clarity, and each time, will restate what I hear before the next point is raised. Provisions of data will emerge as the discussion takes shape.

---

429 'Whilst interviews excel at eliciting “private” accounts, group interviews give the researcher access to the interpretations and arguments that participants are willing to present in group situations, whether these are peer groups or research-convened groups of strangers’. Barbour, Doing, p.54

430 Although pre-existing groups can afford access to discussions that more closely approximate ‘real-life’ situations, they raise challenges in terms of maintaining the research focus and the implications of group familiarity. The researcher cannot afford to ignore these challenges of group dynamics. Barbour, Doing, p.72

431 Cameron & Duce, Researching, p.114
The second group interview will involve a local church of 70 members of whom 65 percent will be young adults. This church will be characterized by the typology of mixed church movement. I will worship with them on the Sunday of the interview. Following the service, I will engage the church [those who will wish to stay] in discussions through an unstructured group interview.\textsuperscript{432} This will be an invitation to the participants to speak freely on key issues, namely the exploration of self-sufficiency and the purpose of foreign-aid. For example, I will expect the participants, with no hesitation, to interact with each other across the group in meaningful talks. I will also expect lots of cross-talks, one-to-one talks, corrections, objections, contrasting opinions and clarifications made and sought regarding other contributors’ inputs. I will listen to them talking on the issues.\textsuperscript{433} I will intervene and bring them back to the subject whenever a deviation from the key issues occurs. Equally, I will use the service of an audio-typist.

Thirdly, the inquiry will make space for another type of focus groups. This time I will interview an existing church-based micro-credit group of 29 registered participants with shared familiarity. Their micro-credit initiative has been financed by foreign funding from a Christian NGO. The topics for the interview will subsume aid-dependency, the micro-credit and self-sufficiency.

In this interview the reliance will be on interaction within the micro-credit group. Contributing as participants, members will interact with each other. They will do it using this three-fold approach according to the tradition of the group: (1) four small groups - whose participants are from the same village - will have consultations among themselves to sound out the topics raised, (2) they will come back and share their findings in the large group setting of 29

\textsuperscript{432} The most data dense interviews are those that are unstructured; they are not dictated by any predetermined set of questions. Corbin & Strauss, Basics, p.27
\textsuperscript{433} Wellington, Educational, pp.125-127
members where (3) further discussions will be had. As advised by the group leader, this approach will minimize intimidation, create a comfort zone for sharing, thereby generating greater group participation.

My task will be to discuss their findings with them and ask further questions to tease out more information. I will listen, facilitate and record the unfolding narratives in the large group. From such an interaction within the group useful data will emerge. I will be allowed to record the discussions in the four small groups and in the larger group.

In the three interview sessions, the settings will be the ones for storytelling, testimonies, discussions and oral life experiences. These have traditionally been a way Haitians express their views. Generally, I will stimulate the flow of these informative views. This focus groups method will not aim to reach a consensus but will generate insights from mutual interaction within the groups and provide new orientations to the discovery of meaning of the phenomenon. The interview sessions will be audio-taped in keeping with local circumstances and regulations. Food and drinks will be provided in all the sessions as an incentive, a sign of enriched fellowship and an expression of gratitude.

However, I will be mindful of limitation issues. Participants may intellectualize and not speak from life experience. They may have been reluctant to fully express vulnerability in a group setting. Dominant voices will seek to monopolize the flow of findings. This is where group interaction in the third focus group will be practically useful. Also, my presence as a minister and my guides as gatekeepers may intimidate the setting. Furthermore, this method will

434 Louis, Voodoo, pp.284-285
produce less data than interviews with the same number of participants on a one-to-one-basis. In view of these limitations, I will make the questions contextually relevant for the groups in order to generate much data. However, focus groups interviews yield insightful and large amount of data in a short period of time. They equally access information not easily shared in one-to-one interviews through people bouncing ideas off each other and sharpening and refining their views in response to other participants.\textsuperscript{438}

3.3.4 Archival Materials

The next qualitative method of data collection to engage the inquiry will be the archival materials. While the process of completing questionnaires and conducting interviews will generate data for analysis, HMC’s project files and various related correspondences will constitute another source of data provision. I will seek authorisation of the HMC’s administration to access files of relevant completed projects and minutes of HMC’s annual conference.\textsuperscript{439} These will include, but will not be limited to, relevant correspondences on relationships between aid-providers and aid-recipients, project funding estimates and responses both leading or not to projects approvals. I will proceed with the classification and analysis of these documents in a thematic approach on the pathway of this theory generation and testing task.

3.4 Procedures for Data Analysis

This section will merge the various strands of the research inquiry’s outcomes into a data processing unit. This will include the meticulous study of datasets in a fourfold phase. The first phase will be devoted to researcher’s reflexivity. The second will consist of writing the reports


\textsuperscript{439} HMC is a district of the MCCA. It is convened annually to report and discuss diversified aspects of its mission which, in written form, constitute the minutes. MDC-HMC2011
on the empirical findings. The third will analyse the data while the fourth will call on theologies - biblical, Methodist and practical - as dialogue partners, to facilitate the reflective action phase.

I proceed to give clarity to every step of this section.

### 3.4.1 Researcher’s Reflexivity

Before I delve into this required area of the research design, it is my obligation to disclose that I am a Haitian Methodist minister. I reside in the United Kingdom for the purpose of circuit ministry within the Methodist Church in Great Britain with a specific emphasis on pastoral care and missional development of churches within the Wirral Circuit.

I will begin analysis as soon as the first set of data is collected. I will seek to avoid having to cope with a pile of interview and questionnaire data which has yet to be analytically processed and actively reflected on. According to Corbin and Strauss, ‘Alternating data collection with analysis prevents the analyst from becoming overwhelmed by data’. Being immersed in data analysis during data collection will provide me with a sense of direction, promote greater sensitivity to data and enable me to redirect and enrich interview questions as I will proceed. However, Corbin and Strauss note that analysis is never finished. ‘Since researchers are always thinking about their data, they are always extending, amending, and reinterpreting interpretations as new insights arise and situations change. Such revisions are part of the qualitative processes’.

Reflection has traditionally been integral to qualitative research design. It emphasizes the importance of the researcher’s reflexive contribution. More recent work has emphasized the

---

440 Corbin & Strauss, *Basics*, p.58
441 Corbin & Strauss, *Basics*, p.58
442 Corbin & Strauss, *Basics*, p.50
need for the researcher to formally document the ways in which their presence, background, discipline and reflection affect the process, context and interpretation.

In my reflective assessment of this exploratory embedded methodology, I will examine the scope of strengths and limitations of the research methods and techniques in their interaction with the Haitian culture wherein they will be tested. I will critically reflect on the dynamics of interlacing the three languages that I will use in the inquiry. The mutual interaction between French, Creole and English in speech and in text will form a baseline for the interpretation of meaning for the inquiry. The objective will be to preserve the integrity of words, phrases and sounds which will be uttered in either language.

3.4.2 Writing

Writing as a methodology in qualitative research is a means of recording and communicating the emerging datasets of the research inquiry. It clarifies thinking, expectations and epistemological assumptions of the phenomenon and reveals gaps in knowledge. It further points to new knowledge and connects sets of knowledge relevant to the nature, practice and effect of aid-dependency in HP. Barbour argues that writing is a way of knowing, a method of discovering and analysing emergent theories. In order to maximize on the research function of writing I will apply it simultaneously with ongoing data collection activities. When gaps are discovered in the analysis of datasets, the ongoing writing activity will offer me the opportunity to contact, wherever possible, participants, in quest of clarity and new supplies of knowledge. As embryonic ideas often come to maturity during writing, I will crystallize months of thoughts and gather data into answers to the research question.

---

443 Fulton, Kuit, Sanders & Smith, *The Professional*, p.56
445 Fetterman, *Ethnography*, p.112
Transcription is very much a part of writing. This will be done in full verbatim. However, transcript is silent about tone, body language, namely gestures, facial expressions and positioning. This silence was prone to posing a challenge to the rigour of the inquiry. Ultimately, in writing methodology as it is in other methods of qualitative research, it is the researcher, and not the method of transcription, that ensures rigour in interpreting the data. I will read transcripts that are produced by the audio-typist while listening to recordings of the original discussions for non-verbal expressions.

With a keen attention for detail, I will carry out a verbatim transcription of every participant’s audio-taped interview and questionnaire response. Texts are normally full of pronounced emotions from participants. They are the construction of the participants’ experiences and proposed actions in an attitude of cooperation. This is where writing involves sensitivity. Corbin and Strauss stress that ‘Sensitivity means having insight, being tuned in, being able to present the views of participants and taking the role of the other through immersion in data’. My emphasis on the need for sensitivity will not be deflected from writing what potentially will be new themes, categories and theories. The resulting coding activity in my processing of data through in-depth analysis will attract credibility based on coherence.

3.4.3 Analysis

Corbin and Strauss note that ‘Analysis involves examining a substance and its components in order to determine their properties and functions, then using acquired knowledge to make inferences about the whole’. My analysis of the written facts therefore will be comprehensive so as to examine descriptions which will embody well-constructed themes and categories, the dynamics of the context and the explanation of the process. Throughout this exercise, the task

---

446 Barbour, *Introducing*, pp.192-194
447 Corbin & Strauss, *Basics*, p.32
448 Corbin & Strauss, *Basics*, p.45
of trying to be on the side of the participants will be paramount. This will not rule out a detailed analysis and in-depth questioning of the texts from the participants.\textsuperscript{449} Analysing data qualitatively will be an intricate process. This will reduce raw data into concepts that will be developed and integrated into categories.\textsuperscript{450}

While completing the transcripts, I will develop a provisional coding frame. This will consist of open coding which will also embed axial coding. This will establish relationships between the emerging themes, sub-themes and categories and the sorts of distinctions between datasets. Equally, the axial coding will note any contradictions.\textsuperscript{451} As the momentum of dataset analysis will increase, I will subject the provisional code to ongoing scrutiny. Relying on my theological, mental, cultural and social capacity to receive and respond to the messages that will be contained in the data, I will thereby refine the provisional coding frame at suitable junctures in the analysis process.\textsuperscript{452}

Obviously, this analytical process will involve my interpretation of the findings and my interpretation will determine my understanding of what will be described in the experiences, spoken words, actions, interactions, problems and issues expressed by participants. In this way, I will fulfil what Corbin and Strauss say, ‘I am the translator of other persons’ words and actions, attitudes and behaviours, the go-between for the participants and the audiences I want to reach’.\textsuperscript{453} In my function as an analyst and translator, I will look for concepts from the datasets. Therefore, my task of building a firm knowledge base of the phenomenon will gradually begin with asking questions, listening, probing, comparing and contrasting, synthetizing and evaluating information.\textsuperscript{454} The use of concepts will provide a way of grouping

\textsuperscript{449} This method is referred to as the IPA (Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis). Barbour, \textit{Introducing}, p.219
\textsuperscript{452} Corbin & Strauss, \textit{Basics}, p.33; Barbour, \textit{Introducing}, pp.215-219
\textsuperscript{453} Corbin & Strauss, \textit{Basics}, p.49
\textsuperscript{454} Fetterman, \textit{Ethnography}, p.110; Corbin & Strauss, \textit{Basics}, p.58
data for the purpose of conceptual categorising towards a deeper understanding of the theoretical assumption ‘aid-dependency, its working in HP’.455

I will not incorporate the use of computer packages to help with theorizing the data analysis process. Although they are designed to alerting me to similarities that will be contained within the data,456 I cannot identify the programme that will be adaptable to the theorizing process of three datasets recorded in Creole, French or English. Furthermore, computer packages do not generate new codes; they rely on the coding scheme which I will assign to the data. While I will be mindful of the empirical significance of this research technique, yet, failing access to the compatible computer packages, I will not absolve myself from the task of manually doing the coding and the theorizing.457

To do this, I will begin by identifying key words, phrases and concepts, their range of use and frequency of repetition. I will print each verbatim transcript in double spacing so that it will be practical to circle and underline key words and write memo labels between the lines. Furthermore, I will lay out all these key words and memos, re-read and compare them together in search for coding themes. As I mentioned previously, the codes will derive from both themes which arose from the central hypothesis, as well as emergent themes, which will be created as data is collected and transcripts reviewed. Finally, I will transpose what I will mark out as relevant core themes, encapsulating priori codes and emerging codes, into my thesis portfolio journal for easy referencing.458

455 Corbin & Strauss, Basics, p.51; Patton, Qualitative, p.133
456 Barbour, Introducing, pp.192-196
457 Barbour, Introducing, p.195
I need to advise on a limitation of the inquiry at this stage; it relates to translation. I will not quote in Creole nor French participants’ experiences. The same limitation will be applicable to French literature I will cite. The desirability of quoting in Creole and French will be challenged by the word count which is allocated to the portfolio. However, I will be committed to translating archival materials, French literature and participants’ experiences with much accuracy into English.

3.4.4 Theological Reflection and Action Practice

Another aspect of this section will be theological reflection. Cameron and Duce advise that this may involve creating conversation in the researcher’s mind between the data and the Christian tradition inside HP. It will create for me the context to review the strengths and weaknesses of theological methodology and practices. Thus, it will be a reflection on the application of practical theology as an embedded method of the underpinning methodological construct of this inquiry. Theological reflection will aid to ensure that qualitative research methods and practical theology tasks work neatly together in the Christian practice which relates to the event of God’s self-communication.

The task of theological reflection will also require microanalysis, general analysis and reflective practice through the lenses of relevant theologies. For example, the discipline of practical theology will enable the practice of exploring the complex dynamics of particular situations. It will place the data in a framework of inquiry which will be driven by the desire to create the circumstances for transformative action but also offers possibilities of radical transformation and challenges existing modalities.

459 Cameron & Duce, Researching, p.106
460 Swinton & Mowat, Practical, pp.90-91
461 Corbin & Strauss, Basics, p.60
462 Swinton & Mowat, Practical, p.x & Osmer, Practical, pp.11-12
In this exploratory embedded methodology, biblical and Methodist theologies will engage in dialogue with practical theology to scrutinize the empirical data and the theology of mission for HP. For example, Wesley’s economic and political ethics will be an essential tool to this end. Economically, one of its emphases is ‘Gaining, saving and giving all you can’ without hurting the neighbour bodily or spiritually. Politically, it advocates to ‘lift up a standard against the inequity which overflows the land’. The practice of giving will be analysed through the lens of the Methodist perspective of not ‘hurting the neighbour’ and of ‘lifting up a standard against the inequity’.

Furthermore, I will reflect on the theological discourse that giving is motivated by a heavenly reward by juxtaposing the biblical dictum ‘The poor you will always have with you’ with the theological imperative ‘give to the poor’. In the same vein, I will theologically reflect on the assumption that aid-providers benefit, perhaps, more than aid-receivers, from their gesture of giving, which in some circumstances, even unintentionally, create more wealth-access for the givers.

Whereas the theoretical assumption of the research will be bound to generating new theories qualitatively, the pragmatic task of theology will, by any means, be instrumental to the scrutiny of substantive recommendations put forward by participants for immediate actions or for further research. It will further help to determine strategies of action that would enrich the dependency-awareness in the HP’s theological practice.

Conclusion

This empirical design is a plan of research procedures that spans from broad assumptions to

465 Osmer, *Practical*, p.4
detailed methods of data collection and analysis with a view to testing the central hypothesis: ‘Aid-dependency has disempowered Haitian Protestantism by inhibiting self-sufficiency’. It includes aims, rationale, specific methods of data collection, background information, scope, ethical considerations, analysis and interpretation. It is an idealized outline that will help me to conceptualize how each step of the study will flow in the pursuit of knowledge and understanding of the research question. Therefore, this foreground outlined objective will be the trajectory of the research design.

Chapter 4. Report and Analysis of Empirical Datasets [hereafter RAED]

Introduction
The datasets under scrutiny emerged from a multi-disciplinary, qualitative and quantitative, methodological research design. They are grounded in HP’s missional reality with a particular reference to HMC in which the case study was carried out. The search for an empirical-based description of the functionality of aid-dependency through intertextual and extra-textual links and key concepts and recurring themes within the datasets parallels the task of utilizing bricolage, examining and sorting large amounts of data. These are compared with each other, cross-analysed and synthetized in order to establish potential connections between the central hypothesis and on-the-ground realities.

The collection process includes four strands, namely (a) distribution of questionnaire, (b) archival materials - access seeking, (c) focus groups in context, and (c) leadership interview involvement.

a. Distribution of Questionnaire

466 Fetterman, Ethnography, p.8; Frankfort-Nachmias & Nachmias, Research, p.51
467 Data is referenced as a ‘quote’ and coded as ADQ (Aid-Dependency Questionnaire) to which a number from 1-33 of the 33 returned questionnaires is assigned.
As I proposed in the research design, I distributed, from February to May 2015, 40 questionnaires. My gatekeeper informed teachers of the research topic and the imminent arrival of the questionnaire. He proceeded to create an email database for teachers who were eligible and consented to participate. As such, 15 teachers were sent questionnaires by email. The gatekeeper distributed 16 printed copies, through HMC office, to teachers who were not on the email database. Subsequently, through a one-to-one encounter with me, I hand-delivered the remaining 9 questionnaires to teachers. By August 2015, 62.5 percent of distributed questionnaires, that is, 25 copies, were completed and returned.

Regarding the ministers, I emailed the questionnaire to the 12 ministers in active service. By August 2015, I received by email 8 completed questionnaires. See Chart Two for a summary of the questionnaire dataset.

Chart Two

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questionnaire Participants' Involvement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ministers 8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ministers 8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The questionnaire contained 14 questions and 4 sections on aid-dependency, namely nature, practice, effects and practical theology. Participants answered a total of 10 questions on the questionnaire while of the remaining 4 questions 2 were not answered and the other 2 were
simply attempted. Given the multi-disciplinary scope of the research, I worked with 62.5 percent of teachers’ and 68 percent of ministers’ returns as a representative sample of employees.

b. Archival Materials – Access Seeking
I harnessed data from unpublished document sources ranging from email correspondences, project files and reports, and minutes of meetings. Materials were written in English and French. I scrutinized the information content through the analytical lenses that grammar, language, socio-political context and funded projects offered me. The chart below illustrates the types of materials which I analyse.

468 See Appendix 4, p.311
470 This includes email communications between former district presidents of HMC and other church leaders in their quest for project sponsorship and voucher-based evidence of project funding expenses. These correspondences were emailed to me by an interviewee, a former Haiti district president, with a view to expanding the literary scope of this methodological strand.
471 Completed project reports in booklet form are available on a limited number of funded projects. They inform foreign church-missions.
472 MDC-HMC
This dataset is drawn from three focus group encounters which occurred in Haiti. The data, as in the methodological strands above, is all together grounded in participants’ opinions and emotions based on their experiences with aid-dependency. The number of engaging participants is indicated in the next Chart.

The gender profile in the focus groups consisted of the following: ADFG1, all females; ADFG2, 35 females and 30 males and ADFG3, 28 females and 1 male.

---

473 Data is referenced as an ‘opinion’ and coded as ADFG (Aid-Dependency Focus Groups): ‘Women’s fellowship Focus Groups’ ADFG1, ‘Church-based Focus Groups’ ADFG2 and ‘Micro-credit Focus Groups’ ADFG3.
d. Leadership Interview Involvement

In the research design, I referred to 3 project managers in the category of managerial lay leadership. One of them, nonetheless, opted out on-the-ground of conflict of interest. He wanted to be solely committed to the job at hand, feeling that, after much reflection, giving an interview on aid-dependency might jeopardize the terms and conditions of his contract. He freely volunteered this information to me in the knowledge of his right to withdraw from the research process without being subject to any inquiry.

That means, the current dataset was generated by the episcopal and lay leaderships with a focus on 5 ministers, 2 project managers, 2 opinion leaders and 2 leaders of foreign missions. Two of these participants were female local leaders.

Participants’ experiences with foreign-aid in HP have attributed applicable designations and definitions to it. As I engaged them through the above referenced four datasets, I have become fully aware of the necessity for a heightened sense of self-reflexivity. Mason observes:

> Descriptions and explorations involve selective viewing and interpretation; they cannot be neutral, objective or total. The elements which a researcher chooses to see as relevant for a description or exploration will be based, implicitly or explicitly, on a way of seeing the social world, and on a particular form of explanatory logic. ⁴⁷⁵

While I proceeded with reading, translating and interpreting perceptions, perspectives, tones and material content, I gathered summative and informative research findings. Of course, I made every attempt to be attentive to data I did not fit into categories. They basically did not descriptively contribute to elucidating answers to the research question. In analysing the datasets, four core themes emerged. They are:

Core Theme A. Positive contribution of aid

Core Theme B. Inhibitive outcome of aid-dependency

⁴⁷⁴ Data is referenced as a ‘view’ and coded as ADLI (Aid-Dependency Leadership Interview) to which a number from 1-11 is assigned.

Core Theme C. Expression of disempowerment

Core Theme D. Alternative responses.

I approached the analysis with an emphasis on quantitative as well qualitative descriptions.

4.1 Quantitative Description

A quantitative analysis is a way of measuring and examining the mathematical variables connected with the experiences of participants, the methods of data collection and the data itself. It involves studying the precise and definitive significance of numerical input.\[476\] This is what I did in what follows.

The research design aimed to solicit contributions from 178 participants. At the start of the fieldwork, the number of participants was settled at 153.\[477\] In addition to the withdrawal of an interviewee, 5 church members of the initial 70 did not participate. They withdrew because of unforeseen family issues. I then examined the numerical significance of the empirical data through the following variables: (a) male and female ratio and (b) demographic factors.

a. Male and Female Ratio: The leadership interviews produced a higher density of male responses compared to female responses since 18 percent [2 participants] were females. This is likely reflective of the higher percentage of male ministers and male project managers on record as being employed by HP such that the sample which I interviewed was proportionate to this established fact.\[478\]

However, completed questionnaires were marginally female-oriented, meaning that 51.5 percent [17 participants] of returned questionnaires were as a result of greater females’

\[476\] Wellington, Educational, pp.16-18; Bryman, Social, pp.142-148
\[477\] This number consisted of 5 episcopal ministers, 2 project managers, 2 opinion leaders, 2 leaders of foreign missions, 8 ministers, 25 teachers and 109 focus group participants.
\[478\] For example, the Haitian Baptist church has not yet welcomed females among its ministerial leadership. In HMC 4 females have, to this point, served as ministers. MDC-HMC2015
contribution. Furthermore, 71.5 percent of focus groups [78 participants in total] were females. On a whole 63.30 percent of female participants’ experiences with aid-dependency impacted the quality of data generated by these methods.  

b. Demographic Factors: Referring to income generating capacity, the data was provided by 30 percent working participants of whom 37 percent [school teachers] were paid an average monthly salary of US$100 and the remaining 63 percent were paid far above that average. The other 70 percent incorporated communities of the unemployed [poorly employed, poorly literate and non-literate] people. Not only has the data been generated by a higher percentage of women, it also resulted from a low-income generating majority who experienced the intensity of socio-economic disempowerment.

- **Age Profile** – Furthermore, 55 participants who constituted the 2nd focus group I interviewed as a church, were young adults, under 30 years old. While there is a probability of young adults’ involvement in the completion of the questionnaire, I kept the contribution of that age group at 36 percent, that is, 55 young adults of 153 participants.

- **Social Stratum** – Included within this variable were 19 urban professionals, namely 5 episcopal ministers, 2 project managers, 2 opinion leaders, 2 leaders of foreign missions and 8 ministers. The duality of their representativeness depicted their roles as the face

---

479 The 51.5 percent, that is 17 of 33 participants, resulted from female names I recognize to be written on completed questionnaires. The other 48.50 percent were either anonymous or carried names of males. They voluntarily wrote their names.


481 The employees were 33 ministers and teachers combined, 11 episcopal and lay leaders and 2 micro-credit coordinators. ADPR6

482 Given the mixed demographic of this group, it is not straightforward to ascertain the average income. This ranged from US$100 to US$5000 a month. Please, note that these amounts include the salaries of two foreign leaders. ADPR9

483 This sub-set consisted of mostly university graduates, people with international experiences and certain financial ease.
of the local church abroad and the face of the foreign church, locally, in most contexts.

Their contributions to the empirical data, mathematically, represented 12 percent.

In summary, 4 overlapping sub-sets, namely: ‘females’ (63.30 percent), ‘professionals’ (12 percent), ‘young adults’ (36 percent), and ‘unemployed’ (70 percent) contributed to the empirical data as Chart Five below details.

Chart Five

This chart presents a summary of high and low support for aid-dependency in HP. Four sub-sets of participants expressed their support in eleven descriptive themes of which the last ‘alternative responses possible’ theme advocated a paradigm shift. In what follows, I analytically illustrate the supporting arguments which peaked at 50 percent and more:

Females said:

- Aid-giving is an absolute necessity and a divine blessing; it intensifies paternalism and deprives of dignity. They supplied alternative responses.
Professionals said:
- Aid-giving is unconcerned with socio-political in-depth change and comparatively sustains lethargic Bondye-bon. They supplied alternative responses.

Young Adults said:
- Aid-giving intensifies paternalism, deprives of dignity and is a derivative of injustice. They supplied alternative responses.

Unemployed said:
- Aid-giving is an absolute necessity and a divine blessing. It creates division, intensifies paternalism, deprives of dignity and is a derivative of injustice. They supplied alternative responses.

I also note the following two facts. Firstly, whereas lower percentages of professionals and young adults data, 20 and 30 respectively, viewed foreign-aid as an ‘absolute necessity’, 61 and 68 percent respectively of females and the unemployed viewed foreign-aid as such. Secondly, data generated by the four sub-sets shared much closer margins of high percentages and emphasized ‘alternative responses possible’. This is a contrast to their low percentages regarding ‘impacts on self-sufficiency’.

The point is that the experiences of a female unemployed young adult may have been different in character, purpose and aid-necessity from the employed male professionals, yet, they shared one common challenge, although perceived differently, which is aid-dependency. Whatever the perspectives and motives which drove these levels of support, aid-dependency stood out as the overlapping reality across the demographics.

This quantitative analysis aims to enrich and deepen the qualitative analysis to which I now turn. It will be a word-based description of the volume of participants’ shared experiences, solicited or unsolicited.
4.2 Qualitative Description

In this empirical description, I analyse the four core themes. Core Theme A encompassed a shared emphasis regarding positivity in participants’ designations and interpretations of the reality of aid-dependency. It is subsumed into these two descriptive themes, namely ‘foreign-aid, an absolute necessity’ and ‘foreign-aid, a divine blessing’.

4.2.1 Core Theme A. Positive Contribution of Aid

Descriptive Theme 1. Foreign-aid, an Absolute Necessity

Questionnaire (ADQ) participants described foreign-aid in languages that portrayed it as an absolute necessity. These key words gave depth and width to the scope of this necessity, namely ‘Foreign-aid contributes to 65 percent, 70 percent, 75 percent, 80 percent and 90 percent of school maintenance’, ‘It is a major employment provider in the church’ and ‘The church is facing great difficulties as foreign-aid has become less available’.

Other ADQ participants expressed the necessity in these terms: ‘Foreign-aid is the oxygen HP. It aims to sustain the most vulnerable class of Haitian society’. ‘Without foreign-aid the dire poverty that the Church attempts to alleviate would unprecedentedly be tripled’.

Views from ADLI participants have an intertextual resonance in the ADQ as explained in these words:

In the educational sector in Haiti, the Protestant church owns 43 percent of primary schools. Very often, this sector benefits from international aid. Without this aid many of our children would not have had the opportunity to go to school. So, for the furtherance of education, aid is very important until the state can take on its responsibility.

ADLI participants continued:

454 ADQ1, ADQ4, ADQ9, ADQ17, ADQ20
455 ADQ4, ADQ14, ADQ6, ADQ21
456 ADQ14
457 ADQ8
458 ADQ22
459 ADLI8
HMC nearly had a hundred schools. We raised the money that run those schools partly by getting the parents to pay a little and by getting full financial help from Switzerland and the United States or wherever to supplement those funds.\textsuperscript{490}

For me aid is the manifestation of an act of solidarity. We must confess as well that the proclamation of the gospel benefits from this aid as Protestantism’s membership is nearing 50 percent of the Haitian population.\textsuperscript{491}

In reference to school feeding programmes, the ADEC highlighted the necessity for foreign-aid.

I write to make a request for the hot lunch programme. I will appreciate that you transfer US$60,000.00 for the first quarter 2004-05 to continue with the canteen programme.

Hello Rev, just a quick response to let you know that a transfer of US$60,000 should be completed next week.\textsuperscript{492}

I am requesting your assistance for those people severely affected by the hurricanes Wilma and Alpha. Thanks for your kind attention.

Thank you, I did receive the email and the wire transfer is in process now. We will notify you when it is complete.\textsuperscript{493}

Other participants highlighted the necessity of foreign-aid in absolute terms: ‘HMC cannot independently pay its ministers without foreign-aid’,\textsuperscript{494} ‘Stopping aid means stopping all projects’,\textsuperscript{495} ‘Surviving without receiving foreign-aid will be a disaster; when grants stop chaos will reign’,\textsuperscript{496} ‘Without UMCOR’s financial support, the Frères Methodist Kindergarten would not have begun’,\textsuperscript{497} ‘I have nothing to live on but aid’, and ‘It will be very difficult to survive without those foreign-aid initiatives especially in a country where more than 65 percent of the people are out of employment’.\textsuperscript{498} Similar evidences abounded in the following quote and view:
We have instances in church schools where teachers have not been paid for more than three months.\footnote{499} This is a warning sign that aid will completely stop, then the schools will be closed. While teachers are paid a meagre aid-subsidized salary, it would be devastating if they were to become unemployed.\footnote{500}

‘HMC is dependent on outside resources and if those resources aren’t there certain activities stop’.\footnote{501} ADFG participants joined in support:

Compassion International is important to the churches in Lagonave [a town]. With the injection of aid, parents are relieved. Compassion’s aid means education for children. It is very beneficial.\footnote{502}

Another participant wished that there was more money in circulation to support the initiatives of poor micro-credit investors. The opinion was shared by many.\footnote{503}

As outlined above, empirical evidences were collected to substantiate the argument that foreign-aid has been an integral and necessary financial item in HP’s recurrent budget.\footnote{504} The fulfilment of this aid-necessity was believed to be a divine blessing. Participants provided the evidence in the next descriptive theme.

**Descriptive Theme 2. Foreign-aid, a Divine Blessing**

In the participants’ responses, ‘Aid is recognisably and intrinsically good to those in immediate need of assistance; it is the Lord’s intervention’.\footnote{505} To them, it has become a divine tool which meaningfully and swiftly translated the ethos of God’s redemptive plan of relief for all and those within specific local communities of believers. Furthermore, interwoven with the concept of dependency, foreign-aid spoke of consistency in love, companionship for the journey and the longstanding duty of care for each other, one church community for the other.

\footnote{499} Owing to lack of funding, the church owes teachers months of arrears in salaries. See: ADQ16, ADQ5 ADQ19, ADQ17
\footnote{500} ADQ25
\footnote{501} ADLI22
\footnote{502} ADFG2
\footnote{503} ADFG1
\footnote{504} Datasets revealed that 60 percent of any given church’s budget are subsidized by foreign-aid.
\footnote{505} ADQ12, ADQ3, ADQ5, ADQ16, MDC-HMC, ADLI
\footnote{ADQ33}
Consequently, whatever flowed from this compassion and love equated foreign-aid with blessing and salvation. The following quotes explained:

HP’s belief in Bondye-bon firmly acknowledges foreign-aid as a blessing from God and therefore depends on aid-assistance, greatly. This said, foreign-aid is a huge inspiration from God.506

As Christians, called ‘Methodists’, the love of God compels us to always assist and care for our brothers and sisters in need. Yes, foreign-aid is inspired by God for it is given by the people of God to the people of God with love.507

In participants’ minds there was an intentionally love-driven blessing, made manifest in aid contributions, between the acts of giving and receiving in the aid-providers’ and aid-receivers’ relationships. Since HP found itself in a constant disaster mode of functionality, participants experienced such a blessing in the operational context of immediate needs. Therefore, hunting for the day-to-day necessities of life has often been relieved by provisions of foreign-aid. The following data expressed their life’s conditions:

When hunger, poverty, natural and man-made disasters, and political turbulences strike; death is imminent, especially, to those living below the poverty line, foreign-aid is their sole salvation.508

‘When foreign-aid arrives we associate it indeed with “la mann tonbe di syel” [manna falling from heaven]’.509 ‘Foreign-aid is like an miracle, unfolding in the life of the local church’.510 ‘Foreign-aid is a blessing this is what I live on’.511 A view from an ADLI revealed that, ‘Aid came from inspired missionaries who were employed by the Lord to come to our rescue here at the time’512 and ‘Foreign presence with aid-assistance is welcome as if it were the Lord’s intervention with adequate supply aid-provision ’.513
Participants argued that this principle of giving stemmed from God so that aid, a divine gift from foreign Christians, is inherently good and unconditionally inspired by God to bless those who are in a disaster mode of living. A focus group confessed: ‘Waiting on aid is waiting on God’s blessing’. 514 On a whole, foreign-aid has assumed the function of ‘divine blessing’ which has gratefully been embraced by participants.

The evidence of aid-positivity which characterizes Core Theme A justifies also its reason for being in HP. However, this positivity is being analysed in the light of alternative designations and interpretations of aid in Core Theme B. This consists of four descriptive themes. They are ‘Impacts on self-sufficiency’, ‘Creates division’, ‘Unconcerned with socio-political in-depth change’, and ‘Impacts on poverty’. Consequently, in the ensuing pages, I present the interplay between six descriptive themes within HP’s space.

4.2.2 Core Theme B. Inhibitive Outcome of Aid-Dependency

Descriptive Theme 3. Impacts on Self-sufficiency

This descriptive theme has generated mixed views. Grounded in personal experiences, participants viewed the positivity of aid’s impacts as underpinning the reason for its existence. Others expressed their discontent and viewed them as being fundamental constraints to Haiti’s growth and collective prosperity. I analyse these views in the ensuing paragraphs.

In line with the descriptive themes above, foreign-aid constituted a divinely anticipated blessing in HP. From this perspective, participants were convinced that foreign-aid was carving for HP a pathway to varied sorts of dividends towards self-sufficiency. They described it in terms that speak of investment in human resources, socio-economic development and the acquisition of fixed assets. In their writing on self-sufficiency, ADQ participants asserted:

514 ADFG2
Resulting from foreign-aid, I am persuaded that the Haitian Church is richly blessed in terms of professional competencies and physical assets, namely, lands and houses, which can be tapped into to create wealth and boost its self-reliance capacity.\(^{515}\)

‘We have acres of lands, clinics and hospitals which could strategically be utilized’.\(^{516}\) The argument was endorsed by these two participants:

HMC, alike a limited number of Protestant churches, has a financial platform built on local businesses, developmental projects, commercial houses and other buildings like schools, hospitals and clinics which are income-generators. Referring to local businesses I mean printing and hardware services. It is financially beneficial that HMC has so many resources at its disposal. They ought to be income generators.\(^{517}\)

Furthermore, participants reminded me of the positive impact of education towards self-sufficiency: ‘A number of local leaders in today’s church management were sponsored or trained with foreign-aid assistance’.\(^{518}\) In fact, ‘One should not underestimate, the positive impact of effective foreign-aid directed to tuition fees for children education and youth educational programmes’.\(^{519}\) ‘Foreign-aid by way of training investment and professional development has also been a source of empowerment towards self-sufficiency’.\(^{520}\)

These ADLI and ADQ participants strengthened the argument relative to the significance of education and training towards self-sufficiency.

HMC has remained faithful to that task. For over 100 years the words of President Pétion figured over the main campus of the Methodist church in Port-au-Prince. ‘It’s education that raises someone to his full stature’. I think that Methodists honestly thought that by educating Haitians they would be giving them tools to shape their own destiny.\(^{521}\)

The thrust was similarly carried out at Projet de Réhabilitation Rurale in Jérémie\(^{522}\) and Institut Chrétien de la Vie Rurale in Vlait. In both

---

\(^{515}\) ADQ13  
\(^{516}\) ADQ25  
\(^{517}\) ADLI11  
\(^{518}\) ADQ23, ADQ16  
\(^{519}\) ADQ13  
\(^{520}\) ADPR6  
\(^{521}\) ADLI4  
\(^{522}\) This was funded in the 1960s. ADLI3
institutions, training in agriculture was provided. There again, the intention was to build self-sufficiency through institutions and sustainable projects.\textsuperscript{523}

Following from this argument, an ADLI’s view referred to a micro-credit group which with time had become a self-sufficient organization so that, without foreign interventions, the group had managed to employ, for example, its own accountant.\textsuperscript{524} This is supported by this excerpt:

Among parents and teachers trained and involved in this process of income-generating activities will be born leaders who will take ownership of the process. This will ensure the transmission of knowledge and know-how to other ASPACREP\textsuperscript{525} and may require program facilitators to pursue or adopt the same policy.\textsuperscript{526}

The datasets, in part, revealed that the local church has inherited and acquired resources from foreign-aid that could be converted into, or generate, dividends. Participants, in this positivity, argued that there is evidence of foreign investment into HP to make it a self-sustained institution. Developing those resources will contribute to the sustainability of the church and the welfare of the whole population.\textsuperscript{527} This contribution will potentially create new employments and build confidence among the initiators.\textsuperscript{528}

However, in certain participants’ responses, there were designations of foreign-aid which were dissimilar. For these participants, foreign aid-assistance, despite its benevolent character and investment potentiality, has been held captive by inappropriate local and foreign practices and modalities which brought about outcomes which have been undesirable. They felt that these modalities, using the words of Swinton and Mowat, contrasted with Christian practices that

\textsuperscript{523} ADLI4
\textsuperscript{524} ADLI1
\textsuperscript{525} Association of Parents of CREP
\textsuperscript{526} ADPR7, ADPR8

136
emerge from reflection on and interpretation of the nature and purposes of the practices of God
in history.\textsuperscript{529}

Participants argued that in the imminence of their crises foreign-aid provided them with some
form of socio-economic response; this was essentially beneficial to keep their heads above the
waters.

Foreign-aid has been welcomed because of limited resources of our members
most of whom are unemployed or with low salaries. It is not what we want
but for the time being in some cases we must rely on foreign-aid in the hope
that it will facilitate self-sufficiency.\textsuperscript{530}

The fact that foreign-aid had to be constantly depended on has exposed its shortcomings and
therefore precluded its generating power towards self-sufficiency; it has rather birthed aid-
dependency. An ADQ participant followed suit:

\begin{quote}
HMC cannot independently pay its pastors without receiving foreign-aid.
From the inception of the denomination in 1817, we have not inculcated in
the mind of our people the need to be self-sufficient. No church can make
progress while depending financially on outsiders.\textsuperscript{531}
\end{quote}

In this light, participants pointed out that the habit of active aid-giving has created a culture of
passive aid-receiving. Regulating this habit and culture has given rise to aid-dependency’s
practices. These have not been compatible with local productivity neither did they promote
self-sufficiency.\textsuperscript{532} Moreover, they confessed that nearly 200 years of missionary service has
been received, yet, HP has been unable to pay, not even, its essential bills and central utilities
unless subsidized by foreign funding.\textsuperscript{533}

In fact, having fully been aware of the current situation, HP and its partners have optimistically
been appealing for local productivity. These excerpts explain:

\begin{quote}
We depend for everything on foreign-aid. It is our hope that through the
intentional and punctual giving of our members, the investment of our
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{529} Swinton & Mowat, \textit{Practical}, p.23
\textsuperscript{530} ADQ11
\textsuperscript{531} ADQ7
\textsuperscript{532} ADPR7, ADPR8
\textsuperscript{533} ADQ32, ADQ30
church’s structural resources and the development of our lands, the Haiti District will be financially viable in the next five years.534

Optimistically, ‘Yes, there has been in recent times a very real attempt to “haitianize” the income, to find local sources of income to set against this foreign grant mentality’.535 However, evidence suggests that aid-dependency practices have distracted HP from this task of holistic mission which includes the right to strive for self-sufficiency. They prevented people from investing their entrepreneurial skills; consequently, they sat and waited.536 ‘Instead of working collectively to develop local resources as a foundation for the church, they try to manage whatever foreign resources they have at their disposal’.537 In fact, HP consistently expects aid from abroad so that they do not focus on any major fund-raising activities to create and sustain development plans for the local church. They lack initiative and self-drive to first help themselves.538

The phrases ‘working collectively to develop local resources’ and ‘create and sustain development plans’ highlight a core issue which substantiates the counter-claim to self-sufficiency as put forward by certain participants. ADQ and ADLI participants went further to say:

The absence of an orderly exit plan from initial aid-dependency initiatives, may have given birth to an anti-productive local church, anti-development attitude, mistrust and a prevailing aid-dependent mentality within the whole body of the church at all levels.539

Sometimes you have a sense that there is a deliberate effort to keep the situations the way they are, keep foreign-aid flowing, a practice which, in fact, is at variance with self-sufficiency.540

534 MDC-HMC2012
535 ADLI4
536 ADLI7
537 ADQ14
538 ADQ12
539 ADQ13
540 ADQ14
In reference to deliberate effort, this ADQ participant affirmed that the ‘HMC has not had a plan to become self-sustaining to the extent that I don’t know, to-date, of any one program or activity operated by the Church that is not dependent on foreign-aid, at least partially’. Therefore, in response to the quote above which referred to houses as church assets, an ADLI participant made the point:

Houses were built to accommodate British missionaries and American ambassadors in the years leading to the 1970s. They were not the outcome of a structured economic plan towards self-sufficiency. I did want to emphasize that some very significant and sincere efforts have been made to accomplish this task, that is, the church to stand on its feet and so on, but all the times it was counter-cultural; it was not where the main debate was. There were contravening forces to the task of self-reliance.

This suggests that the poverty of local productivity hinders the richness of self-sufficiency.

Furthermore, opinions from the ADFG data resonate with the above ADLI data as explained in these words:

We obviously need aid-support, but categorically not aid-dependency. With a development plan, we can make better use of foreign-aid and move forward in faith and self-reliance.

At the beginning it was necessary to help with chapel and school constructions in many communities; and many children were able to go to school because of those efforts. However, leaders of the churches in Haiti did not do enough or anything at all to prepare an exit plan towards self-sufficiency and financial growth in the future.

This means, there has not been a systematic program aiming to enable Protestants to be successful entrepreneurs. ‘More relief work has been done than entrepreneurially sustainable initiatives taken in the past’. An ADLI participant, alluding to the Marshall Plan, argued in these words:

---

541 ADQ14  
542 ADLI3  
543 ADL4  
544 ADFG1  
545 ADQ11  
546 ADQ14
The Marshall Plan was a huge success. Yet, the Plan has never been offered nor enforced in Haiti. Neither has its principle ever been tried in HP by foreign and local Protestants. The kind of plan that has been drafted for us consists of aid, provided in small drops. The outcome is that, after 200 years, our economic stability has been further weakened.  

‘That’s the fate of our church. We have no vison, grand or simple collective plan’.  

ADQ participants were also convinced that foreign-aid ‘prevents us from developing our local resources’, ‘encourages poverty’ and pre-conditions the church to be ‘always looking out for assistance in order to help disaster victims’. ‘Foreign-aid ruins our local economy rather than propelling it towards autonomy and sustainability’. In fact, these data affirmed similar thoughts: 

Aid-dependency is a major obstacle to Protestants being successful entrepreneurs. As such I have not met any Haitian Protestant whose successful entrepreneurship has been foreign-aid financed in the first place. The idea of easy money will never create incentives that lead to success.  

Resulting from this dependency culture, the church’s entrepreneurial arm has become underdeveloped. In these circumstances, many fixed assets were not developed to generate funds in order to transform the church into an income generating organization.  

‘I don’t know whether foreign-aid has facilitated self-sufficiency in some Haitian institutions, in this one there is no evidence of such’. ‘We live at the expense of foreign-aid so that self-sufficiency is an elusive thought’ and ‘In our lack of self-sufficiency, we pray to the Lord for foreign-aid’.  

ADLI and ADFG participants progressed with the thought, believing that:

---

547 ADLI13  
548 ADFG3, supported by ADQ28  
549 ADQ6  
550 ADQ12  
551 ADFG1  
552 ADQ13  
553 ADLI1  
554 ADQ16  
555 ADQ15  
556 ADQ19
Aid-providers come to us with the intention of keeping us in the current position so that they can continue to benefit from aid collected in our name, at the expense of our poverty.\textsuperscript{557}

If we were to become economically self-sufficient, the missionaries on the ground would be without a job and therefore, wouldn’t be here. After so many years, there is no evidence to substantiate that the agenda of these church-missions vigorously pursue HP’s self-sufficiency.\textsuperscript{558}

The logic of foreign-aid is not for sustainability. To me, the foreigners came with the intention of keeping us in the current position so that they can continue to benefit from aid collected in our name, at the expense of poverty-alleviation.\textsuperscript{559}

From this optic, after 40 years of sponsorship in HP, \textit{Entraide Protestante des Églises Reformées de Suisse} [hereafter EPER]\textsuperscript{560} has resolved to help to address the perennial socio-economic deficiency of HMC. EPER’s pragmatic initiative aimed to increase in 22 months (September 2013 to June 2015) the agricultural production of parents, students and teachers of 29 schools in a rural region of the church in order to be local producers and suppliers of agricultural produces.\textsuperscript{561} The revenues to be generated would yield resources to help to pay teachers’ salaries and maintain the schools. An excerpt of the main goal was:

\begin{quote}
By July 2014, EPER will no longer be able to contribute as before to the regular financing of the [school] system. To minimize the risk of collapse EPER has decided to make investment funds and training available to ASPACREP in a three-year pilot phase of an income-generating project.\textsuperscript{562}
\end{quote}

During this new phase of collaboration, all efforts would be converged towards the financial autonomy of these schools.\textsuperscript{563} Note this excerpt as well:

\begin{quote}
During the first 20 years of the partnership, the operation of ASPACREP was greatly dependent on foreign contributions. However, this project aims to be the pilot phase of the process of self-sufficiency of ASPACREP and the gradual withdrawal of [EPER’s] financial partnership.\textsuperscript{564}
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{557} ADLI3  
\textsuperscript{558} ADFG3  
\textsuperscript{559} ADQ30  
\textsuperscript{560} MDC-HMC2009  
\textsuperscript{561} Project cost: US$260,000.00; ADPR8  
\textsuperscript{562} ADPR7, ADPR8  
\textsuperscript{563} ADPR7, ADPR8  
\textsuperscript{564} ADPR7, ADPR8
Another long-standing supporter of HMC, UMCOR, has also recognized this perennial deficiency which has, over past many years, characterized HP. It has therefore resolved to carve a missional pathway towards sustainability over a five-year period. This excerpt explained:

UMCOR is supporting the mission and ministry of HMC through sustainable, integrated community development projects in the sectors of agriculture, health, microcredit, and literacy. Through the InterDisciplinary Team (IDT), community meetings were held in HMC congregations across Haiti to review sustainable development practices and identify resources available locally. Designs for sustainable, integrated community development projects have been received and projects are underway in HMC communities across Haiti.\textsuperscript{565}

In relevance to this descriptive theme, I highlight two additional goals from UMCOR: ‘to finance the Methodist school system at 60 percent with local contributions within five years’ and ‘to help recipients lift themselves out of poverty and become financially independent through businesses’.\textsuperscript{566}

Participants did not see any economic mobility in these kinds of initiatives of which, the belief is, their short-lived lifespan and tokenistic symbolism, as in the past, would potentially complicate the poverty status of the socially disenfranchised.\textsuperscript{567}

No, not in this timeframe. I recognized nonetheless it is the chicken and egg situation. But, the creation of an autonomy plan to transform the current state of Haiti’s misery and poverty will need more time.\textsuperscript{568}

They reminisced and argued further that when similar goal-driven projects came systematically in contact with the lack of infrastructure, the socio-economic insufficiency and the anti-growth

\textsuperscript{565} ADPR4
\textsuperscript{566} ADPR4
\textsuperscript{567} An agricultural project was carried out during July 2011-June 2013. The project cost was US$180,000.00. The objectives were similar to the current EPER’s agricultural project (September 2013 to June 2015). Since the set goals of the previous project did not materialize, participants were skeptical of the current project’s profitability. ADPR7
\textsuperscript{568} ADLI3
political system in HP’s space, they did not yield any sustainable transformation for the poor and the non-literate. An ADLI participant said to me:

My brother, the idea that aid-providers were committed to helping with education and production of local farm produces in Haiti towards autonomy was great. They have, for a while, tried to do it; but challenged by the truculent socio-political realities in Haiti, they have conveniently diverted their foci to other needs i.e. school feeding programmes.

Given the weight of evidence collected, is it therefore ironic, in this anti-productive climate to speak of self-sufficiency? However, it may not be ironic for selective individuals whose personal experiences with aid-dependency augured the start of a transformational change.

While both views are consequentially potent in the evolution of this research, the intriguing point here for me is that the existing indicators of positivity outlined above have been foreign-aid dependent. By contrast, participants advocated self-sufficiency to be the result of indigenous developmental initiatives which are owned by Haitians and motivated by Haiti’s needs. These kinds of initiatives will boost Haitian pride and resonate with the building of self-confidence and trust, dignity towards self-investment in community life.

**Descriptive Theme 4. Creates Division**

The fact that dependency on foreign-aid is an absolute necessity in HP has become an axis of interest at the heart of the church and church’s social communities. The more it is a necessity and a tangible expression of Christian love, the more aid-providers and aid-receivers invest in it. Consequently, the more it has become a divine blessing with potential ramifications towards

---

569 ADL6, ADL7, ADL10
570 ADL3
polarizing the church and the community. However, an ADLI participant hastened to highlight Haitians’ disinclination to co-responsibility and social coherence, a consequence of slavery, which predisposed them to polarization.572

We have a problem of social cohesion and collaboration among us. It goes contrary to what the Jamaicans believe: ‘Together we aspire, together we achieve’. We have struggled to achieve together. We have a weakness at the collective level. We are prone to polarization and are therefore unable to crystalize a common vision.573

An ADLI accentuated the point:

Our divisions resulted from, class prejudice and psychological damages inflicted on us by slavery which thrived throughout the years on polarizing the enslaved residents in whose minds the other slave was a treater, an enemy.574

On evidence, alongside long-term social incoherence, dependency on foreign-aid has accentuated the culture of polarization in HP and has therefore made it difficult to achieve transformational goals. The datasets highlight evidences of polarization in (1) management of aid-resources and on (2) religious grounds.

Memo 1. Management of Aid-resources

Participants felt that the necessity for foreign-aid nourishes the root cause of polarization. As the following data explained, it resulted in lack of mutual trust among aid-beneficiaries.

After 5 years, owing to lack of foreign sponsorship, the funding for a community canteen programme had stopped. The community expressed suspicion over the abrupt ending of the programme, and consequently, accused the minister of fund misappropriation. This episode has led to the church being split and the minister vilified.575

‘Aid-dependency has become a dividing tool. There has been so much at stake among the beneficiaries that aid-dependency played off one church against another and one

572 ADLI8
573 ADLI8
574 ADLI13
575 ADLI9
leader against another’. 576

Furthermore, within local church governing bodies, polarisation involved local leadership contests for aid-management. Participants unearthed the potential rivalry that undergirded relationships in any given church in HP. These quotes spoke to the matter. ‘Foreign-aid tends to create tension among church leaders as they vie for positions which would give them the monopoly on aid-management’. 577 ‘Relationships between deacons and pastors have been marred by heightened tension and polarisations over aid. There is much in-fighting in the church over aid’. 578 In this context a participant argued: ‘While it is imperative that we are united to build our church, foreigners stand between us with enticing gifts pulling us in different directions’. 579

These data evidenced internal tensions within an elite minority of church leadership. Their financial status has been sustained by the monopoly on aid management. 580 However, this monopoly - in church and state - has not yet facilitated growth. 581

Another typology of polarization has been on religious grounds. It juxtaposed HP’s aid-dependency culture and Voodoo’s inaccessibility to foreign wealth.

Memo 2. Religious Grounds

HP has been invested with wealth, power and, by extension, the perceived socio-economic control that are derived from aid-investment. In contrast, Voodoo has been portrayed as an

576 ADL17
577 ADQ22
578 ADQ27
579 ADL11
aid-deprived religion with no overseas relations, and therefore with no financial resources to build, for example, a school or a clinic. This marked difference has nurtured vibes of polarization within the Haitian faith sector. As an example, Protestants have been noticeably providers of foreign-aid and therefore dented the public dignity of the Vodooists who offer no contribution but herbal healing and outstretched hands. Further to this, there has been an element of faith discrimination. This participant observed:

Other religions/denominations benefit from compassion, canteen, and scholarship grants when they become involved in Protestant church institutions like schools, orphanages or homes for the elderly. Many protestant churches extend their help only to persons who belong to their own denominations.

In some cases, proselyting, as the motive of foreign assistance, further divided the faith sector. This quote explained:

However, in the long-run, many of them have had their children baptized at the Methodist Church as a way of showing their appreciation for this cooperation, despite their different religious convictions. With times, few of them get converted into Christianity.

Given the perennial discord between HP and Vodoo, foreign-aid has not in any measure helped to ease it. It has rather strengthened the divide between them. Dependency on foreign-aid, therefore, thrives on the supporting pillars of internal tensions, polarizing both HP’s aid-beneficiaries and the faith sector. Could it be that this polarization has sapped the energy of local missions to work for the advancement of communities of the Lord’s people?

Descriptive Theme 5. Unconcerned with Socio-Political In-depth Change

According to participants, the lack of evidence that previous social projects helped to dismantle socio-political and economic structures strengthened the standing of this descriptive theme.

583 ADQ32
584 ADQ9
However, before I receive related supporting evidences, I highlight the following data which built a counter-argument:

The very involvement of the church in education, social projects and health care is a strong message of the church’s desire to see changes in the socio-political reality of the country.  

I do not believe that aid-dependency distracts the church from being involved in socio-political change. In fact, it sustained such an involvement. With the failure of our government to provide for its people, the situation could have been worse had not our church been active, alongside the poor, through the means of foreign-aid.  

However, other participants described this descriptive theme as a legacy of foreign inculturation. The ensuing view explained:

Owing to our missionary heritage, we have been cultured to be indifferent to the management of civic and political life of our nation. As such, we have discarded the socio-political dimension of our civic responsibility in favour of simple social acts which are bereft of any lasting poverty-alleviation.  

Another strand of the argument emphasized the welfare of church leaders which has been guaranteed by aid-provisions. It, therefore, means little to them to pursue in-depth political change. Self-preservation has silenced them. This resonates with these ADQ participants’ view and opinions:

Advocating for national political transformation means to pursue also for oneself the relevant benefit that will result. Given that one gains the said benefit from another source, such political advocacy is no longer a priority.  

HP is less concerned with effecting any socio-political change by living an ‘I don’t care life’ regarding what is happening socio-politically because its help comes from across the sea.  

It is difficult for Protestants to achieve any consensus aiming to change our social-political landscape as we are faithfully committed to fulfilling the terms and conditions of foreign-aid policies as a necessity for our welfare.  

Equally important were the next sets of opinions which described foreign-aid as a distraction

585 ADQ23  
586 ADQ6  
587 ADLI11  
588 ADLI13  
589 ADQ22  
590 ADQ27
and a hindrance to socio-political change. ‘Foreign-aid hinders the church from making progress towards sustainable socio-political change’.  

Because they have been too heavily dependent on foreign-aid and on many partners/donors who have interests in keeping the status quo, HP, with the notable exception of HMC, would not be too involved in socio-political change.  

Dependency on foreign-aid distracts the church. There is a gaze for help from outside rather than seeking to join the struggle for socio-political change on the inside. Aid gives immediate relief without political or social struggle and conflict. Therefore, the church chooses the easier way.  

‘Foreign-aid does not empower us to change things on the socio-political front’. In fact, ‘HP has always been involved in social rather than political change’. Foreign-aid has therefore silenced the voice of advocacy. There is another prevailing argument which emphatically does not accept doing politics as a vital ministry of HP. A participant explained:  

I do not believe that foreign-aid distracts the church from being involved in socio-political change. The point is that, with or without the injection of aid, HP has not done and should not do politics.  

‘I strongly believe that the church, as an institution, should stay away from directly involving in politics’. Here, doctrinal conviction has silenced the voice of prophetic mission.  

However, these data presented a case for socio-political involvement:  

Foreign-aid does not distract but restricts us in our local development. Some time we are not participating in political activities because we claim to be Christians, as though, being Christians means being aliens to the socio-political reality of our country; in fact, the opposite is a missional requirement.  

The church is the voice of the poor, it ought to advocate socio-political change for their sake. We cannot enumerate the number of people who have
been marginalized and exploited in our community, because they do not have people to stand by them. The Church must always aim to be their advocate.\textsuperscript{601}

A corresponding view was recorded as follows:

We are currently suffering from the failure of engagement with the socio-political reality of our nation. We have an interesting and flourishing effervescent HP, yet, in a paralytic and agonising country of which foreign-aid provision, at the neglect of socio-political involvement for change, is not a plausible solution.\textsuperscript{602}

The datasets highlighted a practice of foreign-aid culture predicated on negligible political input which in turn undermines HP’s ability to profoundly transform its context. With the aid-dependency practices creating the ideal space for HP to effect minimal social change, it is rather more convenient for aid-providers to engage with a limited socio-economic response to poverty at the neglect of in-depth socio-political engagement which potentially holds the key to lasting socio-economic transformation.

*Descriptive Theme 6. Impacts on Poverty*

A limited socio-economic response to varied poverty-driven triggers within HP’s space blurred the line of differentiation between attending to immediate humanitarian needs and fostering in-depth socio-economic transformation as a guarantee to lasting poverty-alleviation. Having said this, what then makes this descriptive theme, although different, distinct from descriptive theme 5? In response, I return to the 1950-2000 and post-2000 aid-eras whose socio-economic ethos was driven more by poverty-alleviation and eradication than by socio-political transformation. Ongoing aid-dependency has been an unintended consequence of ‘palliative economics’. However, to be consistent with the datasets, I firstly underline UMCOR’s clarification of its missional involvement in HP and then proceed to articulate views purporting to substantiate this theme. The following view gave a summary of UMCOR’s generic policy:

You can say that UMCOR has a mandate to alleviate suffering and, in disaster situations, respond to disasters by providing aid-assistance. Also, it assists

\textsuperscript{601} ADQ12 \textsuperscript{602} ADLI11
partners, strengthens their capacities to do their own work in terms of long-
term development so that they can respond to disasters. It is that recovery
process we invest in.\textsuperscript{603}

Precisely, UMCOR, in its all-encompassing vision, aims to provide disaster-recovery aid as
well as DA towards poverty-alleviation. However, there are mixed views in understanding
the effect of aid-dependency on poverty-alleviation. In the first instance, participants’
responses took me along to receive what they considered to be poverty-alleviation impact.

This opinion explained:

HEIFER had a programme, called, ‘passing on the gifts’ in which the
individual received a young native goat to cross-fertilize with a foreign race. After mating and reproducing, the goat receiver is expected to give or pass
on a goat to another person. This plan worked so well that it alleviated
poverty in so many families.\textsuperscript{604}

An ADLI explained the ‘passing on the gifts’ modality:

Aid-providers tell you that they are doing sustainable development by giving
to a poor man a goat to raise. In the same breath, they request from him, after
a breeding process, a young goat to go to someone else. You then begin to
wonder how long it will take this poor man to really prosper from that goat
and improve his living conditions. To me this is a distraction in which the
poor man \textit{se débrouille}.\textsuperscript{605} It is neither a poverty-alleviation scheme nor sustainable development.\textsuperscript{606}

These quotes find resonance in the first part of the descriptive theme ‘impacts on self-
sufficiency’. There is the positive momentum and the claim that, through social services, which
have been well received, poverty-alleviation has been achieved. The reality is that these
services have created a short-term positive impact on peoples’ need-driven lives.\textsuperscript{607}

However, a contrasting discourse substantiated the description of foreign-aid as a poverty-
driven mechanism. There is much evidence for this argument in the following opinions. ‘If

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{603} ADLI9
\item \textsuperscript{604} ADQ12. The success is also acclaimed in the following data: CMHMC2014, ADPR9
\item \textsuperscript{605} The term \textit{se débrouiller}, and its synonym \textit{se démêler}, is French and translates in English to manage or to
make do with. See p.218
\item \textsuperscript{606} ADLI6
\item \textsuperscript{607} See ‘Descriptive Theme 1’, p.130
\end{itemize}
funding were to be well allocated, touching the marginalized in our society as well as in the church, one would witness a reduction of poverty’. 608

In my opinion, aid-dependency is a poverty-feeding factor instead of being a poverty-alleviating vehicle in the church. The idea of always depending on someone else to provide for one’s needs is pro-poverty because it impairs human’s capacity to think outside of the box to come up with solutions which go beyond seeking other’s assistance. 609

Can we really say that foreign-aid has an impact on poverty-alleviation? Depending on aid will not get us out of poverty, it rather sinks us deeper in a hole. It does not improve the standard of living of the people. 610

‘The church itself has become poorer over the years by being dependent on foreign-aid. So, it is hard to talk about alleviation of poverty’. 611 In fact, foreign aid-dependency has not had any impact on the economic poverty level in HP. 612 This ADQ participant opined:

On a large scale foreign-aid has not had that huge impact on poverty-alleviation. Over 200 years of [Haiti’s] political independence, and almost the same period since Protestant churches have been involved in the very thing they are doing today, receiving foreign-aid, yet the poverty level in the church and wider society has not changed much. 613

As grounded in the datasets, then it is surreal to speak of poverty-alleviation in a context where foreign-aid has continued to be the oxygen of the poor and the deeply impoverished. Effectively, participants argued that aid has not yet reached the poor with a socio-economic plan of empowerment through poverty-alleviation initiatives to exonerate it from being a psychological relief.

In the next Core Theme, the focus of the analysis will shift to, firstly, participants’ perceptions of aid-providers, and secondly, to aid-receivers’ discovery of how their dignity has been affected by the eight preceding descriptive themes. Therefore, Core Theme C, ‘expression of

608 ADQ25
609 ADQ13
610 ADQ7
611 ADQ14
612 ADQ5
613 ADQ23

4.2.3 Core Theme C. Expression of Disempowerment

Descriptive Theme 7. Paternalism

In this core theme, participants referred to the types of relationship which has existed between aid-providers and aid-receivers in paternalistic terms. They posited aid-dependency as a tool of paternalism. An accumulation of data provided the evidence. This was firstly constitutive of these phrases which expressed influence, namely ‘Who finances, commands’, 614 ‘Whoever finances, gives orders’ 615 and ‘Whoever pays the salary is the boss’. 616 In fact, participants asserted that ‘As long as one accepts foreign-aid, one will always be controlled by the aid-provider, the two are related’. 617 This suggests that ‘Of course, aid-dependency and foreign control are directly related’. 618 This control was said to be, in part, embedded in the mother and daughter church relationship which has been at variance with a sister-church relationship model. An ADLI participant gave more clarity:

The dependency model creates a form of monopoly and control from the giver. Absolutely! That’s the motivation, of course, that’s what it all about. Aid-providers are generous, but there is always a price to pay for their generosity. For example, the Methodist Church in Zimbabwe or in Haiti is a daughter-church to a mother-church which provides aid. Daughters look up in respect to their mothers so has the daughter-church behaved. This is a very interesting thing to ponder on. 619

In a pragmatic way, participants gave this understanding of control:

The church has fallen under the tutelage and authority of foreigners. Whatever the foreigners said remained unchallenged. The local ministers do not have neither the right nor the authority to act in their own churches on

614 ADLI4, ADLI2
615 ADLI1
616 ADLI10
617 ADQ7
618 ADQ14
619 ADLI4
foreign-funded projects unless foreign approval is granted. This is one of the major breaking points in the church.\textsuperscript{620}

The foreigner helps us but imposes on us their professional and anthropological ideas with a view to keeping an eye on their aid-supply.\textsuperscript{621} An ADLI participant presented this experience of control:

When I was living there [Haiti], I had many battles with the American Methodist church and with their aid agencies as well. I refused to accept money on their terms; and they had terms, I have to say.\textsuperscript{622}

This is a vivid example of what the participant meant by ‘they had terms’:

An aid-provider raised sponsorship money through a relationship with children in schools. So, the American sentimentality is played upon by a little Haitian girl or boy, writing a little letter with a photograph to get from the Americans, those were the figures called in my days, US$15 a month. And so, the relationship had to be serviced and we had to appoint and pay someone to get this done. All these letters from a hundred little children had to be translated. Otherwise funds would not be released.\textsuperscript{623}

Furthermore, in this controlling culture, participants attributed wealth and power to aid-providers. Their perception has been that they are rich and therefore able to do many things in the power of their wealth and influence of their ethnicity. In the same discourse, they have also been perceived as some demi-gods by participants:

When one’s mouth and belly are controlled by somebody or any entity for that matter, the possibility exists that the mind could stare at the benefactor as a fatherly deity and the future of the recipient could well be trapped in the web of the patron.\textsuperscript{624}

In the participants’ optic, paternalistic conversations and actions have inherently and inadvertently been codified in the practices, written and unwritten, of the aid-dependency culture. Embedded in the datasets are an accumulation of quotes, opinions, views and

\textsuperscript{620} ADQ27
\textsuperscript{621} ADFG3
\textsuperscript{622} ADLI4
\textsuperscript{623} ADLI4
\textsuperscript{624} ADQ22
excerpts which are instructive to the naming of this descriptive theme, paternalism. I provide evidence for this theme in five memos.

Memo 1. Not Listening to Local Needs

Participants have been preoccupied by the aid-providers’ application of their own religious and professional judgments and strategy-driven changes made on various projects submitted by HP. They shared the conviction that ‘In matters pertaining to sustainable development, we would prefer to receive aid for investment according to people’s needs, social, religious and economic, rather than according to the aid-providers’ dictates’. ADFG and ADLI participants have been dissatisfied with this approach:

The revised plan most times yield deleterious consequences resulting from the donors’ ignorance of the contexts and community needs. In this way aid would not generate the desired change in a specific impoverished target community.

The foreigner goes unto the fieldwork to install filters. The issue, often, is, there is no water to filter. A water cistern needs to be built then filtering water will be profitable. How then do you make filters available to a community whose priority-need is flowing water? Since the foreigner does not listen, we give them the green light to go ahead.

‘Most of the time the donors dictate the rules that do not always match the socio-religious and contextual realities. Therefore, very few if any successful outcomes can be retraced’. An ADLI claimed that:

Haitian spiritual worldview constitutes an essential reference point, a type of knowledge-base and local expertise around which everything revolved and in which the supernatural has been real and influential. Surprisingly, the aid-provider does not use it, in fact dismiss it as backward.

With the lapsing of years, the strategy has, so far and obviously, not been working. Other participants went in support of the above data in these words: ‘Most importantly, in order to

---

625 ADLI6
626 ADFG3
627 ADLI6
628 ADQ14
629 ADQ32
630 ADFG3
discover what they really need, aid-providers should listen to aid-receivers. They shouldn’t assume that they know what the recipients’ needs are’. 631 ‘In aid-relief and -developmental projects, foreigners do not give the slightest attention to local religious values and needs’. 632

The foreigners believe they have the right to decide for us, so they don’t listen. Take the orphanage as an example; we always have relevant programmes to meet children’s needs. We know those children as being deprived of clothes and books to go to school. The foreigners, however, insist on buying and bringing toys. They should, at least, have the courtesy of asking us what is needed at the orphanage. 633

Coping with this paternalistic-based rectitude drew these responses from ADLI participants:

At the school in Dondon [a town] there were 250 children. Aid-providers then only wanted to sponsor a hundred children. I said that’s unacceptable. I can’t, in a rural economy, fathom the idea that some children had US$6 a month, US$75 a year, and other children have nothing. So, I took the money and spent it on the entire school. And I promise you the battle that I had was wearing me out. They were not concerned about the social implications of the way the money was distributed but their terms and policies. 634

ADFG and ADLI participants then pointed out: ‘In many instances, whatever the donors say stands. The colonial mentality continues’, 635 that being the case, ‘The ethos of paternalistic relations goes unchallenged so that we are controlled by aid-providers in our context of un-met needs’. 636 On empirical evidence, the fact of ‘not listening to local needs’ underpinned aid-provider’s paternalistic strategy to disempower those being aided.

Memo 2. Not Using Local Expertise/Labour

Often, embedded in revised plans has been the donors’ intentionality to crowd HP’s fieldwork, doing tasks that Protestants can do best with little or no supervision. Taking it altogether,
participants felt that the local expertise has not been a pre-requisite investment alongside foreign funded project investments. An ADFG participant remarked:

Sadly, we are not even allowed to build our own latrines. Church-missions have taken the pleasure to build, inaugurate and inscribe their names on our church latrines.\footnote{ADFG1}

An ADFG participant revealed:

In the aftermath of the 2010 earthquake disaster, we were not allowed the time and freedom to construct from our funding and with our labour a building, school or church. We could have built something from our own sweat. Definitely, we could have!\footnote{ADFG3. See also ADPR9 for a summary of foreign partners’ recent projects.}

ADLI participants pointed out a root cause:

When I look at the history of the Methodist Church, I recognized from the beginning there was a fatal flaw. Namely, it was missionaries and money from Britain who sustained mission works in Haiti. And that was in a sense, the foundation upon which Methodism in Haiti was built. Local contributions were not solicited.\footnote{ADLI4}

Since the establishment of this church, the [European-American] church has donated cars, built manses and paid ministers’ stipends. They have trained us to receive so that our gifts, expertise and contributions were not required.\footnote{ADLI6}

Concerning observing the 50/50 agreed policy as a criterion for project financing, a complete disregard has rather been enforced.\footnote{A funding policy which requires foreign partners’ contributions to match by 50% local partners’ resources. ADPR4} ADLI participants viewed the non-application of this policy in these words:

Yes, this policy is always flagged up; but it left us worse off. The office of ‘Coordination du Development’ is a practical example. Aid-providers requested that we forfeited all charges so that their occupancy of the office will be regarded as our contributions. In this regard, I can tell you, the foreigner took away what we had.\footnote{ADLI3}

This ADLI participant esteemed that there has been no policy compliance.

In some projects, we applied it in principle. Although, often, our contributions have been insufficient or non-existent, this does not hinder the execution of development projects.\footnote{ADLI1}
We always have a section that’s headed ‘local contribution’. In practice, the money isn’t there and won’t be sourced. We have incorporated it in different ways to make it work, like paying reduced salaries to our staff. 644

‘We haven’t managed to honour this contribution as prescribed by the agreement. Projects went on anyway’. 645

Arguably, the datasets provided paternalistic evidences to suggest that participants’ entrepreneurship and local expertise have been a perennially neglected asset in aid-providers poverty-alleviation initiatives.

Memo 3. Imported Financial Procedures

Regarding these procedures, providing vouchers, receipts and financial reports for every cent received and spent has not been an integral component of the day-to-day activities of the non-literate peasants whose disenfranchised lives warranted foreign-aid intervention. This procedural approach which has been a way of doing business in the aid-providers’ culture has been viewed as a paternalistic interference. Policies and control have been tightly linked to projects. However, while aid-receivers were bent on receiving aid, they were largely unconcerned with conditionalities attached to it. The datasets substantiated the point.

‘Foreign project policies are set by foreign-aid donors. Therefore, when the locals don’t follow the financial directives donors intervene’. 646 ‘Yes, there is much control, because donors always require voucher-based reports from church leaders and school principals for funds spent’. 647 ‘Yes, there is a lot of control exercised on us. When foreign-aid is received it must be followed by a report on spending’. 648

This excerpt spoke of reporting as a challenge to the church:

644 ADLI1
645 ADL16
646 ADQ12
647 ADQ1
648 ADQ15
The issue of financial reporting which has always been a problem for many years is currently the weakness of the circuits. I invite all ministers to do their best to change things by reporting regularly. It is not possible that narrative reports are presented in the absence of relevant financial facts.\textsuperscript{649} 

Certain ADLI and ADQ participants, however, were satisfied with aid-providers’ applied accounting procedures. They did not see it as a paternalistic tool of control but argued in favour of responsible business practices. They made their case in these words:

When funders ask for accountability statements, this is not to impose foreign control, but to strengthen the conventional way of encouraging transparency and good stewardship.\textsuperscript{650}

‘There must be control by the person or the institution which provides the fund through a system of financial reporting’.\textsuperscript{651} ‘Foreigners invest, they must have their watchful eyes over everything’.\textsuperscript{652} ‘I feel that if they give aid, there must be control in the way of producing report on spending’.\textsuperscript{653} ‘Yes, we must be accountable. We receive money for a project, we must justify its use’.\textsuperscript{654}

I believe that is normal. We should provide relevant reports. Normally, the one who gives us the money received it from somebody else who in their chain of accountability will ask about its spending.\textsuperscript{655}

However, pressured by this expectation, many aid-receivers have been found wanting between their inability to competently produce the reports and their determination to provide transparent reports. In this context, a participant revealed:

Conditional aid is killing us, we can do without it. When it is received, we are meticulously instructed about its spending. It would be more beneficial to be permitted to use it, without any strings attached, according to emerging community needs.\textsuperscript{656}

\textsuperscript{649} MDC-HMC2014, MDC-HMC2009
\textsuperscript{650} ADQ22
\textsuperscript{651} ADQ16
\textsuperscript{652} ADQ4
\textsuperscript{653} ADQ16
\textsuperscript{654} ADLI1
\textsuperscript{655} ADLI2
\textsuperscript{656} ADLI6
Memo 4. Foreign Structure

The datasets indicated that HMC has embodied an unwavering loyalty and faithfulness to imported paternalistic structures.\(^{657}\) These offer a coherent organizational system, well detailed and structured in accordance with [the mother-church] governance of their European and American counterparts.

Illustratively, the organizational ministry-based pyramid of British Methodism consists of this cascading pattern: a president for the connexion, a chair-person for the district, a superintendent for the circuit, and a minister for the local church. In each layer of the pyramid sits a stipendiary minister entrusted with pastoral and administrative responsibilities. Haitian Methodism has inherited this paternalistic organizational structure, which, compared to British Methodism, has been costly in terms of budgetary allocations, adequate staffing and visioning.\(^{658}\) Yet, even after nearly two hundred years, HMC has preserved such foreign structure at the expense of localized church leadership experimentations.\(^{659}\)

Regarding training, stationing and upkeep of ministers, HMC’s practice has equalled that of its foreign partners, so that, the transferred paternalistic structure maintained its characteristics in HP. For example, upon the completion of training, the provision of a furnished church-house, a monthly stipend to ministers, allowances to their children\(^ {660}\) and payment of central utilities and transport facilities is guaranteed.\(^ {661}\) These requirements constituted the same tenets of


\(^{658}\) See the list of stations in the MDC-HMC2011

\(^{659}\) MCB: *The Constitutional*, pp.221-236 and MCCA: *The Constitution*, pp.55-64

\(^{660}\) Who are the children qualified to receive the ministers’ children funds? This question is integral to the agenda of the MDC-HMC, annually. As evidence, I chose four of the eight responses available from the literary material: 18 children were eligible in 2002, MDC-HMC2002; 19 children in 2006, MDC-HMC2006, 17 in 2009, MDC-HMC2009 and 12 children in 2014, see MDC-HMC2014

\(^{661}\) See recurrent budgets of MDC-HMC from 2002 to 2016.
constitutional provisions, with minimal variations, for the upkeep of ministers in the European and American mother-church system.662

By choosing to welcome Methodism in 1817, the Haitian community, later HP, vowed to loyally sustain this administrative package of ministerial staff well-being for both first foreign, then, subsequently, local ministers. In this regard, HP’s leadership at varying levels embodies a paternalistic elitist structure which separates them from the average Haitian, and which by extension, elevates them as local representatives of the European and American mother-churches.663

In a context where the socio-economic pressure is forever threatening the existence and the livelihood of the average Haitian,664 it is taxing, on the average poverty-stricken and non-literate member, to sustain the provisions of care to which their ministers, priests and pastors are legitimately entitled.665 In the circumstance, the up-keep of this paternalistic structure takes pre-eminence over the financing and nurturing of ministries.666 In this way, participants argued that aid-dependency’s practices have strengthened paternalistic structures for reciprocal missional benefits within the mother-daughter church relations.667

Memo 5. Cultural Assimilation

The datasets revealed that HP’s leadership has gradually been initiated into foreigners’

663 See ‘Cultural Assimilation’ below
664 See ‘Descriptive Theme 1’, p.130
665 In church years 2002-2003, 2005-2006 and 2009-2010 the financial contributions from local congregations towards the upkeep of the church have consistently been low, compared to the respective annual budgets. Illustratively, in 2009-2010, HMC contributed 20% (HTG 1,563,140.00) to its own budget (HTG 7,165,155.00). MDC-HMC2009
666 On average, 75% of the church budget relative to the upkeep of ministerial leaderships is subsidized by foreign grant. See recurrent budgets of the MDC-HMC from 2002 to 2016.
ethnocentrism. They have not solely been contented to be co-distributors of aid-supplies to
the disenfranchised of their own communities but have copied and contextualized the aid-
providers’ paternalistic practices. They have potentially become their faithful representatives,
locally. Local leaderships, instead of striving for emancipation from these practices, tended
themselves to become paternalistic. An ADLI participant argued that:

In our church our comportment is that of the English and American ministers. We
develop a mentality in that our mission approach is a replica of those who
were there before we, the locals, arrived on the scene.\(^668\)

This data suggested that:

The aid-providers are wealthy [in education, housing and social status] and
paternalistic, and, therefore, constitute an elite group. We, the local
representatives, aspire to be like them and in varied circumstances function
like them. We tend to unconsciously reproduce this elitist and paternalistic
mentality; that often is the case.\(^669\)

Too often a small group of people in the church has been educated in western
foreign style and has tended to see themselves in some ways as partly citizens
of a world that is largely beyond Haiti.\(^670\)

In line with the memo ‘foreign structure’ an ADLI argued:

We are going to a Circuit; we don’t need to know whether the local church
is financially able to meet the constitutional requirements to receive us. We
may not always be able to buy ourselves a donkey, more less a house and a
car, yet, we are entitled to a car, a house with many bedrooms with its utilities
paid. We are conscious of the reality, but why should we be treated
differently than the English and American ministers for whom such a
structure was initially set up?\(^671\)

At times, we are more adept in the application of this paternalistic system
than the ones who initiated us into it. We can become so foreign, more foreign
among our own people than the foreigners themselves among our own
people. This is a legacy we have inherited from a paternalistic culture.\(^672\)

Cultural assimilation yielded benefits. The foreigners’ wealth, privilege and position have
somewhat been channelled to local leaders. These participants explained, to a great extent, that
dependency on foreign-aid creates wealth for leaders. Lack of education of the grassroots turns

\(^{668}\) ADLI3 \\
\(^{669}\) ADLI3 \\
\(^{670}\) ADLI3 \\
\(^{671}\) ADLI4 \\
\(^{672}\) ADLI3
the aid-advantage over to the leaders who write and manage these projects. In addition to instant aid, some church leaders do take advantage of scholarship opportunities for close families and friends to study abroad.\(^{673}\)

Take the bishop of the Methodist church. All his children were educated at university in America. The church leadership took advantage of its leadership. He got his own children the benefits of that relationship. It’s an insidious and perfidious process.\(^{674}\)

By way of clarifying the above view, an ADLI used a socio-political platform as a prop. What is happening in the church is a replica of what goes in the wider Haitian society.

What do you need when 1.5 million people are displaced and a \(\frac{1}{4}\) of a million people dead? You need water as well as food and shelter. And somebody who already had millions of dollars through his business enterprises, claimed the monopoly of the market by providing trucks of water supply, making for himself huge profits on foreign money destined to supply water lines to tented villages of the victims of the earthquake.\(^{675}\)

According to participants, paternalism is a symbiotic power-sharing relationship between local and foreign ethnocentrisms within HP. For fear of losing their grips on aid-assistance and their paternalistic significance, local leaderships have traded their worth and pride through the acceptance and assimilation of paternalistic practices. In other words, ‘these practices have disempowered local leaderships’.\(^{676}\) An ADLI concluded:

We are not ourselves, we do not represent the nation’s values, but our aid-providers’. We sell our conscience; we trade our birth-right. Yes, we sell our birth-right for aid. There are times, some aid should be left alone lest it became a stumbling block for us.\(^{677}\)

Descriptive Theme 8. Derivative of Injustice

The presence of NGOs has been so firmly established in Haiti that the line of differentiation between church’s [FMDs’] charities and [FP’s] charities has almost been negligible. It is from this perspective I glean from the dataset the following contributions.\(^{678}\)

\(^{673}\) ADQ23, ADQ25
\(^{674}\) ADLI4
\(^{675}\) ADLI4
\(^{676}\) ADQ33
\(^{677}\) ADLI2
\(^{678}\) See ‘What is FP?’, p.175
Participants revealed that aid-dependency is a consequence of socio-economic and political injustices which Haiti [HP] has suffered and continues to suffer. They have been recurrent issues in HP’s space. Moreover, they argued that aid-dependency has been crystallized as a practice which upheld socio-economic injustices.

Participants stressed that this suffering has in part been inflicted by foreign and local wealth extractors in their practice of ‘extraction of underground natural resources and other historical treasures or monuments which are priceless to the country’. 679

Haiti’s impoverishment has not been done overnight. Its resources have been shipped away in the course of time. As a result, lack of education, health care and jobs marred the country in poverty for centuries. Then aid is given and received to compensate. 680

This ADQ equated injustice with exploitation:

Foreign forces exploit Haiti’s wealth in many ways: they occupied the country, they controlled the public treasure, including custom revenues of seaport and airport. While trading with us they weakened the local leadership and divided the people. 681

Another ADQ experienced Haiti’s impoverishment in foreign institutions, locally established.

Foreign forces contributed to the impoverishment of Haiti; the result is here to see in our poverty. They set up Haitian-like administrations over which they have had oversight. This is how they started the wealth squandering of the country. 682

With no specific distinctions being made between churchmissions and secular organizations, these views and opinions described aid-dependency’s practices as both a derivative and a reinforcement of socio-economic injustices.

Deskptive Theme 9. Lethargic Bondye-bon

Within the current discourse, participants upheld the legitimacy of the Bondye-bon ethos as

679 ADQ13
680 ADQ7. A participant argued: ‘Rich countries which support Haiti financially give back a little of the amounts of wealth they have extracted from Haiti. A case in point is aid from France to Haiti’. ADQ32. See ‘Independence Indemnity’, p.45 and ‘Costs of Economic Injustices’, p.179
681 ADQ32
682 ADQ7
an internal characteristic, spiritual escapism, and a psychological blockage towards efficiency within HP’s applied theology. Intrinsic to this ethos, the poverty of local productivity which hinders self-sufficiency and the mobility of socio-economics confirms the lethargic attitude of the average Haitian. It is in this context I receive this view: ‘To a great extent foreign-aid nurtures this attitude, because, people, instead of using their God given gifts, talents and resources, prefer to sit idly and wait for ‘manna, falling from heaven’.  

While there is merit in this argument for some, other participants considered the validity of data, for example, in descriptive theme ‘Unconcerned with socio-political in-depth change’ to counter-act. These data: ‘We have been cultured to be indifferent to the management of civic and political life’ and ‘Given that one gains the said benefit from another source, such political advocacy is no longer a priority’, pointed to foreign-aid continued presence as an equally causative factor, in fact, a dominant factor. These additional data were also relevant in this context:

‘Aid-dependency atrophies our mental strength and renders us lethargic. It is nurturing the Bondye-bon culture’. ‘Foreign-aid atrophies the desire to work such that the culture of local productivity is rather evasive’. The fact that many church leaders nurture the thought that foreign-aid will arrive prevents them from taking transforming initiatives locally’. Since foreign-aid has engendered and fostered local dis-engagement, participants affirmed that Bondye-bon has been nurtured by foreign aid-dependency. The more foreign-aid is an

---

683 ADLI1, supported by ADQ23  
684 See ‘Feature 3’, p.68  
685 ADLI11  
686 ADLI3  
687 ADFG1  
688 ADQ25  
689 ADQ24  
690 ADFG1  
691 ADQ24
‘absolute necessity’ and a ‘divine blessing’ the more the acuteness of Bondye-bon attitude and its consequences are evident in HP.

Using this argument as a baseline, other participants refused to agree that aid-receivers have wittingly opted for Bondye-bon in spiritual escapism. Rather they conceived it as a spiritual asset of Haitian stoic resistance. They ascribed the acuteness of Bondye-bon to the failure of aid-dependency to help to generate self-sufficiency and poverty-alleviation. In fact, an ADLI participant alluded to three scenarios to argue the case that the use of the terminology Bondye-bon has been an affront to the aid-receivers’ dignity:

Let us consider the example of irrigation in the country [Haiti] where the farmer does not have any professional and modern technical assistance, nor modern mechanisation to grow the produce. He can only wait on heavenly rains. He is waiting on the Bondye-bon generosity. So, if rains don’t fall, he cannot do anything. Put him in an advanced mechanization structure he would work and produce more without the wait.  

The second scenario brought evidence to counter-act Bondye-bon as the epitome of Protestants’ philosophy of life.

We have the capacity to think and work. In the United States, for example, the average Haitian works hard and produces because the structure of that advanced country maximizes their possibilities. The Bondye-bon is only in Haiti, in that, it’s nurtured there in a context of endemic poverty and concomitant presence of foreign-aid.

Take a Haitian, put him in a context full of possibilities, take another person of a different nationality and put him in the same context to perform, I can guarantee you the Haitian wouldn’t come last really. The Haitian has the capacity to think and is endowed with great ingenuity. He simply does not get the right environment to evolve.

The third scenario was from a participant’s personal situation.

My parents had ten children of whom I am the last. I am the only one who has completed my studies reaching the university level. I can’t say that my parents did not want to further the education of the others, or that they were simply sitting idly and wait. The fact of the matter was they had no way of

---

692 ADLI3
693 According to ADLI8, Haiti receives annually from Haitians living overseas US$200 million as remittance.
694 ADLI3
695 ADLI3, ALDI8
making it happen. It looks as though we were nurturing the *Bondye-bon* attitude, but that is entirely false.\(^{696}\)

Therefore, on current evidence, *Bondye-bon*, as a psychological coping mechanism, is equally participants’ spiritual response to the failure of aid-dependency to trigger their entrepreneurial skills. This said, participants argued that the *Bondye-bon* discourse which has described Protestants as lethargic and unwilling to work is another ploy towards depriving them of their entrepreneurial dignity, belittling their worth.\(^{697}\) Consequently, a participant asked for a change of discourse:

> We need to combat the [lethargic] *Bondye-bon* attitude by understanding that it is a twin brother or sister to poverty. If foreign-aid were to help people out of poverty, it would also help to do away with this pitiful label of *Bondye-bon* mentality, designed for Protestants.\(^{698}\)

**Descriptive Theme 10. Deprives of Dignity**

Explicitly, this descriptive theme is about aid-receivers’ state of being in their interplay with aid-dependency. They have over the years, overtly or latently, embraced foreign-aid believing it to be a pathway to in-depth socio-economic and political empowerment. Contrariwise, components of the datasets have somewhat shown the extent to which aid-receivers, although often aided in their deepest financial needs, have been deprived of their dignity. The next paragraphs aim to provide two sets of evidences in line with deprivation of dignity.

**Memo 1. Feeling of Worthlessness**

Participants expressed their views on the impact aid-dependency has had on their dignified lives. These data gave this evidence:

> ‘As often as we depend on someone to meet our needs or those of our loved ones, we lose our dignity and the freedom to be true to ourselves’.\(^{699}\) ‘One could be prouder to have hands-on

\(^{696}\) ADLI3
\(^{697}\) ADLI32, ADLI3
\(^{698}\) ADLI3
\(^{699}\) ADLI4
than to be continually given hands-out’. 700 ‘If we are dependent, we lose our right to independency and our dignity is trampled under’. 701 ‘Dependency on hands-out jeopardizes self-dependency; this is not at all good’. 702 ‘When our right to decide is taken away, we lose our right to heightened self-esteem’. 703 ‘Dependency raises within us a sentiment of insignificance and erodes the self-worth of our church’. 704 It ‘exposes our weaknesses so that in our limitations we feel worthless’. 705 In other words, ‘Within the aid-dependency reality, we are owned by the giver’. 706

Other participants spoke of vulnerability and emphasized their experiences of low self-esteem:

‘Dependency on foreign-aid makes us feel worthless and vulnerable’. 707

Very unfortunately aid-dependency has for many years nurtured low self-esteem in HP. This led to the belief that HP cannot do anything good without the ‘Blanc’ [the white person]. Therefore, the major decisions are made by foreign boards based in Europe, the United States or Canada. 708

‘Aid-dependency has had a negative impact on the self-worth of the church and the school’ 709 because ‘Everything the church has done has been a function of the quantity of foreign contributions it has received’. 710 They feel that their worth has been determined by aid.

In the aid-receivers’ environment, the state of low self-esteem has co-existed with the loss of honour.

Memo 2. The Loss of Honour

This ADFG spoke about the loss of honour and confidence:
We are reduced to the status of beggars and are not valued as entrepreneurs. We’re losing our honour and dignity. The foreigners, upon seeing us, seek every possibility of avoidance knowing that the encounter would not end without us making a request of some sort. We are so very miserable in this world that our honour is gone.

These following data pointed out, particularly, the lack of respect for participants’ personality as an outcome of foreign-aid services:

‘As a teacher, depending on foreign-aid for my salary erodes my personality. We can never receive our salaries on time as we wait on partners’. ‘We don’t get it on time; besides, it is insufficient. It is not a dignified life to be dependent’. Aid makes me feel small, working like a \textit{restavèk}, a slave. ‘Foreign-aid makes me feel humiliated, small, lacking in worth, with no personality’. ‘When people are always doing for you, you feel humiliated, wondering and reflecting at the same time on how to restore pride’. ‘We are likened to children in search of goodies; it is shameful, we need to change this’.

The outcome of aid-dependency’s practices pointed to low self-worth and loss of honour in participants rather than to renewed confidence in their struggle against poverty. In those circumstances, participants felt that unless aid-dependency’s practices are re-imagined, they are prone to being disenfranchised in their right to dignity.

Whereas participants became conversant about the core themes highlighted in this empirical analysis, they did not refrain, even sporadically throughout the datasets, from pointing HP to what they considered to be a pathway of recovery from socio-economic disempowerment in

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{enumerate}
\item ADFG1
\item ADQ18
\item ADQ15
\item For a definition of \textit{restavèk}, see ‘Disempowering Silence of Non-literacy’, p.232
\item ADQ20
\item ADQ18
\item ADQ19
\item ADQ16
\end{enumerate}
\end{footnotesize}
which aid-dependency has been a vehicle of psychological relief. This suggested pathway of recovery will be analysed as Core Theme D: ‘Alternative responses’.

This will include one descriptive theme ‘alternate responses possible’.

4.2.4 Core Theme D. Alternative Responses

Descriptive Theme 11. Alternative Responses Possible

This descriptive theme harnessed opinions, views and excerpts which participants purposefully offered as potentially constructive alternatives to inhibitive functionalities of aid-dependency in HP. They further argued that the onus is on the church to ‘Help us to think differently so that we may be shining lights of progress in the community’. This ADLI participant believed that,

The church leadership ought to inspire people to be aware of the significance of co-responsibility in community living and provide relevant technical, professional and vocational learning centres which are community need-focussed to achieve this goal.

While the ensuing data suggested new ways of theologising, then of embracing and using aid, they have also been indicators of participants’ levels of response to the applied theological theory that undergirded the functionality of foreign-aid. I, therefore, receive the following two memos.

Memo 1. Local Church Saying No

Participants felt that they would need to muster the courage to say no to both aid that does not suit them and aid-dependency’s practices. This quote explained:

We should receive and use aid according to our own plan; otherwise, we need to boldly refuse it. ‘Whoever finances, commands’ does not have to be applicable to all situations. If the partner does not want to agree our plan

719 ADFG3
720 ADLI8
while their revised plan includes irreconcilable cultural and bookkeeping differences, we should allow them to keep their aid-support.721

In continuance with this opinion, ADLI participants went a step further to emphatically suggest ‘no to aid-dependency’. They argued that ‘Aid-providers exploit the country and the Haitian church; we can’t allow them to do that in our administration. We can do many things without foreign interventions or help’.722

Responding to a group of elders who approached an ADLI participant to become the president of their Mission, he expressed his anti-aid-dependency conviction in considering the offer:

If I were to become president, the next 5 years of my administration would be regarded as 10 years of backward steps in the Mission in its international relationships. The point is, I must first tell you this, I would like to see myself as an independent pastor. Get it well, therefore, and make no mistake, I will not beg on behalf of the Mission. Neither will I fly away from my country in search of aid for the Mission. Never. This will not be my approach. If you think as president, I must go overseas to beg the ‘Blanc’, you will be appointing the wrong leader.723

Another ADLI participant expressed his views in these terms:

I do not believe that it [aid-dependency] is good. I have been fighting against this culture since I have become the president/bishop of the church. I have tried to resist it by inviting local congregations to meet the financial demands of the church. I remain convinced that local efforts are significant in order to curtail the flow of aid.724

Meanwhile, in order to finance church ministries, foreign-aid has kept nudging aid-providers and aid-receivers into action. Still, funds needed for schools, canteen, teachers’ salaries and students’ scholarships could not be sidestepped. These purpose-driven expenses have been included in the foreign-aid reality. As confronted by these recurrent needs, participants believed that the church can only be missionally transformed to meet those needs when its leadership is liberated. The leadership is liberated when it says no to foreign aid-dependency.725

721 ADFG2
722 ADLI5
723 ADLI5
724 ADLI6
725 ADLI15
In order to say no, participants then aimed to muster their own initiatives towards saying yes to local aid-dependency and local entrepreneurialism to meet even partially these needs.

‘This will necessitate personal generation of sources of income’ through ‘the emphasis on the spirit of co-responsibility and entrepreneurial leadership which has not yet been fully developed’. As such, participants advised on the following possible responses:

We’re trying to instil a culture of giving by encouraging the congregants to increase their offerings. This is not easy to do as congregants customarily expected funding from overseas to help with the finance of the church.

We need to use our God-given potentials, to be more business-minded in order to create wealth for our church and to not depend on foreign-aid contributions.

There existed also in the datasets the affirmation that ‘We would have been, very certainly, further ahead without aid-injection. At least our faith would have been challenged and strengthened’. In this light, participants called each other, as the remnant community of the church, to action. If we ‘rebuild the church’s mental capacity towards positive transformation, then we will eradicate the aid-dependency mind-set in our nation’.

Embedded in this ‘saying no to aid-dependency’ principle was the investment in an all-encompassing plan of empowerment. This has become a pre-requisite. Aligned with entrepreneurial leadership, participants have been yearning for ‘new ways of being church and understanding God’. In this emerging hope a request for a national Protestant programme of production echoed their vision. They aimed to re-write the destiny of their church and country in the spirit of co-responsibility.
Memo 2. Local Entrepreneurialism

The argument has been that since ‘Foreign aid-dependency creates passivity, the absence of it can only yield active local entrepreneurialism as every sector of society becomes involved’.

As such, participants formulated varied approaches to the application of their entrepreneurialism. Firstly, they argue that HP needs to strategically develop church assets financed by foreign-aid.

We need to advocate for a mature economic engagement with resources in our care and reject the practice that aid-support should be subject to misspending and other kinds of selfish agendas.

An ADQ participant echoed a similar thought:

The church needs to function like a business in order to be successful. To be a successful entrepreneur the church needs to maintain and invest its resources as much as possible. This approach will generate financial sustainability.

ADFG1 participants added:

HP needs to constantly challenge itself to generate a methodology of mission strategy and a collective plan of need-driven action in order to maximize the profitability of aid-support and rescue itself from aid-dependency.

They equally highlighted an entrepreneurial initiative in which local competencies worked in partnership with foreign aid-providers. The construction of the Lévêque Methodist School was financed by the Wirral Circuit of MCB without the direct supervision of the mother-church.

Local engineers under local supervision built the school in less than two years. A memorandum of understanding was the only procedure of action needed to achieve the goal.

Furthermore, participants gave evidence of entrepreneurialism by demonstrating the practice of ‘using local expertise/labour’ in some domestic achievements.
I came in here in 1986, by 1988 we began a reconstruction campaign which constituted of many building projects. We built the secondary school above the primary school, in concrete floor. A few years later, we put on a third floor. All that you see here around you, Marcus, today, is the fruit of the local church together with the local community. Nothing came from foreigners, not a cent. Be it the school or the church we did it all with the help of the Lord.740

Two other revealing examples were provided:

In the Champin church, a congregation of 80 people, we had a water pipes problem. We decided, without any foreign intervention, to solve it. To date we’ve raised [Haitian dollar] $20,000 towards a renovation project. The church makes a choice to beg when it does. We believe, together, we can change our own church dependency culture and dynamics thereof.741

Very recently, we managed to purchase from our own funds a generator which is so powerful that it can practically supply electricity to the entire community. As a leader if your feet and hands are tied by foreign aid-policies, you can’t faithfully struggle to achieve this, neither can you liberate those whose feet and hands are tied as well.742

Another case underpinned local entrepreneurship as follows:

When we resolved to repair the roof on the apartments of the university, many people discouraged me for fear of financial failure. We did not do most things we wanted to do and never attempted those we wouldn’t manage to do. Obviously, we couldn’t move as fast as we would like to. Nevertheless, we completed the work, in our own strength, with the help of the Lord.743

At this juncture, participants proposed to invest pride and heroism in their entrepreneurial multi-tasked initiatives. They further realized the need for enhanced advocacy for civic responsibility and liberation in the interplay between triggering needs and enticing foreign gifts.744 This quote resonated with this proposition:

This liberation could only happen when we learn to take our civic destiny in our own hand and feel proud of our efforts and determination to build a community based on equity, justice and love.745
Conclusion

In Section One, aid-literature designated three theoretical categories. These have been synthetized to describe the central hypothesis. In order to test the cogency of the hypothesis, Section Two conducted a methodological inquiry of which the outcome has been the ‘on-the-ground’ articulation of the hypothesis expressed in core themes. Continuing with this trend, it is perhaps fair to suggest that TCI: ‘Aid embodies characteristics of empowerment’ is explained by Core Theme A, ‘Positive contribution of aid’. Similarly, TCII: ‘Aid-dependency fosters socio-economic disempowerment’ is aligned with Core Theme B, ‘Inhibitive outcome of aid-dependency’, and finally TCIII: ‘Aid-dependency has contributed to ineffective poverty-alleviation’ is demonstrated by Core Theme C, ‘Expression of disempowerment’. In summation, the thick data mirrored the thin data to confirm that ‘Aid-dependency has disempowered Haitian Protestantism by inhibiting poverty-alleviation’. In fact, the thick data has not simply expanded and grounded the thin data but has expressed new realities which strengthen the cogency of the hypothesis under scrutiny. A new set of reality, for example, is recorded in Core Theme D: ‘Alternative responses’. This will later be discussed in Section Three.

In Chapter 5 which follows, I delineate the hypothesis in four lenses with a view to further expanding the descriptive functionality of aid-dependency in HP.

Chapter 5. Hypothesis Claim Discussed

Introduction

On current evidence, literary based theoretical categories and on-the-ground descriptive themes have supported and expanded existing features of the reality of aid-dependency and have therefore confirmed the hypothesis. To deepen the research exploration and strengthen the
hypothesis, I further discuss it within the repertoire of other published literature in ecclesiastical missiology, socio-economic disciplines, and theologies: biblical, Methodist and practical.

I therefore proceed to further examine the hypothesis through four lenses. They are (1) foreign presence in Haiti has primarily contributed to the reality of aid-dependency in HP, (2) aid-giving is an essential component of integrated mission in contrast to aid-dependency which disempowers, (3) the practices and modalities of aid-dependency have become tools of economic disempowerment in HP, and (4) for all FMDs’ aid-work in HP the outcome is consistently overshadowed by a disempowering culture of silence which inhibits poverty-alleviation initiatives.

I now focus on the First Lens.

5.1 First Lens:

**Foreign presence in Haiti has primarily contributed to the reality of aid-dependency in Haitian Protestantism**

**Introduction**

The First Lens seeks to affirm the reliability of the central hypothesis by demonstrating how FP and FMDs have contributed to HP’s socio-economic disempowerment. I also analyse the effectiveness of the agency of hope, a systematized aid-strategy, they have offered in response. To do this, I begin by clarifying what FP signifies and establish its resonance with FMDs. Subsequently, I highlight three counter-arguments which will be interspersed with appropriate responses as I progress. I now turn to the FP’s range of meaning in the following sections.

What is FP?

Historically, FP has been depicted as a wealth seeking and consolidating entity. It colonized and plundered St. Domingue/Haiti, leaving it, as a result, largely mentally dependent, in
complete deficit.\textsuperscript{746} Its economic interests outweighed, in fact, jeopardized the right to existence of a wealth-deprived but dignified St. Domingue/Haitian community. Today, FP’s offer of a systematized aid-strategy to mitigate the deficit has rather benefitted more an elite minority, local and foreign.\textsuperscript{747} Furthermore, the offer has somewhat generated slow growth and contributed to the crystallization of a culture of aid-dependency.\textsuperscript{748} In fact, in its interventions as IMF, World Bank and other transnational aid-regulatory agencies, FP has epitomized the opportunistic-driven goals of HICs. Aid-as-political expediency and SAPs are cases in point.\textsuperscript{749} In brief, FP has preferentially given agency, perhaps unintentionally, to the interests of nations which it represents and, thus, have fashioned and sustained its operations.\textsuperscript{750}

FMDs, however, are dissimilar in telos to FP. Compelled by scriptural compassion, FMDs have been the corporate presence of church-missions in HP’s space in order to evangelize, give a voice to the dominant poor and alleviate their suffering through aid-subsistence, including DA.\textsuperscript{751} Having relied on and constantly assimilated and simulated FP’s inhibitive aid-modalities and practices,\textsuperscript{752} FMDs have also been received with the inherent capacity for sustaining an inhibitive culture of foreign-aid dependency within HP.\textsuperscript{753} It might be possible to argue here that either FP’s or FMDs’ poverty-alleviation attempts have pragmatically inhibited in-depth socio-economic empowerment, thus, prolonged socio-political, economic and religious vulnerabilities in Haiti.\textsuperscript{754} As such, the currency of FP’s ethos serves to, in fact,
demonstrates the reliability of the First Lens. Nonetheless, in order to broaden the scope of the discussion, I highlight counter-arguments.

Meanwhile, I firstly establish the following interdependencies. Earlier, in the literature, slavery and socio-economic disempowerment were highlighted as precursors to aid-dependency. It equally pointed out that significant Haitian institutions have been adversely affected by aid-dependency of which HP is a prime example. Whereas Haiti has been impoverished and therefore dependent, by correlation, HP’s missional existence has equally been characterized by socio-economic disempowerment and functions in aid-dependency terms. Consistent with regulated aid-modalities, therefore, FP has engaged with Haiti as a nation while simultaneously FMDs’ intended generosity has been spent in HP. On this evidence, Romain posits ‘The more a country is dominated and dependent, the more its imported religious movement is dependent on the mother-church of the dominant country’.755

The literature suggested that FP instigated the spiralling downward processes of Haiti’s socio-economic life which RAED embodied as components of a foundational argument to substantiate the hypothesis. I therefore examine, altogether, published literature and RAED for evidence that FP and its systematized aid-strategy have rather, perhaps unintentionally, sustained significant variables of the reality of aid-dependency.

5.1.1 Counter-argument One

Critics share the views that ESRs, having toppled French powers to secure their political freedom, have squandered an historic opportunity to capitalize on their heroism, at that moment, by converging their strengths, in the spirit with which they conquered, towards building the economy of their emerging nation. They question the validity of the First Lens

755 Romain, Le Protestantisme (1985), p.159
which attributes Haiti’s socio-economic misery to contributions of successive interventions of HICs by exonerating Haitians of the ramifications of their own failure to intelligently and consistently act with patriotic interests.\textsuperscript{756}

The point the First Lens puts forward has not, in any discourse, exonerated Haiti, by extension HP, of its potentially ill-contribution to its own socio-economic stability. I will consider this claim later in Chapter 7. Rather, at this juncture, I sustain the hypothesis with the evidence that FP has strategically begun and consistently sustained over the years the downward spiral of Haiti’s socio-economic affairs, resulting in the current state of disempowerment which Haiti, perhaps, may have somehow helped to sustain. However, on the matter of Haiti’s failure, Dubois disapproves:

The true causes of Haiti’s poverty and instability are not mysterious, and they have nothing to do with any inherent shortcomings on the part of the Haitians themselves. Rather, the present Haiti is the product of its history, of the hostility that its revolution generated among colonial powers.\textsuperscript{757}

Meanwhile, I recognise the existence of an elite Haitian minority, mulatoes and blacks, which controls foreign-aid and largely influences the nation’s economy, locally. This elite represents both FP’s and its own interests at the expense of the poor.\textsuperscript{758} Considering that this elite is Haitian, it is a socio-cultural miscalculation to endorse that Haiti’s poverty has nothing to do with any inherent shortcomings on the part of Haitians. On the other hand, it is historically irresponsible to dismiss the point that the present Haiti is the product of its colonial history.\textsuperscript{759}

\textsuperscript{756} Emile, \textit{Haiti}, pp.167-170
\textsuperscript{757} Dubois, \textit{Haiti}, p.4
\textsuperscript{758} See ‘Class Segregation’, p.182
\textsuperscript{759} Regarding Africa, see a similar debate in Gifford, \textit{Christianity}, pp.142-144

178
Thacker puts it this way: ‘It is clear that a number of former colonial nations are poorer today than they would have been had it not been for our [the West’s] activities during the colonial period.’

Easterly’s argument is equally applicable to Haiti’s context:

I am not sure that the Democratic Republic of Congo [DRC] would be a prosperous place if the Europeans had never come. But after five centuries of European’s violence, slavery, paternalism, colonialism, exploitation and aid to prop up bad rulers after independence, the DRC is an extreme example of why the West’s successive interventions of exploitation, colonization, foreign aid and nation-building have not worked out well.

To continue with the discussion, I examine the following evidences: costs of economic injustices, FMDs’ legacy, class segregation, Haiti’s isolation, and political economy of trauma.

**Costs of Economic Injustices** - The ESRs’ hermeneutical resistance to FP’s enslavement which, later, culminated in the Haitian revolution in 1804 were economically disempowering.

Throughout the revolution, Louis and Nicholls, both confirmed that St. Domingue/Haiti’s infrastructures - irrigation systems, plantation set-ups, houses, hydraulic plants and sugar mills - were either damaged or destroyed. Later, altogether, France’s constant threats of invasion, the clearance of the indemnity burden, Haitian protests against the Occupation and other forms of power aggression have had profound economic consequences on the economic development of the embryonic nation. This happened in spite of Haiti’s deficit in socio-economic capital. FP’s activity of enslavement and mechanization of wealth extraction and the resulting self-defence initiatives adopted by Haitians have, over the years, contributed towards the solidification of entrenched poverty which warranted the reality of aid-dependency.

---


761 Easterly, *The White*, p.255

762 Gaillard, *Etzer*, pp.45-50


764 Before 1825, to safeguard its independence status, Haiti became over-militarized. The size of its army doubled that of Great Britain on a per capita basis and therefore attracted excess spending. Lundahl, *Peasants*, pp.375-379; Gaillard, *Etzer*, pp.21-22
In this light, there arises the need to juxtapose the following arguments. According to Cooper, ‘Charity is only needed when a situation of injustice exists’. This argument is partially factual because charity, on moral grounds, is also needed during and subsequent to prolonged natural disasters with catastrophic effects. However, Cooper’s argument is justifiable in the context of Farmer’s and Beckles’ respective reactions to the indemnity: ‘Imposing an indemnity on the victorious slaves was equivalent to making them pay with money that which they had already paid with their blood’ and ‘Reparations payment to France crippled the fledging Haitian state’. These reactions suggest that the indemnity payment, arguably, was an act of socio-economic injustice.

What makes aid-subsistence an ‘absolute necessity’ for Haiti is a ‘highly complex subject’. However, slavery, the imposition of an indemnity and the adverse effects of the Occupation, for example, are integral antithetical constituents in that complexity. The Occupation triggered this response from Péralte: ‘With cruelty and injustice, the Yankees have for four years cast ruin and destruction on our territory’. Therefore, from gathered evidence, FP’s systematized aid-strategy, in response to Haiti’s poverty, has become increasingly necessary, because of, for example, an initial act of injustice in the matter of Haiti’s payment to France for its liberty.

‘Derivative of injustice’ highlighted the point that aid-dependency acts as both a derivative and a reinforcement of socio-economic injustices. The two are not identical, but neither can they be separated in HP’s space. RAED, as aid-literature did, highlighted that ‘Aid-dependency results from the extraction of Haiti’s natural resources’, ‘Foreign forces exploit Haiti’s

---

765 Cooper, *Controversies*, p.175
767 Beckles, *Britain’s*, p.214
768 In fact, slavery itself was an act of gross cruelty and injustice. See the oration of Frederick Douglas. Available: https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2008/jul/04/us (accessed 19 May 2017)
769 Thacker, *Global*, p.62
770 Nicholls, *From*, p.149
771 ADQ13
wealth in many ways’,\textsuperscript{772} and ‘They set up Haitian-like administrations’ to secure them its wealth.\textsuperscript{773} Moreover, despite FMDs’ systematized aid-strategy, the crystallization of aid-dependency in HP has deepened proportionately to the intensity, duration and scope of inhibitive socio-economic modalities perpetrated by intervening forces in Haiti.\textsuperscript{774}

Therefore, weighing up the alternatives it would seem that ending Haiti’s economic downward spiral in the immediacy of post-slavery victory was a political and financial enterprise which transcended the fighting capacity and the economic ingenuity of the independence heroes. On balance, it is empirically fair, perhaps, to advance that FP has primarily contributed to Haiti’s dependency status. Resulting from this, HP has today, in part, become a needy space to accommodate FMDs’ wealth surplus in the context of TCII.

\textit{FMDs’ Legacy} - RAED showed that Haiti had long been conditioned by the colonial vestige of a mental framework of existence and debilitating socio-religious subjectivities to accept cultural and economic inequalities as the will of God. For example, ‘unconcerned with socio-political in-depth change’\textsuperscript{775} is conceived as a legacy of foreign inculturation. The ensuing views explained the inculturation: ‘We have been cultured to be indifferent to the management of civic and political life’,\textsuperscript{776} ‘We have discarded the socio-political dimension of our civic responsibility in favour of simple social acts which are bereft of any lasting poverty-alleviation’,\textsuperscript{777} ‘It was money from Britain that sustained the money operation in HMC’,\textsuperscript{778} and ‘Local contributions were not solicited’.\textsuperscript{779} Another quote posited, ‘Since the establishment of this church, [foreign friends] have donated cars, built manses and paid teachers’ salaries and

\textsuperscript{772} ADQ32
\textsuperscript{773} ADQ7
\textsuperscript{774} Schwartz, \textit{Travesty}, Kindle Location 704-1041; Buss & Gardner, \textit{Haiti}, pp.48-67
\textsuperscript{775} See ‘Descriptive Theme 5’, p.146
\textsuperscript{776} ADLI11
\textsuperscript{777} ADLI11
\textsuperscript{778} ADLI4
\textsuperscript{779} ADLI4
ministers’ stipends’. They have trained us to receive so that our gifts, expertise and contributions were not required.

However, in defence of the missionaries, writers suggest that, generally, this legacy should be weighed against missionaries’ positive impacts on the world. For example, ‘Development and spread of religious liberty, mass education, mass printing, newspapers, voluntary organizations, and colonial reforms, [have] thereby created the conditions that made stable democracy’. This is a fair point since the world, including Haiti, has benefitted from resources which God has entrusted to FMDs. However, consistent with the principle of practical theology, it is also fair to scrutinize even with the benefit of the hindsight FMDs’ orthopraxis. The scrutiny seemed to suggest that a flipside of their impact, particularly, in Haiti, has been that the contributions of the locals have not been fully valued.

Moreover, in the immediate aftermath of the Haitian revolution, no one, no institution, including the church [Catholic and Protestant] helped Haiti to successfully reverse and overcome the effects of slavery-like inculturation which ‘precluded the prospect of a generative future’. In fact, FMDs, perhaps unintentionally, have sustained it. Despite some contradictory views, it would seem that FP and FMDs in Haiti have primarily contributed, through an inculturation process, to the reality of aid-dependency in HP.

*Class Segregation* – Writers argue that during slavery FP gave to future Haitians a disturbing gift, that of class prejudice, which divided, long before independence, mulatoes and free black

---

780 ADLI6
781 ADLI6
783 See ‘Breaking the Disempowering Silence of Low Self-esteem’, p.261
784 Theus, *ONG*, pp.111-114
people from the enslaved people, leaving Haiti, as an independent nation, in social effervescence.\textsuperscript{785} A participant noted that Haitians’ disinclination to social coherence and co-responsibility is a consequence of slavery which ‘predisposed them to polarization’.\textsuperscript{786} Rocourt laments, ‘Above all, colour prejudice and the social capital that came with it, the perpetuation of which would sow thereafter permanent seeds of discord and polarization among sons and daughters of the same soil’.\textsuperscript{787} In respect of the church, Rocourt further explains, ‘As time went by the first Protestant churches established in Haiti were considered as churches for the elite, if not for the mulatoes’.\textsuperscript{788} Moreover, the socio-economic tension and hatred which existed between the Haitian elites and the non-literate peasants has not altered.\textsuperscript{789}

Furthermore, RAED highlighted these related facts which underpinned the social attitude of an elitist church group. Aid-providers ‘constitute an elite group’\textsuperscript{790} and ‘We, the local representatives, aspire to be like them and in varied circumstances function like them’.\textsuperscript{791} We ‘tended to see [our]selves as partly citizens of a world that is beyond Haiti’\textsuperscript{792} as our ‘help comes from across the sea’.\textsuperscript{793} As the local elites, in some ways, isolated themselves from the impoverished on whose behalf aid has been collected, RAED echoed their view: ‘We are not ourselves, we do not represent the nation’s values, but our aid-providers’.\textsuperscript{794} They have, as highlighted earlier, partly become socio-economically unconscious of their indigenous realities. Evidence suggests that this socio-economic and class polarisation in Haitian society,

\textsuperscript{786} ADLI8
\textsuperscript{787} Rocourt, ‘The Challenge’ in Mitchell, \textit{With Eyes}, p.72
\textsuperscript{788} Rocourt, ‘The Challenge’ in Mitchell, \textit{With Eyes}, p.76; see also Pressoir, \textit{Le Protestantisme} (1945), pp.178-180
\textsuperscript{789} Wah, \textit{A la}, pp.79-80
\textsuperscript{790} ADL13
\textsuperscript{791} ADL13
\textsuperscript{792} ADL14
\textsuperscript{793} ADQ22
\textsuperscript{794} ADL12
a vestige of slavery, enlivened by aid-dependency, has worked at the outset to restrain Haiti’s [HP’s] socio-economic well-being.\textsuperscript{795}

Rocourt notes that ‘Some French blood runs through the vein of the Haitian elite, the mulatoes, from whom Haiti could not be liberated’.\textsuperscript{796} De Saint-Rémy adds: ‘The sovereignty of the people was proclaimed as a principle, but it was replaced in practice by the “the sovereignty of a ruling clique”’.\textsuperscript{797} The suggestion is that ESRs successfully rebelled against white and light-skinned slave-masters, but nothing has changed for their descendants who fall prey to power-consolidating neo-colonialists, Haitian mulatoes and enriched blacks.\textsuperscript{798}

In this context of continuing social incoherence, FP’s systematized aid-strategy, controlled today by the Haitian elites in church and society,\textsuperscript{799} has somewhat accentuated the culture of polarization in HP and has therefore made it difficult, so far, for the average Haitian to achieve transformational goals in the substance of the Haitian revolution.\textsuperscript{800}

\subsection*{5.1.2 Counter-argument Two}

Notwithstanding the missing historic opportunity of political ancestors, succeeding generations of political and corporate leaders have consistently missed opportunities to raise the standard of life, at least, above, the poverty line. Despite FP’s systematized aid-strategy, they have all engaged the path of economic regression. Theus gives an example:

\begin{quote}
The situations of intermittent crises, turbulence and political instability, and the absence of national growth policies, mean that every socio-economic
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{795} Lundahl, \textit{Peasants}, pp.318-319
\textsuperscript{796} Rocourt, ‘The Challenge’ in Mitchell, \textit{With Eyes}, p.73
\textsuperscript{798} For a perspective on Haiti’s economic elite, see: Ridgeway, \textit{The Haiti}, pp.27-41. Further afield, Hickel argues that Western and African agents, together with the African elite, have kept Africa economically poor. J. Hickel, ‘The Donors’, available: https://www.globalpolicyjournal.com/blog/12/12/2013/donors%E2%80%99-dilemma-aid-reverse-how-poor-countries-develop-rich-countries (accessed 17 October 2016)
\textsuperscript{799} Wah, \textit{A la}, pp.61-65
\textsuperscript{800} See ‘Descriptive Theme 4’, p.143
stimulation carried out by a [Haitian] government is sabotaged and rejected by the subsequent government. 801

In support, Casséus and Wah add that the nation has experienced 200 years of division and negative governance outcome. 802 Casséus further elucidates:

Since we have nourished the sentiment of poverty and the incapacity complex, we are destined to be poor and truly destitute. We have mentally chosen to be what we have become. 803

This counter-argument suggests that Haiti’s political leaderships have opted to stabilize poverty in Haiti. While the counter-argument is valid I suggest, however, that it is a consequence of the current hypothesis since the ‘ruling clique’ represents, more strategically, FP’s interests. 804 Haiti, for example, has dominantly been governed by mulatto presidents and a handful of indifferent black elites who functioned under mulattoes’ influences. 805 This may have led Nicholls to argue: ‘No government in the history of Haiti had done anything significant’. 806 Lundahl observes that since cooperation between the Haitian elites and the poor is nearly non-existent, it is not surprising that mulatto governments have failed to raise the poor’s standard of life. 807

Meanwhile, in response to this counter-argument, I seek to uphold that FP is a contributor to Haiti’s perennial aid-needy status. I back up this theory with the isolation argument.

_Haiti’s Isolation_ – The post-independent Haiti, as the pre-independent St. Domingue did, swiftly began to produce and export agricultural goods to the United States. 808 However, owing

---

801 Theus, _ONG_, p.117
802 Casséus, _Eléments_, pp.313-315; Wah, _A la_, p.216
803 Casséus, _Haïti_, p.88
804 Ridgeway, _The Haiti_, pp.27-41
805 In 1946 patriotic black elites - well educated, fluent in French - had emerged as Haiti’s presidents. They, however, like previous light-skinned and indifferent black presidents, did very little to improve the well-being of the poor. Lundahl, _Peasants_, pp.318-319. See also ‘Country Profile’, available: https://www.marines.mil/Portals/59/Publications/Haiti%20Profile.pdf?ver=2012-10-11-163238-907 (accessed 10 June 2016)
806 Nicholls, _From_, p.247
807 Lundahl, _Peasants_, pp.318-319
808 Farmer, _The Uses_, p.75
to France’s diplomatic pressure, this level of fruitful international trade relations was short-lived. France reckoned that the existence of a negro state where blacks ruled ‘was a horrible spectacle for all white nations’. 809 Because of this ‘hostility that its revolution generated among colonial powers’; FP resorted to international isolation. France, together with the United States and the Holy See, for example, distanced themselves from Haiti. 810 In this ‘diplomatic quarantine’, ‘Haiti became the outcast of the international community’ 811 and the target of an ‘international conspiracy spurred by the world’s powers’. 812 The isolation argument sustains that the ‘international boycott of Haitian products undermined its long-term economic development’. 813

Regionally, for example, Haiti has also been isolated, deprived of an anticipated solidarity. It has grown accustomed, ignored as it was by its Caribbean neighbours, to ignore them also. 814 RAED indicated that this isolation has had repercussions on Haiti’s trade, in brief, its socio-economic and religious existence. This has persisted throughout its political existence such that, today, Haiti is not commercially and politically integrated for mutual economic benefit in any group of nations, including CARICOM. 815

809 Farmer, The Uses, p.75
810 See ‘Independence Indemnity’, p.45. From 1804 to 1825 Haitians were isolated. Contacts were maintained with a few people including two British abolitionists: William Wilberforce and Thomas Clarkson. Clément, ‘History’, Revista, pp.141-181
811 Farmer, The Uses, pp.75-76
814 Rocourt, ‘The Challenge’ in Mitchell, With Eyes, pp.77-79. Noticeably, the Caribbean territories were still European colonies until the early parts of the 1960s.
815 While Haiti is listed as a member state of the Caribbean Community (CARICOM), Haitians and Haiti goods have been restricted free movements. Available: http://caricom.org/about-caricom/who-we-are & http://www.jamaicaobserver.com/news/New-visa-system-for-Haitians (accessed 15 November 2015)
Critics may further counter-argue that the isolation was not a punitive measure, but Haiti’s choice. With the knowledge of the hindsight, however, it could not have been since Haiti had once more been tied to France by the terms of the indemnity and the constraints of the dependency theory that followed.\footnote{Dependency theory is the idea that the colonial era bequeathed to the materially poor world a structural economic problem in which they will continue to supply the materially rich world with relatively cheap labour and raw goods. Thacker, ‘From’, Transformation, pp.115-116; Thacker; Global, pp.164-167. See also V. Ferraro, ‘Dependency Theory’, available: https://www.mtholyoke.edu/acad/intrel/depend.htm (accessed 20 July 2017). Tied aid is also relevant in this context. See: Riddell, Does, pp.99-101; ‘Foreign’, https://sites.tufts.edu/jha/archives/75}

The evidence would appear to indicate that the counter-argument which contrasted Haiti’s political success with its lack of ambition for socio-economic liberation is being justifiably challenged by the isolation argument.

5.1.3 Counter-argument Three

Brooks points out the following:

Why is Haiti so poor? Well, it has a history of oppression, slavery and colonialism. But so does Barbados, and Barbados is doing pretty well. Haiti has endured ruthless dictators, corruption and foreign invasions. But so has the Dominican Republic, and the D.R. is in much better shape.\footnote{D. Brooks, ‘The Underlying Tragedy’, available: http://www.sinkers.org/posters/greetingsfromhaiti/NYTdavidbrookshaitiJan1410.pdf (accessed 22 May 2016)}


\textit{Political Economy of Trauma}\footnote{I borrow this term from James. James, Democratic, p.26} – In response, I propose that another cause of Haiti’s poverty has been the effect of the modality of the ‘political economy of trauma’. This is a process
through which ‘The suffering of another person, when extracted, transformed and commodified through maleficent and beneficent interventions, can become a profit for the intervener’. In an effort to defend this First Lens I turn to the ‘political economy of trauma’ to draw supporting facts.

I firstly offer the following historical facts. For example, Barbados, like the rest of the Caribbean and Africa, did not have to carry out an expensive slave revolution: Haiti did. Neither did Barbados nor the Dominican Republic suffer the pain of an unjust indemnity from England nor Spain: Haiti did. Furthermore, neither have Barbados nor the Dominican Republic suffered political isolation and commercial exploitation to a point of being labelled the capital of the NGOs: Haiti has. This counter-argument is lacking in-depth historical epistemology, past and recent.

The NGOs, as subsets of FP, whose expertise has been honed to safeguard the wealth of their sending nations, have, in their provisions of palliative economics, materialized ‘political economy of trauma’. On literary evidence, FP, in its interventions in Haiti, has extracted wealth to further impoverish it. For example, in economic terms, St. Domingue, a HIC [colony] in 1791, has been downgraded to Haiti, a LIC in 2017. While not using the term political economy of trauma the following propositions define it ‘the wealth of rich countries depends on the poverty of poor countries’. The Lausanne Conference, in 2015, emphasized this economic reality:

So, we have seen with our own eyes the poverty of the masses, we feel for them and with them, and we have some understanding that their plight is due

821 James, Democratic, p.36
823 ‘Donors’, https://www.globalpolicyjournal.com/blog/12/12/2013/donors%E2%80%99-dilemma-aid-reverse-how-poor-countries-develop-rich-countries
in part to an economic system which is controlled mostly by the North Atlantic countries.\footnote{Available: https://www.lausanne.org/content/lop/lop-2, (accessed 15 November 2015)}


Furthermore, across Haitian society RAED posited that ‘Local elites claimed the monopoly of the markets, making huge profits, for example, at the expense of earthquake victims’.\footnote{ADLI4} Klein theorizes it as ‘disaster capitalism’, that is, the practice of taking advantage of a major disaster to adopt economic policies that the population would be less likely to accept under normal circumstances.\footnote{ADLI3}

In the same vein, RAED revealed that ‘Aid-providers continue to benefit from aid collected in our name, at the expense of our poverty’.\footnote{ADLI3} In ‘cultural assimilation’ aid-dependency ‘creates
wealth for leaders’ as is evident in ‘All [Bishop’s] his children were educated at university in America’.\textsuperscript{831} It is against those expensive aid-modalities and practices that James speaks out the terms ‘political economy of trauma’. In support, Peck adds ‘Humanitarian organizations transform human suffering and rights into goods’.\textsuperscript{832} There is no incontrovertible evidence that all FP and FMDs’ agencies acted that way, however, whoever did, contributed to Haiti’s disempowerment and aid-crystallization.

Evidence suggests that whatever has been the percentage of aid-positivity which has reached the impoverished, the greater percentage has tilted in favour of FP/FMDs.\textsuperscript{833} The impoverished Haitians’ conviction, then, has consistently been tested by the invitation to be loyal to the inherent positivity of aid in the face of their humiliating circumstances. With this counter-argument in mind, I therefore ask: Has this NGOs’ invasion of Haiti been a kind-hearted and compassionate response to Haiti’s ‘progress-resistant cultural influences’? No, based on current evidence, it has not been. The fact is that, as I alluded to earlier, critics have deflected the attention of Haitians, particularly, Protestants, from aid-dependency and aid-dependency’s beneficiaries as dominant causes of Haiti’s poverty, to Voodoo.

\textbf{Conclusion}

In this context, the political goodwill of ESRs [Haitians] had been holistically inadequate to fight a post-independence battle against continued wealth extraction and varied tools of socio-economic and political disempowerment. These overshadowed their goodwill as thin and thick data demonstrated. Synthesising the main points, I might reasonably conclude that the reality

\textsuperscript{831} ADLI4
\textsuperscript{833} According to Zanotti, 84 percent of every dollar spent in Haiti by USAID goes back to the US as salaries of international experts, thus contributing only marginally to the creation of value added in Haiti. Zanotti, ‘Cacophonies’, Third, p.760; Hallward, Damming, p.178. Hancock further observes that ‘70 cents out of every dollar of American assistance to the Third World never actually leave the United’. Hancock, Lords, p.156
of aid-dependency in HP is a by-product of costs of socio-economic, commercial and political disempowerment which resulted from FP’s successive interventions. Thacker notes:

Of course, why any particular country is poor is a highly complex subject, but at least part of the reason is because of the enduring legacy of what we in the West have done. Such behaviour constitutes shalom breaking and the only theologically responsible response to it is one of repentance. 834

5.2 Second Lens:

Aid-giving is an essential component of integrated mission in contrast to aid-dependency which disempowers

Introduction

Published literature, RAED, written testimonies, reports, snapshots and experiences of scholars have reaffirmed that aid-giving is the manifest enactment of divine compassion revealed within our common humanity. They expressed it as the fulfilment of the theological imperative in which wealth is a positive indicator of divine generosity which primarily aims to empower the economically poor, including Protestants. This has been in the hope that people may gradually and equally share in God’s provisions of wealth.

In fact, beyond the large amount of ethical support aid-giving has gained from secular discourses, in HP, it has been carried out on the premise of meeting poverty-driven needs and driving away poverty in compliance with the inherent positivity that Scriptures affirm it possesses. 835 Aid is intrinsically good not solely by human convention but as a tool of divine generosity. Viewed this way, I argue that aid-giving is an essential component of integrated mission in contrast to aid-dependency which has disempowered HP.

834 Thacker, *Global*, p.62
835 See ‘Pre-1949 aid-era’, p.19
I discuss the positivity of aid in support of the current Lens by extracting contributions from these interconnected data with an emphasis on three aid-related strands. They are (1) the positivity of aid in Scriptures, (2) ethical worth of aid, and (3) aid as investment. However, these clusters of aid-positivity have consistently been defied by (4) crystallization of aid-dependency, and (5) aid-giving illusion.

5.2.1 Positivity of Aid in Scriptures

God had consistently fashioned the Israelite nation to intentionally embrace the necessity of care in mutual dignity for each other and, with the same end in view, he has built the church. God grounded these people in a generosity-based initiative firstly by directing them to himself as the source of their wealth and secondly by instructing them to share that wealth.

You may say to yourself, “My power and the strength of my hands have produced this wealth for me.” But remember the Lord your God, for it is he who gives you the ability to produce wealth, and so confirms his covenant, which he swore to your ancestors, as it is today (Deut. 8:17-18).836

The very fact that God has providentially given us his wealth testifies that he wills such wealth to be an instrument of continuous sharing which humanizes. Wealth as aid to the needy has been such a positivity which characterizes his reign as the protector of and provider for the poor. The Scriptures abound in this theology of generosity and firmly invite us to its application. In fact, I consider four biblical narratives, two in the Old Testament: the Pentateuch and the prophetic; and two in the New Testament: the gospel and the epistle.

On the outset, the Pentateuch narrative succeeded to underscore such a positivity in which the Sabbath year allowed the poor to glean from the fields and landlords were constantly reminded to equip workers to be productive (Deut. 15:1-8). The injunction of the jubilee observance outweighed any misgivings about their obligation to share. Opportunities for exercising

836 See also 1 Chro. 29:11-12
generosity were to preoccupy the thoughts and activities of wealth possessors in the Jewish community. The outcome envisaged was the poor would be cared for each day of the year (Leviticus 25:35-38 and Deuteronomy 14:28-29).

Equally, in this scriptural discourse the prophetic voice echoed the generous character of God:

Share your food with the hungry and …provide the poor wanderer with shelter - when you see the naked, …clothe them, and [do] not … turn away from your own flesh and blood… (Isa. 58:7).

In the Old Testament, a demonstration of generosity and care for the poor was inherent to the task of leading and shepherding the people of God as well as the hallmark of love among the said people. This divine call to uphold the poor’s needs preserved its relevance in the New Testament church. It is so dear to God’s heart that John Wesley added ‘even reading, hearing [the Word], prayer, are to be omitted, or postponed, “at charity’s almighty call” – when we are called to relieve the distress of our neighbour, whether in body or soul’. Wesley went as far as including works of mercy – good deeds for the benefit of the neighbour – into the list of the means of grace.

In the New Testament, the ministry of Jesus was filled with aid-driven pragmatism. When his compassion was awakened to the hunger of the crowds, he said to the disciples: ‘Give them something to eat’ (Matt. 14:16). Matthew affirmed such positivity in this act of mercy:

I was hungry and you gave me something to eat, I was thirsty and you gave me something to drink, I was a stranger and you invited me in, I needed clothes and you clothed me, I was sick and you looked after me, I was in prison and you came to visit me (Matt. 25:35-36).

Furthermore, in the accounts of the feeding of the 5000 in John and in Luke’s Gospel chapters 3 and 4, there is a vivid account of the demonstrations of power of love for the vulnerable poor

---

837 Sermon 92, ‘On Zeal’ II.5, Works, 3:313
through the positivity of giving, liberating, curing, and healing and serving. In line with this depth of love, the church has been summoned to freely offer its workmanship of generosity. In fact, the ecclesiology of the Early Church demonstrated, by way of teaching and compliance to teaching, an abundance of compassion and care. The epistle narratives have not come short of this demonstration. Paul wrote:

Command them to do good, to be rich in good deeds, and to be generous and willing to share. In this way they will lay up treasure for themselves as a firm foundation for the coming age, so that they may take hold of the life that is truly life (1 Tim. 6:18-19).

John and James advised the church to adopt the practice of giving:

If anyone has material possessions and sees a brother or sister in need but has no pity on them, how can the love of God be in that person? Dear children, let us not love with words or speech but with actions and in truth (1 John 3:17-18).

Suppose a brother or a sister is without clothes and daily food. If one of you says to them, “Go in peace; keep warm and well fed,” but does nothing about their physical needs, what good is it? (James 2:15-16).

These scriptural discourses firmly embed, in the mission proclamation of rich Jewish and Christian believers, the requirement to treat wealth as a holy offering to God, through the provision of care to others in need. Therefore, the mission principle of aid-providers in HP has been primarily rooted in this scriptural foundation on which explicitly the aid-dependency reality has been built. God intended their wealth to serve his glory by making his name great and by making his ways known throughout the earth (Psalm 67). This suggests that aid-providers have consistently been under the theological imperative to unite with HP, holding the Scriptures in one hand and aid in the other, to serve, in dignity, the spiritual, physical and mental needs of Haitians. RAED echoed this perspective of the Scriptures in referring to aid as a ‘divine blessing’ and affirming further that aid is ‘the Lord’s intervention’.

In HP’s space, where God’s distributive economic justice ought to be pursued, foreign Christians are ‘created in Christ Jesus to do good works, which God has prepared in advance
for [them] to do’ (Eph. 2:10). Pragmatically, the need-driven contexts of Matt. 25:35-36, so prevalent in HP’s space, have been clamouring with urgency for such a missional response from the redeemed children of the Lord. This puts side by side the ‘commission to go’ (Matt. 28:19-20) with the ‘commandment to love’ (Matt. 22:37-39) in integrated mission.

This generosity-based principle has outlined God’s purpose for aid-providers in HP, sidelined their misgivings and established their mission priority and agenda. Understandably, participants responded with this affirmation, in that, FMDs are here to bless us by helping. In this regard, Rowell affirms:

> Under the lordship of Christ, in spite of geographical distances, cultural differences and political divisions there is in our world only one gospel and only one body, the church of those redeemed by grace and therefore ruled by generosity of love and not by differentiations of law.  

This implies that giving to such redemptive work in HP has been a key reason for which wealth has been attributed to high-income foreigners. In support of this principle, Rowell disapproves the convenient prescription that secured the wealth of the rich to themselves while offering a little relief to the plight of the poor. He argues for such this resolve.

Here, Rowell points out that Christians are intended by God to live as generous stewards of kingdom resources. The Scriptures clearly and consistently require responsive giving rather than reasons for holding back when material needs are going unmet disproportionately. Rowell’s view is such that we must not avoid the biblical injunctions that call us to generous living in order to defend our propensity to minimize giving. This participant’s quote from RAED reverberated with the ethos of God’s generosity: ‘As Christians, called “Methodists”, the love of God compels us to always assist and care for our brothers and sisters in need’.

---

838 Rowell, *To Give*, p.xx
839 Rowell, *To Give*, pp.4-5
840 Rowell, *To Give*, pp.50-55
841 ADQ24

195
The imperative of love was so extensive in the scriptural narratives that aid-giving was designed to achieve the ultimate goal of eradicating poverty among God’s people: ‘There need be no poor people among you’ (Deut. 15:4), and ‘There were no needy persons among them’ (Acts 4:34). I will later, in Chapter 6, discuss the messianic worth of these texts. These unwavering biblical obligations underwrite both the moral responsibility of the aid-provider and the ethical worth of aid-giving.

5.2.2 Ethical Worth of Aid

As was discussed in pre-1949 and 1950-2000 aid-eras, these scriptural aid-giving requirements in contexts of disaster, humanitarian health crises and socio-political upheavals have intrinsically been good as immediate dire needs have been met. There are hints of evidence in RAED that the functionality of aid-assistance has fulfilled the tenets of holistic mission. Certainly, HP’s proclamation of the gospel has been partly coherent with social service distributions through a wide range of ministries. In fact, individual success stories testified to this factual love.

These participants’ testimonies are worth repeating: ‘I have nothing to live on but aid’. Aid conveys the significance of ‘the oxygen of the church’, is ‘manna, falling from heaven’ and an of ‘absolute necessity’. In the literature it is an ‘urgent and temporary provision’, ‘it is a good thing’. It is good to install water pipes, build wells in disaster-stricken communities. It is right to emulate the Samaritan who had mercy, stopped the bleeding and

842 ADQ8
843 ADQ23, ADL11
844 See ‘Descriptive Theme 1’, p.130
845 Corbett & Fikkert, When, p.104
846 Riddell, Does, p.1
847 Easterly, The White, p.209
prevented death (Luke 10:25-37). Because these people are often unable to do things for themselves, they need handouts to ‘stop the bleeding’. A participant explained:

When hunger, poverty, natural and man-made disasters, and political turbulences strike; death is imminent, especially, to those living below the poverty line, foreign-aid is their sole salvation.

In times of disaster, aid-positivity in HP has been received as an act of divine mercy, motivated by love. This resonates with ‘food, nutrition and cash’ distribution during the 1973-1985 Ethiopian famine, increased generosity to the 2004 Tsunami Victims, the ministries of the foodbank in the UK and the Salvation Army. Furthermore, Haiti’s and Nepal’s post-earthquake humanitarian responses met the eligibility of the theological imperative. Here, the ethos of sharing has destabilized selfishness, the outcome could only be a messianic endeavour. Recognising the importance of aid, Thacker asserts:

There will clearly always been a need for emergency relief, for instance, in response to natural disasters or in conflict and post-conflict zones. In addition, there are also good development projects that should continue to be supported and funded.

As the literature highlighted earlier, aid- assistance in HP has become the dominant source of income of a financially dependent church. In this way, through aid-giving, HP has attracted remittances to capitalize church finance and, by extension, in the short-term, boosted the Haitian economy. In support of the positivity of aid Tandon sustains the point that aid is well recognized as a contributor to global financial flows. ‘It sounds positive because in the public

---

848 Corbett & Fikkert, *When*, p.109
849 ADQ22
853 See ‘The Church’, p.19
855 Thacker, ‘From’, *Transformation*, p.118
eye and the media it is associated with “development”, “solidarity”, and “humanitarian” causes.856

5.2.3 Aid as Investment

In RAED and published literature, job creation has been received as a form of investment. It augmented aid’s usefulness and positivity in HP and has therefore been celebrated by all sectors of the church, ranging from professionals to the non-literate, although the margin of profit often tilted in favour of the professionals.857 Referring to HMC alone, the education sector has employed, in 2011, 505 teachers and a diversity of workers in these sectors, namely social services, micro-credit, health and agriculture. In brief, large numbers have benefitted from employment sustained by foreign-aid.858

Furthermore, aid-positivity in terms of investment has been aid-providers’ exhibition of what western civilization has promoted as wealth which served as financial, entrepreneurial and educational paradigms and incentives towards success. Bonk resists this view and points out that ‘an imbalance in the relative wealth of the evangelizer-missionaries and those among whom they work distorts the transmission and inculturation of the gospel’.859 While this argument holds merit in the Haitian context, this model, however, through the right process of exhibiting, distributing and contextualizing God-given wealth, is prone to inspiring the locals to pursue their own success.

As mentioned earlier, another component of aid-positivity included physical assets, namely lands, buildings [schools, hospitals and churches]860 and the teaching of skills to families, aiming, for example, to learn scientific and clinical ways of curtailing HIV/AID and to

856 Tandon, Ending, p.1
857 See ‘First Lens’, p.175
858 MDC-HMC2011
859 Bonk, Missions, p.ix
860 ADQ25
appropriate methodologies of good governance in micro-credit.\textsuperscript{861} Riddell contends that the belief that aid is a good thing is sustained by the assumption that the resources or skills that aid provides do indeed ‘make an immediate and concrete difference’ to those being assisted.\textsuperscript{862} Schuller refers to a western research participant, confessing to him this assertion: ‘We have not succeeded in developing some countries, but we have worked hard. We have offered good careers to people who live here in the United States and have given them the ability to travel’.\textsuperscript{863}

The momentum has been that aid-givers’ love has resonated with God’s generosity, believing that aid is a good thing and that giving more and more to those who are in economic deprivation is righteous living in action. From a secular perspective, this has generated a revival in aid-giving and a growing public interest.\textsuperscript{864} Riddell further affirms that ‘The link between aid’s revival, expanding aid levels and the adoption of MDGs, has sharpened the focus on the role of aid in achieving short-run and tangible inroads into poverty in the poorest countries’.\textsuperscript{865}

Equally illuminating for the discussion have been the challenges to the positivity of aid-giving. They have brought to the foreground arguments that are needed in order to have a balanced discussion of the hypothesis. I consider, as outlined earlier, the following challenges: crystallization of aid-dependency and aid-illusion.

\subsection*{5.2.4 Crystallization of Aid-dependency}

The signs of aid-positivity are essential, yet, they are celebrated, as a divine blessing in contexts where both people are hunting for the day-to-day necessities of life and aid-assistance is crystallized as aid-dependency to satisfy the hunt. Rowell explains:

\begin{quote}
We need to find the kind of resolve that will ensure that we remain on site when others face catastrophe until stability is fully achieved. That is why
\end{quote}

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{861} Schuller, \textit{Cette}, pp.260-261 \\
\textsuperscript{862} Riddell, \textit{Does}, p.7 \\
\textsuperscript{863} Schuller, \textit{Cette}, p.267 \\
\textsuperscript{864} Riddell, \textit{Does}, pp.2-4 \\
\textsuperscript{865} Riddell, \textit{Does}, p.7
\end{flushright}
missionaries should be intent upon a far more sustainable strategy than just walking through the open doors that natural and manmade disasters create.866 In respect of aid-positivity and aid-worth, Rowell’s argument holds merit. ‘Remain on site’, ‘stability is fully achieved’, and ‘far more sustainable strategy’ are a practical goal of integrated mission. However, whereas natural and human-made867 disasters have selected Haiti to constantly function in a disaster mode, the crystallization of aid, or aid-dependency, is consolidated by ‘remain on site’. In this crystallization, aid-recipients are conditioned to testify to, and even augment, the worth of foreign-aid. Theus explains:

They think in this way because they are alienated and bound up to the illusive hope that aid-drops generate, right where they are, rooted in their context of dependency and dominance, which do not aim to get them out of there.868

Furthermore, the fact that the density of aid-provision, in HP’s space, has vastly been disproportionate to the gravity of human-made and natural disasters, aid-positivity became selective individuals’ [foreign and local] economic success stories. It is micro in depth, scope and timeframe.869 This selective approach has conveniently supported the case-based advocacy, which is, specific actions to tackle the injustice and oppression experienced by individuals.870 It may have also been relevant to what social scientists called the ‘Identified Victim’ effect, which is, a deliberate effort to give more if specific individual sufferers are identified rather than an equal number of non-identified victims.871 This selective manifestation of aid-positivity has found a reliable foothold in Matt. 25:35-36 and James 2:15-16 which on the surface appear to solely address individual-focused, but collective, needs. On the other hand, Haiti’s continuous socio-economic struggle is evidence that macro-economic success

866 Rowell, To Give p.13
867 Which I recognise to be ‘acts of injustice’.
868 Theus, ONG, p.410
871 People will generally give more to a single identified victim rather than to a much large number of non-identified people. Tehila Kogut & Ilana Ritov, ‘The “Identified Victim” Effect: An Identified Group, or Just a Single Individual?’ , Journal of Behavioral Decision Making 18 (2005), pp.157-167
stories have not been the testimony of the community as a whole. In support, Casséus argue that if we come to grips with the problem on a global front, it would clearly show that our economic condition [despite the positivity of aid], far from being improved, worsens. Theus adds: ‘NGOs’ aid balance sheet [in Haiti] is negative and the results after half a century of aid are not at all satisfactory’. I understand Casséus and Theus as saying that selected Haitians have been rescued while the nation itself has been submerging. On this account Thacker suggests that:

A larger number of people may benefit from taking a wider policy approach. This is not to resort to a crass utilitarianism, but it is rather to appeal to a love ethic which commands me to love all and not just the individuals who happen to come before me.

And until the juxtaposition of the case-advocacy and the wider policy approaches has been addressed, selective aid-positivity is collectively inadequate. Its inadequacy has served to further crystalize aid-dependency so that the local elite in church and society, together with selected Haitian grassroots, continued to receive aid-empowerment of the West. Another point ensues. The crystallization of aid-dependency has not offered space to answer the questions: What if instead of aid-assistance another model of poverty-alleviation strategy were applied to HP’s space? Harries’ counterfactual argument has found resonance with the current thought, namely what might have been had things not have been done as they were

---


873 Theus, ONG, pp.144-145; Casséus, Haïti, p.99. This is not to counter-argue the ‘positivity of aid’, ‘ethical worth of aid’, or ‘aid as investment’, but to highlight that these positive aid-related strands have not yet adequately reached the intended majority of the economically poor.

874 Theus, ONG, p.272

875 Thacker, ‘From’, Transformation, p.123
done? In other words, what would the economic position of HP have been if it had not received supplies of foreign-aid? Once this individual-driven aid-positivity has become the fruit of the crystallization of aid-dependency these signs have authenticated a positivity which, in part, precluded the aggregate outcome of alternate models of poverty-alleviation, and rather, reflected the shadow of its messianic significance.

However, in the light of the systematic deprivation that has inhabited Haiti since its birth, and, in the absence of a current instrumentality of alternative models of socio-economic success within HP, the injection of aid, in the short-term, has been a positive mission undertaking to hundreds of individuals in desperate need. Meanwhile, Thacker’s concern remains applicable in HP’s context: ‘At present, too much of the efforts made on behalf of the poor are focussed on the individuals, the concrete. It is time to lift our eyes up and address the wider structural injustices that plague our world’.876

5.2.5 Aid-giving Illusion

In contrast to aid inherent positivity in biblical narrative, scholars, in secular society, note that aid-giving does not exist in any meaningful sense. LICs, explicitly Haiti, have been net creditors to rich countries. Hickel’s, Lausanne Conference’s and Warmback with Khumalo’s earlier quotes have backed up this point. In further support, RAED confirmed these facts: ‘We live at the expense of foreign-aid so that self-sufficiency is an elusive thought’.877 I return to Schuller who argues: ‘Aid serves as an illusion to mask this fact; it makes the takers seem like givers’.878 Russel advances the same point about the debt-massage. Likewise, RAED testified that aid-providers have become richer on the axis of aid-dependency.879 Schuller then

876 Thacker, ‘From’, Transformation, p.124
877 ADQ15
878 Schuller, Cetee, pp.114-115
879 See ‘Descriptive Theme 6’, p.149
concludes that ‘Despite some individual aid success stories, as a whole, the international community, has failed Haiti in many ways’. 880

Further to this understating from the secular world, I juxtapose the act of aid-giving to the poor with the act of receiving a ‘heavenly reward’ (Deut. 8:17-18). The following biblical texts among other texts substantiate the argument: ‘Whoever is kind to the poor lends to the Lord, and he will reward them for what they have done’ (Pro. 19:17). ‘It is more blessed to give than to receive’ (Acts 20:35). ‘In this way they will lay up treasure for themselves as a firm foundation for the coming age, so that they may take hold of the life that is truly life’ (1 Tim. 6:19). ‘Sell your possessions and give to the poor. Provide purses for yourselves that will not wear out, a treasure in heaven that will never fail, where no thief comes near and no moth destroys’ (Luke 12:33).

These scriptural alms-giving instructions suggest that the aid-giver’s act of remembering the poor has not been solely motivated by moral obligation but a heaven-interest. This has been mindfully influenced by an ultimate biblical reward. Alms-giving then meant to deliver from death and poverty and has equally been a loan to God that he would surely repay. Therefore, it is possible to argue that the goal of giving, has not only appeased the conscience of the giver, 881 but favoured the desire for securing a heavenly reward. Gary Anderson illuminates, ‘Funding a treasury became a rational act for the believer because by acting this way she is actually swimming with the current that God has fixed in the created order’. 882 In support of this

880 Schuller, Mèt, p. 2
881 Harries, Vulnerable, p. 170
motivation Hobbes and MacPherson note that ‘Self-interest serves as a guideline in every action’.  

Gary Anderson singles out this desire as a disservice by emphasizing that an act could not be moral if it was prompted by self-interest. An act rises in moral stature to the degree that it is not governed by self-interest. Pope Benedict XVI, however, expresses serious reservations about an ethics that would completely separate unmerited love for the other from love that benefits the self. ‘Man cannot live by ablative, descending love [agape] alone. He cannot always give, he must also receive’. Gary Anderson resists this motivation, by arguing that:

In this respect we must confess that built into our very DNA is the aspiration for self-preservation and self-fulfilment; human beings are no more able to detach themselves from these desires than they are able to stop breathing on their own.

Weighing up the different sides to the argument it is, perhaps, fair to conclude that FP and FMDs in their services to Haiti have accrued a double blessing which is, in one part, wealth and security for their nations and financial security for themselves, and in another part, heavenly reward. From a materialistic perspective, this heavenly reward has matched earthly wealth and security, except in cases where unfettered capitalism has been pursued. Aid-giving, then, aid-dependency, in this context, have not been an illusion from the givers’ perspective, but an act of self-service and generosity to the impoverished in material and heavenly terms of profitability.

Taken as factual, where do the impoverished Haitians, then, fit in? They have been at the receiving end and therefore have constantly been deprived of a twofold blessing: restricted

886 Anderson, *Charity*, p.68
887 Zanotti, ‘Cacophonies’, *Third*, p.760; Hallward, *Dumming*, p.178
increased capitalism and a heavenly reward. Reading it this way, in the current reality, HP has the right to perceive aid-receiving, aid-dependency, as an illusion towards a twofold blessing.

**Conclusion**

According to this Lens, these acts of divine mercy - ethical worth of aid and aid as investment - are compelled by God’s generosity and, therefore, authenticate positivity of aid in Scriptures. Nonetheless, this generosity is outdone by perennial costs of economic injustices, class segregation, economic isolation and political economy of trauma which have, in the long-term, boosted the crystallization of aid-dependency in HP. This crystallization, then, dissipates aid-positivity’s opportunities to reverse specific disempowering crises and transform HP into an aid-possessor.888 It is, therefore possible, to conclude that the crystallization of aid-dependency strengthens the argument that aid-giving is an illusion.

### 5.3 Third Lens:

**The practices and modalities of aid-dependency have become tools of economic disempowerment in Haitian Protestantism**

**Introduction**

In the First Lens, the research aimed to demonstrate that FP is still recovering from the injustices of colonialism. Moreover, in recent times, this recovery has been delayed by FP’s ‘NGO-isation’ effort through disempowering modalities of aid-dependency.889 Referring to an earlier analysis, evidence suggested that FMDs have simulated FP’s modalities such that FMDs’ poverty-alleviation initiatives have been conceived as tools of economic

---

888 See ‘Theological Imperative’, p.238
disempowerment. In fact, participants described aid-dependency as ‘a type of poverty’ and ‘a poverty-feeding factor’. On this premise, the scriptural compassion which compelled FMDs to be alongside HP has produced the unintended outcome of prolonged socio-political, economic and religious vulnerabilities.

Nonetheless, I proceed to test the soundness of this Lens. To do this I analyse by way of two examples (1) paternalistic practices and (2) samples of aid-modalities. Thus far, the research finds them to be typologies of economic disempowerment in their delay, in fact, waste of timely opportunities for remarkable transformation. In continuance with this Lens, I examine paternalistic practices.

5.3.1 Paternalistic Practices

Gutierrez comments: ‘The centres where decisions are taken are outside the continent and this maintains the countries of Latin America in a state of neo-colonialism’. This resonates with a participant’s opinion: ‘The major decisions are made by foreign boards’. Schuller remarks that the influence of such practice has often resulted in policies that have been widely seen as externally imposed.

Policies like ‘results’ or ‘performance’ based management have centralized decision-making authority and closed off avenues for meaningful local participation. Corrections and changes made from on-the-ground experience are increasingly difficult.

Fernando further elaborates:

Despite all the talk about cross-cultural relationships today, North Americans process information they receive from other cultures through their own cultural grid and end up making some very wrong judgments.

---

890 ‘The sole purpose of aid is to enable people not to need it’. Mary B. Anderson, ‘Aid: A Mixed Blessing’, Development in Practice, 10:3 (2000), pp.495-500 [498]. This purpose has been so far thwarted in HP.
891 ADQ6
892 ADQ13
894 ADQ9
895 Schuller, Mèt, p.3

206
In support, these empirical discourses confirm: ‘Who finances, commands’,\(^{897}\) ‘Whoever finances, gives orders’\(^{898}\) and ‘Whoever pays the salary is the boss’.\(^{899}\) In this practice:

Local needs deliberation has become increasingly irrelevant, as NGOs have to follow the ‘project’ cycle and do exactly as they’re told, implementing donor priorities, or risk their funding being pulled.\(^{900}\)

I, therefore, proceed to examine paternalistic practices with an emphasis on knowledge, labour, managerial and monopolization of relations.

*Knowledge Paternalism* - Thacker states:

> The income, employment and growth in the economically poor world is not determined by decisions taken in that sphere. It is determined by the behaviour of trans-national corporations and governments in the materially rich West. It represents, then, a loss of self-determination for the global poor.\(^{901}\)

The task of instantiating FP’s mission here has portrayed the intrinsic influence of HICs. Their ideas are branded to be the right theory of practice, the ultimate answer to complexities of problems in Haiti. This suggests that there is one single path of progress, the western aid-centred trajectory.\(^{902}\) The consistency of these practices has, in the long-term, wasted huge sums of money and timely opportunities for transformation. Timothy Schwartz supports this with an episode:

For about twenty years, hundreds of thousands of dollars was spent on BIGs [Bio Intensive Gardens] that the peasants never paid the slightest bit of attention to, but into which CARE International went right on pumping hundreds of thousands of dollars of aid.\(^{903}\)

Corbett and Fikkert conclude:

The failure of the outside ‘experts’ to understand the realities of life on the ground led them to give life-threatening advice to the materially poor and then to demean the poor when they failed to listen to this ‘experts’ advice.\(^{904}\)

---

\(^{897}\) ADLI4
\(^{898}\) ADLI1
\(^{899}\) ADLI10
\(^{900}\) Schuiller, Mèt, p.3
\(^{901}\) Thacker, ‘From’, *Transformation*, p.116
\(^{903}\) Schwartz, *Travesty*, Kindle Location 1120
\(^{904}\) Corbett & Fikkert, *When*, p.116
The practices of ‘a loss of self-determination for the global poor’ and ‘life-threatening advice to the materially poor’ have converged to be another layer of economic setback to HP’s fledging economy. Published literature has fleshed out tenets of this practice in the same way the empirical data could not ignore its existence. Schuller further illustrates: ‘Haitian NGOs may have Haitian decision-making structures but foreign funders still wield powerful influences, recalling the old saying “one who pays the piper calls the tune”’.905 Timothy Schwartz further highlights how aid-providers, wittingly or unwittingly, attributed little worth to local productivity, expertise and views, in brief, to Haiti’s indigeneity. He argues:

Even though the Jean Makout rainy season is only three months, the NGO agronomists distributed long season seed varieties. [This caused] the peasants who accepted and planted the seeds to lose their harvests, [and therefore] to be driven deeper into poverty.906 Aid-providers defended their paternalistic decisions based on their experiences of aid-receivers’ lack of self-determination and ‘know-how’ in specific areas of missional development. They complained about the lack of efficient cohesive plans of action, the inability of non-literate Haitians to dissect or execute those plans and the resulting lapse in time to prepare projects and reports on them.907 In other words, the locals lack the required knowledge to operate the ‘box’. This is equally a socio-political recurrence evoking the absence of competent leaders for national governance.908 To compensate, out of their committed inclination to service, FMDs have offered their decision-making and knowledge processes as a love gift.

Writers disapprove of the practices of ‘centralized decision-making’,909 ‘life-threatening advice’,910 ‘making some very wrong judgments’,911 ‘closed off avenues for meaningful local

905 Schuller, Mèt, p.4
906 Schwartz, Travesty, Kindle Location 1122
907 Theus, ONG, pp.336-340
908 Schuller, Mèt, p.3
909 Corbett & Fikkert, When, p.116
910 Fernando, ‘Chipping’, Mission, p.17
participation’, 912 and ‘silenc[ing] front-line staff with experience in the field and erod[ing] organizational autonomy’. 913 While in some contexts these practices of decision-making in developmental projects may have been a love gift, Corbett and Fikkert classify them as knowledge paternalism. This occurs when we ‘assume that we have all the best ideas about how to do things’ 914 but it ruins ‘the self-determination for the global poor’. From this flows the practice of labour paternalism.

**Labour Paternalism** - In addition to knowledge paternalism, there exists the recurrent practice of labour paternalism in which aid-providers continue to influence. It occurs when FP or FMDs undertake activities in Haiti that could easily be performed by those who live within Haitian communities. 915 Participants explained: ‘In the aftermath of the 2010 earthquake, we were not allowed the time nor freedom to construct from our funding and with our labour a building, school or church’. 916

However, FMDs have understood HP, and its organizations, as entities with limited developmental ideas and the lack of social skills and technical infrastructure. The assumption is that they are suffering from the paucity of local human capacity. For example, USAID has defended its aid administration and labour paternalism stating that Haitian organizations often lack the capacity, track experience, or business standards to qualify as a contract or grant recipient. 917 Furthermore, FMDs have recognized that financial aid-positivity should not solely be limited to money, but include pools of creative ideas, availability of foreign resources and professionals with tested knowledge in specific fields of approved projects. Purposefully,

---

912 Schuller, Mèt, p.3  
913 Schuller, Mèt, p.3  
914 Corbett & Fikkert, When, p.116  
915 See Lederleitner, Cross-cultural, pp.78-79  
916 ADFG3  
FMDs have also understood its leading role as an expertise provider. This may be classified as a type of justice in mission.

However, writers, as pointed out earlier, explain this justice principle in terms that define labour paternalism. Thacker asserts ‘All of this means that when we deprive the poor of the opportunity of work – whether or not that work is remunerated – we are depriving them of the dignity and status that comes from such work’. 918

In Haiti where the rate of unemployment peaked at 41 percent in 2010, the rootedness of labour paternalism in aid-dependency’s practices augur long-term negative economic impact. 919

Given this reaction, is it unproductive that missionaries utilize their expertise in the mission field? Mary Anderson advises:

> A healthy division of labour between giver and receiver should acknowledge these differences in ‘aid expertise’. Clarity about roles can be a vehicle for acknowledging capacities that exist within recipient communities and, thus, affirming the dignity and worthiness of recipients’ humanness. 920

Until this healthy division of labour has been productively adopted, a productive suggestion is that aid-providers do nothing for those they serve that they can do for themselves. As Thacker explains, ‘If one always believes that the solution to one’s problems is located externally then one is far less likely to expend time and energy in finding those solutions’. 921 Labour paternalism ushers me into managerial paternalism.

**Managerial Paternalism** - This paternalistic practice of aid-dependency is another setback to HP’s economic and spiritual growth. In this practice, the trajectory of FMDs’ mission has been mapped across into HP’s structure of ministry. I refer to the ecclesiastical path dependency

918 Thacker, *Global*, p.26
921 Thacker, *Global*, p.24
which ultimately has maintained FMDs in control. Glen Schwartz explains ‘Many church leaders in mission-established institutions have almost an unmanageable legacy without sufficient local funding to successfully carry it on’.\(^{922}\) Therefore, FMDs’ agencies reckoned that they should not remove themselves from structures of functionality they have set up nor deprive local communities of their expertise which befits their exported administrative, mission and ministry structures. However, at the level of a nation’s administration, Maggay explains that ‘What seems to be wrong is the ancient structure of inequality which allows the elite to perpetuate privilege and corner much of the resources’.\(^{923}\)

Furthermore, FMDs’ enthusiasm towards controlling, supervising and managing tokenistic aid has not been characterized solely by their entrepreneurial instinct towards avoidance of financial misspending. This enthusiasm has also evoked the lack of required local resources to function at FMDs’ standards for which FMDs compensate. Corbett and Fikkert and Thacker classify this practice as managerial paternalism.\(^{924}\) For example, in a context where the socio-economic misery has forever threatened the existence and the livelihood of the average Haitian, the provisions of care, which have been imported to which their ministers, priests and pastors are legitimately entitled have been demanding to sustain.\(^{925}\)

In the Voodoo culture, it has been vastly different:

Because there is no centralized hierarchy paying salaries to Houngans [male priests] and Mambos [female priests], and because a peristyle [temple] is private property, it is considered normal for uninitiated participants to make a small cash gift. This money is used to defray the cost of the drummers, food which is offered to the participants, and the general upkeep of the peristyle and of the Houngan or Mambo in charge. This is often hard to understand for people raised in the Judeo-Christian tradition, where priests, ministers, and rabbis are salaried professionals.\(^{926}\)

\(^{922}\) Schwartz, *When*, p.34

\(^{923}\) Maggay, ‘Justice’ in Hoek & Thacker, *Micah’s*, p.117

\(^{924}\) Corbett & Fikkert, *When*, pp.115-117; Thacker, *Global*, pp.23-33

\(^{925}\) See ‘Foreign Structure’, p.159

Ramseyer argues that churches which came into being through the ministries of these missionaries shared the missionaries’ value system which placed a significant importance on managerial resources not available to these churches locally. They came to regard themselves as incapable of functioning as churches without significant subsidies from abroad.\textsuperscript{927} Thus, FMDs’ aid-budget is spent in paying high salaries and the upkeep of an elite group at the expense of economic empowerment for the functional poor within the same church.\textsuperscript{928}

\textit{Monopolization of Relations} - Arising from the ecclesiastical typologies, discussed earlier, foreign church-missions established unilateral relations with their denominational counterparts in the mission fields. Foreign Baptists have built and nurtured affiliations with Haitian Baptists and Methodists with Methodists. These excerpts give credibility to this practice:

After the 2010 earthquake:

From a Methodist perspective, UMCOR was committed to rebuilding the Nouveau College Bird.\textsuperscript{929} The Wirral Circuit of MCB rebuilt the Lévêque Methodist School.\textsuperscript{930} MCB donated £470,000 to HMC to help to pay ministers’ stipends and rebuild churches in the Cap-Haitian circuit.\textsuperscript{931} The Methodist Church in Ireland rebuilt the \textit{Appartements de Delmas 54}, a childcare centre in which Methodists care for orphans and neglected children.\textsuperscript{932}

Furthermore, from a wider perspective:

\begin{quote}
The World Team pledged resources to its national church partner, MEBSH, and were committed to repairing hospitals and clinics affected by the earthquake.\textsuperscript{933}
\end{quote}

\begin{quote}
The United Church of Canada spent Canadian $300,000 through Act Alliance to provide support for young people, particularly, with the giving of
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{928}Hallward, \textit{Darning}, p.178
\textsuperscript{929}ADPR7, ADPR8
\textsuperscript{930}ADPR1
\textsuperscript{931}ADPR7, ADPR8
\textsuperscript{932}ADPR4
\textsuperscript{933}ADLI5
scholarship grants.934

The Episcopal Church [TEC] provides an annual grant of US$360,000 to the diocese of the Episcopal Church of Haiti [ECH] to underwrite the costs of much of their work program. Besides, the rebuilding of the ECH Cathedral, a worthwhile project in its own right, became the principal project of TEC’s engagement with the ECH.935

The data suggested that each foreign church-mission maintained, in a protected way, a paternalistic relationship within HP. Related missional issues have emerged such that aid-recipients’ negotiating rights have been subjugated in the particularity of their loyalty to mother-churches in a paternalistic monopolization. In parallel with this, converging missional initiatives of leading foreign aid-providers to help to tackle a national problem in HP have been non-existent. In fact, in circumstances where a mother-church has been unable to bring a development project to completion, another mother-church will not intervene.

In society, Schuller observes that ‘NGOs are in fact, structurally speaking, competitors with one another - even with the Haitian government itself - and monopolized particular given community projects. Why share information or coordinate among one another with an entity that is competing for the same resources?’936 Zanotti adds: ‘Internationally sponsored NGOs have been criticized not only for carrying out uncoordinated and particularistic political agendas, but also for being ineffective in channelling resources to the Haitians.’937 Furthermore, referring to dependency theory, FP’s multi-levelled relationships with Haiti isolated Haiti from other potential well-meaning nations. Those relationships have had no real impact on Haiti’s living conditions. Emile elucidates:

It is not a productive initiative to solely maintain economic relations with the traditional colonial powers. Given their forms of cooperation, the relations have had, thus far, no impact on our living conditions.938

934 ADPR7, ADPR8
936 Schuller, Mèt, p.4
937 Zanotti, ‘Cacophonies’, Third, p.760
938 Emile, Haiti, p.174
The point is that paternalistic monopolization of relations - in church and society - is another evidence which seems to support the argument that aid-dependency’s practices have become tools of economic disempowerment.

Some critics suggest that this uncoordinated agenda has been facilitated by Haiti’s culture of polarisation and the absence of a cohesive socio-economic developmental plan. Equally, local churches, in their lack of unified vision, offer support to this premise. This criticism holds merit. It is however challenged by the descriptive theme ‘Creates Division’ in which aid-dependency inspires existing rivalry. Rightly, monopolization fostered rivalry and conditioned the local consciousness to ‘not using local expertise/labour’. It frustrated local bi-lateral and/or tri-lateral initiatives and drove church-neighbours to ignore solutions to certain problems akin to HP’s collective problems, duplicating, in the process, costly experiences. Moreover, it has equally served to inhibit the coming together of the two-third world church with HP to share common experiences, learn from each other towards growth and sustainability in the struggle against a common enemy, the socio-economic deprivation.

The evidence would appear to indicate that in compliance with paternalistic practices, in certain circumstances, local church leaderships have undermined potential benefits of cross-church relationships and transnational partnerships. Otherwise, the misery of impoverished Haitians would be tackled in a systematized, unified prosperity plan, driven by the aggregate FP’s/FMDs’ and HP’s competencies and resources. In this respect, the monopolization model has worked against the necessity of fostering a broad array of relations with a view to collectively and comprehensively meeting HP’s missional needs. In this inequality of practice

940 Fontus and Casséus lament the scandal of church division. Fontus, Les Églises, pp.105-106; Casséus, Haiti 2010, pp.96-97
941 Griffiths, A View, pp.66-67; Buss & Gardner, Haiti, pp.10-15

214
aid-dependency’s functionality has arguably become FMDs’ paternalistic choice which has somewhat, perhaps indirectly, deprived HP of the use of its collective enterprising efforts to solve its own problems.

Alongside paternalistic practices stand aid-modalities which are almost inseparable.

### 5.3.2 Aid-modalities

Firstly, I need to recap the dynamics of aid-worth. The thesis has demonstrated, thus far, that aid is a good thing, an essential component of integrated mission and the right option for compassionate and humanitarian interventions. Aid-giving is a moral obligation and an ethical response from individuals, churches, church-based groups and nations towards people, affected by socio-economic deprivation; people who are deeply impoverished by slavery and its related causes. It has been grounded in spiritual values, objectified in kindness and care and aims to dignify humanity. Furthermore, throughout this portfolio, a multiplicity of evidences confirm that aid-giving has raised humans’ living standard and created norms and patterns of thought and behaviour in the receiving communities to recognize the generosity and sovereignty of God.

However, another reality of aid-giving has revealed the operational frameworks of its functionality. I refer to aid-modalities. They describe and enforce foreign bureaucratic procedures of budgeting, delivering and reporting on aid. They include policy-implementations and project supports while facilitating fragmentation, project proliferation and overlaps among donors. They are set up to benefit aid-agencies, their intermediaries, more

---

942 Moyo, Dead, pp.11-13
than they benefit aid-recipients, since, for example, aid-givers’ rights to totally withdraw from sponsored projects cancel out receivers’ rights of redress.\textsuperscript{945} Evidence suggests that they are characterised by the principles of the identified victim effect, case-based advocacy, neo-patrimony and a political economy of trauma, delivered through paternalistic parleys and practices. As such, palliative economics and deprivation of dignity have been two recurrent outcomes.

However, aid-modalities do not negate the intrinsic nature of aid, its ethical worth and investment potentialities. Neither do they rescind the positive works of outstanding missionaries since aid-modalities are not all inhibitive. Broadly, they preserve their characteristics to be tools of economic disempowerment. Therefore, justification in offering the scrutiny of FMDs’ aid-modalities to validate the claim of this Lens within HP is evidenced by consideration of school sponsorship, passing on the gifts, food-for-work, and \textit{se débrouiller}.

\textit{School Sponsorship} - The mission modality applied in Dondon School’s sponsorship programme has predisposed school children to internalize the influence of foreign control.\textsuperscript{946} Through the mechanism of writing letters to patronized fathers and mothers in foreign lands, their identity has been contingent on foreign-aid. They are being taught that ‘the solution to one’s problems is located externally’.\textsuperscript{947} This modality has the capacity to transform, at that early stage, their worth, together with God’s aid-positivity, into a commodity.

\textit{Passing on the Gifts} - Another modality encompassed the HEIFER’s programme, ‘passing on the gifts’. The Haitian peasant is made to understand that the practice of ‘passing on a goat’ to

\textsuperscript{946} ADL14
\textsuperscript{947} Thacker, \textit{Global}, p.24
another peasant as a poverty-alleviation tool. A fundamental question arose on the premise of this modality, ‘How long it will take this poor man to really prosper from that goat and improve his living conditions’? Pragmatically, ‘this is a distraction in which people se débrouillent’. It eventually culminates into further economic deprivation.

*Food-for-work* - Cash-for-work and food-for-work modalities provided me with another constituent of aid-dependency’s functionality. In the food-for-work programme:

Haitians worked, tilling the fields in return for food, rarely for money. Thus, Haitians become dependent on food supplied by Christian aid agencies, usually imported from the United States and neglect to produce their own. While the outcome of these modalities is similar, cash-for-work implied the opposite of food-for-work. However, neither cash-for-work nor food-for-work offers job security to the receiver. For example, in response to the 2010 earthquake, NGOs’ job creation in Haiti has been temporary, precarious and low-paying. They were specifically labour-intensive and dominated largely by cash-for-work. It is understandable that, from the perspective of compassion, these modalities have provided food and quick cash to disaster victims. However, as an exception, the *Zanmi Lasante* [partners in health] has taken a more proactive approach, by creating job security in the communities where it operates.

As discussed in Chapter 2, they are pragmatic social services in response to humanitarian crises. They are in themselves valuable. However, the literature seeks to confirm that HP’s

948 While it might work in Cambodia, it is an inhibitive modality in HP. Available: https://www.heifer.org/search.html?q=passing+on+the+gifs&submit= (accessed 15 May 2017)
951 Thomson, *Bonjour*, p.107
952 Zanotti, ‘Cacophonies’, *Third*, p.760
dependency on these aid-relief modalities has become a tool of economic disempowerment in the grand scheme of palliative economics.

*Se Débrouiller* - In the functionality of aid-dependency, *se débrouiller* implies an aid-driven activity, with no inherent economic worth, treated as a business investment, and therefore, yields negligible improvement to the welfare of the poor. That is to say, the hope of fundamental change dissipated as the impoverished *se débrouillent* in inappropriate aid-based business models [food-for-work] from which labour paternalism actively distanced itself but functionally supported.

These aid-modalities have contributed to transform and maintain HP into a church of small skilled entrepreneurs who have subscribed to a work-routine, yielding, often, unsatisfactory and frustrating economic outcomes. Small skilled entrepreneurs have been those who *se débrouillent* industriously.

Whether it has been time, money, skills, resources or participation which typified the investment model, *se débrouiller* has conditioned Protestants to a culture of time waste which of course let evaporate opportunities to affect given disempowering crises with effective transformational schemes. On this point Corbett and Fikkert note:

> Our concern is not just that these methods are wasting human, spiritual, financial, and organizational resources but that these methods are exacerbating the very problems they are trying to solve.

Timothy Schwartz endorses the argument in this account:

> I could tell about all these failed projects and most bizarre of all, I could tell the same stories several times over for they have been repeated in Jean Makout and throughout Haiti for over half a century: The same projects, often in the same places, and always with the same result, failure. But the point is not simply the waste. The waste was bad. It was a foregone opportunity to

---

954 For example, when education and family relations are not readily available to help to achieve social mobility, quick fix businesses substitute. Consequently, there is an increasing number of people who constitute an informal fledgling economy system, predominantly struggling for social mobility. Wah, *A la*, p.100
955 Wah, *A la*, p.81
956 Corbett & Fikkert, *When*, p.28
turn back the crisis. Worse, however, was the impact of the waste, for it seemed to be causing many of the problems.\textsuperscript{957} 

Taken together, the practice of \textit{se débrouiller} has been economically unproductive, yet, conscientiously appeasing to FMD agents in the hope of generating dividends to a nation of \textit{débrouillards}.\textsuperscript{958} Haiti’s context suggests that the hope of fundamental change has not yet resulted from those who \textit{se débrouillent} with an aid-driven gesture as a symbol of hope. This failed to capitalize the business vision of \textit{débrouillards} in their quest for in-depth transformation. \textit{Se débrouiller} has been practiced at two micro-levels of subsistence living, namely (a) tokenism and (b) rhetoric.

\textit{a. Tokenism}

By tokenism, I mean a well-packaged financial grant, with little economic and market value. This is derived from FMDs’ knowledge paternalism and is given transiently to those severely affected by socio-economic deprivation. In this practice, tokenism assuages FMDs’ consciences and temporarily enhances their image locally.

Despite the tokenistic nature attributed to aid-positivity in this context, the disempowered have been kept busy, they \textit{se débrouillent} with nothing to show for it, except more of the socio-economic recurrences which, beforehand, justified their need for and acceptance of tokenism. Worse still, in this modality they have become targets of ‘disaster capitalism’, that is, an economic strategy in which the economical poor have been exploited to benefit capital interest in many ways.\textsuperscript{959}

\textsuperscript{957} Schwartz, \textit{Travesty}, Kindle Location 1131
\textsuperscript{958} Whoever \textit{se débrouille} is a \textit{débrouillard}. Wah, \textit{À la}, p.99
b. Rhetoric

By rhetoric, I mean projects of varying types, requested, amended and approved by FMDs’ knowledge paternalism, which when thoroughly scrutinized in the light of locally expressed needs, socio-cultural and religious sensitivities and socio-political instability, aim to yield no sustainable gains for the poor. Equally appropriate to the term rhetoric have been the enticingly appealing project titles, namely ‘building back better’, ‘rehabilitation project’, ‘make Haiti an emerging country by 2030’ and ‘hope for Haiti now’. They have formed the fabric of FP’s and FMDs’ rhetoric in the name of aid-positivity. The question, then, is: are those word-based enticing project titles competently conceived to appeal to FMDs’ donors? On this Freeman advises ‘Most surprisingly, NGOs have failed to live to their buzzwords so often associated with them – despite the rhetoric and the intentions’.

Aid as wealth to the impoverished empowers. On the contrary, aid-dependency which constantly yields, through the se débrouiller economic model, socio-economic stagnancy, results in disempowering and disenfranchising mission. This invites my reflexivity to reconsider the economic worth of aid-driven practices which were meant to be a lifeline in HP. Rather, they have, for years, become, HP’s dependable life breath. Again, in the absence of the application of the tools of practical theology to help to scrutinize FMDs’ performances, the suggestion is that FMDs’ paternalistic practices and aid-modalities within HP have constantly nurtured, even unintentionally, aid-dependency as a tool of economic disempowerment.

961 MDC-HMC2017
964 See ADPR2
965 Freeman, ‘The Pentecostal’, in Pentecostal, p.9
Conclusion

The current Lens emphasizes that FMDs’ paternalistic practices and aid-modalities have persistently shaped and dominated the ontology and ecclesiology of HP. As such, it further strengthens TCII’s and TCIII’s aid-dependency’s features. Moreover, it confirms that FP/FMDs have not yet inhabited Haiti’s indigenized know-how to legitimate its activities as empowering. Meanwhile, perennial costs of economic disempowerment, consistently increased by onerous tools of economic disempowerment - paternalistic practices and inhibitive aid-modalities - transform HP into a community of débrouillards. Despite some contradictory views, it would seem that FMDs’ poverty-alleviation attempts rather inhibit in-depth socio-economic transformation.

5.4 Fourth Lens:

For all FMDs’ aid-work in Haitian Protestantism the outcome is consistently overshadowed by a disempowering culture of silence which inhibits poverty-alleviation initiatives

Introduction

In practice, FMDs have inhabited the role of transforming agency in HP for which they have demonstrated renewed interests and competencies. This role purported to buttress poverty-alleviation not least to help to dissipate, alongside HP, a perennial culture of silence. I emphasize here that silence is a root cause, a manifestation of disempowerment. For example, from this portfolio I gather evidence as follows: ESRs lived in total silence, de-forestation has ‘engulfed Haiti in a culture of silence’, and paternalistic practices have silenced ‘front-line staff’. Ironically, in the church, FMDs’ ‘doctrinal conviction has silenced the voice of

966 See ‘Historical Narrative 2’, p.64
967 See ‘Aid-dependency in St. Domingue’, p.41
968 See ‘Trade Deals’, p.46
969 Schuller, Mèt, p.3
prophetic mission’. Additionally, aid-dependency’s practices have silenced ‘the voice of advocacy’ and ‘local leaderships’. A critical theological analysis of this transforming role reveals that, owing to limited competency in understanding the Haitian context, FMDs have not yet enabled HP to achieve its missional goal to empower, that is, to ‘give a voice to the silent majority’. 

In fact, since HP’s official birth-year in 1817, FP/FMDs of familiar sending nations have remained as unchanged as HP’s poverty conditions and culture of silence have remained active. As such, Easterly argues: ‘Many problems were created by colonizers’ incompetence as by their exploitation’.

First, the task of examining FMDs’ competency is self-imposing. A scrutiny of FMDs’ competency does not, by any means, seek to disregard the positive outcomes of foreign missionaries’ engagement in HP. In fact, it is a premise of the research to endorse it. In given circumstances, they have almost ventured to share holistic mission from positions of vulnerability in HP’s space. Their own survival and the implantation and consolidation of their mission works required great levels of proficiency. As noted in the literature review, the implantation of Protestantism and its survival in the Haitian climate must be commendably ascribed to missionaries’ keen optimism and proactive intentionality.

970 ADQ3
971 ADQ33
972 MDC-HMC1979
973 James, Democratic, p.174
974 Easterly, The White, p.239
976 See ‘FMDs’ Legacy’, p.181
Their competency attracted the displeasure of politicians,\(^{977}\) the affirmation of the community\(^{978}\) and the consistent support of their home churches, permitting them, in many cases, prolonged stays of up to 40 and 37 years in particular cases.\(^{979}\) They have witnessed or heard missionary colleagues die, in horrendous climatic conditions, of yellow and typhoid fevers.\(^{980}\) The deadliest earthquake in Haiti in 2010 took away the lives of missionary colleagues. Others suffered hearing the cries of their compatriots trapped under the rubble for hours.\(^{981}\) Despite the situation of poverty in the mission field and their individual suffering, missionaries did not refrain from physically embracing and committedly serving in HP’s space. Whether as foreign survivors or new missionaries they refused to let their love for Haiti die. Participants echoed their understanding of this sacrifice: ‘Aid-providers do not depend on our aid; instead we depend on theirs. They jump to help out of love’.\(^{982}\) Zanotti confirms:

> Today, *Zanmi Lasante* ranks as one of the largest nongovernmental health care providers in Haiti - and the only provider of comprehensive primary care, regardless of ability to pay, for more than half a million impoverished people living in the mountainous Central Plateau.\(^{983}\)

Globally, in particular circumstances, foreign missionaries reacted in disgust at the news of Gatu’s moratorium on Missionaries in the 1970s. They received it as an unfortunate distraction to what they considered to be the real work of mission, that is, the vocation to communicate the whole Gospel in and to the whole world.\(^{984}\) For the average FMDs, sharing competencies within the lives of Africans [Haitians] has been conceived as a fulfilling adventure.

\(^{977}\) British missionaries, James Catts and John Brown, were forced to leave Haiti during a church persecution which targeted their ministries. *Pressoir, Le Protestantisme* (1945), pp.98-103


\(^{981}\) ADL19

\(^{982}\) ADFG2

\(^{983}\) Zanotti, ‘Cacophonies’, *Third*, p.762

On the contrary, the lack of proficiency I discuss has been encapsulated in FMDs’ ignorance of local-conditions. Owing to their limited competency, their zeal and conviction for transformation have been outweighed by negligible aid-spending in three core areas of HP’s culture of silence.\textsuperscript{985} By this I refer to (1) disempowering silence of local theologies, (2) disempowering socio-political silence, and (3) disempowering silence of non-literacy. Again, these cultures of silence are a manifestation of disempowerment in interaction within aid-dependency. In support of the central hypothesis, I therefore argue that the outcome of FMDs’ aid-work has consistently been eclipsed by a culture of silence which inhibited poverty-alleviation initiatives in HP’s space.

5.4.1 Disempowering Silence of Local Theologies

In the literature review, Tremblay and Louis refer to ‘Haitian theology’, and ‘socio-cultural subjectivity’.\textsuperscript{986} Participants provided similar concepts, in fact, argued that donors’ rules do not ‘always match [our] socio-religious and contextual realities’\textsuperscript{987} and sometimes donors ‘don’t care about our religious needs’.\textsuperscript{988} These conceptual realities define an understanding of local theologies in HP’s space.

Evidence shows that these theologies have been characterized by both ancestral [African-Indian] and Christian [European-American] theologies.\textsuperscript{989} Africans sold to slavery, later to become Haitians, lost all but their spirituality.\textsuperscript{990} On their arrival in the new land, they turned to Voodoo, their ancestral faith tradition, to embattle against the dehumanising ideology and

\textsuperscript{985} Negligible aid-spending has also been noted in other areas of disempowering silences, namely disempowering silence of de-forestation and disempowering silence of low self-esteem. pp.260-261
\textsuperscript{986} Tremblay, \textit{Mères}, pp.18-25; Louis, Voodoo, pp.104-118
\textsuperscript{987} ADQ14
\textsuperscript{988} ADQ6
\textsuperscript{990} ‘Religion is perhaps all that remains for the voiceless poor of Haiti: the spirits of far-away Africa’. Thomson, \textit{Bonjour}, p.36
[European] theology of slavery. From this understanding, local theologies have become a symbiotic syncretism which transcends Voodoo theology yet have mostly been influenced by Voodoo traditions.

Pragmatically, according to local theologies, ‘Sickness and death are seldom thought to be due to natural causes’, ‘He who has much wealth is assumed to use evil means’, and some trees, mountains and rivers are held in divine respect. Local theologies do not conceive socio-economic development in isolation as if matter and spirit, interlaced in unity, were antithetical to development. An excerpt from ADPR12 explains:

The peasants relied on a basically super-naturalistic interpretation of their environment, believing that crop failure, droughts and flood are manifestations of the anger of neglected spirits or of the envy of some neighbour. Proper offerings can secure success in economic and amorous ventures.

The natural and supernatural are real and influential in understanding economic mobility in Haiti. In contrast to European-American development practices, typical Africans [Haitians] do hardly commit themselves to any proposal for human action, politically, economically, socially, and otherwise until they are mentally satisfied with the religious undercurrents of such proposals. Casséus tells his readers that nothing happened in Haiti without the permission of

---

991 See ‘Feature 3’, p.68
992 ‘Vaudoux [Voodoo] is so inextricably woven in with every side of Haytian’s life, his politics, his religion, his outlook upon the world, his social and family relations, his prejudices and peculiarities that he cannot be judged apart from it’. Hesketh-Prichard, Where, p.99. ‘Every Haitian is a Voodooist, in one way or another. The Haitian population is constituted of 70% Roman Catholics, 30% Protestants, but 100% Voodooists’. However, Casséus objects, arguing that authentic Christians are not Voodooists but a ‘new creation’ in Christ (2 Cor. 5.17).
994 Peters, La Croix, p.189; ADPR12. The mapou tree, for example, known in English as either a silk-cotton tree or a Ceiba tree, represents the Voodooists’ connection to the spirits which inhabit the tree. While Christian practices abhor such belief, they acknowledge its socio-religious significance. Also available: http://thehaitianblogger.blogspot.com/2010/01/sacred-avatar-hometree-is-mapou-tree-in.html; and https://www.haitiom.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/10/Health-care-beliefs-and-Voodoo.pdf (accessed 24 July 2017). Other natural symbols are treated with reverence as sanctuaries of ‘spirits’. For a similar view from an African perspective, see Harries, Vulnerable, pp.205-206
995 ADPR12
996 Harries, Vulnerable, pp.205-207. See also John S. Mbiti, African Religions and Philosophy (Garden City, NY: Doubleday Anchor, 1970); Auvinen-Pontinen & Jørgensen, Mission, p.87

225
the supernatural.\textsuperscript{997} This understanding has been real for both Christian and Voodoo adherents. For example, success in any Haitian business, micro-credit initiatives and farming enterprises, has been attributed to the Lord in Church or the \textit{Grand Maître} [Great Master] in Voodoo. Failure then, for Christians, has been interpreted as the fruit of witchcraft, Voodoo fetishes and invisible malefic forces; or, for Voodooists and Christians, it has been, reticently, interpreted as being the will of God.\textsuperscript{998} According to Fontus, these theological pragmatisms have found sustained resonance in Haitian socio-religious subjectivities.\textsuperscript{999}

However, successive teams of FMDs and a dominant cohort of Protestant leaders have not fully understood and tolerated local theologies.\textsuperscript{1000} Because local theologies are predominantly Voodoo-driven, FDMs’ and HP’s limited ability to accommodate them has led to their criticisms and ultimate rejection of Voodoo. Prichard singles out the reason for the rejection: ‘The perpetuation of a cult so degrading must have its source deep in the character of the race’.\textsuperscript{1001} As a result, a culture of silence about local theologies had disempowered Voodooists and conditioned Voodoo to be practised in secrecy, most times in the night, until it became official in 1987.\textsuperscript{1002}

The implication has been such that no church funding, no NGO’s [Christian or non-Christian] educational programme has ever been invested in the understanding and transformation of local theologies which subsume and influence Haiti’s wider socio-religious understanding of development.\textsuperscript{1003} Rather, campaigns of eradication and an imposed silence of local theologies

\textsuperscript{997} Casséus, Éléments, pp.39-41
\textsuperscript{998} Casséus, Éléments, p.73
\textsuperscript{999} Fontus, Les Églises, pp.78-85
\textsuperscript{1000} Hesketh-Prichard, Where, p.110
\textsuperscript{1001} Hesketh-Prichard, Where, p.99
have become purposefully normative at the expense of that transformation. In fact, HP [Haitian Catholicism as well], since its birth, has been psychologically equipped to fight Voodoo with a view to silencing the voice of local theologies\textsuperscript{1004} which, I emphasize, are ironically Voodoo- and church-rooted.\textsuperscript{1005}

The belief that Haitian religious subjectivities have not required any productive and developmental considerations has been to the demise of HP’s development initiatives. Casséus further advises that these subjectivities have been disruptive, and unless redeemed, and not vilified, the socio-economic life of Haitians will consistently be delayed.\textsuperscript{1006} Precisely, inherent to FMDs’ tutelage has been the lack of urgency to help to effectuate change to this syncretic religious subjectivity. Rather, their message and action aimed to eradicate local theologies by silencing Voodoo. Thus, Haiti’s socio-religious ontology has resisted trusting in aid-instrumentality as FMDs’ imported choice to fight against material poverty. An aid-led development initiative would be more effective if it were to be transformative of, and sensitive to, the residue of African-Indian and European-American theology which has dominated local theologies.

Stretching the point further, there has been much in common between FMDs’ missed opportunities in HP’s and FP’s waste of timely opportunities in church and secular society for large-scale transformation as both have neglected to factor into their poverty-eradication initiatives purposeful engagements with and redemption of Haitian theologies. As such, they have been unable to give a voice to a silent majority, and this has been an inevitable cause of disempowerment.

\textsuperscript{1004} The 1685 Code Noir [black law] prohibited the practice of Voodoo in the colony. Desmangles, The Faces, p.25
\textsuperscript{1005} Casséus, Éléments, pp.68-70; Louis, Voodoo, pp.40-115
\textsuperscript{1006} Casséus, Éléments, pp.98-99
This culture of sustained silence within Haiti’s faith sector has been exploited for political expediency and provided an environment for the prevalence of a socio-political silence.

5.4.2 Disempowering Socio-political Silence

Reference to socio-political silence evokes, in particular, the brutal dictatorship of the Duvalier regime and its total control of the Haitian religious systems. Hurbon explains:

It is essential to understand that the Duvalier regime is the outcome of a petrifying government, that is, the enactment of an internal praxis which disaffects individuals and structures alike and transforms its citizens into a population of enslaved people.

In reference to religious systems, I start with the Voodoo element. As a persecuted and silenced minority, Voodoo had not yet been legally conferred any institutionalised status, thereby having no official headship. Francois Duvalier epitomized, in his regime, its aspirations for political gain. Subsequently, the regime made Haitian Catholicism, through the Concordat and Voodoo, subservient to Duvalier’s Négritude ideology. According to Farmer, from 1969 onward, Haitian Catholicism’s decision-making processes revolved around the perpetuation of the regime to the detriment of Haiti’s welfare.

Protagonists and adherents to this Négritude ideology objected to such criticisms being levelled against the Duvalier regime since it epitomized their aspirations which aimed to give a voice

---

1007 The regime (1957-1986) was the product of cynical, ruthless, and dictatorial leaders [father, Francois and son, Jean-Claude] whose ambitions consisted of gathering maximal wealth and power to themselves, their families and associates. In attempting to neutralise opposing forces, the Duvaliers brutally arrested, killed or exiled militants. Consequently, the entire population was terrified, further impoverished, disenfranchised and kept non-literate. Nicholls, *From*, pp.212-221
1008 Hurbon, *Comprendre*, p.16
1009 Wah, *A la*, pp.68-69
1011 The Concordat conferred headship of Haitian Catholicism to Duvalier with power to appoint and dismiss members of the clergy. Farmer, *The Uses*, p.112
1013 Farmer, *The Uses*, pp.112-115
to the disempowered majority. They argued that since ‘The sovereignty of a ruling clique’ has usurped the benefits of a black-led Haitian revolution, the Duvalier regime emerged to epitomize ‘black oligarchy’ as a substitute for ‘mulatto oligarchy’.\textsuperscript{1014} According to the Négritude ideology, the ‘mulatto oligarchy’ was the real enemy of the people.\textsuperscript{1015} Not only had Haiti to be governed by Blacks to reflect the country’s majority, it had to be governed by a charismatic and autocratic black leader since liberalism was a ‘white and mulatto’ political system.\textsuperscript{1016}

While from a religious perspective, Duvalier’s autocratic regime, as expected by black protagonists, took control of Haitian Catholicism and Voodoo, politically, it turned, with time, against the black electorate, the non-literate Voodoo and Catholic peasants, and therefore corrupted the Négritude ideology into Noirisme which black intellectuals championed as black bigotry.\textsuperscript{1017} In this culture of socio-political silence, Farmer notes that ‘It was a dark time for the Catholic Church, and the people abandoned it, often for evangelical Protestantism, in droves’.\textsuperscript{1018}

HP epitomized hope for Haitians in their thirst for self-actualisation and protection from Satan’s deadly arrows and Duvalier’s brutality. Reaching HP in numbers was akin to reaching the kingdom of God - a highly spiritualised kingdom. However, this religion-state regime in its consciousness divided Haiti into two polarised communities. They are (1) the adherents of the

\textsuperscript{1014} De Saint-Rémy, ‘La République’, \textit{Revue}, pp.315-334
\textsuperscript{1015} There is another argument which supports the Haitian elites as chief local job providers. Their lack of involvement in Haiti’s socio-economic life would precipitate the collapse of the Haitian economy. Ridgeway, \textit{The Haiti}, pp.27-41. However, Leybrun argues that a minority mulatto elite has silenced the black majority in order to maintain their wealth and power for nearly a century. Their involvement has been more about the consolidation of their wealth. James G. Leybrun, \textit{The Haitian People} (London: Yale University Press, 1966), p.ix
\textsuperscript{1017} Available: \url{http://www.genocidewatch.org/haiti.html} (accessed 10 February 2015)
\textsuperscript{1018} Farmer, \textit{The Uses}, p.112
regime, a community thriving on fear, torture, imprisonment, corruption and a slave-driven mentality and (2) the governed, including HP, brutally treated, by the adherents of the regime, as communists, thus, labelled as ‘anti-Duvalierist’ and anti-patriotic. The implication was that HP, for fear of reprisal, opted out completely of a proactive political life and sunk, like Haitian Catholicism and Voodoo, into a state of social unconsciousness in a deep silence.  

HP could not cultivate the noble practice of engaging and becoming conversant with the entire society, either in worship or in public spheres, on matters of in-depth social transformation. This, inevitably, would be construed to mean a change of regime; it would be silenced if it did not remain silent. The then social attitude resulted in the increasing number of Protestants existing in a culture of silence. Thus, the vitality and the outward witness of a growing Protestant movement, more inclined towards the primacy of evangelical proclamation, had dissipated, giving an option to HP to turn inward in a maintenance mode. Consequently, as far as it was possible to discern, in order to survive, ecclesiology in HP had softened its missional, biblical, social and political edge and could only afford, at best, to generate peripheral changes at the expense of large-scale systemic transformation.

I go back to the subject of aid-dependency to emphasize my argument in this Lens. The Duvalier era is crucial in understanding HP’s aid-driven context. During that period HP began experiencing numerical expansion. Equally, within that period DA, or aid-for-political expediency, reached an unprecedented rise. FP’s aid-instrumentality supported the Duvaliers while FMDs’ aid-work simply kept HP afloat in palliative care, yet, engulfed in a culture of sustained silence.

---

1019 There have been Protestant leaders both foreign and local who refused to accept the prevailing reign of terror predicated by the Duvalier regime. However, their positions did not epitomize HP’s overall advocacy. Griffiths, A View, p.88

1020 Given the geographical proximity of Cuba, a communist state, to Haiti, the US supported the Duvalier regime, particularly Jean-Claude’s, in its determination to fight communist ideologies in Haiti. Abbot, Haiti, pp.148, 153 & 170-171; Farmer, The Uses, pp.109-110
The long-term effect of this socio-political silence, akin to the ESRs’ silence in the colonial period, has affected the mentality of Haitians and conditioned Protestants to retreat. Rocourt insists that ‘It has often been necessary for the Protestant Haitian to retreat into himself or even to become anonymous in order to survive’. On current evidence, this had clouded HP’s vision and impeded its self-worth, orthopraxis and patriotic responsibility. Despite FMDs’ aid-work, again, according to Casséus, this has resulted in in-depth social witness being removed from the psyche of HP which has gradually become a marginalised, disempowered church. Despite its sporadic resistance, HP has consistently been unable to exercise its true role as salt and light. To the extent that I can present an accurate picture of the socio-political conjecture, FMDs’ aid-work simply endorsed HP’s culture of socio-political absenteeism.

On balance, it appears, that the pragmatic aid-based social services concurred with the non-existence of a socio-political engagement and precluded the inculcation of a growth culture, an economic aspiration and dignity of social humanity to thereby transform society, sociopolitically. Synthesising the main points indicates that HP’s current reality has been both a pro-numerical-growth church entity and a foreign aid-dependent institution. In this reality, it has equally been unable to help to generate life’s quality in terms of socio-economic and political viability.

The literary evidence suggests that in this culture of socio-political absenteeism and in response to a sustained socio-political culture of silence, socio-economic unconsciousness has become normative for local and foreign missionaries. I, therefore, argue that the outcome of FMDs’ aid-work is consistently overshadowed by a disempowering culture of socio-political silence. It has been in this sustained culture of silence that Haitian children have been educated.

1021 Rocourt, ‘The Challenge’ in Mitchell, With Eyes, p.75
1022 Casséus, Haiti, pp.95-96
1023 See TCIII, p.78
Inevitably, another strand of silence emerged, gripping the educational sector, to further disempower future generations.

**5.4.3 Disempowering Silence of Non-literacy**

As with the Duvalier regime, over the years, successive Haitian governments have failed to recognise the inefficiency of their marred educational system which has marginalized many generations of youth.\(^{1024}\) Critics of the system note that Haiti’s educational, political and socio-economic institutions have perpetrated a poor literacy culture through a system of caricature [grotesque] education.\(^{1025}\) The suggestion is that the system is capable of preserving and reinforcing disempowering structures of silence which suit the aspirations of an elite political minority, locally and internationally.\(^{1026}\)

Regarding quality,\(^{1027}\) the educational system has promoted intense memorization of information some of which is transferred into knowledge but little into an educational denominator for critical thinking.\(^{1028}\) It has confined its strategy in the pedagogy of reading and writing through un-adapted and dis-articulated methodologies.\(^{1029}\)

\(^{1024}\) However, King Henry Christophe (1811-1820) initiated public reforms in education in Haiti. He reckoned that Haitians needed to be educated, indeed transformed, before they could truly be independent. Dubois, *Haiti*, pp.52-53. For Christophe’s education reform, see: D. Heinl & N. Heinl, *Written*, p.147; Clément, ‘History’, *Revista*, pp.141-181


\(^{1026}\) This is not unique to Haiti. The Caribbean governments and churches have adopted and perpetuated an educational system, designed to ensure an unrelenting intellectual, cultural and aesthetic dependency on foreign values and attitudes. However, Cuba’s educational system has opted out. Patrick P. Hylton, *The Role of Religion in Caribbean History* (Washington: Billpops Publications, 2002), pp.113-115

\(^{1027}\) Haitian education is renowned to be of a dismal quality. Bourjolly, Féthièrie & Toussaint, ‘Système’ in Pierre (ed.), *Construction*, p.319; Buss & Gardner, *Haiti*, p.11. However, by the 1950s, Haitian Catholicism established prestigious schools and was at the helm of quality education in the country. Hylton, *The Role*, p.110; Bellegarde, *La Résistance*, pp.91-113

\(^{1028}\) Fontus, *Les Églises*, p.45

\(^{1029}\) Sabine Manigat, ‘Éducation pour des Citoyens Égaux’ in Buteau, Saint-Éloi & Trouillot, *Refonder*, pp.185-189; ADQ3
Certain observers, however, argue that, given Haiti’s current low-literacy rate, it would be strategically better to promote literacy, reaching Haitians in numbers, than to be concerned with quality education.\textsuperscript{1030} This criticism has been popularly supported and helpful except that, on literary evidence, non-literacy and poor literacy are not the required vehicle of socio-economic development Haiti needs.\textsuperscript{1031}

Furthermore, Haiti is theoretically not a bilingual country as a tiny minority speak French.\textsuperscript{1032} The use of French text-books and the French language as the principal linguistic vehicle of learning, at every level in the educational system, has been a setback to an indigenous educational success.\textsuperscript{1033} It has made the majority of students ‘cultural aliens’ in their own context.\textsuperscript{1034} Meanwhile, Creole was forbidden in schools, students have been ashamed of their own speech and, therefore, a culture of silence reigned in most classrooms.\textsuperscript{1035}

From gathered literary evidence, the system has failed to inculcate into students’ minds in-depth knowledge; the relevant tools to critically assess and transform their immanent world.\textsuperscript{1036} It has neither fully developed the innovative spirit nor the enterprising ability of the students to advocate for their rights. It is perhaps fair to claim that it has therefore accommodated silence as an aspiration, deprived students of self-determination and the ability to think for themselves.

\textsuperscript{1031} ‘Currently, the majority of Haitians lack access to quality education; a prerequisite for sustained social and economic development’. Available: https://www.usaid.gov/haiti/education (accessed 10 May 2015)
\textsuperscript{1032} For a debate on the importance of Creole in Haitian education, see F. Zephir, ‘Challenges and opportunities for Haitian Creole’, available: https://doi-org.manchester.idm.oclc.org/10.1515/ijsl-2014-0055, (accessed 14 May 2017)
\textsuperscript{1034} Jean, \textit{A Quand}, p.19. Through this educational system, the intellectual Haitians (mulatto and black) have become ‘colonised French’ and ‘superficial and futile minds’ rising against their social and national milieu. Jean-Jacques Honorat, \textit{Enquête sur le Développement} (Port-au-Prince: Imprimerie Centrale, 1974), p.249
It has led to a culture of disempowerment where many students leave school without the ability or conviction to speak out for real socio-political transformation.

Unwittingly, the educational arm of HP, apart from a few self-sufficient schools,\textsuperscript{1037} is embedded within this educational environment.\textsuperscript{1038} I go back to emphasize a point. The Article explained, ‘Schools have been as widely dispersed as Protestant church buildings’,\textsuperscript{1039} RAED noted ‘the Protestant church owns 43 percent of primary schools’\textsuperscript{1040} and ‘Compassion’s aid means education for children’.\textsuperscript{1041} Literary evidence suggests that for all FMDs’ aid-sponsored education, the outcome has consistently been overshadowed by a culture of silence which inhibits the vocalization of advocacy in public spheres. Parallel to palliative economics, the silence of non-literacy presents itself as the result of palliative education.

Furthermore, quantitative data suggests that the prevalence of a normative culture of children living as \textit{restavèk}\textsuperscript{1042} has partly contributed to the nation’s high non-literacy and poor literacy rate. In 2002, the number of children subjected to this disguised child slavery varied from 200,000 to 400,000.\textsuperscript{1043} Their right to quality education has been violated, as has the right of generations of Haitians to think critically and publicly. Meanwhile FMDs’ sponsorship programmes have hand-picked selected children as if FP and FMDs have the goodwill not the

\textsuperscript{1037} Certain Schools - Collège Méthodiste de Frères, Collège Bird, Collège Harry Brackman and Collège Modèle du Cap - can afford to pay tuition fees and therefore are not foreign-aid dependent. ADPR9 and reports from ‘Bureau de l’Église Méthodiste d’Haïti pour l’Éducation’ in MDC-HMC2010-2017
\textsuperscript{1038} Hylton, \textit{The Role}, p.110
\textsuperscript{1039} Louis, \textit{Voodoo}, p.213; Fontus, \textit{Les Églises}, p.96
\textsuperscript{1040} ADLI8
\textsuperscript{1041} ADFG2
\textsuperscript{1042} The Creole word \textit{restavèk} comes from two French words \textit{rester} (stay) and \textit{avec} (with). \textit{Restavèk} is a type of child fostering service in which impoverished families let go of their children to ‘stay with’ friends, very often to fulfil domestic duties. It is practised under no specific legislation and therefore is vulnerable to human rights abuses, including the right to education. Bourjolly, Féthière & Toussaint, ‘Système’ in Pierre (ed.), \textit{Construction}, p.314; Jean R. Cadet, \textit{Restavec, From Haitian Slave Child to Middle-Class American, an Autobiography} (Texas: The University of Texas Press, 1998), pp.4-5
\textsuperscript{1043} Aristide, \textit{Child}, p.92
financial capability to help to dissipate, holistically, alongside the locals, the silence of non-literacy and poor literacy in Haiti.

Empirical evidence is lacking from HP’s *telos* vis-à-vis the orthopraxis of a sustained non-literacy-eradication campaign.\(^{1044}\) FMDs’ misreading of large numbers of functionally poor literate people and significantly high percentages of non-literate *restavèk* and other children has conditioned its aid-work to hand-pick schools at the expense of a national literacy campaign. This makes it possible to argue that FMDs’ aid-work in education has therefore been consistently overshadowed by the disempowering silence of non-literacy. In brief, non-literacy is incompatible with empowerment themes.\(^{1045}\)

**Conclusion**

Fanon warns African countries [including Haiti] against embracing western models of development. Precisely, according to this Lens, these models tend to silence national theologies and support a culture of political disempowerment for political-expediency. While in palliative education the models have supported many children, they have equally disempowered the critical thinking of generations of students. They do not command the competency for empowerment that HP requires. Neither does FMDs’ aid-work gain the trust to help to generate such an outcome. Fanon concludes that ‘If we want humanity [Haiti] to advance a step farther,

---

1044 Since McConnell’s literacy campaign, sporadic literacy campaigns have later been carried out. For example, in 2002 the Haitian government spearheaded a campaign. This involved 30,000 literacy monitors and the distribution of 700,000 literacy manuals. However, Haiti’s non-literacy rate stood, in 2006, at 47 percent. ‘Profile’, https://www.marines.mil/Portals/59/Publications/Haiti%20Profile.pdf?ver=2012-10-11-163238-907. More precisely, adult non-literate rate has been reduced to 39.3 percent during 1982-2015. Available: https://knoema.com/atlas/Haiti/topics/Education/Literacy/Adult-literate-rate (accessed 23 July 2017). However, these percentages of non-literacy do not include percentages of poor literacy. Cassèus, *Éléments*, p.124. The problem of non-literacy and poor literacy has been perennial. For example, four Heads of States were non-literate and poorly literate: Jean Jacques Dessalines, Henry Christophe, Faustin Soulouque and Jean-Baptiste Riché. However, non-literacy and poor literacy inhibit poverty-alleviation and are therefore antithetical to socio-economic development. Dorsainville, *Histoire d’Haïti* (Port-au-Prince: Henry Deschamps, 1942), pp.109, 114-118 & 139
1045 Cassèus, *Éléments*, p.115
if we want to bring it up to a different level than that which Europe has shown it, then we must 
invent, and we must make discoveries’.\textsuperscript{1046}

The interplay and the scrutiny of the four Lenses of the hypothesis generate additional features 
to demonstrate how complexified the nature of aid-dependency is. Aid-dependency arguably 
emerges as a by-product of FP’s costs of socio-economic, commercial and political 
disempowerment. Wealth extraction from Haiti, debt-crisis, palliative economics, and poverty 
crystallization in Section One lay the foundation for complexified expressions of 
disempowerment in Section Two in an entrenched culture of silence [current Lens]. Positive 
accounts of aid [Second Lens] do not fruitfully co-exist with aid-dependency’s costs [First 
Lens] and tools [Third Lens] of socio-economic disempowerment because they pragmatically 
halt, through paternalistic theories and practices, and opportunity wasting, transforming 
mission. Therefore, the portfolio acknowledges contrasting views on the root causes and 
effectiveness of aid-dependency. However, because aid-dependency is another kind of poverty 
and poverty-alleviation schemes inhibit self-sufficiency, collective aid-effectiveness is a mere 
illusion in HP [Second Lens].

In Section Three I will dwell on the significance of shaping the Haitian church of the future 
and Core Theme D. ‘Alternative responses’ in order to explore a counter-narrative which 
potentially empowers.

\textsuperscript{1046} Fanon, \textit{The Wretched}, p.254
Section Three: Shaping the Church of the Future Towards Self-sufficiency

Chapter 6. A Dreamed Church

What Ought to be Going on in Haitian Protestantism?
Normative Task

Introduction

The descriptive-empirical and interpretative tasks of the pastoral cycle generate a central hypothesis to describe the socio-economic, religious and political dynamics which, from a Methodist perspective, underpin aid-dependency’s practices in Haitian society. The hypothesis is examined, discussed and confirmed in dialogue with empirical factors and an expanded pool of published literature which gave a global context to such a perspective. It is now fitting, in coherence with my earlier indication, that I return, in this Section, to the pastoral cycle to engage both the normative and pragmatic tasks in quest of theological insights and transformational responses to aid-dependency’s modalities.

Accordingly, this Chapter addresses the question: what ought to be happening in HP? or what should be the normative characteristics of an empowering church, called to prophetically redeem the past of its failures? Arising from this, the reflection is built on HP’s spiritual capacity, notwithstanding aid-dependency’s disempowering costs, to critically revisit its past and inspire future practices in the belief that HP will avoid a repeat of the past. The reflection envisages the re-imagination of a theological engagement which affords opportunities for shared responsibility and transformation in response to what constituted Sections One and Two.

Section Three enables this re-imagination in the following: (1) theological imperative, (2) theological scrutiny, and (3) theological vision.
6.1 Theological Imperative

A substantial pivot of this re-imagination encompasses the theological imperative as revealed in the Scriptures and entrusted to Judeo-Christians. In the Judeo-Christian tradition, the Scriptures affirm generous giving as follows: ‘There will always be poor people in the land. Therefore, I command you to be openhanded towards your fellow Israelites who are poor and needy in your land’ (Deut. 15:11). This is closely predicated on ‘There need be no poor people among you’ (Deut. 15:4). The theological imperative is ‘therefore be generous to the poor’.

Whenever Judeo-Christian believers complied with this imperative by being openhanded towards each other (Acts 2:42-47), the Scriptures further affirm ‘There were no needy persons among them’ (Acts 4:34). Embedded in this imperative is the urgency to empower God’s people by eradicating poverty. Within the context of HMC, this unwavering imperative underscores the moral and spiritual responsibility of the aid-provider, the civic co-responsibility of the aid-receiver and the continued worth of aid-giving as an expression of that will. The dominant objective is thus summarized, ‘we can eradicate poverty’. This is further supported by Wallis who argues that we should be generous [because] we can end poverty.

In the context of the normative task, God’s will for HP transcends aid-givers’ advocacy which nurtures the heartfelt imperative principle. This principle gives anchorage to the theological mind-set embedded in these words of Christ, ‘The poor you will always have with you’ (Mark 14:7). Taken literally, this mind-set makes the theological imperative of abundant living, through generous giving, a contradiction in God’s economics. These words of Christ ‘The

1049 This is not a suggestion that the church should shelve its poverty-eradication programmes. Miller stresses ‘That, of course, is exactly the opposite of what this text says’. Patrick Miller, *Deuteronomy, Interpretation* (Louisville: John Knox Press, 1990), p.137
poor you will always have with you’ resonate with ‘There will always be poor people in the land’. Their fullest meaning is not graspable in isolation from ‘therefore be openhanded towards the poor’ and the essence of (Acts 2:42-47). In other words, the characteristics of any mission for Haiti ought to be normalized by the theological imperative of poverty-eradication as fulfilled in this context ‘There [will be] no needy persons among them’ (Acts 4:34). An exegesis of this text suggests a pragmatic understanding that is ‘they were all possessors’. The fulfilment of this goal is precisely an antithesis to the post-2000 aid-era.

In addition to ‘they were all possessors’, equality between aid-receivers and aid-providers is proclaimed as an anticipated goal of the Scriptures, that is, the ‘ought-to-be happening’ imperative as recorded in 2 Corinthians 8:14-15. This says, ‘At the present time your plenty will supply what they need, so that in turn their plenty will supply what you need. The goal is equality’.

Realistically, for example, apart from successful cases of the identified victim effect and case-advocacy, there exists no compelling evidence to substantiate this fact: ‘There [are] no needy persons among them’. Neither has there been any evidence to uphold the next obligation, ‘so that in turn their surplus will meet your need’. The constant flow of FMDs, the multiplicity of foreign NGOs and the huge sums of money that have either been spent in Haiti or on behalf of Haiti have not yet empowered HP to be on the sending side of holistic mission in the world church.1051 This further justifies that, so far, FMDs’ wealth surplus has not yet transformed Protestants into ‘possessors’. It worked in the Judeo-Christian community; it is potentially elected to work again today in HP. This ‘ought-to-be-happening’ imperative is a goal of aid-giving, the normative reality, which needs to be the outcome of the positivity of aid in HP.

In brief, here is the imperative formula: ‘There need be no poor people among you’, in response, believers distributed ‘their surplus of [aid/wealth] to meet the need of the poor’. The surplus [of wealth] was distributed and ‘There were no needy persons among [them]’. They were all possessors so that in turn the new [wealth] possessors would meet the need of whoever was poor. This imperative was to behave like the pastoral cycle within the community of believers, that is, as [wealth] possessors meet the need of the poor to become new [wealth] possessors, ‘they can eradicate poverty’ among them.

If we were to apply this formula to HP the process would be as follows: ‘There need be no poor people among you, [Protestants]’. In response, FMDs have intervened and ‘distributed their surplus of [aid/wealth] to meet the need of Protestants’. Surpluses of [aid/wealth] - some of poor quality, delivered in paternalistic modes and tied to aid-modalities - have been distributed, consistently and systematically, for years and ‘There are more needy] persons among [them]’. They have not yet all been possessors so that in turn they can meet the needs of FMDs and whoever is needy. It could be suggested then that if the theological imperative is not yet obeyed, poverty-eradication remains an aspiration.

For the FP’s/FMD’s surplus of aid to yield wealth for HP, an appropriate theological scrutiny is a pre-requisite.

6.2 Theological Scrutiny

The Christian narrative as rooted in missio trinitatis has solicited a thorough scarcity-alleviation response to HP’s socio-economic disempowerment, primarily, in the interest of aid-recipients’ welfare, which FMDs have not yet helped to secure. In God’s evangelical economics, FMDs and HP have been summoned, in the crux of their calling, by the theological narrative, to re-imagine and recreate a type of community in which foreigners and locals, the ‘haves’ and the ‘haves-not’, co-habit in inter-dependency, sharing equally in the provisions of
God’s creation. I have been convinced that this re-imagination can be brought about through pragmatic theological fora which provide safe sanctuaries in which theological aid-led issues are assessed and challenged critically and contextually. On current evidence, FMDs’ missional practices, tied to strings of aid-dependency’s modalities, have not embedded this re-imagination.

Theological trends have inhabited a praxis that has been non-normative to the theological imperative in which practical, Methodist and biblical theologies are grounded. In practical theology, for example, the practices and the modalities of aid-dependency ought to be subject, through the indwelling of the Holy Spirit, to constant scrutiny and the object of theological reflection such that HP’s mission may embody, in its life and ministry, the continuing safeguard of the positivity of aid.1052 This theological requirement, as the divinely ultimate right of every local church and missions, has been hindered by the practice of an imported theology which has been superimposed upon, and equally integrated in, local theologies and has transcended them in paternalistic terms. Theological scrutiny, therefore, evokes this ‘ought-to-be happening’ imperative to be normalized in HP. A Methodist perspective therefore requires that FMDs be accountable to HP which in turn will formulate the right safeguard within which FMDs and HP may give essence to the theological imperative.1053

In fact, the longevity of aid-dependency has signalled the absence of continuous theological reflection to minimize unintended consequences to which FMDs’ praxis, in its limited knowledge of local contexts, has been prone to yielding. Ray Anderson insists that for the church to exist as an end in itself, without a scrutinized missionary praxis, is to sever its connection with the praxis of God’s mission to the world.1054 Swinton suggests that practical

---

1053 See ‘Imported Financial Procedures’, p.157
theology is critical reflection on the actions of the church in the light of the gospel and Christian tradition.\textsuperscript{1055} This suggests that HP is called to normalize an exercise in critical love, pointing to areas requiring transformative redemption with a view to providing aid in a more practical, dignifying and empowering manner.\textsuperscript{1056}

In line with Wesleyan theological principles, scholars note that God is not the prisoner of the spiritual sphere but is active in all of life, healing, feeding, and responding to all sorts of human distresses.\textsuperscript{1057} As such, Wesley saw the Methodist project of ‘spreading scriptural holiness’ as entailing the transformation of economics and politics. The argument is that the failure to instantiate evangelical economics could menace the whole of the holiness project. For Wesley a transformed economics is testimony to the efficacy of grace; an untransformed economics is counterevidence to the gospel. From a Methodist perspective, such transformation must be visible and formalized to be real and must be publicly certifiable to be convincing.\textsuperscript{1058}

The practices of aid-dependency particularly in HMC and largely in HP have been impeded in their objectives to instantiate evangelical economics, and therefore, stand in need of redemption. Jennings makes it clear that a grace that allegedly saves my soul while leaving the concrete and visible relations of my life unaffected is mere illusory, whatever metaphysical compliments we may pay it.\textsuperscript{1059} He further notes that ‘The transformation of the subject which left untouched the very sphere of constant activity, would be an illusory transformation’.\textsuperscript{1060}

Methodist theology entails a new economics of practice that is a dedication of all resources to the wellbeing of the poor because of the theological imperative.\textsuperscript{1061} As driven by love, the

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{1055} Swinton, \textit{From Bedlam}, p.7
\item \textsuperscript{1056} See ‘Third Lens’, p.205
\item \textsuperscript{1057} Jennings, \textit{Good}, pp.48-53; Maddox, \textit{Responsible}, pp.243-247; Oden, \textit{Ethics}, pp.119-128
\item \textsuperscript{1058} Oden, \textit{Ethics}, pp.119-128
\item \textsuperscript{1059} Jennings, \textit{Good}, pp.148-156
\item \textsuperscript{1060} Jennings, \textit{Good}, p.155
\item \textsuperscript{1061} See ‘Theological Reflection and Action Practice’, p.119
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
practice of aid-giving should model a new economics, consciously opposed to secular economics. This economics is the theological praxis required in order to offer a new paradigm, a redeemed normative praxis, to secular aid-modalities and to pose a challenge to both Christian and secular NGOs. This practice will also enable the church to look at itself through the theological imperative in order to set free the positivity of aid in *missio trinitatis* terms by challenging disempowering theologies, foreign and local.

The theological imperative and theological scrutiny are subservient to this enfolding theological vision.

### 6.3 Theological Vision

This is emboldened by the theological imperative which envisions the creation of a new Haitian community to be free of the sort of aid-necessity entanglements described in this research. God’s vision of the future, to which he points Haiti, finds its rootedness in Judeo-Christian Scriptures. From the perspective of the Old Testament I turn to Isaiah 43:19 ‘Behold, I am doing a new thing’. Isaiah 43:16 explains why Isaiah 43:19 is concerned with a new thing. The prophet had referred to the deliverance from Egypt and the crossing of the Red Sea. In the current text the Lord promises that the same power shall be exercised in the redemption and return of Israelites from captivity in Babylon. This was to be a new unprecedented work of deliverance.

I liken this theological vision of the new work for Israel with Haiti’s need for empowerment. For example, the God who delivered Haiti from the chains of enslavement in 1804 and the Occupation in 1934 promises to make normative self-sufficiency.

In the New Testament, I consider Revelation 21:5 ‘See, I am making all things new’. This echoes Isaiah 43:19 ‘Behold, I am doing a new thing’. In both situations, the theological vision
transcends the old order of things to normalize the new order of things and trigger a state of renewal. In his commentary on Revelation 21, Thacker redirects the energy of the church towards the necessity for renewal which will result from Christ’s presence in action in the disciples of the Lord.\textsuperscript{1062} This theological vision will discuss 4 overlapping components of abundant life for the Haitian society, namely (1) presence of God, (2) people of God, (3) wiping-of-tears, and (4) no-more-death.

6.3.1 Presence of God (Rev. 21: 2-3 and 5)

The new Haiti can be authenticated by the rediscovery therein of Christ’s presence in its various manifestations. This is the embodied authority for enacting transformation, conceptualized in its immanent nature as the applied ideals of righteousness and social transformation which should become the trademarks of the nation. Unlike ‘expression of disempowerment’ the messianic presence does not serve the dominant class at the expense of the impoverished peasants. Instead, it despises the process that perpetuates class prejudice which ensures the comfort of the elites and the entrenched impoverishment of the poor.\textsuperscript{1063}

The appropriateness of Christ’s presence is the agency to illuminate the Haitian worldview and local theologies and dismantle Haiti’s structure of sin that epitomizes disempowerment and nurtures systemic and structural evils which cause poverty to exist. Christ’s presence equally nullifies the idolatrous investment of divine prominence in FMDs in the same way his presence nudges religious adherents towards unity in Christ. HP will then present itself to be the embodiment of the work of fashioning the Haitian society into a life-sharing community through its hatred of evil.

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{1062}Justin Thacker, ‘New Heaven and New Earth’ in Hoek & Thacker, \textit{Micah’s}, pp.38-41
\item \textsuperscript{1063}Hughes, \textit{God}, p.206
\end{itemize}
Within the remit of HP, the expectant normative occurrence of abundant living can be equated with the active presence of the Holy Spirit moving through Haitian society, strengthening its economy, establishing distributive justice and transforming its politics through the infectious witness of Christians. Thacker corroborates the need for Christ’s presence in these words: ‘The kingdom never comes in the abstract, but only by means of God’s active presence, whether in his Son or Spirit, or in us as we allow the Son and the Spirit to work through us’.\(^{1064}\) In this normative occurrence, Christ’s presence points to the good old days when St. Domingue/Haiti was the ‘pearl of the Antilles’ and heralds the new day in which, akin to the West, the percentage of improved drinking water usage, for example, will be estimated at 96 percent and the gross national income per capita will peak to US$24,000.

**6.3.2 People of God (Rev 21.3)**

Grounded in an ecclesiastical paradigm of equality, it is perhaps right to affirm that HP, a local expression of the church, is as such God’s people, created through Christ, for God’s workmanship (Ephesians 2:1-10). This implies that in Christ, HP has the rights to a dignified life in the abundance of God’s grace.\(^{1065}\) In holistic mission, the abundance of God’s grace is normative spiritual and physical salvation. To the extent that poverty-alleviation is an aspect of grace HP has been deprived of it.

This further affirms that salvation needs to be both personal and socio-political undergirded by the gospel which is ‘the power of God for salvation’ (Romans 1:16).\(^{1066}\) Stone and Yoder believe that the very existence of the people of God is political, not by extension, application, or implication but inherently and inescapably as a paradigmatic alternative social order in the

---

\(^{1064}\) Thacker, ‘New’ in Hoek & Thacker, *Micah’s*, p.44

\(^{1065}\) Casséus notes that ‘Being legitimate children of God, co-heirs of Christ, we have the same rights and privileges as Christians of the whole world [American, Canadian, Swiss, Dutch, German & Belgian]’. Casséus, *Haïti*, p.96

\(^{1066}\) Stone, *Evangelism*, p.180
Therefore, to fully claim these rights HP’s socio-political and spiritual consciousness will need to be attuned to the ideals of holistic mission. HP’s mission, collectively and individually, ought to include prophetic denunciations of disempowering social structures and practices of educating consciences. The aim of a Methodist perspective is to inspire the initiatives that contribute to the formation of true humanity and value Haitian dignity. Then, as sons and daughters of God, Protestants will no longer see dependency on foreign-aid as its life-line.

6.3.3 Wiping-of-tears (Rev 21:4)

HP’s space needs to be healed of historical abnormalities in the establishment of the foundation of the new Haiti. Notwithstanding physical pains which caused wiping-of-tears, Haiti has been tortured psychologically. The economic consequences of Haiti’s historical pains are antagonistic to the renewal discourse generated by Isaiah and John. For example, these paternalistic attitudes, as a colonial expansion, are further complicated by the deep scars carried by the victims of these attitudes which lead to suspicion and distrust of anything which comes from the sending side of the mission relationship. Wah notes that ‘Having long been ignored, rejected and oppressed [disempowered], most Haitians, especially the rural and poor of the cities, have internalized this mistrust which has helped to shape Haitian social relations and transactions’.

Healing ought to be normative in HP for the sake of its empowerment. The historical pains cry out for the healing of the collective memory of Haitians. Thacker and Corbett and Fikkert advocate repentance as a starting point towards potential trust.

---

1068 Stone, *Evangelism*, p.191
1069 Ramseyer, ‘Partnership’, *International*, pp.32-39
1070 Wah, *A la*, p.79
1071 Thacker, *Global*, p.62; Corbett & Fikkert, p.28
writers, it begins, for example, with reparation instead of apology, and justice for the Creole pig farmers and the alleged victims of dictatorial political regimes. Evidence suggests that it is beneficial that healing of the memory be normative in HP.

6.3.4 *No-More-Death (Rev 21:4)*

Reference to the health indicators in the first task implicates the most disadvantaged as the most susceptible to health inequalities and suffering, thus, the most eligible ones to join the statistical figure for a reduced life expectancy. While death, including politically motivated disappearances, has silenced the nation, Christ’s presence is hostile to death. In defiance, Thacker encourages HP to harness local resources towards becoming a community that is, to a large extent, free from physical pain and suffering. He argues: ‘We [in the West] certainly do not experience, either first- or second-hand, the physical torment that would have been commonplace in earlier centuries, that would have affected our contemporary brothers and sisters in the global south’. Subversive actions towards health inequalities are required to counteract the complex interaction of death related issues in HP. A Methodist perspective claims that a renewed anthropology of the sacredness of life should be given legitimacy in HP’s space.


1074 However, Jean-Claude Duvalier, on his return from exile, was prosecuted in Haiti for ‘murder, kidnapping, illegal detention, and torture’ committed during his presidency. The trial was ongoing when he died in 2014. Available: [https://trialinternational.org/latest-post/jean-claude-duvalier/](https://trialinternational.org/latest-post/jean-claude-duvalier/) (accessed 27 January 2016)

1075 Thacker, ‘New’ in Hoek & Thacker, *Micah’s*, p.38
Conclusion

Christ has proclaimed the greatness of his kingdom by making new the things of the past ‘the old order of things’ through his active presence. He asserts, ‘See, I am making all things new’ (Rev. 21.5). In this portfolio, conceptualizing ‘All things’ includes the slave-built mentality of Haitian people, the country’s debilitating infrastructures, the impeding socio-religious systems and subjectivities, the disempowering socio-economic and political structures and the ideological justifications for their perpetuation. Therefore, by the active mediation of Christ’s presence, Haiti will nurture the theological hope of being a distinctly transformed community in Christ, a new place where ultimately there will be no more aid-dependency.

Chapter 7. Re-imagining Haitian Church

How Might We Respond?
Pragmatic Task

Introduction

The preceding tasks of practical theology - descriptive-empirical, interpretative and normative - have begun shaping the direction of this portfolio which the pragmatic task seeks to complete. It engages with and upholds Haitian creativity to give significance to ‘alternative responses possible’. Based on evidence gathered in the descriptive-empirical task, it therefore seeks to answer the question: how might we respond to the hypothesis, in brief, to needs in HP’s space? Those needs, certainly, have been perennial. For example, in 1952 a Haitian poet in his engagement with the religious status quo vis-à-vis Haiti’s economic deprivation gave this insight:

In truth, I do not understand anything in all these things. We make Voodoo ceremonies, they do not bring us anything, and misery is killing us! We go to the Catholic Church and misery remains; every day misery becomes more
terrible! We make ourselves Protestants, but also nothing changes; and it is always disease, misery and suffering!1076

In the present-day, the poet’s analysis is still relevant. It resonates with Thomson’s description ‘Nothing has changed there [Haiti] for the two hundred years since independence’. 1077 While Saint-Amand and Thomson may exaggerate their point, it is, however, a fact that Haiti has been labelled the ‘poorest country in the western hemisphere’. Yet, I understand the poet to be underlying that religiosity in Haiti has missed the opportunity to be the alternate paradigm of advocacy for in-depth socio-economic empowerment.

Whereas the literature has confirmed FMDs’ shared responsibility for the crystallization of aid-dependency, this pragmatic task will formulate a response as an alternative to HP’s missed opportunities to initiate transformation. Unlike knowledge paternalism, it does not require me to respond, in isolation, but summons me to stimulate reciprocal analytical discourses on the plausibility of strategies of action. This means, the perennial reality of ‘disease, misery and suffering’ cannot be solved by the effort of any one group regardless of its affiliations.

The response will inhabit the genesis of a transformation to be carried out by a Haitian Creole church [hereafter HCC] and its leadership. Based on the evidence that a culture of silence has been disempowering, HCC will be devoted to breaking silences by giving a voice to the silent majority. From a Methodist perspective, a response in this context will underpin strategies of action, as a model of empowerment, towards breaking multi-faceted cultures of silence. To do this, I map out the response in four phases. Phase One will explore the recalibration of foreign expertise which will consist of an in-depth conversation between HCC and FMDs on informed consent. This will feed into Phase Two which will be devoted to a consensus-seeking dialogue among religious sectors, local and international. Phase Three will offer four concrete examples

1077 Thomson, Bonjour, p.317
of potential agreed consensuses while Phase Four will culminate with transformational strategies.

Firstly, I want to establish a connection between (a) HCC, (b) the Creole language, and (c) its leadership.

*a. Haitian Creole Church*

Conceptualizing a Creole church puts back the responsibility on HP to initiate the transformation of the habitat within which it lives, serves, worships and witnesses. Here, the fear and failure of engagement in the past will be translated into breaking disempowering silences in the future.

It is paramount that I place added emphasis to participants’ clamour for ‘new ways of being church and understanding God’. More precisely, in my reflexivity, it means HCC. HCC, as an arm of HP, will spearhead the theological scrutiny, that is, a re-examination of the practices of *missio trinitatis* as conceived and carried out by HP and FMDs. It will assume, in lieu of FMDs, the leading role of pursuing, however slowly it may be, an indigenous integrated mission, constructed on biblical principles of prophetic calling. This HCC will be constitutive of freedom-inspired believers from local churches and Haitian churches in the diaspora.

*b. Haitian Creole*

I emphasize that HCC will not be commissioned to be a new Protestant ecclesiastical typology. It will be recognized as a Creolized church, a community of believers who inhabit God’s envisaged and long-awaited prototype of in-depth transformation of his people’s lives. This will be a Church in which the Creole voice of the non-literate and forgotten will equally be heard. Here, Creole is not simply a language but a distinctive Haitian heritage.1078 It has been

---

1078 I advocate Creole, not merely as a linguistic vehicle since from 1950 to 1960 it became the distinctive indigenous identity of worship in Haitian churches. Romain, *Le Protestantisme* (1985), pp.189-190; Fontus, *Les Églises*, pp.92-94. I propose Creole in terms of aspiration, motivation and resistance as expressed in these
both a combative methodology and an imaginative resistance-strategy, coded into ESRs’ vernacular of contextual realities.\textsuperscript{1079} This description will characterize the ontology and mission of HCC.

Creole was a linguistic design through which ESRs inspired each other and communicated among themselves their dreams, hidden theologies, infectious bravery, and ingenuity of adaptation. Today, it will still be a linguistic identity to shape HCC’s mission character, facilitate the expression of its development dream, theologies and worship, and to help to articulate its suffering, enthusiasm and advocacy. This initial response will be Creole in inspiration, character and imagination and will epitomize the qualitative faith experience of Haitians, drawn from their concrete socio-economic situations.

c. Leadership

The hope is that, based on the principle of prophetic calling, God is constantly raising from among this growing population of Protestants an empowered leadership, whose responsibility, together with HCC, for continued spiritual development and gradually large-scale socio-political transformation, will be underpinned by the urgency of their calling.\textsuperscript{1080} It will be a leadership, trained for the task,\textsuperscript{1081} whose ‘feet and hands [will] not be tied by foreign aid-

\textsuperscript{1079} From a secular perspective, the minority Haitians who speak French, and by extension, influence national consensuses, have resisted every move towards teaching Creole as the Haitian language and French as a foreign language. Available: https://groups.google.com/forum/#topic/haiti-nation/VA7rFcuYONY, (accessed 14 August 2017)

\textsuperscript{1080} It is intrinsic to God’s plan of redemption to call leaders to pioneering roles. Illustratively, Moses and Ezekiel received such a call. Moses and Aaron spearheaded the exodus of the Israelites from bondage in Egypt (Exodus 3-6). Likewise, Ezekiel spoke words of hope of homecoming and unity to the kingdoms of Israel and Judah as an exilic community (Ezekiel 1-3 and 36-37). In parallel, in the history of St. Domingue/Haiti, national leaders like Toussaint Louverture, Jean-Jacques Dessalines, and Charlemagne Peralte were God’s chosen emissaries in the successful Haitian revolution against slavery during the 1789-1804 era and the Occupation. Anténor Firmin, De l’Égalité des Races Humaines, 2nd ed. (Port-au-Prince: Les Editions Fardin, 2011), pp.330-331

\textsuperscript{1081} Jovin, ‘Christian’, Transformation, p.6
policies’.\textsuperscript{1082} It will not be ‘socio-economically oblivious of their indigenous realities’, but freedom-inspired to ‘liberate those whose feet and hands are tied’ and will engage with new-evangelization.\textsuperscript{1083}

According to Hennelly, this new-evangelization, in this missiological context, does not translate into re-evangelization. Rather, it calls for HCC, together with the wider local church, to build on the positivity which existing mission paradigms have provided and proceed to complement them by correcting, through consistent theological reflections, previous missional deficiencies, towards righteousness in the larger society. It will equally be devoted to discerning an indigenising Haitian theology for an emerging and more transforming ecclesiology.

My point is that there currently co-exists within HP, both in Haiti and the diaspora, an HCC and its leadership whose orthopraxis and righteousness are attuned to the theological imperative to sustain this pioneering, redemptive role. However, as with any prophetic calling, reluctance, feelings of inadequacy, limited spiritual discernment, and procrastination may impede swift responses. However, in the current hype of Haiti’s celebration of 200 years of HP’s witness (1817-2017), this thesis portfolio will aim to be instrumental in awakening such prophetic calling and creating a heightened awareness in HP and the larger community to the need for freedom from aid-dependency’s entanglements.\textsuperscript{1084} I will hereafter use HCC to encapsulate the emerging church and its leadership.

7.1 Phase One: Foreign Expertise and Recalibration

On the evidence of the lenses two intriguing questions emerge: should HCC push for the

\textsuperscript{1082} ADLI5\textsuperscript{1083} Alfred Hennelly, \textit{Santo Domingo and Beyond} (ed.), (New York: Orbis Books, 1993), pp.81-82
\textsuperscript{1084} Available: \url{http://www.lenational.org/protestants-celebrent-leurs-200-ans-de-presence-pays/} (accessed 13 May 2017)
termination of HP’s long-lasting ties with FMDs? Alternatively, how does HCC exercise a two-edged ministry, simultaneously, serving FMDs’ interests while utilising FMDs’ expertise to boost local resourcefulness to inspire the self-liberation of the disempowered? With these questions in mind the stage is set to highlight the significance of recalibration and engage in difficult conversations.

To be consistent with RAED, participants did not clamour for an end to the relationship with FMDs but insisted on retrieving their voice and dignity. They would prefer that HCC applies FMDs’ expertise, funding and well-meaning fellowship as a need-driven response. This suggests that aid-practices and aid-modalities will be eligible for a recalibration in the breaking of disempowering silences.

Pragmatic realities have provided justifications for the continuing aid-provision relationships. In the first place, the Second Lens has outlined the significance of aid-positivity. Furthermore, Christians in Europe and America own significant amounts of the world church’s wealth.1085 It will be deemed strategically irresponsible, even relationally suicidal, were HCC to turn its back on wealth God has entrusted to high-income Christians, with a view to fulfilling the theological imperative.

Also, according to the First Lens, FP/FMDs have been co-contributors to the perennial problem of poverty in HP. It is, therefore, an act of moral justice that they are invited to share with their resources in HCC’s model of empowerment towards self-sufficiency. HCC’s prerogative will be to offer, for example, France the opportunity to compensate for its act of injustice and keep Haiti’s reparation request on the agenda of difficult conversations. In so far as HP’s current

---

1085 Bonk, Missions; Rowell, To Give, pp.4-5; ‘The Church of the Rich’, available: https://newint.org/features/1984/07/05/church (accessed 15 August 2017)
reality persists, an obligatory case for existing and new aid-providers to fulfil their Christian calling will also be necessary. This is a calling with which HCC will aim to engage. 1086

Another justification for nurturing ties with FMDs lies in the significance of emulation and interdependency. A basic strategy that made Europe so evenly self-sufficient was what Enlightenment economics called emulation and the extensive toolbox that was developed for the purpose of emulating. 1087 According to Reinert, emulation then was the endeavour to equal or surpass others in any achievement or quality. It is aligned to the idea of catching-up and forging ahead and resonates with the understanding of dynamics of competition. 1088 It is best realized in the good practice of interdependency. Forging ahead for HP, therefore, will be possible through emulation based on interdependent relationships with FMDs, other networks of churches and the business world within which HCC will witness.

Therefore, it is advisable that HCC emulates the recalibration of the classical professional model described by Verbeek. 1089 The point of departure for the model was not so much the desires of supplicants seeking medical assistance but what health experts deemed necessary from their objectifying perspective. This classical medical view is likened to ‘knowledge paternalism’ in which the remedy for aid-receivers’ wealth-deprived conditions is determined by aid-providers’ expert choice. Verbeek explains that against this paternalism of medical professionals who believed they knew ‘what is good’ was pitted the autonomous claim of

1086 International assistance can be a crucial asset but must support Haiti’s strategy rather than reflect donor priorities. Available: https://www.hbs.edu/faculty/Publication%20Files/20170922-A-Strategy-for-Haitian-Prosperity-Michael-E-Porter_d961c43a-f86f-42bc-8e64-7377ba0c360e.pdf (accessed 15 May 2017)

1087 Reinert, How, p.15

1088 Reinert, How, p.15. It is like learning, adapting the best practices, not copying. Available: https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=1CCgCwAAQBAJ&pg=PA21&lpg=PA21&dq=Enlightenment+economics+called+emulation&source=bl&ots=Qq8410e70K&sig=y21o_Z4EcfuQnduN9p1U1WwoO0o&hl=en&sa=X&ved=0ahUKEwiwqXa7v3aAhUmB8AKHb9GCG9A6AEI0TAI#v=onepage&q=Enlightenment%20economics%20called%20emulation&f=false (accessed 11 March 2012)

1089 Sytse Strijbos with Gerard Verbeek, ‘Who will decide? Towards a more Balanced Donor-recipient Relationship’ in Gruchy, Koopman & Strijbos, From, pp.151-167
patients who desired control over their bodies. Similarly, HCC, despite its socio-economic vulnerability and limited resources, according to this model, will aim to claim its autonomy from the objectifying perspective of aid-provider experts. This is with a view to having control over the church’s finance, theology and administrative structures in co-responsibility with other motivated church communities.

The model advocated a type of relationship which guaranteed care seekers’ informed consent. It suggested that like care-seekers, aid-receivers will advocate the right to be well informed about their options [from food-for-work to Marshall aid options] and of the dangers [experts’ bad judgements] and risks [Jean Makout rainy season] involved in specific cases of aid-provision and on that basis choose to grant or not grant permission to FMDs for a particular project. This is a difficult conversation, yet, it will be beneficial to both parties as FMDs’ mission and HCC’s interests will be purposefully fulfilled. The recalibration of aid-relationships as a need-driven response will break HCC’s [HP’s] culture of disempowering silence in getting the on-the-ground voice heard.

Furthermore, HCC’s leading role will not be to argue for the cessation of these types of aid-positivity-driven projects but to broaden their objectives so that selective individual economic success stories of Protestants will become the collective success story of the nation. This suggests that a reprioritization needs to take place such that the weight of our energy is no longer spent on relatively small-scale development projects but is equally directed towards the wider issues that keep people in poverty. ‘If we merely continue with charity, our own consciences may be salved but the plight of the world’s poor will remain unabated’.1090

This model of transformation by recalibration, however, may potentially be derailed by numerous domestic issues. The issues of class prejudice and economic imbalance, non-literacy

1090 Thacker, ‘From’, Transformation, p.124
levels, divisions and disinclination to community participation have been challenges to social cohesion. In the current socio-political effervescence, what will be the crux of the nation’s informed consent? How does Haiti build a pool of identified knowledge-based options and risks to elucidate and evaluate informed consent narratives?

In response, I advocate constructive dialogues as silence breakers to help to diffuse these domestic issues. As such, these issues, primarily, call for the breaking of disempowering silence within the religious sector in order to emulate the practice of the recalibration model based on agreed consensuses. The initiative will be for HCC to model unity and co-responsibility, as a messianic goal, for the sake of the nation. This initial response will not be a pragmatic solution to all domestic and foreign socio-economic issues. It is an attempt at modelling a new practice in the ecclesiastical unity of purpose that HCC will pursue.

7.2 Phase Two: Seeking an Agreed Consensus

Conversations with FMDs on the right to informed consent as silence breakers will require HCC to initiate silence breaking initiatives among the Haitian faith sector on the axis of aid-positivity. Again, the momentum of the response will not be to say, ‘no to aid’, but to materialize the recalibration of aid-practices and aid-modalities in HP’s/FMDs’ aid-relationships. Therefore, the coming together of the faith sector in dialogue will be essential towards achieving short-term and long-term national agreed consensuses to underpin an informed consent. HCC needs ‘a collective plan of need-driven action’. This will potentially alleviate difficult conversations with FMDs who will be required to offer a comprehensive development plan to be, then, dovetailed into HCC’s collective plan, meaning, a national

---

1091 ADFG1
1092 The fact that there are so many NGOs, each with their own priorities and projects, makes it almost impossible to develop a coordinated policy’. Hallward, Damning, p.178
1093 FMDs’ overall plan will satisfy the request of scholars and set a model of transformation for NGOs: Max Chauvet, ‘Témoignage, Où En Est Haïti Un An Après Le Séisme?’ in Rainhorn, Haïti, pp.127; Rocourt, ‘The Challenge’ in Mitchell, With Eyes, pp.71-81
agreed consensus.\footnote{The thesis advocates the necessity of a national consensus to be initially modelled by the religious sector. For a secular perspective, see ‘Governing Haiti’, available: \url{http://www.refworld.org/docid/51121bf92.html} (accessed 10 May 2015)}

7.2.1 Christianity and Voodoo in Dialogue

I start with this clarification from a participant:

Leadership representatives from HP, Voodoo, Haitian Catholicism and other faiths in Haiti do not have a history of working together on community development projects in co-responsibility. Particularistic faith, empowered, in the case of HP and Haitian Catholicism, by foreign-aid, does not meet the criteria for collective religious community achievement.\footnote{ADQ32}

The breaking of disempowering silences will aim to revisit the ‘history of [not] working together’. This will begin with HCC’s upholding the ancestral religion’s legal right to existence.\footnote{See ‘Disempowering Silence of Local Theologies’, p.224} It is not in the interest of Haiti’s development that responding to needs in HP’s space is equated with physically eradicating and silencing Voodoo. From the outset, this approach failed since it has rather strengthened the confidence of the persecuted religion.\footnote{Casséus, \textit{Éléments}, pp.344-345}

Unlike FMDs and HP which have, for a long while, ignored local religions, HCC should affirm the necessity of religious dialogue, at least, for the sake of discerning an agreed consensus.\footnote{I am aware that starting out by labelling the holders of an opposing religious perspective, as HP has done, does not bode well for the advancement of an openly honest engagement on any subject matter. It may put Voodoists on the defensive. However, being silent on the subject matter of Haiti’s prosperity does not help either. Therefore, this dialogue will not pursue syncretism and ecumenism. Neither will it promote the inculturation of the Vodoo faith in HP and culture towards a Haitian theology of prosperity. As an alternative, it will be a meaningful engagement of Haitians, fellow citizens, who uphold different religious persuasions. For more on this dialogue, read: Celucien Joseph, ‘Redefining Cultural, National, and Religious Identity: the Christian–Vodouist dialogue?!’, \textit{Theology Today} 73:3 (2016), pp.241-262; Jean Fils-Aimé, \textit{Et Si Les Loas N’Etaient Pas Des Diablos?} (Montreal: Éditions Dabar, 2008), Jean Fils-Aimé, \textit{Vodou, Je Me Souviens} (Québec: Les Editions Dabar, 2007); Casséus, \textit{Éléments}, pp.344-345; Hurbon, \textit{Dieu}}

Unlike FMDs and HP which have, for a long while, ignored local religions, HCC should affirm the necessity of religious dialogue, at least, for the sake of discerning an agreed consensus.\footnote{I am aware that starting out by labelling the holders of an opposing religious perspective, as HP has done, does not bode well for the advancement of an openly honest engagement on any subject matter. It may put Voodoists on the defensive. However, being silent on the subject matter of Haiti’s prosperity does not help either. Therefore, this dialogue will not pursue syncretism and ecumenism. Neither will it promote the inculturation of the Vodoo faith in HP and culture towards a Haitian theology of prosperity. As an alternative, it will be a meaningful engagement of Haitians, fellow citizens, who uphold different religious persuasions. For more on this dialogue, read: Celucien Joseph, ‘Redefining Cultural, National, and Religious Identity: the Christian–Vodouist dialogue?!’, \textit{Theology Today} 73:3 (2016), pp.241-262; Jean Fils-Aimé, \textit{Et Si Les Loas N’Etaient Pas Des Diablos?} (Montreal: Éditions Dabar, 2008), Jean Fils-Aimé, \textit{Vodou, Je Me Souviens} (Québec: Les Editions Dabar, 2007); Casséus, \textit{Éléments}, pp.344-345; Hurbon, \textit{Dieu}}

From the 1950-2000 aid-era onward, HP’s failure to secure such a consensus has side-lined bottom-up perspectives in the development debates. It fails the redemption thrust to operate in a rational ontology which assumes a society of western-type individuals, by silencing
traditional values, practices and forms of social existence.\textsuperscript{1099} Evidence suggests that the absence of this dialogue has potentially contributed to Haiti’s socio-economic stability.

7.2.2 \textit{Unity of Purpose within the Church}

Further afield, identifying a national agreed consensus will necessitate local churches to break their own silence. This is not a suggestion that the Christian community has not had dialogues through its own networking.\textsuperscript{1100} Neither is the suggestion that each local church has not yet, fully, developed a denominational agreed consensus. Rather, gathering an agreed consensus to effect the agenda of conversations with FMDs on the basis of informed consent will augur a positive response in this context.\textsuperscript{1101} A Methodist perspective advises that, ‘Isolated efforts are too feeble to change the chronic under-development situation in Haiti’.\textsuperscript{1102} This agreed consensus calls for unity of purpose within the Christian community, a bold step towards breaking the silence on national issues that affect the flock of Christ. Breaking disempowering silences here will be a challenge to a singularity of purpose in the aim of establishing a national consensus on a specific need as a target. At this juncture, evidence suggests that the lack of coordinated efforts towards Haiti’s prosperity among Christians has been another typology of failure which consolidates the crystallization of aid-dependency.

7.2.3 \textit{Conversation with the World Church}

The clamour ‘Help us to think differently’\textsuperscript{1103} has brought about a need for not only freedom from ‘Monopolization of relations’\textsuperscript{1104} but freedom for multi-lateral engagements with other

\textsuperscript{1099} Freeman, ‘The Pentecostal’ in \textit{Pentecostal}, p.26
\textsuperscript{1101} It will be concerned with ‘defining the goal of aid’. Anderson, ‘Aid’, \textit{Development}, p.498
\textsuperscript{1102} Rocourt, ‘The Challenge’ in Mitchell, \textit{With Eyes}, p.77. Rocourt is a former president of HMC; MDC-HMC1979
\textsuperscript{1103} ADFG3
\textsuperscript{1104} See p.212
world church networks. For example, using poverty as a pivotal reference factor between Haiti and Africa, both the former and the latter, together with their institutions, have generally been suffering from the effect of socio-economic inequalities. As such, the clamour called for the breaking of silence with African churches. This conversation will be an exploration of relationships and an experimentation of whatever works for the continent and for Haiti, particularly, in the church development sector. However, identifying a national agreed consensus may not only break the silence it may also offer opportunities for solution-exchange dynamics between African churches, FMDs, and HCC.

Phase Two seeks an agreed consensus through dialogue and carves the path to Phase Three to identify potential agreed consensuses in a culture of disempowerment.

7.3 Phase Three: Potential Agreed Consensuses

To materialize typologies of national agreed consensuses, the thesis underlines, as has been drawn from resources which have shaped it, the significance of breaking disempowering silences it has highlighted. They are (1) disempowering silence of non-literacy, (2) disempowering silence of de-forestation, (3) disempowering silence of low self-esteem, and (4) disempowering silence of political absenteeism.

7.3.1 Breaking the Disempowering Silence of Non-Literacy

French and English have been the languages of development in the aid-dependency culture. This culture has strategically silenced the voices of - and kept in poverty - a large percent of the Haitian non-literate. It erodes their development opportunities since they are not conversant in French nor English. Casséus indicates that non-literacy is ‘a curse to the Haitian people’.\footnote{Casséus, Éléments, p.115} Understandably, the arm of the Haitian people to combat this silence as a ‘curse’ is permanent,
uninterrupted, wholesome education rooted in the pedagogy of the oppressed which is opened to the universal. Holistic education is a necessity for the furtherance of the Haitian people’s emancipation.\footnote{This argument is supported by: Bird, \textit{The Black}, pp.358-359; Hallward, \textit{Damming}, pp.328-329} Here again, evidence suggests that FMDs and HP have missed the opportunity, through the trigger of a national consensus, to break the silence of non-literacy of the Haitian people.


7.3.2 \textbf{Breaking the Disempowering Silence of De-forestation}

Béliard and Norris note the considerable regression, since 1492, of Haiti’s forestation heritage which today is largely destroyed. Writers also note that St. Domingue was France’s chief ‘aid’ provider. In order to sustain this ‘aid’ provision, for example, trees were substituted for sugar cane. The long-term consequences have been the crystallization of a culture of de-forestation.\footnote{‘Who’, \url{https://www.nytimes.com/2016/10/18/opinion/who-will-speak-for-haitis-trees.html}.} The suggestion is that Haiti’s Mother Nature has been crying out for help to break the culture of silence de-forestation has created.

In addition to Haiti being labelled ‘the poorest country in the western hemisphere’ and the ‘Republic of NGOs’, it has equally been called the ‘most deforested country in the
It is again ironic, given the abundance of so much aid in the republic of NGOs, that the disempowering silences of non-literacy and de-forestation have gained such a huge momentum. The trees are silent because they are no more since only a third of the surface of Haiti’s soil remains covered with trees. My point is that a narrative concerning wholistic re-forestation in Haiti will engage the wider public consciousness. Agrarian soil loss, increasing demand for charcoal, flooding caused by hurricanes and storms, declining agricultural possibilities and increased national population will underpin informed consent on reforestation to be an agreed consensus with which to negotiate partial funding with FMDs.

Breaking the silence of de-forestation will be such a strategy of action that HCC will join with other organizations to develop systems of wood production and tackle the problem holistically and with potentially remarkable success.

7.3.3 Breaking the Disempowering Silence of Low Self-esteem

A derivative of the perennial discourse which has demeaned black ethnicity, civilization, production, subjectivity and theology has been the debilitating effect of low self-esteem. Using Haiti as an example, I consider a mere two references. Firstly, in St. Domingue, ESRs were ‘non-socio-political entities’, ‘made blank’ who incurred ‘deficits in self-hood, self-determination and mental strength’. They were psychologically tortured to be mentally

1115 See ‘Aid-dependency in St. Domingue’, p.41
enslaved today. Secondly, in aid-dependency’s practices, Haitian ‘contributions are not appreciated’\textsuperscript{1116} as ‘disabled entrepreneurs’.\textsuperscript{1117} They ‘nourished the incapacity complex’\textsuperscript{1118} and ‘discredited their ability and self-worth’\textsuperscript{1119} and, therefore, became the prey of a ‘psychological blockage towards fruitful productivity’.\textsuperscript{1120} Therefore, having been rejected, the former colonized Haitians suffer from the psychological pain of self-rejection and low self-esteem, a manifestation of disempowerment.\textsuperscript{1121}

According to Freeman, socio-economic change has occurred in contexts where the focus of transformation has been predicated on individuals’ changed subjectivities and heightened self-esteem. Freeman refers to changed subjectivities which result from the work of Pentecostal churches in Africa. While NGOs and secular development theories are interested in the connection between personal change and social change, they currently lack the tools, competency and goodwill to bring about personal transformation to anywhere near the same degree as the Pentecostals.

While Pentecostals seek to bring personal transformation, NGOs tend to be more interested in structural transformation. When it comes to bringing about social and economic change it seems that approaches that focus on individuals are rather more effective.\textsuperscript{1122}

In HP such personal transformation may, more precisely, include redeeming the mind from socio-religious subjectivities and mental slavery, which according to Theus, may be eradicated in another 300 years. In fact, Shahadah explains the effect of mental dependency in former colonized minds as follows: ‘If you give them water to quench their thirst, they use it to drown themselves. If you give them a rope to climb out of their situation, they use it to hang

\textsuperscript{1116} See ‘Feeling of Worthlessness’, p.166
\textsuperscript{1117} Chanson, ‘Haïti’, in Rainhorn, \textit{Haïti}, pp.215-227
\textsuperscript{1118} Casséus, \textit{Haïti}, p.88
\textsuperscript{1119} Griffiths, \textit{A View}, pp.124
\textsuperscript{1120} Chanson, ‘Haïti’, in Rainhorn, \textit{Haïti}, pp.215-227
\textsuperscript{1121} Theus, \textit{ONG}, p.72
\textsuperscript{1122} Freeman, ‘The Pentecostal’, in \textit{Pentecostal}, p.25
Mental slavery is a silent killer as it is a deficit in mental strength, a modern slave-chain, which fosters mental dependency.

This model of personal transformation invites HCC to emulate African Pentecostalism. Advising on a working paradigm, Freeman comments:

It is a form of Protestantism that not only fits with African sensitivities, but also stimulates a transformation of behaviour that can lead to success, or at least upward mobility, in the contemporary neoliberal economy. It motivates new behaviours and renders them moral.

Garvey advises from a Caribbean perspective:

We are going to emancipate ourselves from mental slavery because whilst others might free the body, none but ourselves can free the mind. Mind is your only ruler. The man who is not able to develop and use his mind is bound to be the slave of the other man who uses his mind.

However, HCC’s initiative towards breaking the disempowering silence of low self-esteem will hasten to materialize both Freeman’s personal transformation model and Garvey’s appeal for collective emancipation. In HP’s space, although personal transformation will be essential, it does not transcend, nor satisfy, the inevitability of collective transformation of Haitian socio-religious subjectivities and the scars of mental slavery which have consistently driven Haitians to the cutting edge of polarization. Historical evidence abounds to confirm, for example, that transformations of selected individuals in terms of education, spirituality and socio-economic mobility have consistently led to the creation of types of Haitian elites which

1124 Freeman, ‘The Pentecostal’, in Pentecostal, pp.20-21
1125 Kenchukwu, http://spiritanfellowshipfortrueglobalpeace.blogspot.co.uk/2018/01/professor-jideofo-kenechukwu-dannibaezue.html
1126 They function as local aliens, oblivious to indigenous realities. The particularistic black intellectuals who, for example, in 1946 advocated Négritude ignored, in their heights of political power, the plights of the poor. The intellectual black elites have consistently emulated the mulatto elites in their indifferences to the non-literate poor. Leybrun, The Haitian, p.ix
1127 The European-American spiritual transformation, whose primary focus has been on personal salvation of individuals, has led to the creation of Christian elites who distanced themselves, socially, from Voodoo adherents. The distinctiveness, rightfully so, of a consecrated Christian community has been corrupted, unfortunately, by the infectious elitist ideology. Thomson, Bonjour, p.107. Despite this individual elitist attitude, Jovin confesses ‘In Haiti Christian Protestants belong to the most disadvantaged and looked down upon socially.’ Jovin, ‘Christian’, Transformation, p.6
1128 This creates local paternalism as the few people with an economic ease elevate themselves reverently as ‘papas’ and ‘mamas’ of the have-nots. ‘Our elite seems to be a foreign organism superimposed on the rest of the
refresh the vestiges of mental slavery through discrimination, exploitation and the promotion of low self-esteem. The lesser in importance transforming collective subjectivities and mental dependency attitudes have been, the more prominent have the failures to structural transformation been over the years.\textsuperscript{1129} The collective redemption of the minds will be slow and costly, yet, it is inevitably desirous as a response.

The test of breaking the disempowering silence of low self-esteem will stem from the task of convincing FMDs, NGOs, local church NGOs and even FP to finance related programmes. These are abstract and ideological realities which are at variance with the worldview of the West. Thacker resolves that:

\begin{center}
We need to demand less often that we can identify the specific child, toilet or cow that our money has bought and be more willing to support work that may in the short term provide us with less tangible results, but in the long-term benefit the poor to a greater extent.\textsuperscript{1130}
\end{center}

Woolnough further argues: ‘Unfortunately, evaluators tend to measure those things which can be easily measured and ignore the more important factors that cannot’.\textsuperscript{1131} Nonetheless, this potential reluctance of the West may be lessened by the proactivity of local engagements with religious literacy towards this re-imagination of subjectivity.\textsuperscript{1132} This paradigm shift, if financed and enacted, would do more good for the disempowered than is currently the case. Therefore, the transformation of collective subjectivity and slavery-based mentality into heightened self-esteem will require righteousness as a paradigmatic, alternative social

\textsuperscript{1129} Thacker, ‘From’, \textit{Transformation}, p.124
\textsuperscript{1131} The ‘rise of religion’ in mainstream development and practice emphasizes the need for ‘religious literacy’. The West may wish to fund such literacy. Emma Tomalin, \textit{Religions and Development} (London: Routledge Taylor and Francis Group, 2013), pp.234-241
existence and a structural collective [FMDs’ and HCC’s] plan of development and funding. HCC will be called to model this transformation as an illustration of agreed consensus.

7.3.4 Breaking the Disempowering Silence of Political Absenteeism

HCC will become an intermediary, slowly but actively involved, on the socio-political scene with dialogue triggers. My point is that socio-political involvement will begin with breaking the disempowering silence of political absenteeism through dialogues with Haitian governments, including by necessity sectors of the Haitian elite, on the foreground of potentially agreed consensuses. The aim is that, as a starting point, those agreed consensuses, piloted within the religious sector, may be legitimized by the government to be potentially national agreed consensuses. They will equally be utilized as dialogue triggers in the difficult conversations between the Haitian government and FP. In this manner, HCC will be a yeast on behalf of the disempowered. Maggay contends: ‘Like the yeast, Christianity works mysteriously yet is visible in the results. Quietly, it penetrates society and alters it in its centre; at that place where things begin to turn and move towards a vision of the “better country” we only see dimly from afar’.

I have examined what can be the genesis of a response to deprivation in HP’s space. In the ensuing sections I analyse potential strategies of empowerment.

---

1133 I refer to these three potentially agreed consensuses as dialogue triggers.
1134 In the ‘professionals’ sub-set, the ‘quantitative description’ gave an additional hint in terms of how the elites think. Moreover, the only meaningful cooperation between the Haitian elites and the impoverished blacks was strategically evident during the Haitian revolution in 1804. Lundahl, Peasants, pp.318-319
1135 While these agreed consensuses have been acclaimed by participants and writers, they will be subjects of consultations across churches and national institutions in order to confirm or reject their legitimacy.
1136 Maggay, ‘Justice’ in Hoek & Thacker, Micah’s, p.130
7.4 Phase Four: Empowering Strategies

‘Alternative responses possible’ will represent the consciousness of these empowering strategies. These will be analysed and offered within the context of righteous living as a paradigmatic alternative to the current reality of social existence. HCC will therefore consider the following two concrete responses: (1) entrepreneurial Bondye-bon and (2) prophetic radicalism.

7.4.1 Entrepreneurial Bondye-bon

The clamour ‘Help us to think differently’ will welcome discussions on the Bondye-bon ideology. Understanding this ideology will be essential to transformation, even the transformation of subjectivity and mental dependency, and will necessitate that a distinction is made between lethargic and entrepreneurial Bondye-bon.1137

Entrepreneurially, Casséus explains that Bondye-bon had been a psychological and hermeneutical resistant concept. Under the torturous treatments of their colonial masters, our ancestors kept believing in the Grand Maître through Creole chants, songs, sighs, words and religious ecstasy and postures that the Bondye-bon ideology sustained. The Grand Maître was their only hope in that hopeless situation of bondage in slavery to human masters; again that hope was preserved by the Bondye-bon ideology.1138 This enduring faith which inspired hope, in the face of death while galvanising the thoughts and resources of the slave maroons, has been strategy-built, action-packed and entrepreneurship-inspired and posed a Creole hermeneutic of resistance to lethargic Bondye-bon. Therefore, responding to what goes on in HP’s space is to invoke and affirm the inner strength, mental capacity and physical workmanship of the stoic, heroic Haitian as an act of defiance to lethargic Bondye-bon.

1137 See ‘Descriptive Theme 9’, p.163
1138 Casséus, Éléments, pp.50-56
The *Bondye-bon* driven fortitude and praxis of faith of the disempowered Haitian, although, today, corrupted by poor work ethics, much negativity, mixed religious subjectivities and aid-dependency’s practices, are still inherently result-impacting for HP’s believers. Disempowered Protestants, and largely Haitians, have been called to confidently lead the path of their own socio-economic recovery in the name of Christ, their *Grand Maître*. Breaking the disempowering silences of non-literacy, de-forestation, low self-esteem and political absenteeism will require the pragmatism and confidence of entrepreneurial *Bondye-bon*. To this end, a redeemed version of the Haitian *Bondye-bon* will be a life-changing response to needs in HP’s space. In this entrepreneurial *Bondye-bon*, Haitian believers:

- Will slowly but surely assume confidently their responsibility - social, civic, patriotic and environmental - for their intrinsic world, in the power of the Holy Spirit.

- Will deliberately question situations around them - either repeated or sporadic, progressive or regressive - since they are not designed to be *faits accomplis*. They will understand that it has not been and is not the will of God that, while the United States and France are comfortably rich, Haiti is extremely poor.

- Will then, in co-responsibility, be self-generous and greater risk-takers while decreasing reliance on foreigners and trusting in the *Grand Maître*, Christ, the Messiah, in whose strength they can do all things through worship and prayer (*Philippians* 4).

**7.4.2 Prophetic Radicalism**

Gomes sees prophetic radicalism primarily as an invitation to HCC to go to the roots of an issue and ask the questions that are being avoided or remain unanswered and to act on any given answers.\(^{1139}\) For instance, why are the economic and intellectual gaps between Haitian

How can we gradually increase Haitian life expectancy? Why has HP failed to support those efforts that effectively sought the reimbursement of the indemnity paid to France? Should HP be in solidarity with the Haitian farmers who yearn for the return of the Creole pig? Why has Haiti been constantly labelled and relabelled? How can the 44 percent of self-proclaimed Protestants each plant a tree? Is there a God for aid-providers and another for aid-receivers? These questions provide options for HP’s prophetic radicalism.

For the average Protestant, brought up in a culture of silence, the thought of asking these questions and the pursuit of answers are the genesis of empowering practices. The following ‘alternate responses’ will aim to enrich prophetic radicalism in its transformative initiatives.

1. HCC will aim to trigger the stoic Haitian character through conscientization. The emphasis will be on entrepreneurial Bondye-bon through the empowerment of self-dignity and consultations on national agreed consensuses. Invitation to meaningful local participation and a celebration of local giftedness, rejected by labour paternalism and regarded as backward, will arouse entrepreneurial Bondye-bon. Haitians will ‘feel worthy and proud of our [their] efforts’. Entrepreneurialism, even non-literate entrepreneurialism, of all sorts, is a gift, for a start and ought to be

---

1142 Conscientization implies both the mobilization of a countering force to eject the cultural myths that remain in the people despite the new reality and a prise de conscience towards safeguarding the costly social transformation. Paulo Freire, *The Politics of Education, Culture Power and Liberation* (Westport CT: Bergin and Carvey Publishers, 1985), pp.85-87
1143 Community participation ranges from nominal through instrumental, representative to transformation types. Sarah White & Romy Tiongco, *Doing Theology and Development, Meeting the Challenge of Poverty* (Edinburgh: St Andrews Press, 1997), pp.111-115
1144 This will recognise resources within ‘geographical proximity’, particularly, within the Haitian communities. Schwartz, *When*, pp.145-147; Anderson, ‘Aid’, *Development*, p.499
1145 ADQ22
harnessed and celebrated for its Haitian character.\textsuperscript{1146} This will help to resist the creeping theological assertion that presents God oscillating between goodness and fatalism.\textsuperscript{1147} Protestants will need to believe again that they can transform their habitat.

2. Furthermore in education, the Protestant School Federation\textsuperscript{1148} can begin to restructure Protestant school curricula and programmes\textsuperscript{1149} with an equal qualitative emphasis on civic, political, socio-economic, professional and academic education.\textsuperscript{1150} According to Freire, the focus will not merely be on reading and writing but to critically analyse and transform the socio-economic fabrications that keep them in the throes of poverty.\textsuperscript{1151} In continuance with the theme of breaking disempowering silences, conversations with Haitian Catholicism on matters of quality academic education will be paramount. Quality education for many Haitians will then no longer exclude the disempowered.

3. HCC will aim to incorporate these difficult questions in public worship and prayer opportunities and provide a spiritual home, a sanctuary, to discuss them.\textsuperscript{1152} In the sanctuary the theological scrutiny and criticism of economic poverty in Haitian societies [elitist and impoverished] which aid-dependency’s practices have impeded will be recurrent. Moreover, the hope of socio-economic empowerment can be embedded in worship experiences that cell groups and house groups provide.\textsuperscript{1153} Thus,

\textsuperscript{1146} Wah describes non-literate entrepreneurialism as limited academic and professional capacity in required fields of development, Wah, \textit{A la}, p.10
\textsuperscript{1147} Chanson, \textquote{Haiti} in Rainhorn, \textit{Haiti}, p.123
\textsuperscript{1148} Protestantism with an emphasis on education.
\textsuperscript{1149} This will be in response to what Rocourt laments on \textquote{The actual school curriculum inspired by foreign programs produces a small intellectual elite and a large majority of drop-outs’.} Rocourt, \textquote{The Challenge} in Mitchell, \textit{With Eyes}, p.79
\textsuperscript{1150} Freire argues: \textquote{Illiteracy is not a strictly linguistic or exclusively pedagogical or methodological problem. It is also a political, as is the very literacy through which we try to overcome illiteracy’.} Freire, \textit{The Politics}, p.10; also available: \url{https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ728822.pdf} (accessed 10 July 2017)
\textsuperscript{1151} Freire, \textit{The Politics}, p.10
\textsuperscript{1152} Likewise, Voodooists may contextualize them in their religious ceremonies.
\textsuperscript{1153} A similar movement called \textit{Ti Legliz} [small church] was carried out by Haitian Catholicism. It eventually contributed to the ousting of Jean-Claude Duvalier in 1986. Protestants, in their thirst for liberation, engaged
divine orthopraxis can address the social, political, economic, health and non-literacy issues through the nurturing, praying, worshipping and celebratory aspects of church life. For example, literacy-empowerment will particularly be offered to adult and restavèk and incorporate diversified educations and literacy into acts of worship. As such the call to go to church and Voodoo ceremonies will equate with the vocation to go to school.

Of course, this will entail a systematic re-education about current worship traditions, a re-organisation of priorities, a clash of church fundamentalists and life-changing ideas, profound dialogues and honest debates, and a structure to allow grassroots members to freely choose this path of recovery. Worship and prayer, as a daily occurrence in the Haitian Church [HCC, HP and Haitian Catholicism], can potentially form the basis of a need-driven-response movement into which the process for personal, collective and development transformation can begin.

4. The financing of social projects has been a pragmatic response to humanitarian and development needs in HP. In the same vein, the financing of academic research projects as a long-term empirical investment into finding cures for HP’s space may be given equal emphasis. At local theological seminaries, alongside systematic theology, for example, these types of theologically-based questions and social issues will become potential research questions for students. Then, in terms of prophetic aspirations, not only will these issues be integrated into Christian worships, Voodoo ceremonies and school curricula to heighten social consciousness and highlight spiritual needs, the research findings will also form the basis for theological reflection and praxis to enlighten informed consent narratives in difficult conversations with FMDs.

with the movement. However, this did not stem from HP’s leadership. Available: http://gailpellettproductions.com/ti-legliz-liberation-theology-in-haiti/ (accessed 20 December 2013)
5. HCC will also aim to galvanize the expertise of the Haitian Protestant media, particularly, *Radio Lumière* and *Radio 4VEH*[^1154] and other Protestant radio stations towards breaking the cultures of silence. In a community with a high rate of non-literacy and poor literacy, the power of the media, including the recent surge of social media[^1155], will have far-reaching benefits. Such power can be invested into the dismantling of the structures of deep-seated silences and other institutionalized typologies of economic disempowerment through story-telling, calls, debates, and educational, health, business-like and civic and sound environmental programmes.

6. A balanced bilateral partnership with FMDs, underpinned by the principles of dignity and self-worth, on agreed consensuses to assess informed consent narratives, will be an objectifying goal. In practical terms, HCC, together with HP, will seek to ensure that, as part of a national agreed consensus within the religious sector - an agreed percentage of local contribution may be the guarantor for overseas funding approvals of local projects. This policy will help to build confidence, impart rights of project ownership and reconstruct broken dignity and trust.

7. This policy will require HCC to set up a local regulatory taskforce[^1156] to regulate sponsored ‘agreed projects’ and propose love-based instead of foreign law-based reporting processes[^1157]. The taskforce will equally aim to forecast and justify, for example, the potential benefits for Haiti of re-forestation and literacy campaigns. An


[^1156]: Protestants with varied expertise.

[^1157]: Rowell, *To Give*, p.xx
additional task will entail the creation of ideally fruitful fora for heightened motivational dialogues with a view, for local churches, to releasing acres of church vacant lands to pilot re-forestation campaigns. Certainly, a ‘one member, one tree’ planting initiative on church vacant lands will, for example, in ten years, recreate the agricultural landscape of HP’s space.

8. In August 1791, the Voodooist ESRs reached a ‘national’ agreed consensus on the terms and strategies of a freedom-led revolution, known as the Haitian revolution. Haiti, historically, has not since had another national agreed consensus of such a profundity and infectious popularity. The portfolio advocates that, this time, HP, in co-responsibility with friends, local and foreign, takes on the initiative of conscientization to facilitate the nation to adopt a holistic agreed consensus that is locally need-based. These empowering initiatives towards self-sufficiency may initially be rooted in the orthopraxis of interdependency, community investment, and sharing of local resources. Slowly, spiritually reenergized heroism can then begin to reclaim Haiti from the chains of ‘hand-outs’ dependency and refashion it into a field of transforming mission where disempowered Haitians become self-sufficient.

**Conclusion**

In this thesis portfolio, I explore a Methodist perspective on aid-dependency in HP. Within this exploratory task, I carve, through a multi-disciplinary methodology, a research design in which HMC is the motivation for a case study. A Methodist perspective emerges as the synopsis of

---

1158 The Haitian church is a landlord. For example, government gives land to church missions. Available: [http://www.christianvillehaiti.com/](http://www.christianvillehaiti.com/) (accessed 17 October 2016). See also ADQ13, ADQ25, ADPR11
HP’s perspective on aid-dependency because it resonates with aid-dependency’s features of HP’s ecclesiastical typologies. Next, I utilize aspects of academic disciplines in the substance of theology, history, politics, economics, sociology, and development science to constitute the methodology. I elicit contributions from a literature review, the tasks of the pastoral cycle, and an empirical enquiry to justify its application. On a whole, these research strands assist me to formalize the exploration into a hypothesis.

Initially, the literature review emphasizes the worth of aid-generosity in Scriptures. It demonstrates how aid-giving was the domain of the church first before it has become a tool of service to secular aid-institutions. Furthermore, it articulates the need for former colonized lands [or LICs] to be ‘modernized’, ‘developed’ in order to earn their place alongside HICs. To materialize this, HICs resolved to invest, consistently and in diversified strategies, DA into LICs. However, despite the ethical nature of aid, aid-investment became entrepreneurial, institutionalized, regulated, commercialized, and politicized and therefore inhibited economic development. This trend crystallizes aid-investment into an aid-dependency culture and leads initially to the formulation of a hypothesis which I summarise as ‘Aid-dependency has disempowered LICs’.

In parallel, ‘literature on aid-dependency in Haiti’ reveals that Haiti has been disempowered by acts of socio-economic injustices, political short-sightedness, and diversified domestic polarizations for several years. The HICs’ interventions chose to combat them with reliable injections of essential goods and services. As described by ‘Effectiveness of Development Aid’ and TCI, dependency on aid-injections results in measurable aid-positivity. However, while there are indicators, albeit modest, of aid-positivity, aid-dependency fails Haiti. By implication, Haiti’s recurrent and investment budgets are subsidized by foreign sources in an un-ending cycle of disempowering dependency.
Consequently, aid-dependency, instead of poverty-alleviation, becomes HP’s socio-economic default and leads to the crystallization of TCII and TCIII. I, therefore, realign the hypothesis to be ‘Aid-dependency has disempowered Haitian Protestantism by inhibiting self-sufficiency’. I refer to self-sufficiency as HP’s sustained capacity to acquire and invest, through multi-lateral partnerships, contextually needed-assets towards economic profitability which exceeds aid-necessities. I progress with the research to test the coherence of the hypothesis and its inherent categories - TCI, TCII, and TCIII - in an empirical inquiry. I apply the bricolage method to examine and sort large amounts of data which further provided on-the-ground data, as described in Core Theme A, Core Theme B, Core Theme C, and Core Theme D to further sustain the hypothetical claim.

To deepen the research exploration and strengthen the hypothesis, I further discuss the hypothesis through the following lenses: First Lens, Second Lens, Third Lens, and Fourth Lens. Perennial costs of commercial and political disempowerment emerge from the discussion and consist of continued wealth extraction, socio-economic injustices and isolation, class segregation, and political economy of trauma. Notwithstanding the worth of aid-generosity, these costs, in the long-term, boost the crystallization of aid-dependency in HP and are heightened by FP’s successive self-motivated interventions. Positive accounts of aid [Second Lens] do not fruitfully co-exist with aid-dependency’s costs [First Lens] and tools [Third Lens] of socio-economic disempowerment because they pragmatically halt, through inhibitive theories and practices and opportunity wasting, transforming mission. In this context, HP has been transformed into a community of débrouillards.

The discussion acknowledges legitimate contrasting views on the effectiveness of the aid-dependency reality in HP. However, because aid-dependency is another type of poverty and poverty-alleviation work is inhibitive, collective aid-effectiveness is therefore an illusion. As such, the discussion further supports the hypothesis.
However, I find an aggregate set of literary- and empirical-based theoretical themes - existent and emerging - which compete to be the emphasis of the thesis. I consider this expanded scope of meaning of the subject to be a scholarly contribution to knowledge from which I highlight four salient competing claims.

1. FMDs’ embodiment of expressed compassion in HP’s space holds merit and represents a valid claim. As a participant explained: ‘The love of God compels [them] to always assist and care for [their] brothers and sisters in need’. Yet, I further discover, the existence of a perennial conflict between aid-providers’ misallocated compassion and aid-receivers’ induced false hope in aid. This conflict made poverty-alleviation work virtually ineffective and therefore lessened the significance of this claim.

2. Paternalism is a recurrent theme. The aid-literature describes it as ‘an imperialistic approach’ in dealing with the debt-crisis and as the 'papa' culture in which the 'haves' patronise the 'have-nots'. The empirical inquiry dissects paternalism into five overlapping memos and outlines its impact on the dignity of aid-receivers. The Third Lens considers paternalism’s inhibitive practices and modalities which work to disempower. Overall, paternalism is a dominant theme but not the central theme of the thesis because it is merely a manifestation of disempowerment.

3. Small scaled schemes of ‘palliative economics’, which do not support the status quo, but advocate ‘development economics’ in the long-term, deserve the right to such a claim. However, there exists, in parallel, a disproportionality in the amounts of time, ideas, energy, theology, and visions invested in ‘raising funds’, ‘palliative economics’, and ‘political absenteeism’ compared with the negligibility of the said resources being invested in ‘abolition campaigns’ and ‘development economics’. Moreover, the very
fact that this disproportionate investment has transformed a selective few ‘palliative economics’ beneficiaries into emerging elites who showed little empathy for the perennial poor has weakened the coherence of this claim.

4. The protracted HP’s culture of disempowering silences, sustained by the absence of a consolidated strategy of empowering mission towards giving a voice to the silent majority, is equally legitimized as a claim. For example, the misery of impoverished Haitians has not yet been tackled in a systematized, unified prosperity plan, driven by the aggregate FP’s/FMDs’ and HP’s competencies and resources. Moreover, the all-encompassing characteristics of the realigned hypothesis outweighed the legitimacy of this claim and, in fact, re-designated it as a sub-claim, a manifestation of disempowerment.

Precisely, I justifiably prioritize the central hypothesis on the basis that the foreground claims represent descriptive expressions of aid-dependency’s disempowering modalities which, in practice, support the hypothesis. Whereas aid-dependency has become the antidote to HP’s perennial disempowering socio-economics, the thesis, in contrast, highlights aid-dependency’s inhibitive capacities. As a ‘poverty-feeding factor’, aid-dependency has therefore, disempowered HP.

In response, rooted more copiously in emic data, the thesis emphasizes the significance of Core Theme D. It advocates the empowerment of the Haitian majority poor,1159 affirms their self-worth and voice, and celebrates the significance of their entrepreneurialism. To achieve this, empowerment narratives and strategies towards self-sufficiency invite aid-providers to validate aid-receivers’ informed consent and distil their paternalistic objectifying perspective. This

---

1159 This will purposefully include marginalised Haitian women. See ‘females’ sub-set in ‘Quantitative Description’ for levels of participation. p.126
empowerment alternative requires agreed institutional and national consensuses to epitomize the Haitian collective dream and galvanize their Bondye-bon entrepreneurialism in defiance to disempowering realities in the descriptive-empirical task. A new lease of life for HP demands the death of aid-dependency through the recalibration of existing aid-modalities, underpinned by co-responsibility, in this context of needed empowering change towards self-sufficiency.

Bibliography

Books

Abbot, E. Haiti, the Duvaliers and their Legacy (London: Robert Hale, 1988)


Anderson, R. S. The Shape of Practical Theology: Empowering Ministry with Theological Praxis (Downers Grove, Ill. InterVarsity Press, 2001)


Aristide, M. *Child Domestic Service in Haiti and its Historical Underpinnings* (Haiti: Bibliothèque Nationale, 2003)


Barbour, R. *Introducing Qualitative Research, a Student Craft to the Art of Doing Qualitative Research* (London: Sage Publications, 2014)

Beauzile, B. *Une Etude de la Communication Religieuse Haïtienne* (Port-au-Prince, Haïti: Media-Texte Press, 2008)


Beckles, H. *Britain’s Black Debt* (Barbados: University of the West Indies Press, 2013)


Boone, P. *Politics and the Effectiveness of Foreign Aid* (London: Centre for Economic Performance, 1995)


Calderisi, R. *Earthly Mission, the Catholic Church and World Development* (London: Yale University Press, 2013)


Casséus, J. *Éléments de la Théologie Haïtienne* (Port-au-Prince, Presse Evangélique, 2007)

Casséus, J. *Haïti, Quelle Eglise... Quelle Libération?* (Limbé, Haïti: Séminaire Théologique Baptiste, 1991)


Casséus, J. *Perspectives Missionnaires, Hier, Aujourd’hui, Demain* (Port-au-Prince, Haïti: La Presse Évangélique, 1997)

Casséus, J. *Théologie de la Libération* (Port-au-Prince, Presse Evangélique, 2004)


Chauvet, L. & Guillaumont, P. Aid, Volatility and Growth Again. When Aid Volatility Matters and When it Does Not (Cerdi: Université d’Auvergne and CNRS, 2007)


Chester, T. Good News to the Poor, Sharing the Gospel through Social Involvement (Nottingham: Inter-Varsity Press, 2004)


Cook, M. Education in Haiti (U.S Office of Education, Bulletin No.1, 1948)


Corbett, S. & Fikkert, B. When Helping Hurts, How to Alleviate Poverty without Hurting the Poor (Chicago: Moody Publishers, 2009)


Cox, J. The British Missionary Enterprise since 1700 (Christianity and Society in the Modern World) (London: Routledge, 2008)


Decraene, E. ‘Religious Confraternities and Spiritual Charities in Early Modern Aalst’ in
D. B. Presciutti (ed.), *Space, Place, and Motion: Locating Confraternities in the Late Medieval and Early Modern City* (Netherlands, Leiden: Brill, 2017)


Desroches, R. *Ce Que Tout Citoyen, Toute Citoyenne Devrait Savoir* (Pétion-Ville: Collection livrets Méthodistes, 2014)


Diederich, B. *Seeds of Fiction* (London: Peter Owen, 2012)


Dubois, L. *Haiti, the Aftershocks of History* (New York: Henry Colt and Company LLC, 2012)


Emile, E. S. *Haïti a Choisi de Devenir un Pays Pauvre, les Vingt Raisons qui le Prouvent* (Port-au-Prince: Les Presses de l’Université Quisqueya, 2017)


Fanon, F. *The Wretched of the Earth* (New York: Grove Press, 1963)

Farmer, P. *Haiti after the Earthquake* (USA: Public Affairs, 2011)


Finley, B. *Reformation in Foreign Missions* (California: Xulon Press, 2005)

Finn, R. *Almsgiving in the Later Roman Empire, Christian Promotion and Practice* (313–450) (Oxford University Press, 2006)


Gifford, P. *Christianity, Development and Modernity in Africa* (London: Hurst & Company,
2015)


Girard, P. R. *Haiti: The Tumultuous History - from Pearl of the Caribbean to Broken Nation* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010)


Griffiths, L. *A View from the Edge, the Autobiography of Leslie Griffiths* (London: Continuum International Publishing Group, 2010)


Hall, P. D. ‘Historical Perspectives on Non-Profit Organization in the United States’ in R. Herman and D. Renz (eds.), *The Jossey-Bass Handbook of Non-Profit Leadership and Management* (San Francisco: John Willey and Sons, 2010)


Hammersley, M. ‘Deconstructing the Qualitative–Quantitative Divide’, in J. Brannen (ed.),
Mixing Methods: Qualitative and Quantitative Research (London: Avebury, 1992)


Harris, B. ‘Charity and Poor Relief in England and Wales, Circa 1750–1914’ in Bernard Harris & Paul Bridgen (eds.), Charity and Mutual Aid in Europe and North America Since 1800 (London: Routledge, 2007)


Honorable, J. J. Enquête sur le Développement (Port-au-Prince: Imprimerie Centrale, 1974)


Hurbon, L. Dieu dans le Vaudou Haïtien (Paris: Payot, 1972)


Hamid, I. Out of the Depths (ed.) (Trinidad: St. Andrew’s Theological College, 1977)

James, E. C. Democratic Insecurities, Violence, Trauma, and Intervention in Haiti (London:


Jean, R. *A Quand la Réforme de l’Education en Haïti?* (Québec: Marquis Imprimeur, 2008)


Jenkins, P. *The Next Christendom, the Coming of Global Christianity* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2002)


Lederleitner, M. *Cross-cultural Partnerships, Navigating the Complexities of Money and Mission* (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, 2010)


Louis, A. *Voodoo in Haiti, Catholicism, Protestantism and a Model of Effective Ministry in the Context of Voodoo in Haiti* (Mustang, OK: Tate Publishing & Enterprises, 2007)


Maddox, R. *Responsible Grace, John Wesley’s Practical Theology* (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1994)


Miller, P. *Deuteronomy, Interpretation* (Louisville: John Knox Fress, 1990)

Morgan, D. L. *Integrating Qualitative and Quantitative Methods, a Pragmatic Approach* (London: Sage, 2014)

Morton, K. *Aid and Dependence, British Aid to Malawi* Vol. 11 (Oxon: Routledge, 2011)
Moyo, D. *Dead Aid: Why Aid is Not Working and How There is Another Way for Africa?* (London: Penguin, 2009)


Mulrain, G. ‘African Cosmology and Caribbean Christianity’ in B. Sankeralli (ed.), *At the Crossroads – African Caribbean Religion and Christianity* (Trinidad and Tobago: Caribbean Conference of Churches, 1995)


Nicholls, D. *From Dessalines to Duvalier, Race, Colour and National Independence in Haiti* (New Jersey: Macmillan Publishers, 1996)


Oden, T. C. *Ethics and Society, John Wesley’s Teachings* (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2014)


Panton, V. G. *The Church and Common-law Union* (Jamaica: Ebony Business Printers, 1992)


Pressoir, C. *Le Protestantisme Haïtien* Vol.1 (Port-au-Prince, Haïti: Imprimerie de la
Société Biblique et des Livres Religieux d’Haïti, 1945


Rieger, J. ‘Between God and the Poor, Rethinking the Means of Grace…’ in Heitzenrater (ed.), *The Poor and The People Called Methodists* (Nashville: Kingswood Books, 2002)


Romain, C. P. *Le Protestantisme dans la Société Haïtienne, Contribution à l’Étude Sociologique d’une Religion* (Port-au-Prince, Haïti: Imprimerie Henry Deschamps,
Rowell, J. *To Give or not to Give?* (Milton Keys, UK: Authentic Publishing, 2006)


Schabbel, C. *The Value Chain of Foreign Aid* (New York: Physica-Verlag Heidelberg, 2007)


Schuller, M. *Cette Charité Qui Tue, Haïti, l’Aide Internationale et les ONG* (Port-au-Prince: Université d’État d’Haïti, 2015)


Schwartz, G. *When Charity Destroys Dignity, Overcoming Unhealthy Dependency in the Christian Movement* (Milton Keynes, UK: AuthorHouse, 2007)


Stone, B. *Evangelism after Christendom, the Theology and Practice of Christian Witness* (Grand Rapids, MI: Brazos Press, 2007)


Swinton, J. & Mowat, H. *Practical Theology and Qualitative Research* (London: SCM Press, 2006)

Tandon, Y. *Ending Aid Dependence* (South Africa: Fahamu, 2008)

Terry, K. *The Paradox of Plenty: Oil Booms and Petro-States* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997)


Thomas, G. *How to Do Your Case Study* (London: SAGE Publications, 2011)


Turner, M. *Slaves and Missionaries, the Disintegration of Jamaican Slave Society, 1787-1834* (London: University of Illinois Press, 1982)


Vilaire, M. *Prosateurs Protestants Haïtiens* (ed.), (Port-au-Prince; Imprimerie des Antilles, 1964)


Wallis, J. *God’s Politics: Why the American Right Get it Wrong and the Left Doesn’t Get It* (Oxford: Lion Hudson, 2005)


White, S. & Tiongco, R. *Doing Theology and Development, Meeting the Challenge of Poverty* (Edinburgh: St Andrews Press, 1997)


Williams, C. W. *John Wesley’s Theology Today* (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1992)


Wilson, K. *Doing Theology, Methodist Theology* (London: T&T Clarke International, 2011)


Yoder, J. H. *For the Nations: Essays Public and Evangelical* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1997)

**Articles**


Clément, J. B. ‘History of Education in Haiti: 1804-1915 (First Part)’, *Revista de Historia de America* 87 (1979), pp.141-181


Lilavois, J. J. ‘Biographie’, Magasin Méthodiste Mai (1883)


Stamm, M. W. Let Every Soul Be Jesus’ Guest. A Theology of the Open Table (Nashville: 294
Abingdon Press, 2006)


Starman, A. B. ‘The Case Study as a Type of Qualitative Research’, *Journal of Contemporary Educational Studies* 1 (2013), pp.28-43


**Website**

Ali,  
[https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?referer=https://www.google.co.uk/&httpredirect=1&article=1005&context=mcnairjournal](https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?referer=https://www.google.co.uk/&httpredirect=1&article=1005&context=mcnairjournal)


Brooks,  

Peck, https://journals.openedition.org/humanitaire/883

Phillips, https://canada-haiti.ca/sites/default/files/Haiti,%20France%20and%20the%20Independence%20Debt%20of%201825_0.pdf


http://abolition.e2bn.org/people_24.html

http://abolition.e2bn.org/resistance_46.html

http://advocacyinternational.co.uk/featured-project/jubilee-2000

http://africanholocaust.net/mental-slavery/


Other Publications:


Wesley, J. *The 'Use of Money'* , B 2:270-277; Letter to the Editor of the London Magazine
Appendix 1

Pilot Questionnaire

I am Marcus Torchon, a minister of the MCCA. In addition to being a research student of the PhDmiss programme of the University of Manchester in the United Kingdom, I am also a Haitian. I invite you to participate in a research study on foreign-aid dependency by completing this questionnaire. The study will be carried out in Haiti within the Haitian Protestant Church.

The study aims to explore how aid-dependency functions within the Haitian Protestant Church. The Haitian Methodist Church will be used as a case study in the research to represent the
Haitian Protestant Church. While the information collected will be kept confidential, the outcome of the study will be revealed to you so that together with the wider church you may initiate the required changes.

As a participant, you are free to withdraw from completing the questionnaire or not to respond to particular questions. However, if you elect to complete it, then it will be very helpful to return it by December 1st, 2014. I sincerely thank you in advance for your interest in this subject and your cooperation in this study.

Kindly, return the completed questionnaire either by courier to the following address: 55 Dawpool Drive, Bromborough Wirral, CH62 6DE, England or via email at mytorchison@gmail.com

Please, feel free to use additional paper as required. Note that this is a pilot questionnaire.

The term ‘your church’ refers to the Haitian Protestant Church.

A. Nature
1. What do you know about foreign-aid in your church?

2. In what circumstances does your church require foreign-aid?

3. To what extent does your church depend on foreign-aid to function?

4. What is your opinion on salaries which are continuously subsidized by foreign partners?

5. How do you feel when salaries are paid late because of late arrival of foreign grants?

6. Describe how you think your church will cope without foreign-aid contributions.

B. Practice
7. Describe the impact that foreign-aid dependency has had on the self-worth of your church.
8. To what extent does foreign-aid dependency distract your church from being more mission focussed?

9. To what extent do you believe that there is a role for your church in Haitian politics?

10. Does your church prefer to utilize local resources or foreign-aid? Please, explain.

11. How does your church offer any assistance to its foreign Protestant partners?

C. Effect

12. How does foreign-aid dependency enable Haitian Protestants to be successful entrepreneurs?

13. To what extent does foreign-aid dependency alleviate poverty in your church?

14. How does your church’s leadership collaborate with foreign Protestant partners to defy dependency on foreign-aid in your church?

15. Is there a connection between aid-dependency and foreign control in your church? Please, explain your response

D. Practical Theology

16. To what extent is foreign-aid dependency a response to the Bondye-bon belief practice which exists among Haitian Protestants?
17. To what extent do you believe that aid-dependency is inspired by God?

E. Additional Comments

18. If you wish to provide additional information on the subject, please utilize the space below.

Appendix 2

Pilot Interview Questions
Local Churches

Episcopal, Lay Leadership and Opinion Leaders in the Church

The term ‘the church’ refers to the Haitian Protestant Church.

A. The Informant

The informants will be invited to:
1. Tell about themselves and their work in the church.
2. Share any experiences they have had with foreign-aid.
3. Express their feelings about being dependent on others for aid or project funding.

B. Informant’s Church Practice
4. Describe the sort of relationship that exists between the church and its foreign-aid partners.
5. Describe the purposes of receiving foreign-aid in the church.
6. Share their thoughts on how the church can provide both social services to the poor as well as help to bring in-depth transformation of their socio-economic conditions.

C. Informant’s Church Theological Practice
7. Share their reflection on the Bondye-bon attitude. This, very often, means to passively wait on God for help.
8. Comment, in the light of their dependency, on the biblical motive of giving versus receiving.
9. Share their views on how dependency on foreign-aid is different from dependency on God.

D. Effect on Informant’s Church
10. Discuss the freedom they have to invest foreign-aid without foreign control.
11. Discuss foreign-aid dependency as a potential tool of foreign control.
12. Reflect on the effectiveness of a partnership funding policy – foreign partners to match local resources with an agreed percentage of foreign funding.

E. Informant’s Concluding Words
13. Share any additional information on this subject.

Appendix 3

Pilot Interview Questions

Leaders of Foreign Missions

The term ‘the church’ refers to the Haitian Protestant Church and
The term ‘home church’ refers to the church of the foreign missionaries.

A. The Informant

The informants will be invited to:
1. Tell about themselves and their work in the church.
2. Share any experiences they have had with providing aid to the church.
3. Tell of their attitude towards foreign-aid dependency.

**B. Informant’s Home Church Practice**
4. Discuss the practice of equal partnership between their home church and the church.
5. Discuss the purposes of providing aid to the church.
6. Discuss the value of the sponsorship of civic and political education programmes in order to transform the social conditions of the church.
7. Comment on the sort of benefits that they have gained for providing aid to the church.

**C. Informant’s Church Theological Practice**
8. Share their reflection on the Bondye-bon attitude and the extent to which they see themselves as God’s answer to such wait. The Bondye-bon attitude, very often, means to passively wait on God for help.
9. Share their theological views on the practice of continuous giving even when this gesture may lead to foreign-aid dependency.

**D. Effect**
10. Discuss the perception that their aid is more about wealth creation among church leaders than the people they serve in the church.
11. Share their views on the managerial abilities of church leaders to manage aid in the church.

**E. Informant’s Concluding Words**
12. Share any additional information on this subject.

**Appendix 4**

**The Questionnaire for Ministers and Teachers**

I am Marcus Torchon, a minister of the MCCA. In addition to being a research student of the PhDmiss programme at the University of Manchester in the United Kingdom, I am also Haitian. I invite you to participate in a research study on foreign-aid dependency by completing this questionnaire. The study will focus on the dependency of the Haitian Protestant Church on foreign-aid and will be carried out in Haiti.

The study aims to explore how dependency on foreign-aid functions within the Haitian Protestant Church. In order to do that, I use the Haitian Methodist Church as a case study. Other Haitian Protestant churches will also be approached for relevant information. Although the information collected will be kept confidential, the outcome of the study will be revealed to
participants so that they, together with the wider church, may initiate the required course of action.

As a participant, you are free to withdraw from completing the questionnaire or not to respond to particular questions. However, if you elect to complete it, then it will be very helpful to return it to me by May 27th, 2015. I sincerely thank you in advance for your interest in this subject and your cooperation in this study.

Kindly, return the completed questionnaire either by courier to the following address: 55 Dawpool Drive, Bromborough Wirral, CH62 6DE, England or via email to mytorchison@gmail.com

Please, feel free to use additional paper as required.

A. Nature
1. Please, tell me what you know about the use of foreign-aid in the following: the Haitian Protestant Church, your local church and your local school.

2. To what extent is the following dependent on foreign-aid: the Haitian Protestant Church, your local church and your local school?

3. Give your opinion on how the following will survive without receiving foreign-aid: the Haitian Protestant Church, your local church and your local school.

B. Practice
4. Describe the impact, if any, that foreign-aid dependency has had on the self-worth of the following: the Haitian Protestant Church, your local church and your local school.

5. Describe the impact, if any, that foreign-aid dependency has had on poverty-alleviation in the following: the Haitian Protestant Church, your local church and your local school.

6. Describe the impact, if any, that foreign-aid dependency has had on self-sufficiency of the following: the Haitian Protestant Church, your local church and your local school.
7. Describe any other impact that foreign-aid dependency has had on the following: the Haitian Protestant Church, your local church and your local school.

8. To what extent does foreign-aid dependency distract the Haitian Protestant Church from being involved in socio-political change?

C. Effect
9. How do you feel about foreign-aid dependency?

10. To what extent do you perceive that foreign-aid boosts the wealth of church leaders more than that of the people they lead in the church?

11. Is there a connection between dependency on foreign-aid and foreign control in the following: the Haitian Protestant Church, your local church and your local school? Please, explain your response.

D. Practical Theology
12. The Bondye-bon attitude very often means to passively wait on God for help. To what extent does foreign-aid dependency nurture this attitude in the following: the Haitian Protestant Church, your local church and your local school?

13. Kindly, share your views on how dependency on foreign-aid is different from dependency on God.

E. Additional Comments
14. If you wish to provide additional information on the subject, please utilize the space below.
Appendix 5

Interview Questions
Leaders of Local Churches

Episcopal, Lay Leadership and Opinion Leaders in the Church

The term ‘the church’ refers to the Haitian Protestant Church.

A. The Informant

The Informants will be invited to:

1. Tell about themselves and their work in the church.
2. Share any experiences they have had with foreign-aid.

B. Informant’s Church Practice
3. Describe the sort of relationship that exists between the church and its foreign-aid partners.

4. Describe the purposes of receiving foreign-aid in the church.

5. Share their thoughts on how the church can both provide both social services to the poor and engage in in-depth transformation of their socio-economic conditions.

C. Informant’s Church Theological Practice
6. Share their reflection on the Bondye-bon attitude. This, very often, means to passively wait on God for help.

7. Share their views on how dependency on foreign-aid is different from dependency on God.

D. Effect on Informant’s Church
8. Discuss foreign-aid dependency as a potential tool of foreign control.

9. Reflect on the effectiveness of a partnership funding policy – foreign partners to match local resources with an agreed percentage of foreign funding.

E. Informant’s Concluding Words
10. Share any additional information on this subject.

Appendix 6

Interview Questions
Leaders of Foreign Missions

The term ‘the church’ refers to the Haitian Protestant Church and

The term ‘home church’ refers to the church of the foreign missionaries.

A. The Informant

The informants will be invited to:

1. Tell about themselves and their work in the church.

2. Share any experiences they have had with providing aid to the church.
B. Informant’s Home Church Practice

3. Discuss the practice of equal partnership between their home church and the church.

4. Discuss the purposes of providing aid to the church.

5. Discuss the value of the sponsorship of civic and political education programmes in order to transform the social conditions of the church.

6. Comment on the sort of benefits that they have gained for providing aid to the church.

C. Informant’s Church Theological Practice

7. Share their reflection on the Bondye-bon attitude and the extent to which they see themselves as God’s answer to such wait. The Bondye-bon attitude, very often, means to passively wait on God for help.

8. Share their theological views on the practice of continuous giving even when this gesture may lead to foreign-aid dependency.

D. Effect

9. Discuss the perception that their aid is more about wealth creation among church leaders than the people they serve in the church.

10. Share their views on the managerial abilities of church leaders to manage aid in the church.

E. Informant’s Concluding Words

11. Share any additional information on this subject.