Yearning for the Infinite

A Study of the Capacity of Music to Mediate a Sense of Transcendence

A thesis submitted to the University of Manchester for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in the Faculty of Humanities

2019

Hannah Burton

School of Arts, Languages and Cultures
Contents

Abstract ............................................................................................................. 4
Declaration .......................................................................................................... 5
Copyright Statement .......................................................................................... 5
Acknowledgements ............................................................................................. 6
The Author ........................................................................................................... 6

1. Introduction: Music as a Medium of Transcendence ................................. 7
   Transcendence and the Infinite ...................................................................... 8
   Yearning and the Infinite ................................................................................. 10
   Instrumental Music and the Infinite ............................................................... 11
   Conversational Partners ................................................................................. 14
   A Musical Reading of Theology: Begbie, Peacocke and Pederson, and MacMillan ........................................................................................................... 17
   Music as Identity- and Community-forming: Clarke and Beckford ................. 25
   A Theological Reading of Music: Hardie, Watson, and Brown ....................... 28
   Music as Expressing or Evoking Emotion: Bowie, Balthasar, Stoltzfus, and Heaney ........................................................................................................ 34
   Conclusions ...................................................................................................... 49

2. E.T.A. Hoffmann’s Theory of Music and the Infinite ................................. 52
   The Infinite in Hoffmann’s Writing on Music .................................................. 52
   Yearning as a Key Element in Hoffmann’s Discussion of Music .................... 57
   Music as Personal, Individual, and Internal ................................................. 59
   Music as Language and Communicator ....................................................... 61
   Unity and Simplicity ....................................................................................... 63
   Sublime and Romantic ................................................................................... 64
   Hoffmann’s Review of Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony: A Close Reading .......... 65
   Conclusions .................................................................................................... 78

3. Religion as Experience in Schleiermacher’s Thought ................................. 81
   On Religion: Speeches to its Cultured Despisers ......................................... 81
   The Christian Faith ......................................................................................... 113
   A Hoffmannian-Schleiermacherian Approach to Music and the Infinite .......... 123
   A Hoffmannian-Schleiermacherian Approach to Music and the Infinite in Practice ................................................................................................. 129
4. Identifying Yearning in Beethoven’s Seventh Symphony ............. 133
   First Movement .......................................................... 134
   Second Movement ...................................................... 139
   Third Movement ....................................................... 144
   Fourth Movement ...................................................... 147
   Yearning for the Infinite in Beethoven’s Seventh Symphony ........ 150

5. Tension, Yearning, and Anticipation in Schubert’s Ninth Symphony
   .................................................................................. 154
   First Movement .......................................................... 154
   Second Movement ...................................................... 165
   Third Movement ....................................................... 173
   Fourth Movement ...................................................... 177
   Yearning for the Infinite in Schubert’s Ninth Symphony ............ 183

6. Conclusion: Yearning for the Infinite as a Path to Transcendence... 186
   Sense Perception over Knowledge ...................................... 189
   The Self and a Sense for the Infinite .................................. 192
   Yearning and Incompleteness .......................................... 193
   Nostalgia and Hope ..................................................... 197
   Opening the Door to an Experience of the Infinite .................. 202
   Areas for Further Study .................................................. 205
   Bibliography .................................................................. 207

Word count: 79,974
Abstract

There is a significant amount of scholarship debating the relationship between music and theology, primarily concerned either with how music might be used as part of prayer and worship or as a conceptual model for understanding certain aspects of doctrine. However, very little consideration is given to the question of how music might facilitate in some way an experience of something transcendent.

This study aims, therefore, to discover how music might open the door for listeners to an experience of religion or transcendence through its forms and features. It relies on an understanding of religion that is not based on practice or doctrine, and so uses the work of Friedrich Schleiermacher to outline a conception of religion as an experience of the ‘infinite,’ which is beyond immediate experience. We notice a similar experience of the infinite highlighted in E.T.A Hoffmann’s writing on music, which emphasises music’s ability to point its listeners toward the infinite. Central to this experience for both scholars is the feeling of yearning on the part of the individual to reach out toward the infinite, having being made aware of the possibility of this experience. For Schleiermacher, some kind of vehicle is necessary to create this feeling of yearning in order to prompt an experience of the infinite; for Hoffmann, music acts as such a vehicle.

An analysis of two orchestral works by Beethoven and Schubert as case studies demonstrates how musical features can create for the listener this feeling of yearning that creates the context for an experience of the infinite. Unlike Hoffmann, for whom the link between music and the infinite is rather too direct, this study concludes that, though music might create the context for an experience of the infinite, the onus is ultimately on the listener to take up the opportunity of such an experience and to appropriate it as an experience of faith.

This study addresses an under-developed area of research in terms of theology and music by examining how it is that music might create the context for its listeners for an experience of the infinite. In doing so, it goes beyond ideas of how music might speak to those who already have faith to explore the role music might play in creating an experience that might lead to faith, and it is hoped that the analysis of the case studies in this study might create a model by which other styles and genres of music can be similarly analysed.
Declaration

No portion of the work referred to in this thesis has been submitted in support of an application for another degree or qualification of this or any other university or other institute of learning.

Copyright Statement

i. The author of this thesis (including any appendices and/or schedules to this thesis) owns certain copyright or related rights in it (the “Copyright”) and s/he has given The University of Manchester certain rights to use such Copyright, including for administrative purposes.

ii. Copies of this thesis, either in full or in extracts and whether in hard or electronic copy, may be made only in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 (as amended) and regulations issued under it or, where appropriate, in accordance with licensing agreements which the University has from time to time. This page must form part of any such copies made.

iii. The ownership of certain Copyright, patents, designs, trademarks and other intellectual property (the “Intellectual Property”) and any reproductions of copyright works in the thesis, for example graphs and tables (“Reproductions”), which may be described in this thesis, may not be owned by the author and may be owned by third parties. Such Intellectual Property and Reproductions cannot and must not be made available for use without the prior written permission of the owner(s) of the relevant Intellectual Property and/or Reproductions.

iv. Further information on the conditions under which disclosure, publication and commercialisation of this thesis, the Copyright and any Intellectual Property and/or Reproductions described in it may take place is available in the University IP Policy (see http://documents.manchester.ac.uk/DocuInfo.aspx?DocID=24420), in any relevant Thesis restriction declarations deposited in the University Library, The University Library’s regulations (see http://www.library.manchester.ac.uk/about/regulations/) and in The University’s policy on Presentation of Theses.
Acknowledgements

With grateful thanks to Prof. David Law, who not only supervised this thesis but also lent me the book by Jeremy Begbie that inspired it. Thank you for your endless patience when I had lost focus, and your confidence that I could succeed. Thanks also to Prof. Thomas Schmidt, who co-supervised this thesis and provided valuable insight and advice. Special thanks to the Humanities Researcher Development team for their practical and emotional support in bringing this thesis to completion.

Most of this thesis was written at home, and so thanks must go to those whose spaces I have invaded with books, binders, and stationery. To my mum, my sister and my nana – I could achieve very little without you behind and beside me. And finally, to my husband, for everything you are and everything you do.

This thesis is dedicated to my grandad, who certainly would have proof-read it.

The Author

This project is inspired by two decades of music making, and my particular fascination with how music can express so much more than the notes on the page. I studied music at undergraduate level at the University of Liverpool before undertaking a Master’s degree in Religion and Theology at the University of Manchester.
Introduction: Music as a Medium of Transcendence

For centuries, music has been used by religious communities across various traditions as an important element of prayer and worship. However, individuals’ engagement with music as a signpost to something beyond immediate experience is rarely discussed. As Brown points out, ‘so used are theologians to engaging with the written word that it is all too easy for them to forget that for most of Christian history… most Christians’ primary experience of their faith will have been visual and, though probably to a lesser degree, aural. The drama of the liturgy, hymns and sermons, re-enactments of the biblical stories… and the visual imagery present throughout the church building would have been what inspired and directed their faith.’1 Though Brown goes on to focus primarily on visual imagery, he raises an interesting point about the significant role music has to play in forming liturgy and inspiring and shaping the faith of individuals. Those scholars who have considered the relationship between music and religion have set about to uncover why music is afforded such great significance in the liturgy and just how it might be able to direct the faith of individuals and communities.

This study aims to explore the capacity of music to cultivate a sense of the infinite or transcendent in the listener. What we mean by these difficult terms will be discussed in due course. We will fuse ideas from E.T.A. Hoffmann and Schleiermacher to create a set of concepts to articulate the transcendent elements of instrumental music. We will then apply these concepts to a close listening of Beethoven’s Seventh and Schubert’s Ninth Symphonies to see how the musical features therein create an experience that points the listener toward the transcendent. Central to our study, therefore, will be the notions of transcendence, the infinite, and yearning, all of which we will understand in terms of instrumental music. Before we begin our analysis, let us consider how it is that each of these concepts will inform our examination of music as a medium of transcendence.

---

TRANSCENDENCE AND THE INFINITE

Many scholars refer to the experience that music creates in terms of transcendence, and so this seems an appropriate point of departure for us, too. It would seem that there is, as Jeremy Begbie describes, ‘an ineradicable, perhaps even essential, link between music and transcendence’ \(^2\) that precedes any kind of specific religious knowledge or doctrine. We will not be taking our discussion so far as to encompass the ways in which music might aid in an individual’s commitment to a particular religion or how it might impact on their understanding of or relation to a God figure; instead, we will be examining how music might be able to direct the individual toward something beyond their immediate experience. Using ‘transcendence’ and ‘the transcendent’ allows us to explore the kind of experience that music creates, whereas more specific language about deities or doctrine seems to refer more properly to the listener’s responses to this experience.

What, then, do we mean when we talk about transcendence? According to Begbie, ‘transcendence will be theorised in ways that are fundamentally shaped by an awareness of the limits of our powers of representation, an intense sense of the inadequacy of the capacities of human language and thought, the stubborn resistance of certain realities to linguistic and conceptual seizure.’ \(^3\) Scruton identifies three applications of the terms ‘transcendent’ and ‘transcendental:’ ‘the theological idea, according to which God is said to transcend our attempts to define or describe him. There is the philosophical idea… according to which certain objects of thought transcend the conditions laid down by the understanding and therefore be thought only negatively, as lying beyond thought. And there is what we might call the aesthetic idea, in which we speak of transcendent versions of empirical phenomena.’ \(^4\) There are certainly elements of both Begbie and Scruton’s notions of transcendence that will inform our discussion, particularly the idea of transcendence being characterised by the limits or boundaries of human existence and experience, an idea that is common to both scholars.

Nevertheless, the terms ‘transcendence’ and ‘the transcendent’ do present us with some difficulties. The idea of transcendence may seem to deny the temporality of music,
and we are certainly not trying to claim that music is something other than this world. Instead, we must find a way of expressing the experience that music creates without negating the fact that this experience occurs for the listener within the context of the finite world. In order to avoid the problems caused by this connotation of transcendence we must bear in mind that music itself is not transcendent but that it creates an experience for the listener that points toward transcendence. Moreover, the term ‘transcendence’ might also be thought to suggest that the experience music creates is somehow distant and unobtainable for the listener. This connotation of the term transcendence is problematic for us because, as we will see in our concluding pages, the experience that music evokes relies a great deal on subjectivity.

It would seem, therefore, that relying solely on the terms ‘transcendence’ and ‘the transcendent’ presents us with some problems in terms of exploring the experience that music creates, though the notions of intangibility and of pointing beyond immediate experience that relate to these terms are useful to us. Since we are not trying to claim that music is itself or contains something of transcendence, we must employ an alternative notion to explore the experience that music creates that points toward the transcendent. Here we may turn to our conversational partners Hoffmann and Schleiermacher and make use of a concept employed by both of these scholars, namely, ‘the infinite.’ Both, as we will discover, focus their discussion not around transcendence but around the notion of the infinite, the sense for which, as we will see, is shown by both Hoffmann and Schleiermacher to direct the individual toward the transcendent. If transcendence is to be characterised as being beyond the limits of immediate experience, the infinite and sense for the infinite describe an awareness of the possibility of something existing beyond immediate experience, and so prompts the individual to strive and yearn for that which is beyond immediate experience. This awareness, according to Schleiermacher’s writing (which we will examine more closely in the following chapters), is brought about by the realisation of the limited nature of the finite world that awakens the individual to the possibility of something that exists beyond it. Unlike the concept of transcendence, with its problematic connotations of distance and otherness, the infinite is, for Hoffmann and Schleiermacher, a dimension within human existence that is not reducible to it. As we will see in our discussion of Schleiermacher’s work in later chapters, Schleiermacher bases his argument on a ‘sense for the infinite,’ which we will argue is directed toward the transcendent. In other words, we will use the concept of the infinite as a tool for
articulating more fully the experience that music creates that points its listeners toward transcendence. In order to fully explore this sense for the infinite, however, we must also consider how it is that music is able to awaken the sense for the infinite in the listener, and this is the role that our additional concept of yearning has to play.

YEARNING AND THE INFINITE

Since the sense for the infinite depends on the realisation of the limited nature of the finite world and of the possibility of something existing beyond immediate experience, it would seem that there is a need for something to stimulate it and bring the individual to this awareness. This awareness can be thought of as a yearning, and this notion will be central to our argument in the following chapters as a signpost of the possibility of the infinite. It indicates not a yearning for finite things but rather a yearning that derives from the recognition of the limited nature of the finite, and longs to reach out beyond the finite. In our discussion of Schleiermacher and Hoffmann’s work below, we will encounter yearning as an essential aspect of an experience of transcendence. The presence and prominence of the feeling of yearning also indicates the necessity of something that can awaken such a feeling – this is, as we will suggest, the capacity of music, to awaken and instil in the listener a feeling of yearning that brings to their attention the possibility of the infinite and inspires them to reach out toward it. According to Hoffmann’s discussion, the feeling of yearning comes about as a result of tension in music, a tension that makes clear to the listener that all is not as it should be. Whereas music that creates a feeling of comfort and security for the listener does not cause the listener to strive for any kind of resolution, tension, conflict, and insecurity evoke for the listener a feeling of yearning.

As we will discover in our analysis of Hoffmann’s writings on music and the infinite, tension and the subsequent feeling of yearning are created through music’s forms and features and the way in which they are heard and experienced by the listener. We will return to the kinds of features that produce a feeling of tension and yearning in the following chapters – they include such features as tonality, instrumentation, and thematic structure – and we will also look for such features in our own analysis of Beethoven’s
Seventh and Schubert’s Ninth Symphony to discover the ways in which tension and yearning exist for the listener in those works.

It would seem, then, that our central concepts of transcendence, the infinite, yearning, and tension are closely connected, and will remain interlinked throughout this study. We will focus primarily on an experience of transcendence rather than any specific religious doctrine or tradition, using the notion of the infinite (and the individual’s sense for the infinite) as a tool for articulating this experience of transcendence and, in particular, how the individual’s sense for the infinite is directed toward the transcendent. We will recognise yearning as a feeling that awakens the individual to the sense for the infinite, and tension as a key factor in generating this feeling of yearning. This study will use these concepts to explore the infinite character of instrumental music that directs its listeners towards transcendence, using case studies of musical works to highlight the presence and effectiveness of tension and yearning. Before we continue, let us consider why it is that instrumental music in particular has a role to play in this project.

**INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC AND THE INFINITE**

Many of the scholars who write about the relationship between music and transcendence or theology (we will examine these below) are not selective in their musical analysis and are content to discuss music generally as a homogeneity. However, this leads to issues such as how we might be able to consider all genres as functioning in the same way or as having a similar effect on listeners. For instance, we perhaps would not expect to speak about Blur and Beethoven or the Spice Girls and Stravinsky in exactly the same terms. In the same way, we must not assume that all music has equal value and significance across cultures – certainly, the formal and tonal structures with which the Western world is familiar are very different from the types of structures used in other music from around the world. Another issue raised as a result of discussing music as a general homogeneity is the contrast between instrumental music and music that relies on a text or narrative. Music that is accompanied by a text or narrative arguably directs the listener toward a particular meaning or mood, whereas instrumental music without any narrative gives the listener greater freedom in their response to the music. Given that our task in this study is to explore the capacity of music to mediate
something of the infinite or transcendent – that is, that which is beyond conceptual or rational representation – we will be focusing on instrumental music. Not only is it necessary that we focus on one particular area of music so as to limit the scope of our study but it also allows us to examine how our key concepts relate to music in the most clear and useful way possible.

We are focusing on an experience of transcendence that does not include any specific ideas of doctrine or tradition, and so it follows that we would also focus on music that does not communicate any kind of specific meaning, including any kind of religious meaning. Therefore, rather than pointing to a text or narrative (and so to a specific meaning), we shall focus on the ability of instrumental music to point beyond the finite world to the infinite. For this reason, we might suggest that instrumental music is able to mediate a sense for the infinite not in spite of its lack of text but precisely because it is independent of any text or narrative; moreover, it can generate yearning and express a sense of the infinite because of (not in spite of) the ineffability of its meaning. It is important to emphasise that text- or programme-less music is not devoid of expression – as Dahlhaus argues, it should ‘not be perceived as “empty” but rather as sublime.’\textsuperscript{5} He goes on to say that ‘music that is “dissolved” from verbal or functional constraints “sublimates” or “exalts” itself above the boundedness of the finite to an intimation of the infinite.’\textsuperscript{6} Moreover, it communicates a meaning that is not accessible through verbal language; it ‘expresses what words are not even capable of stammering.’\textsuperscript{7} This means that, without a text or programme which to refer, we must turn to music’s forms and features as the means by which instrumental music is able to evoke the feeling of yearning and mediate a sense for the infinite.

As we will see, the subjective and personal experience of music is another important element of its infinite nature, and this subjectivity is enhanced in music that communicates no specific meaning – the onus is placed on the listener to interpret and appropriate the experience of such music. The music that we will discuss over the coming chapters in terms of its ability to awaken the listener’s sense for the infinite will therefore be purely instrumental music without any text or narrative. We are by no means

\textsuperscript{6} Ibid., 60.
\textsuperscript{7} Ibid., 63.
the first to examine such music in this way – as we will see in chapter 2, it is instrumental music that our conversational partner E.T.A. Hoffmann regards to be particularly evocative of the infinite. He does consider vocal music – notably the music of Palestrina, for whom he says composing was ‘a religious exercise’\(^8\) – to be able to express something of the infinite as ‘an act of worship in itself,’\(^9\) though it is instrumental music whose ‘only subject-matter is infinity.’\(^{10}\) Hoffmann’s understanding of such music as having the ability to create the conditions by which the listener might experience something of the infinite is indicative of a cultural change which began to recognise the special power of instrumental music. Hoffmann is not the only writer, and certainly not the first, to emphasise time and time again this special quality, which appears to derive from instrumental music’s lack of specific meaning. Wackenroder speaks of the ‘vagueness’ of music as a ‘virtue of metaphysical proportions,’\(^{11}\) while Michaelis asserts that ‘musical sounds are in themselves a spiritual phenomenon,’ precisely because of their lack of specificity.\(^{12}\)

The idea of instrumental music as being particularly suited to an evocation of the infinite is not limited, however, to the Romantic period. As we saw earlier, Dahlhaus expresses an understanding of instrumental music without text or narrative that is ‘exalted into the realm of the immeasurable;’\(^{13}\) indeed, music ‘attains its metaphysical destiny in the very process of distancing itself even further from empirical circumstances – from functions, words, plots.’\(^{14}\) He suggests that both harmony\(^{15}\) and rhythm\(^{16}\) are key features of music through which yearning is conveyed. It is instrumental music’s lack of specific meaning, Dahlhaus argues, that allows it to create such an experience. In this way, Dahlhaus agrees with Hoffmann, whose rejection of music with text he emulates.\(^{17}\)

---


\(^9\) Ibid, 366.


\(^11\) Quoted in Mary Sue Morrow, *German Music Criticism in the Late Eighteenth Century* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), 14.

\(^12\) Ibid., 15.

\(^13\) Ibid., 30.

\(^14\) Ibid., 33.

\(^15\) Ibid., 44.

\(^16\) Ibid., 56-7.

\(^17\) Ibid.
He also appears to reject the suggestion that ‘the musically spiritual’ may belong only to music with text or narrative.\(^1\)

Since it was instrumental music that first drew scholars’ attention to the potential of music to evoke a sense for the infinite and direct its listeners toward the transcendent, it seems appropriate that we also focus on this type of music for our study. Not only would applying our set of key concepts to instrumental music allow us to remain consistent with these early ideas of such music’s infinite nature, but it would also enable us to build upon theories of instrumental music and transcendence, such as Dahlhaus’, that have come since.

As we have mentioned above, we will focus in this study not on instrumental music generally, but rather on examples or case studies of musical works that can be thought of as purely instrumental music without text or narrative. The decision to focus on case studies allows us to examine in detail the particular features of music that create a feeling of yearning and awaken the listener to the sense of the infinite. We will consider two specific examples with the aim of creating a model for analysing how music might create the context for an experience of the infinite that might then be applied to other musical works, styles, and genres. Much as Hoffmann does in his review of Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony, we will explore how the use of features such as tonality, instrumentation, and thematic structure create a tension and yearning that awaken the listener’s sense for the infinite and direct the listener toward the transcendent.

**CONVERSATIONAL PARTNERS**

In order to fully examine music’s potential for evoking a sense of the infinite directed toward transcendence, we must first fully explore the concepts of transcendence, the infinite, yearning, and tension that we have outlined above. As we have highlighted, we will be drawing upon the ideas of E.T.A. Hoffmann and F.D.E. Schleiermacher to examine how these concepts might aid our understanding of how instrumental music might mediate an experience of transcendence.

\(^1\) Ibid., 14.
Hoffmann was one of the first to write about music’s infinite nature, and particularly to do so with specific reference to a musical work – for this reason, we will pay close attention to his review of Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony. Hoffmann did write more broadly about the ability of music to direct its listeners toward the transcendent, and outlines a conception of transcendence articulated by the notion of the infinite – an experience of which he goes some way toward describing. However, the detail in which Hoffmann examines Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony provides an example of how these concepts can actually be applied to individual musical works and experienced by the listener. For instance, as we will observe in chapter 2, Hoffmann devotes a great deal of his review to analysing how the various musical features of this symphony create a feeling of tension that, in turn, generates the yearning that leads to an awakening of the listener’s sense for the infinite. Hoffmann plays a central role in this study because his work sets a precedent for examining music’s potential to spark the listener’s sense for the infinite and demonstrates in practical terms how the key concepts not only relate to but can be experienced through musical works.

Though Hoffmann’s theory of music and transcendence provides an excellent starting point and basis for our own study, his argument, as we will see, is somewhat underdeveloped, and so we will use his theological contemporary F.D.E. Schleiermacher to enhance our understanding of an evocation of something beyond immediate experience. Both Hoffmann and Schleiermacher are concerned primarily with experience; for Hoffmann, this is the experience of music that points the listener beyond immediate experience, and for Schleiermacher, it is a focus on religion as experience over doctrine. By emphasising experience over knowledge, we begin to move away from ideas of music as a metaphor for religious concepts so as to consider how music might open the door for listeners to an experience of that which is beyond their immediate experience.

Schleiermacher’s work informs our study in the sense that it elaborates on and provides further explanation of the concepts that Hoffmann applies to music. In particular, Schleiermacher discusses in detail how it is that the sense for the infinite is awakened in the individual and the role that yearning has to play in experiencing the infinite. Having established his theory of the infinite and of how the individual might continue to yearn and strive toward the infinite, Schleiermacher goes on in his later work to consider how individuals experience the sense for the infinite that points them toward the transcendent within the context of a particular religious tradition.
Once we have grounded our key terms in the work of Hoffmann and Schleiermacher, we may next examine them in relation to specific musical case studies. In order to maximise the usefulness of the principles we have identified, these case studies will come from the repertoire roughly contemporary with Schleiermacher and Hoffmann and therefore informed by Romantic ideas. This will provide us with a basis for exploring Hoffmann’s claims about how such music, and Beethoven’s music in particular, is able to point the listener toward the infinite. Moreover, it will allow for the development of a method of identifying the aspects of music that are able to do this that most closely reflects Hoffmann and Schleiermacher’s own ideas but that may also then be applied to other styles of music. For this reason, we will explore Beethoven’s Seventh Symphony, following Hoffmann’s assertions about the special quality of Beethoven’s music, as well as Schubert’s Ninth Symphony, in which we will look to discover a similar quality. By using music from roughly the same culture and time as both Hoffmann and Schleiermacher’s writings, we aim to remain consistent with their theories of the infinite and yearning and to apply these theories as accurately as possible to our analysis. It should be noted that the decision to focus on Western classical music rather than any other genre or style is not a value judgement but instead is a necessary limitation of our study and aids us in exploring ideas in the context of Hoffmann and Schleiermacher.

Having discussed music itself and the features used to create tension and a subsequent feeling of yearning, we must finally turn to the question of how we might think of the religious appropriation of this key notion of yearning. Though much of Schleiermacher’s conception of religion rests on the idea of the individual yearning for the infinite, we must turn to other sources to illustrate how the stimuli of this feeling of yearning might create the context for an experience of faith. For this reason, we will use Kierkegaard, another rough contemporary of Schleiermacher’s, to examine how it is that the feeling of yearning might provoke the individual to take a step toward religion. Kierkegaard’s particular focus on the relationship between the individual self and religion provides a useful resource for this undertaking.

Before we begin our own discussion, let us first take a look at the approaches taken by theologians in their examinations of music. This survey will allow us to identify the resources available for our project, while at the same time indicating where further progress may be made in order to understand how music can open the door to the transcendent. A further advantage of this study is that there has not yet been an attempt to
capture all the different ways in which theologians have addressed the question of the relationship between music and theology.

A MUSICAL READING OF THEOLOGY: BEGBIE, PEACOCKE AND PEDERSON, AND MACMILLAN

Possibly the most prominent scholarly consideration of music and theology is that which uses music to give clarification and enlightenment to theological ideas and concepts. In other words, these discussions use music as a tool or metaphor for examining theological concepts and particular areas of doctrine and providing a new perspective on them.

Throughout his work in the area of theology and music, Jeremy Begbie maintains that music may be used as a tool to discuss theological concepts and to develop an awareness of how some of the conflict between these concepts and the issues of modern life might be resolved. Music, he suggests, may be used to aid an understanding of, for example, the nature of the Trinity, by offering insights into a kind of interrelationship and co-existence of sounds in a space that differs greatly from our physical-world experience of space and time.\(^{19}\) He posits the three tone chord as an example of this interrelation and co-existence, noting how, unlike our visual perception of physical objects, which exist at one particular point in time and space, each of the three tones occupies our entire aural space simultaneously – we do not hear them in one distinct place or another.\(^{20}\) Similarly, considering the divine and human natures of Christ, Begbie seeks to demonstrate how two simultaneously sounding tones, which occupy the same aural space but are mutually enhancing rather than conflicting, may be used to shed some light on this much debated doctrine.\(^{21}\) Through music, we are encouraged to move beyond our everyday visual experiences of space and time so as to think differently with regard to theological issues, such as the doctrine of the Trinity, that can often appear problematic. We are provided with a model for thinking about theology not in terms of the opposition and exclusion we


encounter in our physical world (e.g. an object is only ‘here’ and not ‘there’) but rather in terms of a God who transcends these encounters.

Begbie also asserts that music might be helpful in coming to terms with and looking beyond some of the issues of modernity. Modernity, in the context of Begbie’s work, is defined as ‘a cluster of attitudes or mindsets inextricably bound up with social and cultural practices’, including conceptions of human freedom and time. For instance, he cites a modern ‘unease with time’ – characterised in Begbie’s argument by a preoccupation with living ‘against the clock,’ whereby time is fragmented into ‘industrial time,’ leisure time etc. and so becomes a commodity, as an issue that may be clarified and transformed through engagement with music and its relationship with time. In contrast to a view of time as being characterised by pressure and struggle, Begbie suggests that music’s use of tension and resolution teach a kind of patience that can only be learned through taking time. The freedom of musical time from the demands and pressures of modern life may be seen to be paralleled by liturgical time – the Church’s organisation of its time such that its year is centred around its most important feasts and doctrines. Here we see one sense in which theology, by means of music, is able to look beyond the constraints of ‘modern time,’ as Begbie sees it. Music also challenges the assumption highlighted by Begbie that transience, due to its association with brevity, is inherently bad since music requires transience – it is only through the coming-into-being and dying away of tones that it can exist. Begbie provides an interesting insight from Rowan Williams, who describes music as a ‘moral event’ through which we are reminded of our place in narrative history and that, ultimately, we cannot and should not be in total control. It might be suggested that we are also able to think of music as a ‘theological event’ through which one may experience something of God, whether that be in terms of understanding a doctrine, as Begbie posits, or in terms of music’s ability to convey a feeling of the transcendent. Moreover, Begbie demonstrates, though not in terms of whole works, how musical events are linked and interact with each other

---

22 Ibid., 142.
26 Ibid., 72-4.
27 Ibid., 86.
28 Ibid., 91.
29 Ibid., 91-2.
30 Ibid., 87, 89.
through ‘dynamic waves’ of metre, rhythm, and key – ‘a wave of equilibrium-tension-resolution in which each beat is dynamically related to the others’\textsuperscript{31} – through which motion, tension, and resolution are created.\textsuperscript{32} Thus musical events are not confined to past, present, or future but interact through time. These dynamic waves form a large part of Begbie’s argument in relation to temporality and function as a useful way of thinking in a new way about temporality in terms of various theological concepts. For instance, Begbie illustrates how the Eucharist, in much the same way as music, depends upon the interaction between past, present, and future in order to enable participation in a ritual instituted in the past by Christ but which is also essential to salvation and the fulfilment of God’s plan in the future, ‘the over-arching history of God’s engagement with the cosmos,’ as well as taking place within a particular cultural and social situation in the present.\textsuperscript{33}

Using these examples of music’s interaction with space and time, Begbie usefully highlights what benefits music has for theology if we are able to think more in terms of its processes of production and reception and less in terms of our own experiences in our physical world. By calling into question some assumptions about our space and time, many of which are often challenged by musical space and time, Begbie opens up a new way of thinking about theology and how its concepts and doctrines might sit more easily in our modern world alongside contemporary issues. However, as we have seen, music in the context of Begbie’s work would appear to function not as a vehicle through which a religious or transcendent feeling may be experienced but rather as a metaphor, a model for thinking differently about theological doctrines and concepts.

The use of music as a model or metaphor for articulating theological notions is an approach adopted also by Arthur Peacocke and Ann Pederson, who focus specifically on the doctrine of creation. The diversity of creation, they claim, is such that only a richly diverse God should be capable of bringing it into being. Diversity, however, should not be taken to mean difference but rather is ‘a diversity in a profound unity’ for which, not unlike in Begbie’s argument, music can function as an analogy.\textsuperscript{34} The authors suggest Haydn’s “Representation of Chaos”, the introduction to his oratorio The Creation, as an example of how creatio ex nihilo might be represented in music through a series of

\textsuperscript{31} Ibid., 40.
\textsuperscript{32} Ibid., 39-40.
\textsuperscript{33} Begbie, Theology, Music, and Time, 165.
‘shifting keys, of resolutions by cadence, deferred and never completed, frequently dissolved by suspensions and passing and grace notes’ which ‘echoes the enigma that is the essence of creation – the nothing giving rise to something.’\textsuperscript{35} Though this depiction might certainly inspire the imagination of the listener, it is precisely that, only a depiction, and does little in the way of actually providing insights into the doctrine of creation. When, later in their discussion, Peacocke and Pederson use music as a metaphor, they do so in much the same way as Begbie insofar as they rely upon the close connection between music and our physical time. Music, they assert, allows us to understand ‘how the potential becomes manifest’, how things come to be.\textsuperscript{36} Central to our understanding of time is the perception of movement – ‘something that was the same becomes different,’\textsuperscript{37} which is paralleled in music by rhythm. Thus ‘rhythm unfolds the possibilities of polarization and differentiation that time possesses and, just as breathing is essential to life, rhythm is essential to creation.’\textsuperscript{38} So rhythm, by providing the movement in music that perpetuates its creation, serves as a conceptual model for how we might understand creation not as a single, stand-alone event in history but as a process through which the created order moves, changes, and is created anew. The complexity of the interplay between rhythm and metre is seen as analogous to the complex systems of nature ‘that science has shown to exist in the created world.’\textsuperscript{39} Time, as we have said, is central to Peacocke and Pederson’s argument (as well as Begbie’s). They, following Victor Zuckerkandl, assert the differences between ‘physical (clock) time’ and ‘musical time’\textsuperscript{40} and claim that recognising the difference may help us to grasp more easily the nature of God’s continuing participation in the created order. Though a piece of music inevitably moves, ‘leans’, towards the future, that is not to say that its only objective goal is its ending. It is the musical process that is important and that creates meaning, not its arrival at a closing cadence.\textsuperscript{41} So it is, say Peacocke and Pederson, with God’s relation to and participation in creation as it unfolds over time.\textsuperscript{42}

When James MacMillan uses music as a metaphor, he does so in order to highlight what he sees as a misconception that only music thought to be calm and peaceful can also

\textsuperscript{35} Ibid., 11.  
\textsuperscript{36} Peacocke and Pederson, \textit{The Music of Creation}, 12.  
\textsuperscript{37} Ibid.  
\textsuperscript{38} Ibid.  
\textsuperscript{39} Ibid., 14.  
\textsuperscript{40} Ibid., 19.  
\textsuperscript{41} Ibid., 22.  
\textsuperscript{42} Ibid., 23.
be thought of as spiritual. Conflict in music, he says, present in the form of changing *tempi* and unstable harmonies, is far from unspiritual but in fact captures the very essence of spirituality, which is not ‘just some sort of easily won feel-good factor’ but ‘something that you find… in the fears, aspirations, joys and tragedies of human life’. MacMillan points out that conflict is crucial if we are to use music to say something about theology, since ‘[y]ou can’t have the resurrection without the crucifixion.’ Thus he rejects the ‘deliberate avoidance of conflict’ in the work of composers commonly thought of as spiritual, noting that ‘to avoid the darkness and the tragedy is to refuse to face up to the abyss, which is our human experience.’ Begbie agrees: using John Tavener’s music as an example, he argues that his evocation of eternity as necessarily still and timeless is at odds with an eternity in which all things are ‘gathered up’ in Christ, and suggests that eternity more properly involves the kind of multiplicity found, for instance, in MacMillan’s music. Such music, says Begbie, offers ‘something more adequate to God’s involvement with the temporal, created order, especially to the pivotal events of Good Friday and Easter.’ Since, for God’s promise of eternal life to be fulfilled, God himself in the person of Christ was required to participate in our temporality, the music of eternity must reflect the realities of this participation. This assertion of MacMillan’s (with which Begbie agrees) is important because it demonstrates a scholar and composer who, unlike many others, is considering that some types of music may represent the Christian faith better than others as well as challenging assumptions about the kinds of music that we might tend to call ‘spiritual’.

Elsewhere, MacMillan’s treatment of music as a metaphor does not focus on any particular feature of the music itself but rather on the act of listening to music. The nature of listening is such that one has little or no control over the music. There is no way in which the listener can hurry the music along, nor can one know, when listening for the first time, what is to happen in the music. All the listener can do is accept and live through the music that is given. MacMillan draws a comparison between the acceptance of the listener and that of Mary in the annunciation who, despite uncertainty, accepted

---

44 Ibid., 20.
46 Ibid., 19.
48 Ibid.
49 Ibid., 147.
and lived through the situation given to her.\textsuperscript{50} In this way, MacMillan characterises the act of listening as a metaphor for how a Christian life should be lived, following the example of Mary, and in doing so outlines a kind of listening that could be thought of as a channel of God’s grace to the listener. Thus hearing God becomes something that can be practised, or perhaps even experienced, through the act of listening. Ultimately, MacMillan views music as ‘a striking analogy for God’s relationship with us,’ suggesting that music’s spirituality lies in its ability to ‘touch what is deepest in our souls, and to release within us a divine force.’\textsuperscript{51} The process of experiencing music, which requires us to give up our time and open ourselves to its meaning, is one through which, following the example of Mary, we learn ‘to live with and before God.’\textsuperscript{52}

Leaving aside his use of music as a metaphor, MacMillan’s discussion holds a number of interesting points. Of particular note is the importance of conflict in MacMillan’s examination of music and theology that invites us to consider how music might be able to say something not only about the transcendent glory of God but also about God as suffering, as participating in the human experience. It would seem that to engage with music’s conflict as well as its ethereal beauty is to engage more fully with the incarnate God of the Christian faith. By focusing on the variety of the human experience, with all its highs and lows, MacMillan acknowledges one of Christianity’s central claims – that God sent his Son to participate in human life so as to save humanity from the ‘abyss’ – and demonstrates how music is able to enact this through the recognition and transformation of conflict and tension.

Like many of the other scholars we will encounter later in this study who do theology in relation to music, each of these writers approaches their topic from a distinctly Christian perspective. In fact, throughout his discussion, Begbie clearly argues that any engagement with music as a theological tool should not simply refer to a generic feeling of something beyond immediate experience, but rather should speak about specific theological concepts. Begbie advocates a Christological approach, focusing much of his work on the incarnation.\textsuperscript{53} Rejecting the approach taken by Brown, in which music

\textsuperscript{50} MacMillan, “God, Theology, and Music,” 23.
\textsuperscript{52} Ibid., 25-6.
serves as a means by which to experience a divine, transcendent being, Begbie asserts that, if we are to say that music evokes a deity, it is only useful if we are able to say something specific about the nature of that deity.\textsuperscript{54} Though this is an interesting approach, we might question why this specificity is necessary – it would perhaps seem that it is enough for music simply to inspire a religious feeling in listeners which may then prompt them to look elsewhere for ideas relating to specific doctrines capable of expressing this feeling.

Both Begbie’s work and the joint work of Peacocke and Pederson go on to consider the role that music has to play within communities. Moving away from the processes of the music itself, Begbie notes its potential for forming, maintaining, and promoting cultural identities, citing his own experiences of music in relation to cultural identity in South Africa.\textsuperscript{55} In this instance, it might be suggested that Begbie does not go far enough in exploring how music might be used in relation to religious identity and culture. Begbie does highlight hymn-singing as a way of creating a sense of togetherness in the Church,\textsuperscript{56} but, given his focus on music as a means of representing and understanding certain doctrines, we might be tempted to look a little further. It would perhaps be interesting to consider how religious groups use music to communicate these doctrines within congregations, as well as its use in shaping the particular identity of that religious group.

Music’s interaction with contemporary culture becomes especially important in the light of Begbie’s claim that the arts may promote faith and religion ‘in a society increasingly alienated from the institutional Church and increasingly ignorant about the Christian faith.’\textsuperscript{57} In other words, when re-writing theology anew in an increasingly secular age, music has a role to play since, through its relationship with culture and society, it is able to comment on and challenge social norms and modern issues.

Peacocke and Pederson also use musical terminology to refer to life within the Christian community. The participation of individuals in the community is seen to be important and akin to the process of rehearsal: ‘[w]e learn the music of creation by practising in an ensemble.’\textsuperscript{58} Musical language is also used in this way to describe the action of God in the life of the community: ‘God sings the blues with us… God’s spirit

\textsuperscript{54} Begbie, “Openness and Specificity”, 156.
\textsuperscript{55} Begbie, “Through Music,” 151-2; see also Begbie, “Unexplored Eloquencies,” 102-3.
\textsuperscript{56} Begbie, “Unexplored Eloquencies,” 94.
\textsuperscript{57} Begbie, “Through Music,” xiii.
\textsuperscript{58} Peacocke and Pederson, The Music of Creation, 53.
transposing our notes of despair into a new key of hope.’59 These notions of how music relates to Christian life, however, are not so much ideas about how music can form and enrich the community as statements about the nature of the Christian community, made using musical language. Given the vast amount and array of music used within the Christian tradition for contemplation and worship, it seems Peacocke and Pederson ought to have been able to say something more about how that music informs and maintains the identity of the community, rather than simply using musical imagery to say something about life in the Christian community. This imagery lacks any basis in music as such – the authors make no attempt to demonstrate how blues music, more so than another genre, might refer to God’s participation in the lives of individuals – and so is ultimately unconvincing. It would perhaps have been enlightening to consider what it is that blues music articulates – for instance, we might suggest that the lyrical content of blues, which is often concerned with hopelessness and striving for a better life, is reminiscent of the notion of God as co-sufferer through whom humanity strives and achieves salvation and eternal life. Peacocke and Pederson’s argument, however, lacks clarity and strength precisely because they fail to provide any real analysis of how blues music might denote God’s participation in human life.

This approach – a musical reading of theological ideas – is interesting and valuable insofar as it presents a new perspective on aspects of theology and of doctrine with which it can be difficult to come to terms. Each of the scholars discussed above uses music and its forms and features to demonstrate how believers might gain an increased understanding of theological doctrine by engaging with a different perspective. However, to use music in this way is to discuss its potential in relation to one particular type of theology and tradition, and also relies on the pre-existing faith of listeners for music to reach its potential. This approach does not adequately take into account the subjectivity of the experience of listening to music or the effect that this might have on music’s ability to say something about theological ideas. It focuses primarily on using music as a metaphor for theological concepts such as the Trinity, Incarnation, and the Eucharist, and pays insufficient attention to the potentially religious effect music in itself may have on the listener. Moreover, it does not consider the effect that music might have on listeners

59 Ibid., 51.
who have no faith, and whether music might be a valuable tool not only in helping to explain the various tenets of faith but also in helping individuals come to a place of faith.

**MUSIC AS IDENTITY- AND COMMUNITY-FORMING: CLARKE AND BECKFORD**

The scholars we have discussed in the previous section include in their arguments some consideration of how music might be used effectively within social and religious communities. For Martin V. Clarke and Robert Beckford, the role music plays within a community setting is their primary focus.

Clarke is specifically concerned with how music was used within nineteenth-century Christian communities as part of prayer and worship and bases his discussion on the ways in which Christian communities at this time thought about and selected music for use in worship. In particular, Clarke focuses on how music was used in the Evangelical and High-Church traditions with somewhat similar aims: ‘firstly, that hymnody, both textually and in the act of singing, embodies theological and spiritual truths; secondly, that congregational singing promotes unity among the participants by affirming theological identity; and thirdly, that it affirms the participants’ place within the universal church, by providing a means of unity across different eras and traditions.’

Though their aims were broadly similar, Clarke notes a number of differences between the two traditions. Regarding the establishment of nineteenth-century Anglican hymnals, he highlights the ‘frequent attempts to impress upon Evangelicals the need to focus on personal holiness and to avoid worldly distractions.’ Quoting Rev. Edward Bickersteth, compiler of the *Christian Psalmody* (1833), he draws attention to the ‘awful responsibility to seeking to direct the devotion of the Church of Christ, in some of the highest and sweetest acts of fellowship with the Father and with his Son Jesus Christ, and the danger of sentiments in any hymns that might leave an unscriptural impression on the mind.’ Music and singing in church were seen in the Evangelical tradition not only as

---

60 Martin V. Clarke, “Meet and right it is to sing” in Martin V. Clarke ed., *Music and theology in nineteenth-century Britain* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012), 33.
61 Ibid., 24.
62 Ibid.
aids to prayer and worship but also as a ‘duty’ laid down by scripture with which ‘many blessings are connected.’ Not only does Bickersteth assert that singing helps congregations to learn about and remember aspects of their faith, but he also claims that singing may ‘help to promote purity of mind and to lead the singer away from worldly distraction.’ Notably, in both the Evangelical and High-Church traditions, singing is suggested as a way in which poorer members of the community in particular might grow in faith and knowledge of Christ. The act of singing in church is, for Bickersteth, ‘a grace-filled activity, a recognition of God-given creativity and a practical expression of Christian unity.’ The ‘presence of God’s grace’ is crucial in church music, as it is only through a participation in this grace that the beauty of music, rather than being a distraction, becomes an aid to prayer and worship.

Both Evangelical and High-Church communities stress the importance of music in public worship as a way of creating unity. Congregational hymn-singing was seen not only to promote individual unity with God through ‘praise and thanksgiving, petitionary prayer, proclamation, and the narration of the mighty acts of God,’ but also to function as a ‘means of affirming theological identity’ which is achieved ‘practically in the act of singing together, but also in adhering to a common set of beliefs or a particular theological interpretation.’ Moreover, as we have already suggested, both traditions make connections between music and singing in church in their present-day congregations and ‘the practical and spiritual discipline of the church throughout the ages’ which provides a historical basis for music as part of prayer and worship as well as linking present-day Christian communities with ancient believers and traditions.

Clarke’s discussion is primarily a historical one and so does very little in the way of examining how the music of these hymns, aside from the text, is able to convey theological meaning or create unity within Christian communities or between an individual and God. However, he does usefully highlight Christian attitudes towards how music should be used within worship and to what end.

63 Ibid., 25.
64 Clarke, "Meet and right it is to sing,” 26.
65 Ibid., 26.
66 Ibid., 26.
67 Ibid.
68 Ibid., 33.
69 Ibid.
70 Ibid., 35.
In his discussion, Beckford focuses on the musical practices of African-Caribbean Christian communities who ‘participate in on-going creative work of God in-and-through the use of words and sounds.’ Indeed, praise-through-singing is seen as an invocation of God’s presence and participation in divine grace – ‘in other words, there is a sense of the divine or spirituality in the sonic field.’ Consequently, Beckford notes how ‘often in churches a sharp distinction is made between ministry (singing and praising in sync with the Spirit of God) and minstrelsy (singing and praising out of sync with the Spirit and therefore a promotion of the individual rather than God).’

Beckford’s study is particularly useful in its discussion of music’s ability to say something about cultural or social norms, describing music as an ‘ideological process’ and using dub – music with ‘an active socio-political agenda’ to form the basis of his argument. Dub, a process that ‘concerns the taking apart and reconstruction of reality from a particular vantage point’ is used in relation to the socially marginalised: ‘When “Jesus dubs”, those on the margins are enabled to tear down the walls that exclude and rebuild and refashion things so that all people are free from the ravages of oppression.’ Of course, that is not to say that music is capable of breaking down all forms of social prejudice and marginalisation. It does show, however, how music can take on a social agenda so as to be used as a model for a kind of Christian society in which all individuals live and are valued according to the message of the gospel, allowing marginalised Christian communities, in spite of their social circumstances, to envisage and live in the peace and freedom brought about through Christ. In order to illustrate this argument, Beckford draws attention to two stories from John’s gospel, highlighting how Jesus ‘dubs’ or reconstructs reality for both the Samaritan woman at the well (John 4) and the woman caught in adultery (John 8). Thus ‘dub’, as a musical technique, is analogous to the transformative power of Jesus as Saviour.

Beckford’s approach in this study, using a specific musical technique rather than engaging with a variety of features as they appear in musical works, differs from many of his predecessors.

---

72 Beckford, *Jesus dub*, 78.
73 Ibid.
74 Ibid., 66.
75 Ibid., 79.
76 Ibid.
77 Ibid.
78 Ibid., 96-100.
other scholars that we have discussed. Though it is perhaps somewhat limited in its scope, it does seem an appropriate method for discussing the theological identity and beliefs of a religious tradition that would be familiar with that particular musical technique, in this case, African Caribbean Christians. Beckford’s comments about how music might impact upon an individual’s Christian identity outside of the community, in the secular world, demonstrate how music might help to affect social change with a Christian ethos.

The approach taken by Clarke and Beckford concentrates on how music might create and inform a listener’s religious identity. Here we have some focus on music’s subjectivity, though once again each argument is centred on how those who already have faith and belong to religious communities use and are affected by music.

A THEOLOGICAL READING OF MUSIC: HARDIE, WATSON, AND BROWN

In contrast to the work of Begbie, Peacocke and Pederson, and MacMillan, each of whom use music as a tool to unpack theological ideas, there are also scholars who use theology to interpret music. Alistair Hardie explores a theological reading of music with particular focus on the use of Hildegard’s *O quam preciosa* in John Adams’s *El Niño*. Though recognising the usefulness of Begbie’s work, he instead outlines how he aims to use ‘Christian theology to interpret musical meaning,’ choosing the work of John Adams on the basis of the composer’s statement: ‘I acknowledge the power of music to contact our innermost emotions, which I believe are religious.’

Hardie grounds his argument in the concepts of transcendence, immanence, and incarnation, all of which, he posits, say something about time and eternity in relation to God and music. In terms of transcendence, he examines the writings of Augustine in which the nature of God ‘is “outside” physical space (transcendent) while simultaneously remaining “within” it (immanent),’ neither a part of nor limited by time. We can thus

---

80 Ibid., 291.
81 Ibid., 292-3.
understand God’s transcendence by its relation to our temporality – ‘distinct from, but not necessarily opposed to, the time we inhabit.’

In this time that we inhabit, the present is understood by its relationship with past and future, just as the musical present depends upon ‘its relationship to past and future musical processes.’

Hardie aims to demonstrate through musical analysis how chant – ‘monophonic texted music of the type used for Christian devotion before musical notation was established’ – might ‘transcend musical time in a similar way that God transcends universal time’ since it can be seen to transcend the framework of key and metre used in more modern music such as Adam’s work.

Considering immanence, Hardie points out that music’s content is expressed through its ‘temporal dimensions of form and content,’ and so suggests that it is immanent in the same way that universal content, again expressed through temporality, is immanent. Thus ‘if chant constituted a piece of music’s content, then this may represent God as transcendent (chant) and immanent (as the music’s content).’ So the musical material borrowed from another tradition becomes immanent in Adams’s music yet simultaneously transcends the normative systems of metre and key at work there. Since ‘God’s transcendence and immanence are both present in the incarnate Christ’, who became incarnate only through entering into universal temporality,

Hardie seeks to demonstrate how the parallels between the processes of music and incarnation are to be found in *El Niño*.

Hardie’s musical analysis treats Adams’s work in five different sections during which chant is used and, in the author’s words, transcends the parameters of metre and key of the music surrounding it. Using excerpts of the score to illustrate his argument, Hardie shows how these musical features that transcend the musical norm in this work interact and become immanent in the music’s content. Of particular note is the way in which these features are combined and are ‘attached to text that explicitly refers to the Incarnation of Christ. The synthesis of the “transcendent” and “immanent” material acts

---

82 Ibid., 293.
83 Ibid.
85 Ibid., 293.
86 Ibid., 294.
87 Ibid.
88 Ibid.
89 Ibid., 295.
90 Ibid., 296-301.
as an illustration for God’s transcendence and immanence revealed in a new way through the Incarnation."91

Watson attempts to demonstrate the consolatory power of music with the aim of discovering whether music might be able to offer a kind of consolation similar to that offered by the Christian faith. In order to do this, Watson concentrates on celebratory aspects of music which prevail in spite of conflict and discord.92 Taking as an example ‘the accompanied recitative that follows the Overture in Handel’s Messiah (1742),’93 Watson outlines how the music itself ‘enacts the consolation of which the text speaks.’94 Just as the text explores the comforting nature of the Christian faith, Watson posits that the music, too, particularly through its use of key, is comforting.95 Though Watson acknowledges that there is nothing in music that ‘possesses any inherent power to communicate the distinctive comfort that is the content of the Christian faith,’96 he also asserts that music’s ability to console also has a great deal to do with the way in which ‘negativities are acknowledged and transformed,’ rather than simply excluded.97 He is clear that, in this discussion, it is not the actual, subjective experience of one listener or another that is taken into account but rather ‘what should be experienced by an “ideal listener” on the basis of objective features of the music itself.’98

David Brown goes further with his theological reading of music to consider the possibility of music as a mediator of religious experience. He does so with reference to specific examples from classical music, highlighting a number of specially selected composers whose aims, compositional styles, and attitudes towards their own music emphasise a particularly religious theme. He begins by outlining a scriptural basis for examining music in this way, and addresses some historical issues in the relationship between religion and music, such as ‘Christian resistance to instrumental music.’99 However, particularly interesting is Brown’s focus on specific examples of music which, he argues, mediate some kind of religious experience. He maintains that ‘certain features

91 Ibid., 301.
93 Ibid., 450.
94 Ibid., 451.
95 Ibid.
96 Ibid.
97 Ibid., 452.
98 Ibid., 453.
of music help an already present God to be perceived... a composer can help the listener through focus on certain features inherent in the music (such as order, transcendence, compassion, or hope) to perceive external reality in general in a new way, and with that perception the ultimate ground for such ideas in God as ultimate reality itself.*100

Brown’s approach is therefore not to examine what music can demonstrate to the believer about religion but how an experience of religion can impact on the individual through music; of Begbie’s notion of music as metaphor, Brown says: ‘his approach is essentially illustrative rather than a learning exercise... But what is not allowed from his perspective is that God might reveal himself through music.’101 In terms of its ability to mediate a religious experience, Brown considers the role of music to be sacramental, since it is a finite entity through which the divine is disclosed in some way, and which necessitates a human response.102 A response on behalf of the individual is crucial to Brown’s notion of how music might be able to mediate religious experience, and he stresses that music is an experience ‘so designed that, as with the eucharist, the original experience can be re-enacted as God’s presence in our midst once more made known.’103

Brown thus prefaces his examination of musical examples by outlining his ideas about how music might function as a mediator of religious experience by fulfilling a sacramental role and encouraging individuals to participate and be drawn beyond their immediate experience.

Brown subsequently moves on to consider a number of different composers and the varying ways in which their music could be thought to mediate religious experience. To begin, he discusses ‘divine order’ in the music of Bach and Haydn,104 in which formal ‘perfection’ was intended to reflect ‘the divine perfection.’105 Of this music, Brown notes that ‘the strict symphonic structure continued to give listeners a sense of living in a divinely ordered world.’106 Secondly, Brown considers how Beethoven and Schubert address the issue of suffering through their music. Outlining both composers’ own experiences of suffering in their lives, Brown notes a striving through adversity to redemption in Beethoven’s Ninth Symphony, and Schubert’s expression of appreciation.

---

100 Ibid., 237.
101 Brown, God and Grace of Body, 245.
102 Ibid., 246-7.
103 Ibid., 247.
104 Ibid., 248.
105 Ibid., 253.
106 Ibid., 254.
of life’s blessings in the face of suffering and death in *Die Winterreise*. Though characterised by suffering, neither of these works are overtly sad, but rather ‘both composers can speak of a life graced through suffering. While Beethoven points to a resolution that may not occur till beyond the grave, Schubert stresses the value of what has already been received, however stark that may appear.’\textsuperscript{107} Using Mahler and Bruckner as examples, Brown then moves on to consider how music might reflect the personal faith of an individual and encourage that individual to dwell on how religion brings meaning to life. He highlights the contrast between the music of these two composers in that Mahler’s work expresses the ‘breakthrough’ of the divine into earthly life\textsuperscript{108} and the ‘warmth of divine acceptance,’\textsuperscript{109} whereas the music of Bruckner portrays the coexistence of light and dark, ‘faith and uncertainty,’\textsuperscript{110} ‘awe and judgement.’\textsuperscript{111}

Next, Brown discusses how even dissonant music might be capable of mediating religious experience, with reference to the music of Schoenberg and Stravinsky. In Schoenberg’s music, he notes a ‘continuing endorsement of the expressive power of music to convey an experience of the divine that can only be hinted at in words.’\textsuperscript{112} Brown also considers how dissonance in Stravinsky’s music could be thought to mediate religious experience and explains that it is precisely the ritualistic element of such music that is able to ‘reaffirm a religious placement for human beings… Dissonance and ritual are thus not enemies but the composer’s way of opening up his listeners’ lives to God.’\textsuperscript{113} He asserts that it is such music that can help believers come to terms with changes in their own personal faith and in religion more generally, that such apparent disorder in music can help us to experience religion in a disordered world. Finally, Brown considers how musical humour and timelessness might mediate religious experience in the music of Poulenc and Messiaen. Considering the presence of musical humour even in Poulenc’s *Gloria*, Brown suggests that this implies that religiosity – and the means by which religion might be experienced need not be solemn and formal: ‘apparent incongruities… might after all give us better access to the sort of innocent joy that is to be found through the divine.’\textsuperscript{114} Alongside Poulenc, Brown highlights Messiaen, whose work displays an

\textsuperscript{107} Ibid., 267.
\textsuperscript{108} Brown, *God and Grace of Body*, 270.
\textsuperscript{109} Ibid., 277.
\textsuperscript{110} Ibid., 273.
\textsuperscript{111} Ibid., 277.
\textsuperscript{112} Ibid., 281.
\textsuperscript{113} Ibid., 287.
\textsuperscript{114} Ibid., 289.
overwhelmingly religious character. Messiaen’s aim, as Brown illustrates, was to convey ‘the vertical, a transcendence that offers access to a different type of timeless reality.’\textsuperscript{115} With regard to what is perhaps Messiaen’s most famous work, \textit{Quatuor pour la fin du temps}, Brown describes how ‘repetition and non-retrogradable rhythms are used in the opening movement to suggest the divine timelessness that [Messiaen] sees as undergirding the eventual assumption of humanity through Christ into that same timelessness.’\textsuperscript{116}

Having considered each of the ways in which music might mediate religious experience using the examples of the composers above, Brown does not favour one type of music over another. He concludes that ‘it is surely important to acknowledge that experience of the divine will inevitably be multifaceted, with some composers better at inducting us into one aspect rather than another.’\textsuperscript{117} Similarly, he references both instrumental music and music with text with no distinction between the two, though it would have certainly been interesting to have included some consideration of how a religious text (or even a non-overtly religious text that nonetheless might include some transcendent element, such as that of \textit{Die Winterreise}, to which Brown refers) attached to a piece of music might play a role in mediating religious experience, and how that might differ from purely instrumental music. Equally interesting would be a consideration of composers of different faiths and of none and the extent to which a composer’s personal faith impacts on music’s ability to function as a mediator of religious experience.

Though he differs from Begbie in many ways in his approach, Brown is similar in that his notion of the type of religious experience that music might mediate is focused rather specifically on Christianity and on the notion of God. Despite his assertion that ‘it is not that God is forced upon anyone,’\textsuperscript{118} Brown prefers to consider music as a mediator of God in particular, rather than transcendence in general, without indication of how these two notions relate to each other.

Brown’s use of a variety of examples of different musical styles to illustrate his theory of music as a mediator of religious experience certainly provides inspiration for our own study. In many ways, his argument might also have been included in the subsequent

\textsuperscript{115} Ibid., 291.
\textsuperscript{116} Brown, \textit{God and Grace of Body}, 292.
\textsuperscript{117} Ibid., 293.
\textsuperscript{118} Ibid.
section because of the way in which emotion plays a part in establishing music as a mediator of religious experience. To take Brown’s work in this respect a step further, we might now ask how it is that the features he identifies to be so important in music – ‘order, transcendence, compassion… hope’ – can actually be experience by the listener through the composite features of the music itself.

Each of the scholars above applies theological ideas to music so as to demonstrate and extract a greater depth of meaning from that music. Their analyses are interesting in so far as they illustrate how musical forms and features can be seen (or, perhaps more appropriately, heard) to relate to and even embody theological concepts. Moving forward, we will examine how music might be seen to evoke emotion and how that emotion might be interpreted to be a particularly religious one.

MUSIC AS EXPRESSING OR EVOKING EMOTION: BOWIE, BALTHASAR, STOLTZFUS, AND HEANEY

Thus far, we have encountered scholars who use music as a metaphor to explore theological concepts, those who apply theological ideas to music in order to access that music’s meaning, and those who discuss music’s capacity to form and maintain identity and communities. None of these scholars takes into account in any detail the emotional and subjective aspect of music as it is experienced by an individual listener. In this section we will examine the work of scholars who approach the subject of music and religion from this point of view.

Bowie’s discussion does not focus particularly on theology but rather on philosophical attitudes towards music, which we will suggest have certain theological undertones. He begins by considering what it is we might think of as music, whether that be a score, and/or a performance that exactly or closely follows the instruction of the score. The nature of musical meaning and expression is also of concern and leads Bowie to ask ‘whether music “arouses” emotions or just has “emotional properties”’. He concedes

---

119 Brown, God and Grace of Body, 237.
121 Ibid.
that music’s meaning is difficult or even impossible to explain but maintains that the meaning itself ‘might lie precisely in the fact that we cannot say in words what it means – why does music exist at all if what it “says” could be said just as well in other ways?’\(^\text{122}\) Music therefore seems to be, for Bowie, a kind of revelation.

Bowie proceeds to explore German Romantic theories of music in more detail, predominantly the notion of the relationship between music and ‘feeling’. The aesthetic ideas in music are, according to Kant and Dahlhaus, essential in creating meaning related to feeling because they make ‘aspects of the intelligible world, like moral concepts, available in sensuous form, such as images that stand for moral attributes,’ an aesthetic idea being ‘that representation of the imagination which gives much to think about, but without any thought i.e. concept being able to be adequate to it.’\(^\text{123}\) Feeling is considered to be closely related to music because it ‘is linked to the realisation that our being is finite, and not wholly autonomous. It consequently plays a key role in the constitution of time, which is of course, essential to the experience of music.’\(^\text{124}\) This feeling is characterised by Schlegel as ‘longing’ – ‘the desire to attain something which can never be present, but which yet demands to be attained’\(^\text{125}\) – and by Bowie as ‘eternal seeking’ which in music is not necessarily frustrating but often pleasurable.\(^\text{126}\) The fact that Romantic philosophy was primarily concerned with instrumental music without a text leads us to consider, says Bowie, how that music can be meaningful and in what ways its meaning can be thought to derive ‘precisely from its lack of verbal cues.’\(^\text{127}\) For Bowie, this engagement with feeling is demonstrative of the Romantic aim to say something about a world made ever clearer to us by science and yet in which we are not able to feel completely at home.\(^\text{128}\) In other words, Bowie, prompted by the Romantics and in agreement with Begbie, recognises music’s ability to challenge some of the issues of modern life.

Though Bowie does not focus on what music might say about theology as such, he does consider religious sentiment in so far as he aims to uncover what it is in music that is ‘eternally sought’ or longed for. He claims that ‘the unifying theme in Romantic

\(^{122}\) Bowie, *Music, philosophy, and modernity*, 3

\(^{123}\) Ibid., 84.

\(^{124}\) Ibid., 92.

\(^{125}\) Ibid., 92-3.

\(^{126}\) Ibid., 99.

\(^{127}\) Ibid., 100.

\(^{128}\) Ibid., 103.
philosophy is probably the attempt to grasp new kinds of connection between human consciousness and nature’ and that ‘music has to do with ways in which we are part of the world that are not accessible to conceptual articulation.’ Following Hoffmann, Bowie suggests that music is a ‘concept-less means of access to a metaphysical realm,’ though he does not envisage this realm as particularly religious but rather as an example of how art might replace religious feeling. He does, however, outline Schleiermacher’s notion of religion ‘based on the idea that we are connected to a world which is intelligible to us in more ways than can be expressed verbally,’ considers that his idea of religion as ‘absolute feeling of dependence’ can be seen to be paralleled by Romantic theories of music’s longing and eternal seeking.

Writing about unity in the Christian Church in the opening chapter of *Truth is Symphonic*, Hans Urs von Balthasar asserts that, just as ‘the orchestra must be pluralist in order to unfold the wealth of the totality that resounds in the composer’s mind’ yet all the while ‘the instruments are integrated in a whole sound’, so it is with the Church. As he explains, ‘the purpose of its pluralism is this: not to refuse to enter into the unity that lies in God and is imparted by him, but symphonically to get in tune with one another and give allegiance to the transcendent unity.’ Balthasar presents the whole of creation as a symphony which for a time was only ‘tuning up’ – it is only with the Incarnation that its purpose becomes clear as it ‘performs God’s symphony under the Son’s direction.’ Equally, the Christian community, unless united in Christ, cannot find its purpose, though they are not integrated in the uniformity of unison but in the ‘beautiful’ diversity of symphony.

In the introductory chapter of *Truth is Symphonic*, therefore, Balthasar uses music as a metaphor for the issue of Christian unity in Christ. In *Die Entwicklung der musikalischen Idee*, on the other hand, he presents a more detailed theological analysis of music. The notion of musical form is key to Balthasar’s argument and is thought of as ‘revelation

130 Ibid., 142-3.
131 Ibid., 144.
132 Ibid., 153.
133 Ibid., 155.
135 Ibid., 9.
136 Ibid., 8.
137 Ibid., 9.
from above (for what else could it be?),’ since, through it, God is experienced within the
parameters of our spatio-temporality. Balthasar refers to as divine ‘information’ better than other art
forms, though, because of its immediacy, it cannot do this perfectly. Form may only
be experienced through its structure, and as such functions as an analogy of the divine
which ‘cannot be the divine itself.’ Balthasar refers to the divine variously as ‘truth’,
‘unmediated truth’, ‘Idea’, ‘spiritual Idea’, and ‘total Idea (Gesamtidee).’ The
importance of form in revealing this total Idea leads Balthasar to prioritise ‘the folksong,
the fugue, and the classic symphony’ in his thinking.

Balthasar describes the development of music in three stages, beginning first with the
‘primitive’ and ‘instinctive’ use of rhythm to ‘bring some order to the overwhelming
noises of nature,’ the Greek use of melody, seen as Dionysian in contrast to Apollonian
rhythm, and finally the development of harmony which allows melody ‘to explore “the
space of tones with unclipped and widespread wings”’. Like music, however, the ‘total
Idea’ is difficult to grasp: ‘it is “Sense” or “primitive light” that is “unintelligible” and
that “surpasses reason”.’

Music, because of ‘its close proximity to the listening subject’ is ‘indispensable for
religious belief,’ yet its lack of any ability to speak specifically about religion proves a
danger to belief: ‘[i]ts intimacy with mystery bestows a religious significance to music,
but it remains indeterminate what this is.’ Sander van Maas, commenting on
Balthasar’s argument, notes Augustine’s difficulty in reconciling music’s beauty,
‘gratification of the flesh,’ with its sacred content, eventually conceding that beauty in
music may be necessary if the religious content of its meaning is to be fully
understood.

138 As quoted in Sander van Maas, The reinvention of religious music: Olivier Messiaen’s breakthrough toward the beyond (New York: Fordham University Press, 2009), 64. In the absence of an English translation of Die Entwicklung der musikalischen Idee, van Maas’ work will be used as a source.
139 Ibid.
140 Ibid., 65.
141 Ibid.
142 Ibid.
143 Ibid.
144 Ibid.
145 Ibid., 71.
146 Ibid., 78-9.
Despite this difficulty, Balthasar asserts that music ‘does not conceptualize or represent the divine’ but is in fact a medium of the divine.\textsuperscript{147} Although, as we have seen, music is not capable of perfectly communicating the divine information, this is just as well, ‘because the intensity of what music has on offer could blind the listener,’ if only it could be perceived in its totality. The subjective experience of listening to music therefore allows us to ‘behold divine light somewhat longer’ and experience something of the divine information without being overwhelmed by it.\textsuperscript{148} Therefore, when we speak of music as being ineffable and its meaning difficult to grasp, we might consider that it is perhaps necessary for music to be this way in order for us to experience the divine without being blinded by it.

Van Maas proceeds to explore Balthasar’s thinking as regards ‘a nonverbal but apparently Christian association of music and mystery,’ in relation to early Romantic notions of absolute music.\textsuperscript{149} Being without words or any other ‘nonmusical content’, absolute music can convey the true nature of music and musical expression and, according to Romantic thinking, this places it above any other form of music.\textsuperscript{150} Such music, not being tied to extra-musical concepts, comes to be thought of as ‘the medium of the sublime… and the (metaphysically or religiously) Inexpressible,’ for Tieck and Wackenroder, the divine.\textsuperscript{151} It is the sublimity, or divinity, of music that some scholars describe in terms of the Christian faith: E.T.A. Hoffmann, for instance, remarks that ‘music is a form of religious worship… and its origin is to be sought and found only in religion, in the church.’\textsuperscript{152} However, Hoffmann does not propose that all music should be a medium of religion, nor even that church music is the best medium of religion and the sublime. Rather, for Hoffmann, Beethoven’s instrumental works ‘fulfil the function of a “monstrance” (in Wackenroder’s words) of religious metaphysical longing (infinite Sehnsucht) for Infinity.’\textsuperscript{153} Evidently, therefore, ‘Hoffmann’s notion of Christianity is not related to confessional faith but rather to a kind of spirituality that evolves from a bursting tradition of Christianity but that is, ultimately, secular.’\textsuperscript{154} According to this thinking, then, purely instrumental music such as that by Beethoven can be viewed as a

\textsuperscript{147} Ibid., 80.
\textsuperscript{148} van Maas, \textit{The reinvention of religious music}, 81.
\textsuperscript{149} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{150} Ibid., 81-2.
\textsuperscript{151} Ibid., 82.
\textsuperscript{152} Ibid., 83.
\textsuperscript{153} Ibid., 83.
\textsuperscript{154} Ibid.
vehicle of faith. In Balthasar’s argument, absolute music is closely related to the ‘intensity’ of the divine information that is communicated, which ‘is ultimately identified with the Word.’\textsuperscript{155}

In \textit{Truth is Symphonic}, Balthasar demonstrates how music might function as a metaphor for life within the Christian community; unlike Peacocke and Pederson, who offer very little in the way of concrete examples for their argument, his use of the pluralism and diversity of symphony as a model is convincing. His exploration in \textit{Die Entwicklung der musikalischen Idee} of how the subjectivity of musical experience allows music to function as a medium of the divine is especially interesting, particularly in the sense that it challenges the assumption that the ineffability of music’s meaning is necessarily problematic. Balthasar offers a way of thinking about musical communication, despite its limited referential ability, as revelation of the divine which, not unlike the person of Christ, reaches out to humanity and shields humanity from the true radiance of God.

Like Balthasar and others that we have already mentioned, Philip Stoltzfus also considers the role of music within religious communities, though Stoltzfus focuses specifically on the performative aspects of music. For Stoltzfus, thinking of theology in terms of performance provides an insight into how religious communities should live their faith. On this point, he quotes Frank Burch Brown’s notion of religion as necessitating performance, and of religious communities as ‘differing performing ensembles and performance traditions, each with its own ways of rendering the classic [the faith/act of worship] which provides the group’s identity and shapes its sense of what is ultimately important.’\textsuperscript{156} Continuation of a religious tradition, therefore, is shown to be similar to the continuation of a musical one, in which the participants (that is, the believers/musicians) must undergo a process of re-interpretation and re-creation of the tradition according to changing cultural norms, while remaining mindful and respectful of previous performances of that tradition and allowing for the plurality of the performance community.\textsuperscript{157} Theology as performance also enables a new way of thinking about how we might approach the content of a religious tradition: ‘We would seek to appropriate Scripture and tradition, not simply to know something we did not know

\textsuperscript{155} van Maas, \textit{The reinvention of religious music}, 84.
\textsuperscript{157} Ibid., 9.
before, but for the redemptive purpose of creating the new enabling a new praxis. Thus Stoltzfus construes religion in terms of praxis which, he says, not only informs how a religious community should behave but also recasts ‘the constructive center of theological work from a textuality aesthetic to a performative one.’ However, unlike scholars such as Begbie who identify musical features that might function as a metaphor to aid understanding of theological concepts, Stoltzfus instead concentrates on the act of participating in music as a model for thinking about engagement in religious communities as well as how individuals learn and about and develop their faith.

In doing this, Stoltzfus considers to a greater extent the emotional and personal aspect of listening to and participating in a musical performance, and how this impacts on its relation to theology. His discussion of music in this respect takes into account Schleiermacher’s concept of expression and he calls for a more serious interpretation of Schleiermacher’s thinking on music, arguing that this thinking directly informed his notion of religion as feeling. In a brief outline of Schleiermacher’s life, Stoltzfus concentrates especially on his experiences of and engagement with music throughout his lifetime, and concludes that ‘[t]he close affinity Schleiermacher saw between religious piety and musical experience was reflected in his lifelong preference for the genres of hymnody and sacred music, yet within the broader cultural context of the emergence of the genre of “absolute” instrumental music.’ Rejecting what he describes as the ‘Formalist Challenge’, Stoltzfus situates Schleiermacher’s argument in the ‘Expressivist Alternative,’ which posits that ‘the role of the composer is to feel an affect from within, then imitate it “naturally” in melodic phrases… so that the same affect can be excited in the listener.’ According to this school of thought, the experience of music as ‘feeling’ takes precedence over musical form and the ‘reflective consciousness.’ This focus on expression is the backdrop against which Stoltzfus examines Schleiermacher’s musical thinking in the Speeches and Soliloquies, Christmas Eve, Ästhetik, and The Christian Faith.

158 Stoltzfus, Theology as performance, 11.
159 Ibid.
160 Ibid., 49-51.
161 Ibid., 52-5.
162 Ibid., 56-9.
163 Ibid., 59.
164 Ibid., 61.
In the *Speeches* and *Soliloquies*, Stoltzfus identifies a number of occasions on which Schleiermacher uses music as a metaphor, notably the use of harmony as an image representing ‘human relationship and community’, a ‘community of faith… in which each person is a priest and an artist.’\(^{165}\) He emphasises Schleiermacher’s conviction that religiosity consists not of knowledge but primarily of intuition,\(^{166}\) and suggests that music ‘is the communal womb within which feeling is allowed to emerge.’\(^{167}\) For Stoltzfus, this aspect of Schleiermacher’s theology is motivated by Wackenroder’s aesthetics of feeling: ‘Wackenroder’s concept of the intimate, ineffable, and intertwined and yet distant character of religious and musical experience would seem to stand as the key to properly grasping Schleiermacher’s understanding of this “inner affinity” between religion and art.’\(^{168}\)

Stoltzfus views the treatment of feeling in *Christmas Eve* as ‘the cultural performance of piety,’ in which piety is not simply ‘fleeting emotionalism but a general… disposition of being,’ in much the same way as it is the effect and feeling of a piece of music as a whole that takes precedence over its individual parts.\(^{169}\) He demonstrates that, over the course of the discussion, the connection between music and piety is seen to be their shared ineffability and nonverbal expression, which, he says, manifests itself ‘in feeling and mood, and this then becomes the building block for Schleiermacher’s later definition of religion and his concept of God.’\(^{170}\)

In the *Ästhetik*, Stoltzfus outlines how Schleiermacher gives a ‘prominent place to music as 1. a human activity, 2. a direct expression of feeling and mood, and 3. a representation of self-consciousness.’\(^{171}\) Art is seen as activity and therefore emphasis is placed on performance as opposed to musical notation.\(^{172}\) Music is not simply representative of the world but rather directly affects the self-consciousness, and Stoltzfus highlights Schleiermacher’s assertion that ‘purely musical materials can be said to represent religious self-consciousness.’\(^{173}\) Ultimately, for Stoltzfus, ‘Schleiermacher’s juxtaposition between artistic feeling and mood, the creativity of self-consciousness, and

---

\(^{165}\) Stoltzfus, *Theology as performance*, 67.
\(^{166}\) Ibid., 68.
\(^{167}\) Ibid., 72.
\(^{168}\) Ibid., 75.
\(^{169}\) Ibid., 80-1.
\(^{170}\) Ibid., 84.
\(^{171}\) Ibid., 88.
\(^{172}\) Ibid., 88-9.
\(^{173}\) Ibid., 90.
the awareness of a higher unity or creativity has opened up the conceptual and aesthetic resources he requires for formulating his mature concept of God.\(^{174}\)

Though Stoltzfus acknowledges that *The Christian Faith* discusses neither music nor the arts more generally, he asserts that, in this work, Schleiermacher concentrates his thinking around the same ideas that were key to his musical aesthetics.\(^{175}\) Consequently, Stoltzfus highlights parallels between Schleiermacher’s concept of religion and the nature of the arts – for instance, his alignment of religion with emotion, which is arguably also a key element of music.\(^{176}\) Schleiermacher’s notion of ‘feeling’ is also present, though here it is linked with the notion of dependence, which ‘as an expression of [feeling] defines the essence of piety.’\(^{177}\) Equally, the term ‘God’ is ‘understood as uniquely immediate: it is a “direct” expression, just as music has previously been identified as a “direct” expression of artistic feeling.’\(^{178}\) This is why Stoltzfus posits that Schleiermacher’s understanding ‘of piety as an expression of religious feeling, God-consciousness as a “feeling of utter dependence,” and theological writing as an expression in words of religious feelings’ is based upon his discussion of music in earlier works and his own personal experiences of music.\(^{179}\)

Stoltzfus is ultimately unconvinced by Schleiermacher’s focus on expression in his theological treatment of music, suggesting that it does not adequately address the activity of music-making in which, he argues, ‘musicality resides.’\(^{180}\) He argues that, in Schleiermacher’s work (as well as Barth’s), the ‘human in relation to God is that of a passive appropriator of feeling or word,’ seeming to suggest that it is precisely this notion of passivity that ought to be addressed or challenged. Rather, Stoltzfus seeks to investigate how ‘theological aesthetics such as the present one truly provide any sort of relevance to one of the central theological questions of our time: “How are we to live?”’\(^{181}\) with the aim that musical aesthetics might address social issues such as ‘racial justice, gender equity, just distribution of wealth, environmental sustainability, and interpersonal and political non-violence.’\(^{182}\) In order to do so, he says, we must place a

\(^{174}\) Stoltzfus, *Theology as performance*, 92.
\(^{175}\) Ibid.
\(^{176}\) Ibid., 93.
\(^{177}\) Ibid., 95-6.
\(^{178}\) Ibid., 98.
\(^{179}\) Ibid., 102.
\(^{180}\) Ibid., 104.
\(^{181}\) Ibid., 252.
\(^{182}\) Ibid., 253.
greater emphasis on music as performance, rather than a musical score or recording. Only this approach ‘exposes and undermines the defensive retreat of theology into the textual, linguistic, and semiotic.’

Clearly, Stoltzfus is motivated by the question of how music as performance might say something about theology, and thus he finds Schleiermacher’s focus on expression to be inadequate. Though this study will not necessarily discuss the relationship between theology and performance practices, Stoltzfus’ highlighting of the religious community as a performative and not solely textual one serves as a useful reminder of the impact that theology has upon believers and how the activity of communities of believers themselves might impact upon theology. His engagement with Schleiermacher’s work functions as a concise introduction to the concepts of feeling, intuition, and absolute or utter dependence. Moving forwards, it would be interesting to consider how these concepts, which Stoltzfus argues are derived from Schleiermacher’s understanding of music and his own musical life, might be evident in the music of the time. Whereas Stoltzfus does not include practical examples of music in his discussion, since these, he asserts, distract from his focus on music as performance, we might look to practical examples from musical scores to explore how the features therein might evoke a heard experience of feeling, intuition, and dependence.

Maeve Heaney’s aim in her *Music as Theology* is to develop a hermeneutical approach to music in theological discourse, motivated by her background as a Catholic missionary and musician (through which she understands music-making as a form of evangelisation) and her conviction that ‘there are aspects of the Logos… which are better expressed through music,’ even that ‘there are things which God may *only* be saying through music.’

From the outset, it is unclear what kind(s) of music Heaney considers to be useful or appropriate for a theological analysis, though she asserts that she has ‘sought to speak with people currently involved in Christian music ministry’ and that these ‘conversations with composers known and valued in this field have guided all the stages of this book.’ On various occasions Heaney refers to ‘contemporary’ music, though she does not clarify

---

183 Stoltzfus, *Theology as performance*, 259.
185 Ibid., 1-2.
186 Ibid., 9.
precisely what she means by this. Evidently, her focus is more on musical theory, emphasising that ‘three traits of music can begin to help us approach our theme: it is free, it is embodied, and it is truthful,’ rather than the ways in which a particular musical style or work might aid theological understanding.

With this in mind, Heaney turns to the question of how musical meaning is created, outlining the work of six musicologists – Susanne K. Langer, Leonard B. Meyer, Alan P. Merriam, Charles Seeger, Bruno Nettl, and John Blacking – as ‘an indispensable introduction to the themes of philosophical research into music, as a first step in theology’s quest to understand it.’\(^{187}\) From this discussion she draws a number of key issues, such as the relationship between music and feeling and emotion;\(^{188}\) the nature of human creativity;\(^{189}\) musical apprehension of recordings as opposed to live performances, the role of the performer and of interpretation;\(^{190}\) whether or not we may think of music as universal;\(^{191}\) the variety of music from different traditions;\(^{192}\) and the question of whether musical communication can be thought of in the same terms as linguistic communication.\(^{193}\) Heaney herself recognises that ‘from the moment we are interested in music as a means of mediating faith, encouragement (and concern) for the life, faith, and capacity of expressing themselves of Christian composers and performers is natural and necessary,’ though she warns against placing too strong an emphasis on the intentions of the composer or performer.\(^{194}\) Nevertheless, the distinction between musical meaning as it is perceived by composer, performer, listener, and of itself independent of these contexts remains a central point of Heaney’s argument.

In terms of how music’s meaning is created, Heaney understands music in broadly structuralist terms as a system of signs. Rejecting de Saussure’s notion of the sign as comprising the ‘signifier’ and ‘signified’, since it does not allow for the flexibility and variety of musical interpretation,\(^{195}\) she prefers the approach of Charles Sanders Pierce which allows for ‘a multiple and infinite number of [meanings] in the process of

\(^{188}\) Ibid., 62-3.
\(^{189}\) Ibid., 63-4.
\(^{190}\) Ibid., 65.
\(^{191}\) Ibid., 65-6.
\(^{192}\) Ibid., 66.
\(^{193}\) Ibid., 67.
\(^{194}\) Ibid., 79.
\(^{195}\) Ibid., 79-81.
signifying.'\(^{196}\) Meaning for Heaney is an ‘event’, an ‘interaction between reality and human apprehension of the same, in a given moment of time and history;’\(^{197}\) moreover, it is a ‘shared event that is created and recreated as it happens.’\(^{198}\) She asserts, therefore, that ‘we can no longer indiscriminately identify a style or genre of music as incapable or no longer worthy of transmitting something of Christian faith,’\(^{199}\) arguing instead that theologians should ‘place the emphasis on the side of the composer, the musician and the dynamic created in listening to music… Theologically speaking, it is consistent with the basic Christian doctrine and theology of all human beings being made in the image and likeness of God, and therefore doted with the capacity to emulate and collaborate with the Creator in their activities, music making included.’\(^{200}\) Despite her emphasis on music making as a key part of the ‘event’ of musical meaning, Heaney does not deal in great detail with what the implications of ‘emulating’ and ‘collaborating with’ the Creator might be – is this to say that musical composition is divinely inspired, or that the music that is created is ‘of God’ in some way? On the other hand, music is described elsewhere as ‘a creation of the human mind’ and a ‘specifically human invention’\(^{201}\) – therefore are we to view musical composition as separate from the work of the Creator? Here, Heaney is not entirely clear.

Before dealing with specific doctrine, Heaney aims to outline both a ‘theological epistemology of music’ (chapter 4) and ‘theological aesthetics in contemporary theology’ (chapter 5), highlighting in each chapter a number of approaches and thinkers that she considers to be useful to the areas of epistemology and aesthetics. In terms of epistemology, Heaney aims to explore ‘what the potential or actual role of music in that process of coming to know and therefore believe, is.’\(^{202}\) Here, she begins to make clear the importance of music’s being embodied and its relation to our human experience: ‘[s]o important is the embodied nature of human existence that our faith professes a God who lived, died, rose and whose body ascended.’\(^{203}\) Heaney goes on to draw attention to the work of Bernard Lonergan, who understands ‘experience’ (and thus, Heaney says,
experience of music) as the first of four ‘levels’ of knowledge,\textsuperscript{204} and Paul Janz, who equates the ‘sensible processes’ of music ‘in the world of space and time’ with our experience of Revelation, which ‘interrupts’ that space and time.\textsuperscript{205} Leisure time, in which Heaney includes making and listening to music, ‘is considered to have meaning in Christian faith as a gift of God to humanity’ and can therefore never be thought of as insignificant or distracting from that which is ‘more important.’\textsuperscript{206} Heaney also suggests that ‘music intensifies our experience of reality’ in a variety of ways; for example, through the way in which music holds us ‘in the present moment, instead of distancing us from it,’ and the ‘dynamic nature of musical movement, which affects our corporal existence and “moves” us, quite literally.’\textsuperscript{207}

In terms of theological aesthetics, Heaney argues that ‘[a]rt and music that seek to express beauty and pain together… invite us to allow the beauty of the incarnated and crucified Son of God redeem our lost hope,’\textsuperscript{208} and, in a rare instance in which musical examples are directly referred to, cites a number of songs on the theme of beauty that deal with pain and suffering as well as beauty and positivity.\textsuperscript{209} This argument resembles James MacMillan’s discussion of the importance of conflict in music such that the redemptive role of Christ and the capacity of creation to be redeemed are not lost. The main focus for Heaney’s discussion of aesthetics, however, is on what might be learnt from scholars whom she considers to be ‘main thinkers or forerunners in theological aesthetics,’ including Hans Urs von Balthasar, Pierangelo Sequeri, Richard Viladesau, Alejandro R. García-Rivera, Frank Burch Brown, Jeremy Begbie, and Don Saliers.\textsuperscript{210} She is convinced by Balthasar’s description of faith ‘as an aesthetic act,’\textsuperscript{211} though seeks to go further in examining how and why we might come to believe through art\textsuperscript{212} and contrasts Viladesau, for whom ‘art and music are “ways of thinking” that can be complementary to conceptual thinking.’\textsuperscript{213} García-Rivera echoes Heaney’s concern for perception in drawing attention to ‘the reception of beauty, not just beauty as a

\textsuperscript{204} Heaney, \textit{Music as Theology}, 150.
\textsuperscript{205} Ibid., 160.
\textsuperscript{206} Ibid., 165.
\textsuperscript{207} Ibid., 169.
\textsuperscript{208} Ibid., 189.
\textsuperscript{209} Ibid., 185.
\textsuperscript{210} Ibid., 192-253.
\textsuperscript{211} Ibid., 196.
\textsuperscript{212} Ibid., 198-9.
\textsuperscript{213} Ibid., 224.
theological reality,’ and, similarly, Brown poses the question of how taste might have a bearing on the kinds of music that might be considered to be ‘Christian’. Saliers in particular ‘emphasizes the senses in our experience of God’ and suggests more strongly than the other scholars discussed that there are aspects of music that bridge the sacred and secular realms.

Having presented a broad view of musical communication, meaning, epistemology, and aesthetics, Heaney begins to consider how ‘contemporary’ music might offer a new perspective on the theology of the body of Christ, and particularly the ascended Christ: ‘We will reflect upon how music can be an apt means or aid in revealing God’s Word and transmitting Christian faith, in that it can help us to “become present to [the] body of Christ” in the present world and moment, and as a source of theological enrichment.’ It is here that Heaney’s emphasis upon music’s embodiment becomes crucial, as she argues that only through this embodiment might music mediate the presence of the ascended Christ to us. Though her discussion of the nature of the theology of the Ascension at times arguably distracts from her examination of musical mediation of the same, Heaney does raise a number of interesting issues that music, she suggests, might begin to address. She draws a distinction between so-called ‘heavenly’ or ‘spiritual’ music, which implies alienation from our senses and bodies, and ‘incarnated’ music, which engages with the senses and body. Concluding that ‘[f]ullness of life, from a Christian point of view, cannot mean escaping from the world but… a transformation of the created order, assumed in Christ, [rather] than a leaving it behind,’ Heaney suggests that music should more properly reflect this. ‘Heavenly’ music, therefore, is not an adequate expression of the relationship between humanity and the ascended Christ. A sensory experience of faith is not one to which ‘only the more enlightened have access,’ but one that, Heaney appears to be saying, is intrinsic to the human person: ‘The Spiritual senses are our same physical sense transformed and formed in Christ, not another set of more ethereal tools.’ Key to Heaney’s discussion is the conviction that the ascended Christ is present to us now, and as such she offers music, particularly its ‘capacity of holding us

214 Heaney, Music as Theology, 240.
215 Ibid., 243-4.
216 Ibid., 252.
217 Ibid., 261.
218 Ibid., 266.
219 Ibid., 269.
220 Ibid., 270.
221 Ibid., 274.
in the present moment, receptive to reality,’ as a means by which to understand this presence.\textsuperscript{222} However, she counters that this ‘does not in any way mean that \textit{all} music bridges to the presence of Christ,’\textsuperscript{223} though, as before, she does not offer an example or explanation of what kind of music might be more or less useful or appropriate.

In her concluding pages, Heaney posits that ‘music and in particular, the making of music, could help us to access areas of ourselves that are not automatically accessible to “rational” conceptuality’ and touches upon ‘areas of human life that are not immediately expressed or even expressible.’\textsuperscript{224} Despite her insistence on music’s embodied nature, here Heaney also considers the ineffable, transcendent qualities of music, which will be the focus of our study. Heaney makes a conscious decision not to cover music in liturgy or non-Christian music as a means of religious experience, which may suggest that it is only Christian music that is considered in \textit{Music as Theology} (though this is not stated explicitly).\textsuperscript{225} She concedes the lack of ‘practical examples from music itself’ though this, she claims, is because of the lack of a ‘theological comprehension of music in itself.’\textsuperscript{226} Without doubt, Heaney’s engagement with the issues of musical meaning and communication provide a comprehensive and enlightening basis for examining how music might mediate religious experience or faith, and her analysis of the differences between verbal and musical semiotics is especially interesting. However, given her claim in the introductory pages that ‘there are things which God may only be saying through music,’ we might reasonably expect a greater level of engagement with practical examples from music, or, at the very least, a clearer indication of the type of music to which Heaney’s arguments refer. Therefore, while Heaney provides a firm theoretical basis for doing theology with music, it seems that her argument would be strengthened through increased engagement with music itself.

The approach taken by Bowie, Balthasar, Stoltzfus, and Heaney looks primarily to music’s subjectivity and what uses music may have for theology when this subjectivity is taken fully into account. Unlike many of the scholars above, these writers consider more closely the emotional aspect of music, asking how it is that the listener’s emotions might be directed away from the finite toward that which is beyond their immediate experience.

\textsuperscript{222} Heaney, \textit{Music as Theology}, 280-1.
\textsuperscript{223} Ibid., 281.
\textsuperscript{224} Ibid., 291.
\textsuperscript{225} Ibid., 312-3.
\textsuperscript{226} Ibid., 312.
CONCLUSIONS

It would seem, therefore, that a significant proportion of the existing literature on the subject of theology and music views music as a conceptual model for reconsidering and developing an understanding of doctrine and for suggesting how Christian communities should be constructed. As we have observed, this approach has a number of benefits for theology. Firstly, we may note how it is predominantly non-sacred music that is considered in this way, opening up new ways of thinking about the relationship between theology and music that do not solely focus on church music. Though music does undoubtedly have the potential to benefit both individual believers as well as Christian communities as a whole by promoting and developing religious cohesion and identity, as Clarke and Beckford both highlight, and through aiding understanding of doctrines that can be particularly difficult to conceptualise, as we have seen in Begbie and Peacocke and Pederson’s works, a focus on non-sacred music without connection to text or narrative demonstrates music’s capabilities in the wider, secular world. Scholars have also challenged assumptions about the kinds of music that are considered to be ‘spiritual’, asserting the importance of conflict and resolution as a reflection of the crucifixion and resurrection over the quiet stillness that is usually described as spiritual but which does not properly reflect the triumph of God over sin and the salvation of humanity. The use of music as a metaphor therefore demonstrates the benefit for theology when it engages with music that is not thought of as typically ‘spiritual’ or as traditional church music. The fact that non-sacred music without text or narrative might say something about theology leads us to consider its potential not only within religious communities but also outside of them.

However, we might also have some misgivings about the use of music as a conceptual model. Though it is undeniably useful to do so, the use of music in this way only describes doctrine, rather than creating an experience of the transcendent. While those who use music as a conceptual model tend to be very specific about the aspect of belief they claim can be represented in music (Begbie in particular emphasises the importance of specificity), this necessarily depends upon a pre-existing knowledge of that aspect of belief. Indeed, though it might help to increase knowledge of the Christian faith, the use of music as a conceptual model might less easily be said to increase faith itself. Given the connection between music and the emotions, we are motivated to explore how and to what extent music can evoke emotion that might be thought of as religious, by creating
an experience of the divine rather than simply describing it. In other words, it seems necessary to examine how music itself can mediate, rather than refer to, religious belief. This, however, would require a more general view of the divine or transcendent, rather than one that focuses on specific aspects of doctrine.

Additionally, this approach requires us to think more carefully about how music communicates, especially as we are to argue that music can communicate a religious experience that language cannot. Heaney’s study is useful in this respect, though we might wish to examine how music communicates in practice as opposed to her theoretical view. We might equally consider how different types of music communicate differently, which will enable us, unlike many of the scholars outlined above, to discuss the varying capabilities of different types of music in relation to theology. Since our aim is to consider the kind of experience created by music, we must also move away from the close analysis of particular musical features, such as that found in Begbie or Hardie’s works, in order to engage with musical works as a whole. The emphasis in Stoltzfus’ work on music as performance highlights what use music can be to theology if we are to look beyond the example of the written score. Though it is difficult to avoid using the score to illustrate an argument, we must bear in mind that music, in most cases, is experienced through listening, and not reading a score. Our study will perhaps most closely resemble Brown’s, outlined above, in that its primary focus will be to examine the capacity of music to mediate a religious experience. However, whereas Brown’s study encompasses a variety of composers and styles and has the Christian tradition at its core, our study will consider fewer musical examples with closer attention to detail in order to explore not how they evoke particular religious ideas but how they might create in the listener an awareness of the transcendent, awakening the listener’s sense for the infinite.

Each of the approaches discussed above offers a useful insight into how music might relate in some way to theology. We have seen how scholars tend to treat music as an aid to prayer and worship – either by offering a new perspective on theological ideas or by creating a sense of community – or else scholars attempt to apply theological meaning to musical works. They have in common either the assumption of pre-existing faith or some kind of correlation to a specific doctrine, whereas our argument will proceed differently. Our approach will not be to examine how music might be capable of explaining certain aspects of doctrine, as Begbie does, nor will we offer a theological reading of musical
works; these areas have already been covered. Rather, we will seek to discover whether music itself is able not only to teach and reinforce religious doctrine but actually to inspire an initial moment of faith. It will not presuppose any existing faith that the individual might have, or refer to any type of specific doctrine, but will instead endeavour to discuss how music might impact upon individuals before they come to faith by opening the door, as it were, to an experience of the infinite which is directed toward transcendence. Our aim therefore is to examine how music, through its form and features, might possess the potential for laying the foundations for faith but not to analyse how this religious disposition might be articulated, for example, through commitment to a particular religious community or practice. In order to do this, we must first explore the kind of experience that music evokes that might play a role in laying the foundations for faith, which, it will emerge, appears to be an experience of something beyond immediate experience and a yearning for that something.
E.T.A. Hoffmann’s Theory of Music and the Infinite

Throughout his writing on music, Hoffmann is concerned with demonstrating music’s capacity for evoking that which is beyond our immediate experience, which, like Schleiermacher in chapter 3, he understands in terms of the infinite. For him, music has an inherent infinite quality which is expressed through its very nature, its form, and the process of its composition. Here we will explore how Hoffmann understands the notion of the infinite, as well as the various key concepts, such as tension and yearning, through which, he believes, music is able to express something of it. Hoffmann is a valuable resource for examining how musical ideas of the infinite relate to theological ones and for informing our understanding of how music might be able to point its listeners beyond their immediate experience.

THE INFINITE IN HOFFMANN’S WRITING ON MUSIC

Hoffmann uses a number of terms in relation to the infinite which provide an insight into his understanding of it and how it may be experienced. Charlton suggests that the notion of the infinite might be contained within Hoffmann’s term ‘spirit-realm,’ which appears frequently in Hoffmann’s musical writings.1 Elsewhere, this spirit-realm is referred to as an ‘unknown realm’2 or the ‘realm of the infinite.’3 Hoffmann’s persistent reference to an infinite ‘realm’ suggests that the infinite may be a place, or perhaps a state, to which we may be taken by a certain experience. Similarly, Hoffmann’s description of the infinite as ‘our other-worldly abode’ is indicative of a particular place, one in which humanity, he seems to imply, should be at home.4 Of course, it cannot be

---

3 Ibid., 238.
that music physically transports us to another world, and so we may suspect Hoffmann of using the concept of the infinite purely symbolically.

However, Hoffmann also considers the ‘vivid consciousness of “higher natures” ruling men’s lives;’ the infinite in this sense is ‘the sanctum of the higher life’ into which one must strive to gain admittance. Hoffmann also states that music ‘allows men to sense their higher destiny,’ alluding to a notion of the infinite that no longer refers to a place, as we have suggested above, but rather to a consciousness or experience personal to each individual, which elevates each individual to a ‘higher’ state of being and brings each into a relationship with the ‘higher life’ that is the infinite. Considered thus, the infinite would seem to be something intrinsic to human experience, as opposed to a world or realm outside of and completely disconnected from our own. We have here a clear example of why using the notion of the infinite to articulate transcendence is more helpful than simply using the notion of transcendence by itself – that is, the notion of the infinite describes an experience that is more relatable to the individual than transcendence, with its connotations of distance and otherness, implies.

The infinite is, nonetheless, transcendent and, given its transcendence, there are notable difficulties in expressing the precise nature of the infinite. It is for this reason that Hoffmann considers purely instrumental music to be to most effective mediator of the infinite, since vocal music ‘can only depict... those feelings capable of being described in words.’ Moreover, Hoffmann stresses that the infinite is the only true subject of music. However, what the infinite is exactly, and what it is to be connected to it, cannot be expressed in normal, verbal, language. Hoffmann’s thoughts on musical communication are explored in greater detail below.

Hoffmann does not outline in detail how he considers that individuals are able to perceive the infinite, other than providing specific examples of musical features that, he argues, provide a particular point of contact with the infinite. For example, concerning Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony, he notes ‘alternating phrases’ which ‘get shorter and

---

7 Ibid.
8 Hoffmann, “Review,” 236.
9 Hoffmann, “Thoughts,” 94.
shorter’ resulting in ‘an irresistible surge – a swelling torrent’ – imagery which, as we will see, is closely associated with the infinite.\(^{11}\) Likewise, he highlights the ‘constant repetition of short phrases and single chords, which maintains the spirit in a state of ineffable yearning,’\(^{12}\) a state which is bound up with an experience of the infinite. Hoffmann is clear that the ability to connect with the infinite through music relies on the perception, or indeed, the heightened perception, of the listener – the ‘more perceptive soul’ who ‘turned his glance away from the bewildering spectacle presented by men sundered from all holiness and truth, and… discerned the shafts of light that pierced the darkness and proclaimed the existence of the spirit.’\(^{13}\) This assertion contains two important points which relate to the perception of the infinite; firstly, that this perception requires a rejection of the ‘bewildering spectacle’ of worldly life and finite things. In fact, Hoffmann insists that the most effective way in which music might evoke and mediate the infinite is by ‘ignoring and despising all earthly things.’\(^{14}\) He speaks of religious music in particular as ‘music from the other world,’\(^{15}\) suggesting, perhaps, that music does not belong to what he thinks of as ‘earthly things.’ Although music must clearly belong to the finite insofar as it interacts with time and place (as well as the physicality of performer and instrument), Hoffmann seems to imply here that music, being arguably less tangible than other art forms, is less tied to earthly concerns. He also claims that religious music ‘should serve not worldly ends but… praise the ultimate reality of religion,’\(^{16}\) once again distancing music somewhat from earthly concerns. Though he refers here specifically to church music, we might suggest that, since Hoffmann considers the only true content of music to be the infinite, all music should strive not for the finite but for this higher nature. This is how we are to understand the claim that music not only speaks of ‘another world’ but is another world,\(^{17}\) since the perception of it is removed from earthly things.

Hoffmann is careful, however, not to separate the infinite from earthly things completely, since he also proposes that earthly things may mediate a sense for the infinite. He holds music to be the vehicle by which the infinite is revealed, noting how

\(^{11}\) Hoffmann, “Review,” 244.
\(^{12}\) Ibid.
\(^{13}\) Hoffmann, “Old and New Church Music,” 372.
\(^{14}\) Ibid., 358.
\(^{15}\) Ibid.
\(^{16}\) Ibid., 360.
\(^{17}\) Ibid., 375.
‘sound audibly expresses an awareness of the highest and holiest,’\textsuperscript{18} how ‘music reveals to man an unknown realm,’\textsuperscript{19} and highlighting ‘the magical spirit-realm where [the listener is] surrounded by pain and pleasure in the form of sounds.’\textsuperscript{20} Yet it is a temporal art form – it is bound up with our time and with the physical boundaries of our instruments, bodies, and the world around us. Though Hoffmann understands music to have an infinite quality, music (as we have said) also undeniably interacts with the finite, and must do so to exist. If he were altogether to remove an experience of the infinite from the earthly, the finite, Hoffmann would imply that the infinite is not reachable through the finite and there would remain a distance between humanity and the infinite that could not be breached. Of course, the infinite, in its transcendence, can never really be attained or grasped fully, yet Hoffmann maintains that music, a finite entity, can give us an inkling or sense of it.

Hoffmann’s suggestion that humanity must turn away from (though not completely reject) earthly things points to another crucial element of an experience of the infinite – that it must be sought by each individual. In light of this claim, we may understand that individuals must turn away from the finite – at least to some extent – in order to recognise the possibility of something outside of the finite and desire to seek it. Therefore an experience of the infinite, in Hoffmann’s thought, is an active process – the ‘perceptive soul’ \textit{chooses} to turn away from worldly things; equally, the ‘profonder mind \textit{seeks} the infinite.’\textsuperscript{21} It may not come about by accident or chance. Hoffmann does not explain how this choice is made, though it would seem that there are some who are more sensitive to a connection with the infinite than others. Hoffmann does not expand upon this point; however, it would certainly seem that perception of the infinite in his thought is a result of a conscious and active reaching out toward the infinite, and not a chance or accidental encounter with it. Charlton comments, ‘It is as though the music were construed on one expressive level, but a philosophically distinct one from the “higher natures” to which it may lend access, given a correctly predisposed or gifted listener.’\textsuperscript{22} Hoffmann is not specific as to how music helps the decision to seek the
infinite to be made, but we might consider that music in some promotes an awareness of
the infinite which allows the listener to choose to seek it further.

Hoffmann’s writing on music is notable for its widespread use of natural imagery,
particularly associated with the infinite and the experience of it. Much of this imagery
appears in his review of Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony, though it is also evident in his
discussion of church music and generally in his ‘thoughts on the great value of music.’
Overwhelmingly, this imagery focuses on the antithesis of positive and negative, joy and
fear, and so much of it is concerned with the interaction between darkness and light. He
speaks on the one hand of ‘shining rays,’ a ‘brilliant shaft of blinding sunlight,’
‘bright tongues of flame,’ and ‘a thousand shining colours,’ among other examples;
on the other hand, he describes, for instance, the ‘darkness of night,’ giant shadows,
a ‘swelling torrent,’ and a ‘storm-cloud.’ Elsewhere, the notion of the infinite is
brought to life – it is ‘a friendly figure moving through the clouds,’ an ‘awful
phantom,’ ‘a strange and dreadful voice’; it can ‘stir its seraph’s wings and begin
again its flight.’ Indeed, it would seem that Hoffmann is not able to speak of the infinite
or music’s transcendence other than through this imagery as a metaphorical tool. This is
not to say that music is less able to express the infinite – rather, that it does so in a way
that cannot be fully expressed in words. This is, in part, because Hoffmann views the
infinite – evoked through music – as ‘a world in which [a person] leaves behind all
feelings circumscribed by intellect in order to embrace the inexpressible.’ It is not that
music is insufficient for expressing the infinite; rather, the infinite itself is ‘inexpressible’
in its precise nature and cannot be grasped by the intellect. The infinite, Hoffmann
suggests, simply cannot be expressed verbally, which is why he places such great
importance on instrumental music. Thus Hoffmann demonstrates music’s ineffability
while, arguably, at the same time suggesting also the ineffability of the infinite, which

24 Ibid., 248.
25 Ibid., 250.
26 Hoffmann, “Beethoven's Instrumental Music,” 103.
27 Ibid., 238.
29 Ibid., 244.
30 Ibid., 245.
31 Ibid., 242.
32 Ibid., 245.
33 Ibid., 247.
music evokes. We therefore begin to understand the infinite in Hoffmann’s writing as something that cannot be accurately described verbally but that is better evoked and expressed artistically, which agrees with the almost universal view of romantic writers’ thinking about music.

We have here established several important aspects of Hoffmann’s understanding of the infinite, concerning its relationship with humanity, the means of its perception, its ability to be experienced through the finite (though never fully), and the difficulty in expressing its precise nature. We have begun to demonstrate how music is, for Hoffmann, a vehicle by which the infinite can be experienced and expressed. He also employs a number of other concepts in relation to the infinite which relate more closely to an experience of it, as well as others that provide an insight into how music might act as a vehicle by which the infinite may be experienced. To explore this further, we must turn to his notion of yearning.

YEARNING AS A KEY ELEMENT IN HOFFMANN’S DISCUSSION OF MUSIC

Much of Hoffmann’s discussion of the infinite relates it to a feeling of yearning or longing, which stems directly from the infinite’s inability to be grasped fully and which he illustrates specifically through his engagement with musical works. We will return to this notion of yearning below, but it is interesting to note here its relationship with the infinite – it emphasises the transcendence of the infinite and seems to suggest that it is not able to be grasped easily or fully. Hoffmann talks of this lack of fulfilment inherent in music’s form as a yearning not particularly for formal and harmonic closure, as we might expect, but as ‘infinite yearning.’ Here we may question Hoffmann’s use of the term ‘infinite’ once more – does he mean to outline a yearning for the infinite, or simply to highlight the immeasurable nature of this yearning? A further look at Hoffmann’s description of ‘yearning’ reveals ‘ineffable yearning,’ ‘anxious, restless yearning.’

36 Hoffmann, “Thoughts,” 94; see also “Beethoven’s Instrumental Music,” 97; “Review,” 238.
37 Hoffmann, “Review,” 244.
38 Ibid., 241; see also p.247.
and a yearning for ‘the higher realm of the spirit,’ none of which quantify yearning but which relate much more easily to a yearning for the infinite.

Central to Hoffmann’s discussion of music, then, is the idea that it provokes and conveys an overwhelming sense of yearning, which, he maintains, is the ‘one lasting emotion’ with which the listener should be left at the end of a piece of music. We have noted above that Hoffmann directly connects this feeling of yearning to an experience of the infinite. That music causes its listeners ‘to yearn for the higher realm of the spirit’ is, it would seem, a direct product of its sounds, which fill ‘the human breast with infinite yearning.’ Moreover, the feeling of yearning may also be linked to music’s form and structure, which appear to accentuate, or indeed embody, yearning. Similarly, Hoffmann speaks of ‘restless yearning inherent in the theme,’ suggesting not only that the sense of yearning is conveyed through musical form and ideas but also, perhaps, that yearning is indeed essential to and inseparable from music. The repetition of musical ideas and phrases, Hoffmann posits, particularly emphasises this yearning, as does the delayed closure highlighted toward the end of Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony, which he reviews.

The notion of yearning appears throughout Hoffmann’s writing, often alongside the juxtaposition of feelings of joy and pain, and usually characterised as a ‘state of tension.’ As such, Hoffmann associates yearning with restlessness, anxiety, and a ‘mood of foreboding.’ Yearning is also to be thought of as ‘infinite’ and ‘ineffable,’ which, in light of Hoffmann’s characterisation of this feeling as one of tension and foreboding, might well suggest that the thing so yearned for can never in fact be truly reached (as we have noted above). Hoffmann highlights ‘the pain of infinite yearning, in which every desire, leaping up in sounds of exultation, sinks back and disappears.’ For

42 Hoffmann, “Thoughts,” 94.
43 Ibid., 99.
44 Hoffmann, “Review,” 247; my emphasis.
45 Ibid., 244.
46 Ibid., 250.
47 Ibid.
48 Hoffmann, “Beethoven’s Instrumental Music,” e.g. 99.
49 Hoffmann, “Review,” 249.
50 Hoffmann, “Thoughts,” 94.
52 Hoffmann, “Review,” 238.
this reason, the yearning conveyed by music should not be specific but, rather, a feeling of and toward something that cannot be explained.\textsuperscript{53} It is expressed in Charlton’s translation as ‘vague,’ though it is perhaps more useful to think of yearning as something ‘unbestimmt’ which, unlike vagueness, is not at odds with clarity. To think of yearning for the infinite as unbestimmt is to understand it as something that cannot be expressed logically or in language but is nevertheless able to be clearly perceived. This is why instrumental music is so important to Hoffmann, because, though it certainly can be said to have meaning, it is not the direct, specific meaning created in vocal music by a text. It is this lack of concrete meaning, argues Hoffmann, which makes yearning ‘the essence of romanticism,’\textsuperscript{54} since it reaches for an object of experience that transcends this world.

It is important to note that yearning, for Hoffmann, is not something negative but is, in fact, essential to the way in which music is able to evoke a sense for the infinite. It is not problematic that the listener might fail to attain their goal of reaching the infinite — rather, it would seem that Hoffmann places greater value on the process of reaching out to the infinite. Yearning, he suggests throughout his discussion, is precisely the experience by which we are able to come into contact with the infinite.

\section*{MUSIC AS PERSONAL, INDIVIDUAL, AND INTERNAL}

In the same way as many of his contemporaries, Hoffmann outlines an experience of music as a primarily personal and internal one, which relates closely to feeling and emotion. As such, Hoffmann’s writing on music contains a great deal of language which relates to the ‘heart’ and ‘soul;’ he discusses, for instance, the ‘deeper relationship [between different passages of music]’ which ‘speaks only from the heart to the heart,’\textsuperscript{55} the composer’s ability ‘to affect the human heart,’\textsuperscript{56} and the act of composition which ‘consists only in writing down the sacred melodies that pour from his soul as though in devout ecstasy.’\textsuperscript{57} It would seem that it is not knowledge or thought that constitutes a piece of music or an experience of it, but that, first and foremost, music must be a

\textsuperscript{53} Hoffmann, “Review,” 238.
\textsuperscript{54} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{55} Hoffmann, “Beethoven’s Instrumental Music,” 100.
\textsuperscript{56} Ibid., 102.
\textsuperscript{57} Hoffmann, “Old and New Church Music,” 372.
personal and individual experience. It is in this sense that Hoffmann asserts that ‘only what the spirit provides is to be paid regard.’ Fundamental to this personal experience is the notion that it cannot be given or taught – rather, it must be sought by each ‘profounder mind.’ Similarly, in terms of music’s composition, Hoffmann maintains that ‘the melody must flow directly from the pious mind,’ but that the artist (be that composer or performer) must not let their own personality have any bearing on the music, so as to allow the listener a completely subjective experience of it. Conversely, however, Charlton points out Hoffmann’s view of the composer as a ‘cognitive vessel,’ whose art ‘arises solely from man’s spiritual nature.’ While Hoffmann is evidently keen that the intentions of the composer should not impact too greatly on the experience of the listener, he also appears to value the role of the composer in creating such music that might lead to an experience of the infinite. His particular focus on the genius of composition suggests that, for Hoffmann, the experience and process of composition as an act of the spirit subsequently influences and is bound up with the listener’s experience of the infinite. It seems important to note, nonetheless, that the experience of the infinite evoked by music should not necessarily be an isolating one, as Hoffmann’s discussion here may appear to suggest. While the experience of the infinite evoked by music might reasonably be thought of as an individual one that should not be affected by the intervention of another, that is not to say that it cannot be shared in some way with others.

Particularly interesting is the way in which Hoffmann likens music’s effects, insofar as they creates feelings in us, to physical conditions and reactions; we read, for example, of how sounds ‘depict the breast, constricted and affrighted by presentiments of enormity, struggling for air.’ Such is the power of music, it would seem, that an experience of it may create feelings so powerful as to affect not only the mind but the body also. The experience of music in Hoffmann’s argument is therefore so deeply personal that it has an impact on the whole person. In fact, just as the experience of music from the perspective of the listener is a deeply personal one, so too is the process

58 Hoffmann, “Beethoven’s Instrumental Music,” 100.
59 Ibid., 102.
60 Hoffmann, “Old and New Church Music,” 373.
61 Hoffmann, “Beethoven’s Instrumental Music,” 103.
64 Hoffmann, “Review,” 242; see also 247.
of composition, which ‘arises from the heart.’\textsuperscript{65} Considering church music especially, Hoffmann thinks of composition as ‘an act of worship in itself,’\textsuperscript{66} and that ‘sacred music… resides only in a truly pious mind kindled by religion.’\textsuperscript{67} This is because Hoffmann recognises the importance of inspiration in composing in that the composer is compelled to ‘speak of the wonders of the heavenly realm in the magical sounds of music.’\textsuperscript{68} It is in this sense that Hoffmann speaks of composing as ‘a religious exercise.’\textsuperscript{69} Though Hoffmann applies this particular idea only to church music, it seems feasible to suggest that, given the highly personal and internal nature of both listening to and creating music, this kind of inspiration could equally apply to other types of music. We might argue that, having demonstrated how music should derive from feeling and subjectivity, and not from thought or knowledge, Hoffmann would similarly advocate that the act of composition be motivated not by thought but rather be inspired to evoke a sense for the infinite. In this way does Hoffmann’s focus on the personal and subjective nature of music pervade his whole argument, and underpins his suggestion that instrumental music – whose meaning must be interpreted by the individual listener – is especially capable of evoking a sense for the infinite.

**MUSIC AS LANGUAGE AND COMMUNICATOR**

Introducing Hoffmann’s work and particularly his efforts to close ‘the gap between theory and public appreciation,’ Charlton asserts that ‘musicians are communicators.’\textsuperscript{70} The manner of music’s communication is in question, however, as Hoffmann is concerned primarily with instrumental music and not that ‘requiring words.’\textsuperscript{71} Contrary to the view of instrumental music that saw its ‘non-verbal nature’ as ‘necessarily inferior’ – such music was, by some, ‘considered incapable of moving, if not downright trivial and boring’\textsuperscript{72} – Hoffmann thinks of instrumental music as the most Romantic and the most able to convey something of the infinite. While we might not agree that music can be

\begin{itemize}
  \item[65] Hoffmann, “Old and New Church Music,” 358.
  \item[66] Ibid., 366.
  \item[67] Ibid., 373.
  \item[68] Ibid., 372.
  \item[69] Ibid., 358.
  \item[70] Charlton, “Hoffmann as a Writer on Music,” 5.
  \item[71] Ibid., 8.
  \item[72] Ibid., 10.
\end{itemize}
thought of as universal, much less that it operates in the same way as spoken language, it does seem that music communicates *something* emotional, and that perhaps it is the ability to experience this, and not the content itself, that is universal. Music presents ‘an entire drama of human emotions,’ and so it appears that this is how it is able to create and communicate meaning in Hoffmann’s thought.

The ‘rejection of words’ is essential to Hoffmann’s argument since it is thus that music is best able to embrace and provide a way to ‘the inexpressible,’ i.e. the infinite. Instrumental music’s ‘only subject-matter is infinity’ (without words, it can be nothing else) which cannot be expressed verbally, which is why Hoffmann holds Beethoven’s vocal music, for example, to be less successful. Fundamentally, Hoffmann highlights the ‘supreme status’ of instrumental music. Indeed, the experience of the infinite that instrumental music evokes has ‘a higher significance than feeble words.’

Precisely because instrumental music speaks about the infinite and cannot be expressed verbally, Hoffmann asserts that to experience and understand it requires no thought or previous knowledge of it. It therefore appears to be a more immediate communication and experience than spoken language. Undoubtedly, instrumental music is able to communicate *something*, though not verbally, which Hoffmann asserts is a sense for the infinite. However, the prominence of yearning within the experience of such music suggests that instrumental music is not able to communicate clearly or fully. In fact, Charlton cites Friedrich Schlegel’s words on irony, highlighting ‘the impossibility and necessity of total communication.’ We will return to the idea of incomplete and indirect communication in chapter 6, where we will draw upon the work of Kierkegaard to examine how the listener might appropriate the sense for the infinite communicated through music in terms of a religious experience.

74 Ibid., 13.
75 Hoffmann, “Review,” 236.
76 Hoffmann, “Thoughts,” 94.
77 Hoffmann, “Review,” 238.
78 Ibid., 235.
79 Hoffmann, “Beethoven’s Instrumental Music,” 102.
80 Hoffmann, “Thoughts,” 92.
UNITY AND SIMPLICITY

Unity plays an important role in Hoffmann’s argument as a way in which music might evoke a sense for the infinite. Music, ‘just as the cosmos,’ is directed toward ‘the totality of all things,’ and so each musical idea is related to others around it and to the work as a whole.  

Consequently, unity is ‘related to the artistic method,’ and the ‘artist must “see” the whole work inwardly’ in ‘total contemplation.’  

Again, Hoffmann highlights Beethoven’s music as an example of how unity may be conveyed effectively within a piece, though his comments might equally apply to other examples. Beethoven is thought to have a ‘special type of creative perception, one which was conscious of an immanent, Romantic, infinite yet unified state of being.’  

He creates, says Hoffmann, particular unity between movements in which ‘all is directed towards a single point.’  

Moreover, ‘they seem to follow a continuous fantastic sequence, and the whole work will sweep past many as an inspired rhapsody.’  

In this discussion, musical unity is integral to its ability to evoke a sense for the infinite. Hoffmann is clear, therefore, that an experience of a musical work is an experience of that work in its entirety, and that composers should create and use musical ideas and forms accordingly. He also highlights the importance of unity between performers, without which, he says, true unity cannot be achieved and an experience of the infinite is much less probable.  

Unity is so significant in Hoffmann’s discussion because it is this which ‘maintains the spirit in a state of ineffable yearning’ for the infinite. This is maintained not only through the unity between movements but also the unity between musical ideas and themes – ‘it is particularly the close relationship of the individual themes to each other which provides the unity that is able to sustain one feeling in the listener’s heart,’ that of yearning.  

This sense of unity and of each movement, theme, and phrase as part of and directed toward a whole is therefore crucial in creating and evoking an experience of the infinite.

---

84 Ibid., 20.  
86 Hoffmann, “Beethoven’s Instrumental Music,” 100.  
87 Hoffmann, “Review,” 250.  
88 Ibid., 251.  
89 Ibid., 244.  
90 Ibid., 250.
Alongside unity, simplicity also appears to be significant in terms of how effectively a piece of music is able to evoke a sense for the infinite. Hoffmann points out the ‘singular dignity’ of music’s sounds⁹¹ and outlines the ‘dignity and simplicity’ of what he considers good church music.⁹² It would seem that Hoffmann values the simplicity of music for its ability clearly and emphatically to communicate something of the infinite, or, in the case of church music, the religious text. For this reason, Hoffmann equally values the simplicity of Beethoven’s music – highlighting in particular his themes and motives – which he maintains helps to create the overall effect which is a sense of the infinite.

SUBLIME AND ROMANTIC

Hoffmann writes within the Romantic tradition, and many of his key ideas and terms can be thought of as Romantic. Especially prominent in his discussion is the notion of the sublime, which Hoffmann uses on a number of occasions in relation to music. Hoffmann considers music a thoroughly Romantic art⁹³ and his writing on the music of Beethoven is particularly demonstrative of this. For him, the Fifth Symphony ‘fully exemplified Romantic transcendence,’⁹⁴ highlighting the idea that Romanticism is closely bound up with an awareness of the infinite. Music, in Hoffmann’s thought, is Romantic because it is able to produce this awareness, and instrumental music especially so because, as we have noted, it has no content other than the infinite.⁹⁵ He is influenced in this way by Wackenroder, who drew attention to the ‘particular Romantic sensitivity to instrumental music.’⁹⁶ Thus Hoffmann disagrees with the predominantly Enlightenment view of instrumental music as inferior.⁹⁷

Sublimity appears in Hoffmann’s writing as an aspect of Romantic thought and emphasises music’s ability to evoke something of the infinite. He speaks of ‘the

⁹² Ibid., 363.
⁹⁵ Ibid., 8.
⁹⁶ Ibid., 12.
⁹⁷ Ibid., 10.
mysterious and sublime art of music” and its ‘sublime effects and images.’ Charlton notes how the idea of something ‘sublime’ is linked to the acknowledgement of ‘the existence of the immeasurable.’ For this reason, the notion of the sublime often appears in Hoffmann’s writing alongside natural imagery, which we have already linked to his understanding of the infinite. Fundamentally, Hoffmann appears to make a connection between the sublime, Romanticism, and music’s ability to express a sense for the infinite. It would seem that he thinks of this ability as ‘the romantic spirit of music.’

HOFFMANN’S REVIEW OF BEETHOVEN’S FIFTH SYMPHONY: A CLOSE READING

Thus far we have used Hoffmann’s writing to examine what it is that we mean by the ‘the infinite,’ how the infinite relates to the finite and how it may be accessed in some way by individuals, though not completely. Central to this, we have argued, is the recognition of the existence of something beyond the finite world and the yearning to discover and connect with whatever that might be (i.e. the infinite). Though Hoffmann appears to view Beethoven’s work as having a special capacity to evoke something of the infinite, valuing it above other musical works (for example, Mozart’s and Haydn’s, which he says can achieve something like this sense for the infinite to a lesser degree), we have suggested that the capacity for evoking a sense for the infinite may also be present in other instrumental music, expressed through its constituent forms and features.

In order to assess how other musical works are able to do this, we will first undertake a close reading of Hoffmann’s review of Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony in order to highlight and explore the particular features of this piece that he suggests contribute towards the expression of the infinite by creating and sustaining the feeling of yearning. Having done this, we will endeavour to apply what we have learnt about these features to other musical works, in the hope that they might show something of that music’s capacity to

---

98 Hoffmann, “Thoughts,” 95.
100 Charlton, “Hoffmann as a Writer on Music,” 11.
101 Hoffmann, “Thoughts,” e.g. 94.
102 Hoffmann, “Review,” e.g. 238.
evoke a sense for the infinite. That will require us, however, to supplement Hoffmann’s notion of the infinite with insights drawn from Schleiermacher, since, as we will see, Hoffmann’s argument is underdeveloped in certain respects. It is worth noting that Hoffmann appears to have been working from a very early version of the score, and so Charlton highlights in his translation a number of places in which the bar numbers quoted are now inaccurate. As such, this analysis will use bar numbers taken from the Eulenburg edition of the score and not from Hoffmann’s original review.

*Thematic Structure and Form*

For Hoffmann, structure and form are not only the framework within which ideas are conveyed but are valid musical aspects in themselves – that is, the music’s structure and form also have a part to play in expressing some kind of meaning. For this reason, Hoffmann pays close attention to form in his review of Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony and highlights it as one of the ways in which this work expresses a sense for the infinite. In particular, he notes the way in which the themes used in this symphony are composed and organised in such a way as to contribute significantly to the overall feeling of yearning conveyed by the work as a whole and thus express a sense for the infinite.

This emphasis on the thematic structure of this symphony is evident from the outset of the review, where Hoffmann comments that the first movement ‘begins with the main idea consisting of only two bars, which subsequently appears again and again in a variety of forms.’\(^{104}\) He appears to value the simplicity of this theme,\(^ {105}\) commenting that ‘one perceives with admiration how [Beethoven] was able to relate all the secondary ideas… to this simple theme.’\(^ {106}\) Hoffmann thinks of the quaver-minim idea of the first two bars alone as the main idea, but, because of its essential simplicity, all of the other themes are able to relate to it. Therefore, when we think of this first idea as conveying a feeling of yearning, we may equally consider the subsequent themes of this movement, because of this relation, also to convey such a feeling. He makes note of the points at which this theme is repeated multiple times,\(^ {107}\) arguing that repetition of the theme increases its capacity for evoking a feeling of yearning – it ‘maintains the spirit in a state of ineffable

---

\(^{104}\) Hoffmann, “Review,” 239.  
\(^{105}\) Ibid., 244.  
\(^{106}\) Ibid.  
\(^{107}\) Ibid., 241; see also 243.
yearning.' There is certainly a sense of insistence in the use of the motive in this movement that might arguably point listeners toward the ubiquity of the infinite. The second theme is ‘melodious but preserves the mood of anxious, restless yearning expressed by the movement as a whole.’ This feeling of ‘restless yearning’ is emphasised by the interjection, ‘every three bars,’ of ‘the figure previously referred to, so that the new theme is artfully woven into the overall texture.’ Not only does the reappearance of this figure create unity with the previous music, however, but it also serves to continue the unsettled feeling of the first theme by way of constant interruption – the new melody is not able to develop without interruption. Alongside interruption and imitation of themes, Hoffmann also notes themes ‘built only on a two-bar phrase,’ which again prevent a melody from developing and thus create the feeling of yearning. Hoffmann also observes this technique used for this effect later in the piece.

This first section of the first movement closes in the relative major, E flat, and the second half opens with the original theme ‘in its original form, but transposed up a third’ (bar 59). Though Beethoven maintains the tension of the opening by using the original theme, the use of the new key could be argued to reassure the listener somewhat, not only because of its major modality but because it follows the standard pattern of modulation that the listener expects. The tension created here with the reappearance of the original theme – ‘sounds that depict the breast, constricted and affrighted by presentiments of enormity’ – is also relieved by the beginning of a new theme ‘that was touched on by the horns in E flat major in the… first half,’ and which Hoffmann describes as ‘a friendly figure moving through the clouds and shining through the darkness of night,’ a notable instance of the natural imagery Hoffmann uses in relation to the infinite.

Returning to the idea at the centre of the original theme, and viewing it in light of the movement as a whole, Hoffmann asserts that ‘there is no simpler idea than that on which Beethoven has based his entire Allegro.’ As we have already noted, Hoffmann appears

---

108 Hoffmann, “Review,” 244.
109 Ibid., 241.
110 Ibid.
111 Ibid.
112 Ibid., 243 and 244.
113 Ibid., 241.
114 Ibid., 242.
115 Ibid., 244.
to view the simplicity of this idea as key to the success of the theme and its ability to convey something of the infinite.\textsuperscript{116} We might suggest that this short theme is so effective because it is heard in so many different ways throughout the movement, therefore creating an experience for the listener that keeps the feeling of yearning for resolution and closure of the idea at the forefront throughout.

The opening theme of the second movement breaks the tension ‘like a propitious spirit that fills our breast with comfort and hope.’\textsuperscript{117} However, as we will examine below, ‘the very course of this theme,’ and particularly its harmonic development, also expresses ‘the character of the whole work and makes this Andante a part of it,’\textsuperscript{118} so that, even in this more tranquil movement, the tension and yearning of the symphony on the whole is expressed through the harmonic structure here. This is important to note since, as we will again observe, one of the great successes of this symphony and arguably a contributing factor in its ability to mediate a sense for the infinite is the unity and connectedness of the four movements and the sustaining of the feeling of yearning. Not only is it the case that the themes in each individual movement relate closely to each other, but they are also, Hoffmann claims, linked across the symphony as a whole: ‘it is particularly the close relationship of the individual themes to each other which provides the unity that is able to sustain one feeling in the listener’s heart.’\textsuperscript{119}

The themes of the third movement, which Hoffmann suggests ‘should be the most piquant and witty of all,’ continue the tension established in the first and developed in the second; here, ‘the restless yearning inherent in the theme now reaches a level of unease that so constricts the breast that only odd fragmented sounds escape it.’\textsuperscript{120} This tension and the resulting feeling of yearning is continued through to the end of the movement by means of delayed cadential closure and dissonance, as we will explore below. Then, unlike the movements before it, the final movement follows \textit{attacca} – that is immediately, with no break between movements – with a theme that Hoffmann describes as ‘splendid, exultant… like a brilliant shaft of blinding sunlight suddenly penetrating the darkness of night.’\textsuperscript{121} He continues: ‘The subjects of this Allegro are more broadly

\textsuperscript{116} Hoffmann, “Review,” 244.
\textsuperscript{117} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{118} Ibid., 245.
\textsuperscript{119} Ibid., 250.
\textsuperscript{120} Ibid., 247.
\textsuperscript{121} Ibid., 248.
treated than the previous ones,’ outlining a clear contrast between the interrupted, fragmented passages heard in previous movements – which create yearning and tension by avoiding development and fulfilment – and the longer lines of the final movement, which are arguably more settling for the listener. However, ‘another theme enters consisting of crotchets and triplets; in rhythm and character it is quite different from the previous ones, pressing urgently forward like the subjects of the first Allegro [i.e. the first movement] and the minuet… with this theme… the spirit returns to the mood of foreboding which temporarily receded amid the joy and jubilation.’ Even here, then, is the feeling of yearning present in the music, manifest in this case in the restless rhythm of this new theme. Therefore, while it might have seemed that the yearning of the previous movements had been fulfilled with the initial triumphant theme of the final movement, the listener is reminded that this is a feeling that cannot be completely overcome, since the thing for which it strives – Hoffmann’s ‘spirit-realm’ or the infinite – cannot ever be fully grasped.

**Harmony**

Closely linked and indeed a key element of musical form and the thematic structure of this piece, harmony is another means by which Hoffmann suggests Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony is evocative of the infinite. From the outset, harmony is used to create a sense of uneasiness in the listener: ‘Not even the key is certain; the listener assumes E flat major.’ The effect is such that listeners cannot quite place themselves in relation to the music; it creates the same unsettled feeling that comes about as a result of the recognition of the limitedness of the finite in relation to the infinite. The lack of a definite key, even for a short time, would have been especially unsettling for contemporary listeners as it defies usual harmonic conventions, therefore subverting their musical expectations. Hoffmann highlights another instance of harmonic uncertainty at the end of the introduction of the main theme which ends ‘with a fermata on the dominant, giving the listener presentiments of unknown mysteries.’ Again, this serves to create a feeling of not being at home, certainly in this musical world, but arguably in relation to the finite as a whole. It is this feeling that in turn leads to a feeling of yearning, to be more united

---

123 Ibid., 248-9.
124 Ibid., 239.
125 Ibid.
with the infinite. The movement does settle in C minor before moving, in the second section, to E flat major, its relative major. As we have said, this modulation serves to dispel some of the tension created by the reappearance of the original theme. The listener is not totally alienated by the music, therefore; rather, they are made to feel uneasy within a structure and a world that ought to be more familiar.

Though Beethoven introduces a new theme in the second section, Hoffmann notes a lingering sense of tension, highlighting the composer’s use of chromaticism as evidence of this.\textsuperscript{126} Alongside this new theme, Hoffmann points out the repetition of earlier, familiar themes, though heard now in unfamiliar ways: ‘The various elements of the first half follow in F minor, C minor, and G minor.’\textsuperscript{127} Here again, in the repetition of themes moving through different keys, is an example of the way in which the harmonic structure of this symphony can be seen to create a sense of unhomeliness, tension, and, consequently, a feeling of yearning. Equally, Hoffmann notes how the listener’s expectations are once again turned on their head when ‘after the first inversion, the reviewer would have expected G minor as the next chord…’ Instead, Beethoven asks his listeners to continue to strive for a release from this tension, represented by harmonic/cadential closure. Another instance of harmonic tension that Hoffmann highlights in the first movement of this symphony is the interruption of a theme in G major by ‘seven pianissimo diminished seventh chords.’\textsuperscript{128} Once more, the listener is prevented from feeling settled in the world of this music.

With the repetition of an earlier theme, heard this time in C major, Hoffmann writes that the movement moves toward ‘a jubilant close in C major with timpani and trumpets.’\textsuperscript{129} However, this triumphant character is not to last, as ‘the music turns towards F minor,’\textsuperscript{130} before finishing in C minor. Following a pedal note, which suspends the listener in a state of uncertainty, the ‘movement is brought to a strong and powerful close.’\textsuperscript{131} Hoffmann is not specific in outlining the effect of this move from C major to C minor through F minor, though we may certainly suggest that it leaves the listener with a sense of anti-climax. The ‘jubilant’ feeling created by the recurrence of the theme now in

\textsuperscript{126} Hoffmann, “Review,” 241.
\textsuperscript{127} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{128} Ibid., 243.
\textsuperscript{129} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{130} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{131} Ibid., 244.
C major quickly subsides and is defeated by the ultimate return of C minor. Just as the infinite cannot be reached in its entirety, so too can the music not remain in the triumph of the major key. Although the listener may have expected to be returned to the tonic at the close of the movement, the brief move to the tonic major gives the listener an insight into another musical world in which the tension of the minor key might be overcome. This move from triumph to tension thus reinforces the feeling of yearning by providing a glimpse of what is within our grasp, but cannot be realised fully.

The second movement is seen by Hoffmann to begin with significantly less tension than the first, and in the key of A flat major. He suggests that ‘the idea of repeatedly interrupting the A flat major with a stately passage in C major for timpani and trumpet has a striking effect. The transition into C is twice achieved by enharmonic change whereupon the stately theme enters and then the modulation back to the dominant chord of A flat major.’\(^{132}\) Despite the major key and considerably calmer opening, however, Hoffmann still maintains that ‘the very course of this theme… passing through A flat major, B flat minor, F minor, B flat minor, and then back to A flat, the repeated juxtaposition of the major keys A flat and C, the chromatic modulations – all these again express the character of the whole work and make this Andante a part of it.’ He continues: ‘It is as though the awful phantom that seized our hearts in the Allegro threatens at any moment to emerge from the storm-cloud into which it disappeared, so that the comforting figures around us rapidly flee from its sight.’\(^{133}\) Once again, Hoffmann acknowledges the use of harmony as a crucial way in which this music creates tension which leads to a feeling of yearning. It is important to bear in mind, however, that while Hoffmann often characterises this tension in negative terms – describing it above as an ‘awful phantom’ – the feeling of yearning is not to be viewed as a negative one insofar as it is a necessary part of an experience of the infinite. Hoffmann’s description of musical tension as negative might perhaps be understood therefore in terms of the unsettled feeling it creates, of how it prevents the listener from feeling comfortable within the musical world. It is this feeling, of being of the finite and yet recognising its limits and the possibility of something beyond, that is central to yearning and to an experience of the infinite.

\(^{132}\) Hoffmann, “Review,” 245.

\(^{133}\) Ibid.
Similarly, Hoffmann notes of the third movement that ‘the distinctive modulations; the closes on the dominant major, its root becoming the tonic of the next bass theme in the minor mode… it is particularly these features which express so strongly the character of Beethoven’s music… and arouse once more those disquieting presentiments of a magical spirit-world with which the Allegro assailed the listener’s heart.’

It would seem that, for Hoffmann, the Allegro first movement awakens the listener to recognise the limitations of the finite in relation to the infinite, and that each subsequent movement emphasises this recognition and sustains the listener in a feeling of yearning for the infinite. Like the second movement, the third moves through a number of keys – C minor, G minor, D minor, and back toward C minor – even before the second subject is introduced, which also uses a variety of keys. Once again, the frequent modulations heard in this movement cause the listener to feel unsettled and to long for some kind of harmonic stability and fulfilment. This appears to be imminent in the second half of this movement when ‘a G major chord seems to be leading to a close, but cellos and basses sustain a pianissimo A flat for fifteen bars, the violins and violas likewise the C a third above.’

Hoffmann thus notes that harmonic closure is delayed and, as he continues, is even obscured. He observes that ‘the kettledrum plays its C in continuous quavers,’ commenting: ‘Why Beethoven continues the kettledrum C to the end despite its dissonance with the chord is explained by the character he was striving to give the whole work. These heavy, dissonant blows, sounding like a strange and dreadful voice, arouse a horror of the extraordinary, of ghostly fear.’

This is another example of the negative imagery Hoffmann uses in relation to the feeling of yearning, which is expressed here in the dissonance of the repeated C.

The effect of this dissonance is intensified with the progression, without pause, into the final movement, where the C becomes the tonic, the dissonance is resolved, and the mood is ‘exultant.’ In this movement, unlike the others, ‘the modulations are unaffected and clear.’ Whereas, as we observed in earlier movements, progression through a number of keys creates tension and yearning, the opening theme of the final movement ‘continues for thirty-four bars in C major,’ before moving, in keeping with

135 Ibid.
136 Ibid., 247.
137 Ibid.
138 Ibid., 248.
139 Ibid.

72
convention, to ‘the dominant chord of this key.’\footnote{Hoffmann, “Review,” 248.} We find that the mood, as a result, is significantly more positive than in the previous movements – this is the fulfilment of the yearning felt earlier. Hoffmann points out that yearning is not completely absent, however, since ‘with this theme and its further development through A minor to C major, the spirit returns to the mood of foreboding which temporarily receded amid the joy and jubilation.’\footnote{Ibid., 249.} Even here, where tension appears initially to have been overcome, the listener is reminded that the fulfilment experienced is not complete; it is a reminder that, though the music points toward the infinite, it can never reveal the infinite in its precise nature.

For Hoffmann, harmony is therefore an important means by which music expresses a sense for the infinite. This is achieved, for the most part, by the ambiguity surrounding the key signature (for instance, at the beginning of the first movement) and particularly the movement of themes through a number of different keys. The effect, as we have discussed, is a feeling of tension that the listener yearns to be fulfilled. It creates the same unsettled feeling experienced as a finite being in relation to the infinite, recognising the limited nature of the finite world. The final movement demonstrates the jubilation that comes with the supposed fulfilment of this yearning, when the infinite is experienced ‘like a brilliant shaft of blinding sunlight,’\footnote{Ibid.}, though this too is shown to be incomplete and short-lived.

\textit{Melody}

Hoffmann devotes a great deal of his review to the thematic and harmonic structure of this symphony and how these structures contribute to a feeling of the infinite, though in doing so he also touches upon the role played by the melody in this respect. For instance, in the first movement, moments of unity, such as the theme heard ‘in octaves,’\footnote{Ibid., 248.} are contrasted with those of conflict – Hoffmann points out an instance in which ‘the cellos play a figure in contrary motion.’\footnote{Ibid., 242.} Therefore, while there are, at times, musical moments that convey a sense of unity, there are also those in which separation is implied. This is not unlike the relationship of the finite with the infinite – though they are indeed

\footnote{Ibid., 241.}
related, they cannot ever be completely united. A ‘descending figure’ in the bass adds to the feeling of tension and further emphasises the sense of separation.

Another feature of the melody that Hoffmann observes on various occasions in the first movement is Beethoven’s use of imitation\(^{145}\) and repetition (we have noted above the frequent repetition of themes, albeit in different keys and instruments). The return of familiar melodies should reassure the listener, though Beethoven’s use of different keys and instruments transform what ought to be settling into music that yet again makes the listener feel unsure – it is familiar music, but presented in an unfamiliar way. This is particularly effective in maintaining the tension of the work as it does not shock listeners with a new melody – potentially alienating them entirely – but rather creates a sense of unease that is more subtle and insidious. This is another of the ways in which Beethoven’s music in the first movement of this symphony prevents the listener from feeling at home in this musical world, creating a similar sense of relation and yet separation of the finite from the infinite.

The length of melodic lines is another feature highlighted by Hoffmann. He notes that ‘all the phrases are short, consisting merely of two or three bars, and are also constantly exchanged between strings and winds.’\(^{146}\) Additionally he comments that ‘alternating phrases get shorter and shorter… It becomes an irresistible surge – a swelling torrent whose waves break higher and higher.’\(^ {147}\) Here we see an example of the natural imagery that Hoffman associates with the infinite. Moreover, Hoffmann insists that ‘it is precisely this overall pattern, and the constant repetition of short phrases and single chords, which maintains the spirit in a state of ineffable yearning.’\(^ {148}\) We might suggest that the feeling of yearning experienced here is caused by the lack of resolution in the melody – rather than a long melodic line, Beethoven writes short, fragmented passages of music which are constantly repeated, causing the listener to long for some kind of fulfilment. It prolongs the unsettlement created throughout the movement through its various features, which we have observed.

Hoffmann comments of the second movement that ‘all the material in this Andante is very melodious and the main subject is almost ingratiating.’\(^ {149}\) Just as the harmony

\(^{146}\) Ibid., 244.
\(^{147}\) Ibid.
\(^{148}\) Ibid.
\(^{149}\) Ibid., 245.
suggests a much less tense opening to this movement, so too does the melody. However, though the melody suggests a more settled mood, the harmony, as we have seen above, maintains the feeling of tension and yearning.

In much of Hoffmann’s review, it is difficult to distinguish what he says about melody specifically from his thoughts on the thematic structure of the piece – often, melody is spoken of in terms of how the themes are constructed. It is also frequently discussed in relation to the harmonic structure of the piece. Rarely does Hoffmann examine the relationship between individual notes and phrases that make up the melody (except to comment on a rising or descending melodic line) though this is not to say that such an analysis could not also provide an interesting insight into how melody is able to contribute toward music’s ability to convey a sense for the infinite.

Instrumentation

Hoffmann’s review of Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony frequently highlights the instrumentation of certain passages, though Hoffmann is not always clear as to what effect he believes this instrumentation to have.

In the passages where Hoffmann specifically comments on instrumentation, he appears to view the wind and brass and strings as working in opposition to each other, or at least as representing different moods and ideas. It can also be seen to emphasise the tension, restlessness, and feeling of yearning created by the other features of the music we have observed above.

In the first movement, for example, the main theme is initially established in the strings, but is heard later ‘played by clarinets and horns’ in the second half of the movement, in conjunction with a harmonic pattern that is increasing tense and unstable. The same effect can be heard in the second movement, where the theme played by violas and cellos is interrupted by trumpets and timpani. Here, by making this particular comment about the change in instrumentation, Hoffmann appears to suggest that it contributes to the tension and resulting sense of yearning created by the harmonic pattern, all of which makes a theme familiar to the listener suddenly less so. Later in this passage, Hoffmann also remarks on ‘a two-bar phrase taken up alternately by the violins and wind

150 Hoffmann, “Review,” 239.
151 Ibid., 244-5.
instruments; another instance in which instrumentation is highlighted as emphasising the feeling of yearning created by other aspects of the music, particularly by creating a feeling of separation and distance that echoes the individual’s feeling of being in relation to and yet set apart from the infinite.

Hoffmann makes a notable mention of instrumentation at the beginning of the final movement, where ‘we hear the full orchestra, with piccolos, trombones, and contrabassoon now added.’ Instrumentation is used in this instance to highlight the triumphant mood of this movement. Where instrument families were once heard in opposition, the full orchestra now plays together; the separation of the previous movements becomes unity and the distance between the individual and the infinite is, briefly, overcome.

_Hoffmann’s Conclusions_

We have discussed above the particular features Hoffmann highlights in his review of Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony as being especially evocative of the infinite. Though he covers each of the four movements separately, we have noted that both the features observed and the effect of yearning created by them are repeated and sustained across the entire symphony. He observes that ‘Beethoven has preserved the conventional order of movements in this symphony,’ though we have also highlighted places in which he slightly deviates from this convention in order to challenge the expectations of the listener. Many of the features and passages examined above could be seen to be disruptive to the flow and overall effect of the music, often by failing to fulfil the listener’s anticipation and expectation, though Hoffmann says that it is exactly this that enables this music to be so effective in evoking a sense for the infinite. Moreover, of the short, frequently interrupted themes, he says: ‘one would think that such ingredients could result only in something disjointed and hard to follow, but on the contrary it is precisely this overall pattern, and the constant repetition of short phrases and single chords, which maintains the spirit in a state of ineffable yearning.’ It would seem that it is precisely the avoidance of long, melodious themes, and ultimately of fulfilment for

---

153 Ibid., 248.
154 Ibid., 250.
155 Ibid., 244.
the listener that sustains the feeling of yearning throughout the entire symphony. Hoffmann identifies this pattern across all four movements of this symphony, even (and perhaps especially) in the final movement, in which the tension initially seems to have been broken. The ‘spirit-realm’ that Hoffmann associates so closely with this music is therefore present in every movement in the feeling of yearning that it created by the thematic structure, the harmony, melody, and instrumentation.

**Using Hoffmann’s review**

Hoffmann’s review seems to suggest that there is something particular about Beethoven’s music that makes it so able to express a sense for the infinite. Indeed, he claims that no other music – even that of Haydn and Mozart, which he admires – is equally able to evoke a similar feeling of yearning that points individuals toward the ‘realm of the mighty and the immeasurable’ that is the infinite. 156 He also appears to place particular emphasis on the Fifth Symphony as having a special ability to express something of the infinite. 157 Though at times Hoffmann suggests that this might be because of Beethoven’s ‘genius’ and some deliberate decision and action on the part of the composer, 158 at others it would seem that Hoffmann views the composer instead as a vehicle for the infinite, which speaks through him. 159 Whereas the former idea restricts Hoffmann’s ideas only to Beethoven’s music, the latter opens up the possibility that the music of other composers, contrary to Hoffmann’s claim, might also be capable of expressing a sense for the infinite. Arguably, the features we have discussed that Hoffmann highlights as being most able to convey a sense for the infinite are also to be found in a wide range of other music that also rely on structure, harmony, melody and instrumentation to create meaning.

That being the case, it is reasonable to expect to be able to analyse these features in other musical works in order to discover whether or not the same feeling of yearning and resulting sense for the infinite are thereby expressed. We will first apply Hoffmann’s ideas to another of Beethoven’s works, his Seventh Symphony, which will enable us to explore in greater detail his claim that Beethoven’s music is particularly expressive of the

---

156 Hoffmann, “Beethoven’s Instrumental Music,” 97; see also Hoffmann. “Review,” 238.
157 Hoffmann, “Beethoven’s Instrumental Music,” 98.
158 Ibid.
infinite. It is hoped that, by doing this, the concepts of transcendence, the infinite, yearning, and tension and how these relate to and can be heard in music might be reinforced. However, it seems important that, if this view is to be applied beyond Beethoven to music more generally, we must also test our model against music by other composers. For this reason we will turn secondly to our analysis of Schubert’s Ninth Symphony – as another rough contemporary of Hoffmann, we can be confident that the model we have extracted from Hoffmann’s work ought to apply and be effective in this case, too. We may explore thematic structure so as to uncover whether the treatment of themes in these works can be seen to echo those of Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony, alongside an analysis of whether the harmonic structure of these pieces functions to similar effect. In terms of melody we will follow Hoffmann’s treatment of Beethoven’s melodies above, but also go beyond this analysis so as to explore whether a feeling of yearning may also be inherent in the relationship between individual phrases and tones. Finally, we will examine the instrumentation of both pieces insofar as it is used to reinforce and highlight the feeling of yearning (and therefore sense for the infinite) conveyed by themes, harmonies, and melodies that comprise each piece. It is hoped that, by applying the concepts that we have developed from Hoffmann’s writing – with further explanation from Schleiermacher in chapter 3 – we might reinforce the model we have developed from Hoffmann’s review of Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony and explore its potential for examining how other musical styles may also express something of the infinite through their various features.

CONCLUSIONS

We have noted how the key concepts outlined in Hoffmann’s writings on music not only demonstrate his understanding of the nature of the infinite but also how it is experienced and how such an experience may be brought about through music. As we have seen, Hoffmann understands the infinite to be an experience that is directed toward transcendence and holds music (and particularly Beethoven’s music) to be an effective and even ideal mediator and vehicle of the infinite. In his review of Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony, which we have examined above, Hoffmann describes how music’s features are able to generate a feeling of yearning for the infinite that directs the listener toward it.
Hoffmann’s discussion highlights the difficulties in both expressing a sense of and communicating about the infinite, and therefore the importance of (particularly instrumental) music as a vehicle for the infinite. As we have noted, he argues for the unity and simplicity of music as a way in which it may act as such a vehicle, as well as the influence of its composer and of Romantic thought. Music’s special ability to communicate meaning that might otherwise be inexpressible also provides a clear link for Hoffmann between a musical experience and one of the infinite.

What is made clear throughout Hoffmann’s musical writings is his belief that music, and particularly instrumental music, may function as a means by which something infinite, which might be otherwise inexpressible, can be expressed and experienced. The fact that Hoffmann applies the notion of the infinite directly to music as it is experienced by the listener provides us with a clear basis for examining other musical works in the same way as he treats Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony. The importance of the feeling of yearning in an experience of the infinite is emphasised throughout his writing and demonstrates that music itself does not contain the infinite but rather points the listener toward an experience of it. Hoffmann is therefore vital to our study both in terms of how his writing provides an example of musical analysis that specifically highlights moments of yearning and also as an illustration of the kind of experience that music is able to evoke for its listeners – that is, an experience of yearning and reaching for the infinite.

However, Hoffmann’s writings alone are not sufficient as a resource for this study. Hoffmann is good at identifying features of Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony that create a yearning for the infinite – such as harmonic tension and the delaying of cadential closure – but is less good at providing theological articulation of this experience. Our next task, therefore, is to supplement Hoffmann’s musical theory with some ideas drawn from Schleiermacher, who provides a theological analysis to fill the gaps in Hoffmann’s argument and, by doing so, enables us to construct a coherent Romantic theory of music’s evocation of the infinite. Though Hoffmann’s review provides a useful model for examining the features in music that evoke a sense for the infinite, it is problematic in the sense that Hoffmann leaves many of his key concepts insufficiently explained, justified, and articulated. Often, his explanation of the notion of the infinite is outlined in such fanciful and metaphorical terms that it can be difficult to get a sense of how the individual is able to experience the infinite, much less how the individual might internalise and appropriate that experience and be directed toward the transcendent.
Schleiermacher’s writing provides a closer look at how the individual is related to the infinite and is able to access the sense for the infinite. We will learn, through Schleiermacher, that the sense for the infinite relies upon close engagement with the finite world, justifying Hoffmann’s assertion that music may function as a vehicle for the sense of the infinite. This will allow us to come to a fuller understanding of the key concepts we have already outlined and so, by the end of chapter 3, construct a Hoffmannian-Schleiermacherian approach to music and the infinite.
Religion as Experience in Schleiermacher’s Thought

In order to enable us to think in terms of an experience of the infinite rather than any kind of specific doctrine or tradition, we will look to the work of F.D.E. Schleiermacher, whose focus on religion primarily as a ‘sense for the infinite’ will inform our own study. Through engaging with Schleiermacher’s writing, we will hope to come to an understanding of how it is that an individual is able to recognise the possibility of the infinite and reach out toward it in a move that may eventually be transformed into religious faith.

ON RELIGION: SPEECHES TO ITS CULTURED DESPISERS

Published in 1799, Schleiermacher’s Speeches aim to explain the nature of religion and demonstrate its importance to those in society who are disdainful of it. Here, Schleiermacher responds to the Enlightenment idea that religion falls outside of the realm of knowledge and therefore has little purpose and merits little thought. Schleiermacher presents his argument in the form of five separate speeches on different themes, each of which we will explore in some detail below.

First Speech – Apology

Schleiermacher begins by addressing religion’s ‘cultured despisers’, those who have ‘succeeded in making [their] earthly lives so rich and many-sided that [they] no longer need the eternal.’¹ He chastises them for their suspicion of religion and particularly of the clergy² and for basing their distrust of religion on its concepts rather than as it is experienced ‘in the world.’³

² Ibid., 4.
³ Ibid., 11. Schleiermacher returns to this notion in the fifth speech, pp. 96-102.
To counter the cultured despisers’ inadequate conception of religion, Schleiermacher outlines two ‘opposing drives’ that coincide in each human soul: the first, which internalises and draws ‘everything that surrounds it… into its innermost being’ is, for Schleiermacher, ‘orientated toward enjoyment’ and ‘individual things.’ The second ‘longs to extend its own self ever further;’ it ‘despises enjoyment’ and ‘proceeds directly to the infinite.’ It is here that Schleiermacher first introduces the notion of activity in relation to religion as a ‘product’ of the coexistence of these drives and in particular as a direct result of the latter drive which ‘only goes on to ever-increasing and heightened activity.’ He goes on to say that to ‘lie at the extreme ends’ of either drive is useless and potentially damaging, advocating instead an equal combination of both drives. It would seem, then, that activity and also receptivity have a role to play in one’s experience of religion. Activity is key since striving and longing for something beyond immediate existence, a defining characteristic of the latter drive, is not only an activity in itself but actually motivates the soul to further and higher activity. However, without receptivity, i.e. the ability and drive to internalise this experience and draw it to the self, striving for the infinite is ineffective and ‘flies beyond its goal.’ Schleiermacher thus introduces an interplay between activity and receptivity that underpins his notion of the experience of religion. One without the other cannot lead to religion, since religion requires both a reaching out to the infinite and a drawing it into oneself. It is here that Schleiermacher also lays the foundation for his claim, taken up in later speeches, that religion requires an engagement with the finite if one is also to strive for the infinite. This is how he shows religion to be simultaneously receptive and active – that in being receptive to/of ‘surrounding things,’ one might become more aware of his or her relation to the infinite (a point Schleiermacher expands upon in later speeches) and so actively strive for it and be motivated to act because of it. The interplay between activity and receptivity in Schleiermacher’s thinking might therefore be understood as an act of striving or longing for the universe that leads to a reception and internalisation of the experience of being

---

5 Ibid.
6 Ibid., 6.
7 Ibid., 6-7.
8 Ibid., 5.
9 Ibid., 6.
10 Schleiermacher describes even this as a ‘force of attraction that actively seizes [my emphasis] surrounding things,’ thus even being receptive to the finite is inseparable from activity.
11 Ibid., 6.
finite in relation to the infinite, which in turn inspires further activity on the part of the subject – a ‘back and forth of activity and receptivity.’  

Those who possess both drives in equal measure are described by Schleiermacher as ‘mediators between limited man and infinite humanity,’ implying that one aspect of religion’s activity is mediation of the infinite. As mediators they must, says Schleiermacher, ‘set down in pictures or words’ their encounter with the infinite and ‘represent for others what they have encountered as poets and seers, as orators or as artists.’ It seems, therefore, that just as to experience religion is to be active, so too is mediating such a religious experience similarly active, and perhaps even proceeds from the first act of the experience itself. The means by which Schleiermacher suggests that religion, these two opposing drives, might be mediated are all notably creative. Though Schleiermacher does not expand too much upon the kinds of creativity that are linked to the mediation of religion, it is feasible that he may have had in mind the kind of creative forms common in prayer and worship – paintings and images, literature, and, of course, music.

The notions of ‘feeling’ and ‘intuition’ that are so central to Schleiermacher’s theology are introduced in this first speech and seem to align with the drive for the infinite (intuition) and the drive which draws everything to oneself (feeling). Barth describes Schleiermacher’s conception of feeling’s receptivity as ‘the subject’s total remaining within itself… in contrast to feeling, action is a total moving out of the self.’ Schleiermacher does not explain what he means by these two terms in any great detail in this first speech, but he does make clear that feeling and intuition are intrinsically connected. It is suggested here that feeling results in ‘an astonishing intuition of the infinite,’ though elsewhere in the Speeches this progression from feeling to intuition, if it exists at all, is less clear. Feeling and intuition are characterised here by movement – feeling is something that ‘moves the mind in a particular manner’ and intuition, we may

---

14 Ibid.
17 Ibid.
18 Ibid.
suggest, is a ‘soul stirred by the universe.'

This emphasises the active but also the receptive and internalising nature of an experience of the infinite and perhaps suggests that this experience has some connection to our emotions/emotional responses.

Schleiermacher’s argument in the *Speeches* may be criticised as being overly concerned with emotion; however, it might be countered that, where Schleiermacher seems to imply the involvement of emotion, it is intended to highlight the deeply personal nature of religion as he understands it. While Schleiermacher is careful in the *Speeches* to avoid a notion of religion that is reduced only to emotion and sentimentality, it is also clear that his theology here is more concerned with a personal experience of religion than an experience focused on knowledge of doctrine, and the concepts so despised by his readers.

Entitled ‘Apology’, we might reasonably expect that the core of Schleiermacher’s first speech focuses on justifying the idea of religion to his readers. As we have seen, he highlights the differences between the concepts and organisations of religion, on which the cultured despisers base their dislike of it, and points out the hypocrisy of such people who ‘most desire to be instructed’ in every subject but have a strong suspicion of religion and its advocates. He is unconvinced that those who are too concerned with earthly things might look beyond themselves to the infinite, and outlines his aim to demonstrate that religion both originates in and has an effect upon ‘the interior of every better soul.’ It is in an attempt to fulfil this aim that Schleiermacher introduces the notions of feeling and intuition in relation to the ‘opposing drives’ of receptivity and activity, which he develops in the speeches that follow.

When Schleiermacher speaks about activity and receptivity in the first speech, we understand him to mean the interplay between the (active) drive to reach for the infinite and the (receptive) drive to internalise that experience, to draw it to oneself. Religion has an active element within it in the form of this first drive, but it also inspires further activity which mediates the experience of the infinite for others. Thus activity and receptivity in the first speech relate directly to how the infinite is experienced and internalised and also how it might be communicated and mediated for others.

---

20 Ibid., xxxii-xxxiii.
21 Ibid., 4.
22 Ibid., 11.
23 Ibid., 17.
These drives, we have argued, are named later in the first speech as ‘feeling’ – the receptive, internalising element of religion – and ‘intuition’ – the active element that strives for the infinite. This, it would seem, is why Proudfoot understands feeling to be the ‘subjective side’ of experience while intuition is the ‘objective side.’ Feeling and intuition are coexistent and impossible to separate in an experience of the infinite, though Schleiermacher certainly conceives of them as two distinct elements of that experience – they are ‘not unity but a totality that refers to an inherent capacity for receptivity’ which motivates further action to mediate or communicate the infinite. As a back and forth of activity and receptivity, intuition reaches for and touches the infinite while feeling remains within the subject, and there is an interplay between the two which causes religion never to be either singularly active or receptive but always a combination of both. In introducing these ideas, the first speech also suggests that feeling and intuition may be linked in some way to emotional experience and that both may be mediated through creativity of some kind.

Second Speech – On the Essence of Religion

In his second speech, Schleiermacher addresses the question, “What is religion?” and, in doing so, develops his notions of feeling and intuition and introduces the idea of a ‘sensibility and taste for the infinite.’ He regrets that he cannot present religion ‘in some well-known form’ and asserts the difficulty of recognising and grasping the nature of religion, a task in which, he says, imagination must play a part. Religion, says Schleiermacher, is neither metaphysics nor morals, though it might seem similar to both of these. However, whereas metaphysics and morals view ‘only humanity as the center of all relatedness,’ religion wishes to looks beyond humanity to ‘see the infinite… in humanity no less than in all other individual and finite forms.’ Notably, religion does this through intuition and feeling: ‘it wishes to intuit the universe, wishes devoutly to

---

26 Schleiermacher, On Religion, 23.
27 Ibid., 18.
28 Ibid., 19.
29 Ibid.
30 Ibid., 23.
overhear the universe’s own manifestations and actions, longs to be grasped and filled by the universe’s immediate influences in childlike passivity.\textsuperscript{31} The first part of this statement describes the activity of intuition, and its perception of the action of the universe upon us, and the latter denotes the role of feeling in the overall impression of religion. Consequently, Schleiermacher posits that ‘religion’s essence is neither thinking nor acting but intuition and feeling.'\textsuperscript{32} This is not to say that religion is completely devoid of thought or activity, since we have already identified in the first speech that activity has a role to play in intuition, and receptivity a role to play in feeling. Instead, Schleiermacher simply wishes to emphasise that ‘everything must proceed from intuition.’\textsuperscript{33}

\textit{Intuition}

Here, Schleiermacher describes intuition as ‘the hinge of my whole speech,’\textsuperscript{34} and accordingly devotes a great deal of argument to its further explanation. Firstly, he establishes that this is intuition \textit{of} something: ‘intuition of the universe.’\textsuperscript{35} Moreover, this thing that is to be intuited appears to be active, since the intuition itself ‘proceeds from an influence of the intuited on the one who intuits, from an original and independent action of the former, which is then grasped, apprehended, and conceived by the latter according to one’s own nature.’\textsuperscript{36} That the thing to be intuited is active is important in Schleiermacher’s theology because ‘what you thus intuit and perceive is not the nature of things, but their action upon you.’\textsuperscript{37}

Intuition is described as ‘immediate experiences of the existence and action of the universe’ and is always ‘something individual, set apart, the immediate perception’ of the infinite.\textsuperscript{38} Schleiermacher now introduces the idea of immediacy to his concept of intuition, which may seem to proceed from his claim that religion ‘is not thinking.’ That is not to say, however, that intuition nor the feeling that is inspired by it should be

\textsuperscript{31} Schleiermacher, \textit{On Religion}, 22.
\textsuperscript{32} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{33} Ibid., 24.
\textsuperscript{34} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{35} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{36} Ibid., 24-5.
\textsuperscript{37} Ibid., 25.
\textsuperscript{38} Ibid., 26.
understood as being independent of thought;\textsuperscript{39} rather, they are immediate because they are ‘not mediated by self-reflection.’\textsuperscript{40} Thus religious feeling and intuition may inspire thought insofar as they relate to human life and experience, but may not involve reflection by the intuited or feeling subject as they must remain above the finitude of human experience and directed toward something infinite. In other words, neither intuition nor feeling may originate from thought or indeed from the subject – it is a personal experience but not one that involves the intervention of the self.

Alongside immediacy is the idea that each intuition is individual, and, significantly, that not everybody intuits in precisely the same way.\textsuperscript{41} Schleiermacher speaks of ‘the particular manner in which the universe presents itself to you in your intuitions and determines the uniqueness of your individual intuitions.’\textsuperscript{42} Evidently there is an element of subjectivity in intuition, as we have already observed that it is perceived and understood ‘according to one’s own nature,’ and thus Proudfoot argues that intuition is ‘shaped by language, culture and individuality.’\textsuperscript{43} Vial agrees,\textsuperscript{44} suggesting that we do not all intuit in precisely the same way because ‘our natures are not completely universal.’\textsuperscript{45} Clearly, there is a subjectivity inherent in intuition and also in feeling that influences how they are perceived and experienced. This is reinforced by the fact that intuition also seems to be bound up with sensory perception. As we have seen, Schleiermacher’s intuition is intuition of something, and therefore that something must be perceived in some way. He claims that ‘your senses mediate the connection between the object and yourselves’ and that this object ‘must stimulate them in various ways and produce a change in your inner consciousness.’\textsuperscript{46} This is the sense in which Schleiermacher argues that religion is separate from thinking and knowing, because it proceeds directly from the senses and the perception of something. Thus sensory perception is of great importance to Schleiermacher’s notion of intuition, and appears even more so when we consider that ‘the sounder the sense’ and ‘the more ardent the thirst and the more persistent the drive to grasp the infinite,’ in other words, the greater

\textsuperscript{40} Ibid., 30.
\textsuperscript{42} Ibid., 29.
\textsuperscript{44} Vial, “Anschauung and Intuition, Again,” 47.
\textsuperscript{45} Ibid., 46.
\textsuperscript{46} Schleiermacher, \textit{On Religion}, 31.
one’s drive to seek the infinite through sensory perception, the stronger one’s intuition will be.⁴⁷

This would seem to be fundamental because, as Grove explains, religious intuition is not to be separated from empirical or sensible intuition, by which he means the perception of and interaction with things in the world around us. Since ‘sensible intuition is a condition without which a particular thing cannot be present to a human subject… religious intuition cannot be independent of empirical intuition, but instead must be necessarily related to it,’ hence the activity and receptivity of religion.⁴⁸ It is because of this relation to sensible, empirical intuition that we can think of religious intuition as (our perception of) the action of the infinite on us.⁴⁹ The difference, however, between sensible and religious intuition, according to Grove, is that religious intuition has ‘the character of an interpretation’ and, as such, can ‘only be generated through the spontaneous activity of the intuiting subject.’⁵⁰ Grove does not elaborate on how this ‘spontaneous activity’ might generate an intuition, or even what type of activity that might be. However, his notion of religious intuition as interpretation certainly suggests a strong connection with the arts, in which interpretation is key in generating meaning and creating impressions.

Of note here is Schleiermacher’s use of Anschauung, which is often translated as ‘intuition’ but in fact means ‘almost the precise opposite of the normal English connotation of something inexplicable, non-rational, or a hunch.’⁵¹ Vial suggests that this term ‘intuition’ often takes on a meaning ‘much closer to the German Ahnung,’ though this is not what Schleiermacher means to say.⁵² Whereas Anschauung is bound to the senses as something that can be concretely perceived and experienced, Ahnung is, rather, pre-sentient and not something that can be seen, heard, or felt. Clearly, Schleiermacher intends to ensure that intuition (as we will continue to use in English) – and therefore religion – do not belong to the realm of uncertainty, estimation, the irrational, or the inexpressible – all of which are implicit in Ahnung. Rather, he uses Anschauung to stress

---

⁴⁷ Schleiermacher, On Religion, 29.
⁵¹ Vial, “Anschauung and Intuition, Again,” 44.
⁵² Ibid.
the somewhat concrete nature of intuition and religion – that they are firmly directed toward an object or concept and are actually experience-able and expressible (despite the fact that ‘we have no direct access to things-in-themselves’)\(^{53}\) – they are not the product of luck, accident, or a ‘hunch’ but a definite experience of the infinite other that forms a central part of human self-consciousness and experience. Thus, through his use of \textit{Anschauung}, Schleiermacher maintains religion as a primarily sensory experience that can be sought, ‘intuited’, felt, and expressed, and not as something outside of the range of the senses or of human life and experience.

How, then, is one able to intuit the infinite? Schleiermacher stresses the importance of recognising one’s own limitations in relation to the infinite – that is, that there are things to be intuited beyond the boundaries of one’s own experience – as the starting point of every intuition.\(^{54}\) We have already identified that intuition must be connected to an object or concept of some kind that may be perceived by the senses, and Schleiermacher insists that this is in fact finite ‘form’, which he describes as ‘the holy essence itself.’\(^{55}\) Crouter points out that Schleiermacher’s belief that ‘one comes to know the essence or nature of a thing… only in its manifestation in finite form’ derives from his knowledge of Plato,\(^{56}\) and this certainly agrees with Grove’s claim, outlined above, that a particular thing may only be presented to us through ‘sensible intuition.’ Thus intuition ‘develops out of everything,’\(^{57}\) and we can better understand why a person’s wanting to intuit may lead them to even stronger intuitions, since such a person would be driven to seek the infinite in every finite thing. Schleiermacher’s conception of intuition and religion is therefore limitless – he asserts that ‘what religion is supposed to perceive it must be able to perceive everywhere,’\(^{58}\) and thus everything finite becomes a potential stimulus for intuition, feeling, and an experience of religion so long as one is willing and able to perceive it as such.

That intuition is connected to objects and concepts may seem to contradict its immediacy. However, as we have already argued, it is not Schleiermacher’s intention to remove the mediation of thought from religious feeling – only self-reflection – and

\(^{53}\) Vial, “Anschauung and Intuition, Again,” 44.
\(^{54}\) Schleiermacher, \textit{On Religion}, 27.
\(^{55}\) Ibid., 32.
\(^{56}\) Ibid., footnote.
\(^{57}\) Ibid., 37.
\(^{58}\) Ibid., 45.
neither, it may seem, does he wish to separate feeling from objects and concepts.\(^{59}\) For Gamwell, Schleiermacher may be read similarly to Kant in this respect, who posits that there is ‘no human experience without concepts’ and specifically ‘no human experience of God independently of thought.’\(^{60}\) We may agree with Proudfoot, Gamwell, and Sorrentino, who all assert that religion, intuition, and feeling do not belong ‘to a field of experience inaccessible to concepts,’\(^ {61}\) though where they have some difficulty in identifying concepts with which religion may be associated, we might look instead to Schleiermacher for an example. He lists ‘miracle,’ ‘revelation,’ and ‘inspiration’ as ‘the first and most essential’ of religion’s concepts, where miracle is an event of which ‘the religious view… can be the dominant one;’ revelation is ‘every original and new intuition of the universe;’ and inspiration is ‘merely the religious name for freedom.’\(^{62}\) Of course, it follows that these concepts are in turn connected to finite objects, since we have already observed that intuition cannot occur without a recognition of the infinite in the finite.

Essentially, Schleiermacher’s notion of intuition rests on the ability (or rather the drive, since he asserts that we are not in fact capable) to view the infinite and everything in it as a united whole, despite the fact that some of its parts are beyond the boundaries of our existence\(^ {63}\) – Schleiermacher thinks of it as a work of art of which we perceive only a part but ‘suspect’ something greater beyond our experience.\(^ {64}\) Particularly interesting in light of our exploration of how these notions might be viewed in relation to musical experience is Schleiermacher’s appeal to his readers to intuit the universe ‘not only in its being but also in its becoming.’\(^ {65}\) Arguably, music, more so than other art forms, embodies this idea of ‘becoming’ – even fully scored works cannot be experienced as a whole, as one might view a painting, for instance, and must instead be heard moment by moment as the music unfolds. It may seem that the music is created or ‘becomes’ anew with each individual performance, especially given the mediation of different performers, audiences, and contexts. That Schleiermacher encourages his readers to intuit in a similar

\(^{60}\) Gamwell, “Schleiermacher and Transcendental Philosophy,” 139.
\(^{61}\) Sorrentino, “Feeling as a Key Notion in a Transcendental Conception of Religion,” 99.
\(^{63}\) Ibid., 47.
\(^{64}\) Ibid., 35.
\(^{65}\) Ibid., 41.
way is surely significant in terms of the role of music in evoking a sense for the infinite and stimulating and mediating intuition and subsequently feeling.

Here, in the second speech, Schleiermacher introduces the idea of ‘God’ alongside intuition and feeling for the first time. For Schleiermacher, God is a particular type of intuition, and ‘whether we have a God as part of our intuition depends on the direction of our imagination.’ He does not advocate one type of intuition over another – i.e. an intuition with God or without God – but what is clearly of central importance to Schleiermacher here is not the presence or lack of God but the intuition itself. He emphasises that ‘God is not everything in religion, but one, and the universe is more,’ and therefore that it is not God but intuition and feeling that are the essence of religion. Schleiermacher reiterates the ‘highest goal’ of religion – that ‘we, by intuiting the universe, will become one with it as much as possible,’ ‘to discover a universe beyond humanity’ by searching to intuit it in the limited, finite world around us.

**Feeling**

Feeling, according to Schleiermacher, ‘must accompany everyone who really has religion’ and is experienced when one is ‘conscious that his religion is only a part of the whole,’ and aware of the finitude of human existence in the face of the infinite. Like intuition, it is bound up with ‘multiplicity and individuality.’ Schleiermacher regrets that intuition and feeling must be spoken of separately in order to be understood, since they should not properly be separated: ‘intuition without feeling is nothing… feeling without intuition is also nothing.’ This is because feelings are inspired by the intuitions themselves; they flow from them and ‘can be explained only in terms of them.’ Though Schleiermacher asserts an intrinsic link between feeling and intuition, it is also clear that they are to be thought of as two distinct aspects of religion, albeit ones which co-exist in every experience of religion.

---

67 Ibid., 54.
68 Ibid., 53.
69 Ibid., 27.
70 Ibid., 24.
71 Ibid., 31.
72 Ibid., 45.
That being the case, there are of course similarities between intuition and feeling; for instance, both require a recognition of humanity as a finite part of an infinite whole, and the idea that religious feeling might be mediated by the senses. Feelings are also claimed to be ‘immediate influences of the universe’ in the same sense as we have understood intuition to be immediate. Arguing that ‘in the act of intuiting, you must necessarily be seized by various feelings,’ Schleiermacher here emphasises that feelings proceed from and are a product of intuition. Therefore, when Schleiermacher says that feeling is ‘produced directly by the universe,’ we can suggest that this is as a result of an initial intuition, a perception of the action of the infinite on/toward humanity. We have already discussed the co-existence of intuition and feeling within each experience of religion, and despite the fact that Schleiermacher devotes a great deal of his argument in the second speech to an exploration of intuition, the place of feeling is not to be underestimated and it is certainly not to be thought of as secondary to intuition. In fact, Schleiermacher makes it clear that ‘intuition never predominates so much that feeling is almost extinguished.’

The importance of feeling, therefore, lies in its ability to internalise and express a connection with the universe as perceived by an intuition. Feeling, on the other hand, may ‘grow to such intensity that you forget both the object and yourselves because of it.’ Schleiermacher describes it as an overwhelming awareness of the universe as if one were, for a moment, part of ‘the infinite life’, and whereas intuition reaches out to the infinite, feeling ‘works its way up from inside.’ Generally, it would not seem accurate to suggest that Schleiermacher prioritises feeling over intuition, though at this point in the speech he does certainly emphasise the significance of feeling as the way in which an awareness and recognition of the infinite universe is internalised and becomes a personal, individual experience.

Though they are undoubtedly individual, Schleiermacher argues that these feelings should be shared: ‘feelings are supposed to possess us, and we should express, maintain, and portray them.’ We have already identified in the first speech that Schleiermacher

---

73 Schleiermacher, On Religion, 27.
74 Ibid., 29.
75 Ibid., 49.
76 Ibid., 29; see also 45.
77 Ibid., 49.
78 Ibid., 29.
79 Ibid.
80 Ibid., 32.
81 Ibid., 29.
seems to favour the arts as a vehicle through which feeling might be portrayed. Here, however, Schleiermacher does not fully explain why it is that feeling should be portrayed in this way, or at all, and how it is that feeling might be portrayed through a work of art, though he does again highlight a ‘creative drive’ for the infinite.\(^{82}\) He does, nonetheless, provide some examples of the kinds of feelings that might be considered to be religious, including ‘reverence in the face of the eternal and invisible’ and ‘true unaffected humility.’\(^{83}\) This supports our understanding of feeling’s immediacy since reverence and humility are surely not to be considered reflexive. ‘Genuine feelings,’ says Proudfoot, ‘are not reflexive,’\(^{84}\) and as a result are ‘more receptive than are states that include self-reflection.’\(^{85}\) In fact, ‘feeling belongs entirely to the realm of receptivity,’\(^{86}\) which is receptivity to the activity of the universe on us, perceived by intuition.

**Activity**

The second speech reinforces the link between intuition and activity which we have already observed in the first speech. Each intuition is a revelation and a perception of the ‘uninterrupted activity’ of the infinite upon us: ‘every form that it brings forth… is an action of the same upon us.’\(^{87}\) Yet humanity is also active in an experience of religion, since ‘an action is brought forth in you’ through ‘the influence of external objects,’ by which Schleiermacher surely means the infinite.\(^{88}\) He is somewhat unclear here, however, as to the extent to which intuition and feeling should lead to action. In the first speech, we identified a ‘back and forth of activity and receptivity’ in which the act of intuition instigates a feeling which might in turn lead to further activity – we suggested that this might be mediating or representing activity. Schleiermacher does here restate that through ‘the same actions of the universe’ and ‘in the act of intuiting it, you must necessarily be seized by various feelings.’\(^{89}\) Nevertheless, he wishes to distance feeling from further activity rather more than he does in the first speech. He speaks instead about the need to ‘master’ one’s feelings of religion before they lead to action and asserts that

\(^{82}\) Schleiermacher, *On Religion*, 47.
\(^{83}\) Ibid., 45.
\(^{84}\) Ibid.
\(^{85}\) Ibid.
\(^{86}\) Ibid.
\(^{87}\) Ibid., 25.
\(^{88}\) Ibid., 29.
\(^{89}\) Ibid.
‘we should do everything with religion, nothing because of religion.’

It would certainly seem that, in Schleiermacher’s thought, it is only feeling and intuition that are religion, and any further action, even that which represents or mediates feelings and intuitions, cannot be religion itself.

_Sense for the infinite_

Thus far, our discussion of how Schleiermacher develops his notions of intuition and feeling, and the activity and receptivity inherent therein, has concentrated on some kind of relation to the ‘infinite.’ In the second speech, we gain a clearer insight into how he conceives of our ‘connection to an infinite totality,’ and why this, and not knowledge of doctrine, is the focus of religion.

Schleiermacher thinks of religion as ‘something integral that could have arisen in the human heart… from which a concept can be formulated,’ and for this reason suggests that religion ‘never appears in a pure state.’ Even ‘holy writings’ are not to be considered religion. Crucial to Schleiermacher’s conception of religion is the idea that humanity is only able to experience religion if it is ‘conscious of [its] limitedness’ and finitude in the face of the ‘immeasurable’ infinite. He thus asserts that ‘religion is the sensibility and taste for the infinite,’ though he is not absolutely clear in his definition of this ‘infinite,’ which he elsewhere refers to as the ‘universe,’ other than to say that ‘religion… is infinite in all respects, an infinity of matter and form, of being, of vision, and of knowledge about it.’ Sorrentino thinks of this as contact with a ‘totally other’ reality, which Vial suggests might be ‘something like the natural causal nexus.’ This is the ‘transcendental core of religion,’ according to Sorrentino, as it ‘involves a relationship with a term (das Universum) that withdraws from a human being’s finite experience’ and is ‘what makes sense of the ultimate human condition… what fulfils the whole of human existence.’ The notion of the infinite, though transcendent, is not,

---

90 Schleiermacher, _On Religion_, 30.
91 Ibid., 25.
92 Ibid., 21.
93 Ibid., 22.
94 Ibid., 23.
95 Ibid.
96 Ibid., 27.
97 Sorrentino, “Feeling as a Key Notion in a Transcendental Conception of Religion,” 98.
98 Vial, “Anschauung and Intuition, Again,” 47.
99 Sorrentino, “Feeling as a Key Notion in a Transcendental Conception of Religion,” 107.
however, meant as ‘something beyond possible human experience. Rather,
[Schleiermacher] means the limits and/or totality of what we can experience.'\textsuperscript{100} By way
of explanation, Vial quotes Feuerbach: ‘The leaf on which the caterpillar lives is for it a
world, an infinite space.’\textsuperscript{101} Thus when Schleiermacher speaks of feeling and intuition as
relating to the infinite, we should not assume that this infinite is in any way inaccessible
to human experience. The sense for the infinite therefore posits the ‘self in relation to
God and the world,’\textsuperscript{102} though, as we have seen, Schleiermacher stresses the notion of the
infinite over that of God. This is not to suggest, however, that there might be a ‘common
human experience of God in relation to the world’\textsuperscript{103} since each individual instance of
feeling and intuition, every unique sense for the infinite (even when these occur within
an individual person), is tempered by cultural, social, and personal influences.\textsuperscript{104}

Sense for the infinite denotes the ‘reality of the transcendent’ in human life and
experience\textsuperscript{105} that can be intuited, felt, and expressed as a distinctly religious experience.
Notably, Schleiermacher refers on a number of occasions to finite things as ‘a
representation of the infinite,’\textsuperscript{106} ‘a true indispensable image of the infinite.’\textsuperscript{107} He does
not elevate one thing over another in terms of its ability to represent and be an image of
the infinite, perhaps because ‘everything finite’ is ‘cut out of” the infinite.\textsuperscript{108} Nonetheless,
it seems feasible to argue that some objects might function as better images than others,
perhaps none more so than art, where imagery is key.

\textit{Intuition and feeling of the infinite as the essence of religion}

In the second speech, therefore, Schleiermacher develops the notions of intuition and
feeling that he introduced in his first speech, and explains their relation to the infinite. He
stresses throughout that the essence of religion is intuition and feeling; it is not any kind
or knowledge or action, nor is it metaphysics or morals. Religion ‘stops with the
immediate experiences of the existence and action of the universe, with the individual
intuitions and feelings.'

This is why, though Schleiermacher concedes that some intuitions may lead to the notion of a God, such a God is not necessarily central to religion and should certainly not be placed above intuition and feeling.

Intuition, as explained in this second speech, is the perception of the action of the infinite on us, and significantly is not the perception of the actual nature of the infinite. This perception relies on finite things in the world, any of which can function as a stimulus for intuition so long as one longs to seek the infinite. A fundamental aspect of intuition – and the resulting feeling – is the ability to view humanity as a finite and limited part of an infinite whole, even if there are parts of that whole that are beyond our experience. Schleiermacher encourages his readers to recognise that there are things to be experienced beyond our finite existence, and to intuit them through the sensory perception of everything around us.

Schleiermacher’s development of the notion of feeling shows it to share many of the same qualities of intuition, and it has been asserted that, though they must be talked of separately, feeling and intuition are intimately connected. Feeling internalises the experience of the infinite that is perceived by intuition, and Schleiermacher speaks about it again in the second speech in terms both of receptivity and creativity. However, though intuition and feeling are the essence of religion, Schleiermacher also posits that neither will ‘properly succeed in this world’ in their goal of reaching the infinite, but may only go some way toward this.

Once again, the link between intuition and activity is reinforced in this speech, with receptivity somewhat secondary. Both the infinite, having an influence on humanity, and humanity, reaching out to the infinite, are active, as is, should one’s intuition require it, God. However, Schleiermacher seeks to emphasise here that action itself is not religion, and that only intuition and feeling can properly be thought of as the core of religion.

In describing religion as the ‘sensibility and taste for the infinite,’ Schleiermacher reveals a little more about that which intuition strives for. The infinite, often referred to by Schleiermacher as the universe, is transcendent but not unreachable or unattainable –

110 Ibid., 54.
111 Ibid., 53.
it is simply beyond the boundaries of our experience and is represented by finite things and can be experienced through them. Concluding this second speech, Schleiermacher claims that ‘to be one with the infinite in the midst of the finite and to be eternal in a moment, that is the immortality of religion.’

*Third Speech – On Self-Formation for Religion*

Having outlined his model of religion based on intuition and feeling of the infinite, Schleiermacher now considers how it is that people come to have religion. Religion ‘expresses and imparts itself freely,’ and so Schleiermacher is primarily concerned here with humanity’s capacity for communicating and accessing religion. Given that religion’s essence is intuition and feeling, it follows that religious formation occurs in much the same way, and so Schleiermacher’s language from the outset of this speech – he speaks of the ‘flow of this [religious] movement’ and how ‘longingly’ people seek religion - has striking similarities to his description of intuition and feeling earlier in the Speeches. Consequently, as we will see, religious formation is also closely linked to activity, as an aspect of intuition and feeling, and the infinite, as their ultimate goal.

*Activity*

One of the obstacles to religious formation that Schleiermacher identifies is that religion can be active within a person ‘even without his knowing it.’ The difficulty, which we will come to below, is in leading a person to recognise their religion; however, Schleiermacher here emphasises that religion is never inactive. It ‘belongs to a truly human life’ and is an ‘ever more active’ part of that life. In fact, ‘in the mind in which it dwells it is uninterruptedly active and living, making everything into an object for itself and every thought and action into a theme of its heavenly imagination.’ If one has religion and recognises it, therefore, one is continuously and actively seeking to find the infinite in every finite object. Moreover, Schleiermacher tells his readers that they,

---

113 Ibid., 55.
114 Ibid.
115 Ibid., 56.
116 Ibid.
117 Ibid., 57.
118 Ibid.
through ‘being and acting,’ act as ‘instruments of the universe’ and also have ‘an influence on religion.’ Vial therefore takes feeling to mean ‘the feeling of our action on the world,’ in contrast to a view of intuition which describes ‘the feeling of the world’s action on us.’ We can thus understand humanity as an agent of the infinite, as Schleiermacher thinks of it, whereby those with religion (even if they are unable to recognise it as such) are able to act towards others and towards objects on its behalf.

**Intuition and feeling**

Having asserted the closeness of intuition and feeling, Schleiermacher here concentrates on these two notions together as aspects of religion. They are, as we have already discussed, individual and unique to each person and indeed each moment. It is perhaps this individuality that leads Schleiermacher to conclude, speaking about those without religion, that ‘we cannot teach them to intuit.’ Spoken language, it would seem, is inadequate for fully expressing what it is to intuit and feel in the religious sense, and Schleiermacher concedes that ‘our words are only shadows of our intuitions and feelings.’

Even if we are able to communicate certain ideas about intuition and feeling to others, it is impossible thus to cause them to intuit or feel for themselves. Moreover, ‘you cannot even accustom another person to have a particular reaction each time a particular impression may occur,’ meaning that a person might have a radically different intuition each time they have an experience of the same object or idea, or perhaps none at all. Thus we may agree with Schleiermacher that religion ‘lies far beyond the realm of teaching and inculcating.’

In spite of these difficulties, Schleiermacher argues that the infinite ‘allows itself to be intuited’ and that everyone should be able to intuit since we are ‘born with the religious capacity.’ We might suggest, then, that intuition and feeling are inherent in human nature, and that a person without religion does not lack the religious sense, only the capacity to recognise it as such. Intuition, feeling, and the ability to reach out toward the infinite are not, therefore, unattainable, despite the obstacles to religious formation.

---

122 Ibid.
123 Ibid.
124 Ibid.
125 Ibid., 58.
126 Ibid., 59.
but are, perhaps, an instinctive element of human nature and experience that a person is able to access should they be aware of it.

Schleiermacher does observe a certain ‘longing’ for the ‘supernatural,’ particularly among young people.\textsuperscript{127} As we have shown in the earlier speeches, it is precisely this longing and striving to reach out to the infinite that allows an intuition of it. As he has already dealt with the nature of intuition and feeling in the preceding speech, Schleiermacher now turns to some of the conditions that make intuition possible, as well as some further obstacles. Though we have shown that intuition depends on a view of everything as part of a whole, Schleiermacher here urges his readers also to consider each object ‘in its unique nature and in its highest perfection.’\textsuperscript{128} This assertion highlights the significance of seeking to intuit, positing again that intuition and feeling are unlikely to occur by chance. It also emphasises the need for a close and attentive relationship with the finite world, since it is only such a relationship that will enable a person to view an object ‘in its highest perfection.’ Schleiermacher stresses once more in this speech that ‘it is an illusion to seek the infinite precisely outside the finite.’\textsuperscript{129} We might suggest, therefore, that only a close relationship with the finite world may enable a relationship with the infinite, and that Schleiermacher advocates this as a means of religious formation.

Sensory perception remains an important part of the way in which Schleiermacher thinks of intuition, and particular attention is drawn to the idea that ‘the extent and truth of intuition depend on the sharpness and breadth of one’s sense.’\textsuperscript{130} The senses are key, according to Schleiermacher, to religious formation and the development of intuition and feeling, unlike understanding, which ‘is absolutely opposed to sensory receptivity.’\textsuperscript{131} Schleiermacher contrasts intuition through sensory perception with his reader’s preoccupation that they ‘are supposed to understand everything, and with understanding they are completely robbed of their faculty of sense.’\textsuperscript{132} ‘Sense perception,’ on the other hand, ‘seeks objects for itself; it approaches them and offers itself to their embraces,’\textsuperscript{133} and here again we have the suggestion that intuition looks for and engages with ‘the

\textsuperscript{127} Schleiermacher, On Religion, 59.
\textsuperscript{128} Ibid., 62.
\textsuperscript{129} Ibid., 59.
\textsuperscript{130} Ibid., 66.
\textsuperscript{131} Ibid., 60.
\textsuperscript{132} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{133} Ibid.
undivided impression of something whole.’\textsuperscript{134} Intuition requires understanding neither of the thing being intuited nor the process of intuition itself, since all understanding breaks the connection between the intuited person and the ‘unique character’\textsuperscript{135} of that through which intuition occurs. Only sensory perception allows a person to view a finite object as it is, and thus perceive it in its relationship with the infinite. Moreover, this sensory perception, which Schleiermacher also refers to as ‘sensible intuition,’ is immeasurable in scope, which is ‘at least a hint at a different and higher infinity.’\textsuperscript{136} We have here a notion of religious formation that is, in essence, limitless, since any finite object may be a pathway to religion so long as one places sensory perception over understanding and seeks to view it in relation to the infinite, the ‘one in the all.’\textsuperscript{137} Schleiermacher therefore identifies one of the obstacles to religious formation as having ‘too little to intuit,’\textsuperscript{138} though it may be more accurate to re-phrase this as ‘having too little inclination to intuit’ through the finite world around us.

Schleiermacher points to ‘three orientations of sense,’ which Barth describes thus: ‘outwardly toward a world-view, inwardly toward a view of self, and the two together as an artistic field,’ highlighting that there is a way from each to religion.\textsuperscript{139} There is a notable emphasis in this third speech on the relationship between art and intuition and an ‘artistic sense’ which Schleiermacher seems to think of as a particular type of intuition. Arguably, this is an especially powerful type of intuition, as Schleiermacher claims that the artistic sense actually ‘changes into religion.’\textsuperscript{140} It is not explained exactly how this is able to happen, yet Schleiermacher is convinced that ‘if it is true that there are quick conversions… then I believe that more than anything else the sight of great and sublime works of art can achieve this miracle.’\textsuperscript{141} Again, Schleiermacher is not specific about what kinds of art works might achieve this, or indeed if any may achieve it better than others. It would seem that he is reluctant to think in terms of a ‘religion of art,’\textsuperscript{142} and Crouter points to the essential difference between the idea of a religion of art and the artistic sense.\textsuperscript{143} Nevertheless, a close relationship between the two is asserted. Given

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{134} Schleiermacher, \textit{On Religion}, 61.
\item \textsuperscript{135} Ibid.
\item \textsuperscript{136} Ibid., 63.
\item \textsuperscript{137} Ibid., 67.
\item \textsuperscript{138} Ibid., 65.
\item \textsuperscript{139} Barth, \textit{The Theology of Schleiermacher}, 251.
\item \textsuperscript{140} Schleiermacher, \textit{On Religion}, 68.
\item \textsuperscript{141} Ibid.
\item \textsuperscript{142} Ibid., 69.
\item \textsuperscript{143} Ibid., footnote.
\end{itemize}
that Schleiermacher holds art in such high regard in relation to religion, intuition, and formation, stating that ‘religion and art stand beside one another like two friendly souls,’ the questions of how art might do this, which of its features might inspire intuition, and which kind of art might best do this, are now raised.

*The infinite*

Once again, the object of intuition is shown to be the infinite, with Schleiermacher restating that ‘it is an illusion to seek the infinite precisely outside the finite.’ Comparing the sense for the infinite with the artistic sense, he warns against a ‘passive religiousness’ in which one only seeks to connect with the infinite through the intuitions of others, ‘without themselves bringing forth works of art.’ Here Schleiermacher underlines the deeply personal and individual nature of each person’s relationship with the infinite, such that it is not possible to perceive it through another person.

Nevertheless, Schleiermacher outlines one particular aid to religious formation – that is, the infinite, should one seek to intuit it, is omnipresent to us. Thus we are able to connect with the infinite and experience religion at any time and in every aspect of our lives. Schleiermacher highlights two certain points at which we might feel especially close to the infinite: ‘being born and dying are such points.’ However, the extent to which we are able to perceive these in our own experience, as opposed to perceiving the births and deaths of others, is debatable. Schleiermacher also seems to turn away, with this assertion, from his conviction that perception of the infinite arises from engagement with finite objects. Nonetheless, the idea that there are points at which we are able to feel especially close to the infinite informs our exploration of how music might enable such a connection as well as supporting Schleiermacher’s claims of the omnipresence of the infinite and how the experiences of our daily lives might encourage our religious formation.

---

145 Ibid., 59.
146 Ibid., 58.
147 Ibid., 58.
148 Ibid., 63.
Learning to connect with the infinite through intuition and feeling

Schleiermacher’s third speech thus applies his notions of intuition and feeling and a sense for the infinite to religious formation, outlining both the obstacles and the aids to developing one’s religiousness. Crucially, as he states in the title of this speech, this is self-formation, meaning both that one’s pathway to religion should be as individual and unique as intuition itself, but also that no formal religious instruction is strictly necessary. As we have seen, each person has the capacity to intuit and connect with the infinite, despite the many obstacles to religious formation that Schleiermacher highlights. The drive to actively seek to intuit and to connect with the infinite therefore remains important as a requirement of religious formation as well as the basis of every individual intuition. Central to developing one’s religiousness and ability to intuit the infinite is an ‘acknowledgement of another realm,’ something beyond the boundaries of the finite world. Schleiermacher continues to place a great deal of importance on the finite as a pathway to the infinite, though Grove suggests that ‘we must insert a curtain concept between the individual and infinite to explain the relation between them.’ He follows Kant’s argument that ‘all our cognition of God is merely symbolic,’ concluding that religion in the Speeches might be thought of as ‘religious interpretation qua symbolic interpretation.’

The notion of a symbol or ‘curtain concept’ to mediate the (sense for the) infinite is an important one, though Grove does not offer a suggestion of such a symbol or concept that might function in this way. Certainly insofar as religious sense can be thought of as creative and interpretative, we can see a clear parallel with the arts as a mediator of the infinite and a means by which individuals might express their intuitions and feelings of the infinite. Schleiermacher appears particularly to advocate the arts as a route to intuition and the infinite in this third speech, although he does not explain in great detail how the arts might mediate religion or which kind of art, if any, might best do this.

151 Ibid., 115.
152 Ibid., 110.
Fourth Speech – On the Social Element in Religion; or, on Church and Priesthood

Schleiermacher’s final two speeches consider more closely the idea of religion as an organisation and a community, although always with the intuition and feeling of the infinite at its centre. He claims that it is the church as an organisation that his readers truly despise, and not religion itself. The fourth speech stresses in particular the communicative nature of religion and discusses how this may occur within ‘a society of those who have become conscious of their religion.’ Furthermore, there is a notable use of musical language and imagery within this discussion which may well inform our investigation of how music itself might function as a mediator of intuition and feeling of the infinite.

Intuition and feeling

Schleiermacher continues to refer to intuition and feeling together as two aspects of the same experience of the infinite. As before, he emphasises the vast variety of intuition and feeling and thus the diversity of each experience of religion. It is ‘the nature of religion,’ as well as human nature, he says, that one ‘is primarily concerned to communicate these intuitions and feelings,’ and those to whom they are communicated are thought of as ‘witnesses for and participants in’ that experience of the infinite. Elsewhere, Schleiermacher speaks of the ‘need to express’ intuitions and feelings ‘wherever and however’ possible. It seems, therefore, that communication and expression are integral to intuition and feeling of the infinite. Moreover, Schleiermacher suggests that a person’s aim in communicating intuition might be ‘also to direct others to the [infinite] object.’ The way in which intuition and feeling are communicated or expressed thus appears to have a direct impact on the religion of others.

Intuition and feeling proceed, as we have already observed, from sensory perception of something finite, and this sensory perception remains important in the fourth speech. Schleiermacher suggests that since one ‘is conscious of encompassing only a small part of religion,’ and given that no intuition or feeling can ever be completely one with its

---

153 Schleiermacher, On Religion, 72.
154 Ibid., 78.
155 Ibid., 89.
156 Ibid., 73; see also 84.
157 Ibid., 83.
158 Ibid.
infinite goal, humanity seeks to ‘perceive through another medium… every expression of
religion.’\footnote{159 Schleiermacher, On Religion, 73-4.} Once more, he distinguishes between \textit{knowledge} of religion and \textit{intuition} of it, asserting that ‘religious communication is not to be sought in books.’\footnote{160 Ibid., 74.} Subsequently, Schleiermacher considers the role of speech and language in religious communication with particular emphasis on the idea that religion may not be expressed ‘in common conversation’ or by the ‘quick and easy exchange of well-aimed wit.’\footnote{161 Ibid.} Rather, religious communication ‘must occur in a grander style… the highest which speech can attain.’\footnote{162 Ibid.} Though Schleiermacher concludes that religion cannot be communicated ‘other than verbally,’ we might recall the difficulties associated with spoken language that he outlines earlier in this work. Thus when Schleiermacher speaks of ‘another medium’ through which to communicate and be communicated to about religion, we may also consider the role that other, non-verbal, means of communication might have to play.

Irrespective of the means of religious communication, Schleiermacher highlights the importance of the ‘spokesperson’ of religion, particularly for religious communities. This is a person who presents ‘his own intuition as an object for the rest;’ ‘he expresses the universe’ with ‘inspired speech.’\footnote{163 Ibid., 75.} Crucially, this spokesperson should be concerned with communicating ‘the clearest, very individual intuitions and feelings’ – which Schleiermacher asserts are the essence of religion – and not ‘concepts, opinions, and doctrines,’ which he describes as ‘abstractions about it.’\footnote{164 Ibid., 81.} In previous speeches, Schleiermacher has emphasised a model of religion in which a personal, individual experience of the infinite reached through intuition and feeling is key, and so he is equally clear here that any communication or expression of religion should have intuition and feeling at its heart. He does concede, however, that most rely upon the ‘symbolic actions’ of doctrine and liturgy in order to feel connected to religion,\footnote{165 Ibid., 81.} and regrets the fact that there is ‘more support in this society for understanding… and observance of customs than for intuition and feeling.’\footnote{166 Ibid., 82.} Those seeking religion may be forgiven for concentrating thus on its ‘symbolic actions’ since it would seem that intuition and feeling may be difficult to come by – though he posits that all are born with a religious capacity,
Schleiermacher at no point in his speeches argues that it is easy to intuit the infinite. This is why so much importance is placed in the fourth speech on communication and the role of the spokesperson.

Schleiermacher recognises the need for a ‘binding agent’ between the ‘true church’ (i.e. one built on a foundation of intuition and feeling) and ‘those who are still seeking religion,’ which he takes to be the religious spokesperson, ‘its leaders and priests.’ It is in this way that Schleiermacher considers the church as ‘a mediating institution,’ and it prompts us to explore other ways in which the church might mediate intuition and feeling, and indeed if it may be mediated other than by the church. However, Schleiermacher appears to suggest that the nature of religious formation is such that ‘the master can do nothing except to demonstrate and to illustrate,’ meaning that some ‘prior knowledge’ is necessary and suggesting that one must belong primarily to a religious community or have had some previous instruction so as to grow in religion. Of course this cannot always be the case, especially since we have already noted Schleiermacher’s belief in the capacity for conversion. He compares religious instruction to artistic instruction, in which ‘the student progresses through practice’ implying that religion may be practised in the same way. We might argue, on the other hand, that to seek to approach and intuit the infinite time and time again, which Schleiermacher advocates, is a form of practice, and that each intuition and the resulting feeling is an accumulative process through which one learns to recognise the infinite as a real and active force in the world. Perhaps Schleiermacher is simply stressing the individuality of intuition and feeling; however, to insist upon some prior knowledge as a condition of religion is to limit intuition and feeling to particular individuals and groups, which is certainly not Schleiermacher’s aim.

The infinite

Though intuition and feeling are always individual, here Schleiermacher introduces the notion of the infinite as it may be reached through others. The stronger a person’s connection with the infinite, the more one wishes to ‘glimpse its power outside himself in

---

167 Schleiermacher, On Religion, 81.
168 Ibid., 88.
169 Ibid., 89.
170 Ibid.
others,’ which Schleiermacher seems to suggest is a way in which a person’s religion might be strengthened and increased.\textsuperscript{171} Moreover, a person so connected with the infinite may also be capable, through communication, of directing others toward it.\textsuperscript{172} There is a focus once more on the significance of viewing one’s own religion as part of an infinite whole,\textsuperscript{173} one that ‘no individual can completely comprehend.’\textsuperscript{174} Schleiermacher again reminds us that no intuition or feeling of the infinite is perfect – as we have discovered, they are intuitions and feelings not of the nature of the infinite but of its action in the world. For this reason, Schleiermacher reiterates here the importance of finding a way to the infinite ‘from every object,’\textsuperscript{175} of reaching the infinite through sensory perception of finite things. It is implied that a person must have this personal religion before they are able to communicate the infinite to others, since religion is primarily an individual experience.

In relation to the infinite, Schleiermacher points out that this is always ‘mutual communication,’\textsuperscript{176} and he seems to envisage two directions in which communication should occur. The first would appear to be the mutual communication between the individual and the infinite, in which the infinite communicates with the individual through action in the world, and the individual communicates with the infinite through seeking and longing – ‘that which inclines us to join what is unfamiliar.’\textsuperscript{177} This is truly mutual communication – without communication by both the individual and the infinite, no religion can form. Schleiermacher also proposes a mutual communication between individuals within a religious community, though he suggests it is more likely in these communities that ‘all people want to receive, and there is only one who is supposed to give.’\textsuperscript{178} This reflects the despisers’ view of the organisation of religion in which one person instructs the congregation, but it is not the model of religious communication that Schleiermacher advocates. Rather, Schleiermacher wishes to see each individual within the community expressing and communicating their individual intuitions and feelings for the others, and for others to reciprocate. Communication is crucial to the formation of

\footnotesize
\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{171} Schleiermacher, \textit{On Religion}, 73.
\item \textsuperscript{172} Ibid.
\item \textsuperscript{173} Ibid.; see also 76.
\item \textsuperscript{174} Ibid., 77.
\item \textsuperscript{175} Ibid., 83.
\item \textsuperscript{176} Ibid., 74; see also 79.
\item \textsuperscript{177} Ibid., 79.
\item \textsuperscript{178} Ibid.
\end{itemize}
religion because ‘the more each person approaches the universe, the more he
communicates himself to others… the more perfectly do they become one.’\textsuperscript{179}

\textit{Musical language and imagery}

Throughout the speeches, Schleiermacher uses musical language and imagery to
illustrate his argument; however, never more so than in this fourth speech. The overall
impression given here is of religion as an art form, and in fact Schleiermacher describes
it as ‘art and object of study.’\textsuperscript{180} Perhaps we may also think of religion as having an
aesthetic quality, since Schleiermacher claims that the religious life is a ‘beautiful life.’\textsuperscript{181}

Schleiermacher uses music differently at various points in this speech – at times as
imagery to embellish his argument, and elsewhere as part of his discussion of how
religion might be communicated. In terms of the former, Schleiermacher describes the
communication between the infinite and the individual as ‘a higher choir’\textsuperscript{182} and the
religious community as ‘a choir of friends.’\textsuperscript{183} The religious person communicates ‘in
heavenly tones,’ hoping ‘to win many’ for religion,\textsuperscript{184} that the ‘music of sublime feelings
might resonate in them.’\textsuperscript{185} Concluding his speech, Schleiermacher thinks of religion as
‘arranged by a composed mind, adorned and perfected by heavenly art.’\textsuperscript{186} We have
already observed in the third speech the link that Schleiermacher claims there is between
religion and art, despite the fact that he is unsure of the nature of this relationship. The
use of musical imagery such as the examples above in the fourth speech reinforces this
link, and arguably demonstrates that Schleiermacher holds music in high esteem out of
all of the arts.

Furthermore, Schleiermacher suggests that there may be something about music itself
that makes it an appropriate means of religious communication. He makes reference to
music as a ‘speech without words, the most definite, most understandable expression of
what is innermost.’\textsuperscript{187} Hymns in particular, it would seem, are capable of expressing and

\textsuperscript{179} Schleiermacher, \textit{On Religion}, 94.
\textsuperscript{180} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{181} Ibid., 78.
\textsuperscript{182} Ibid., 75.
\textsuperscript{183} Ibid., 94.
\textsuperscript{184} Ibid., 78.
\textsuperscript{185} Ibid., 92.
\textsuperscript{186} Ibid., 94.
\textsuperscript{187} Ibid., 75.
communicating ‘that which definite speech can no longer comprehend,’ though Schleiermacher does not place too great an importance on the words of those hymns.\textsuperscript{188} It might therefore be argued that, despite Schleiermacher’s claims about the role of language, music may provide the means to communication religion where the capabilities of language fail. Certainly, the fact that Schleiermacher includes so many references to music throughout his speeches, and particularly in this fourth speech, would suggest that it holds significance for him in relation to an experience of religion through intuition and feeling.

\textit{Communication as essential to religion}

Here Schleiermacher deals with the notion of religion as a community of believers, and challenges many of the ideas held by the despisers. The community, he stresses, arises not out of doctrine or ritual but out of the need to communicate that personal, individual experience of intuition and feeling which we have seen to be the essence of religion. Therefore, when Schleiermacher talks in this speech about ‘church,’ he is not necessarily referring to the organisation familiar to contemporary or even modern readers.

Intuition and feeling are discussed here as experiences about which it is natural to communicate, and the desire to express them in some way seems to integral to intuition and feeling. Moreover, expressing or communicating the infinite is claimed to be one way in which humanity might draw closer toward it. As we might expect from Schleiermacher’s treatment of intuition, feeling, and the infinite in the preceding speeches, however, the communication of religion is not straightforward and often relies on the mediation of a spokesperson. Schleiermacher seems to think of this person literally, as some kind of priest or religious leader, though it is perhaps feasible to think also of the religious ‘spokesperson’ as any kind of mediator, whether human or not. This is especially pertinent given Schleiermacher’s continued focus on finite being as a vehicle of the infinite, on sensory perception as a means of viewing the infinite, and particularly in view of the way in which he uses musical language and imagery to support his argument.

\textsuperscript{188} Schleiermacher, \textit{On Religion}, 75.
As always, the object of intuition and feeling remains the infinite, and here Schleiermacher considers how these individual experiences might be expressed and communicated within a group in order to affirm and to advance one’s religion, and that of others. This is not to say that intuition and feeling of the infinite is anything other than an individual personal experience, but rather that the expression and communication of this individual experience among members of a group may itself be a way to the infinite. As such, Schleiermacher considers the ‘true church’ to be one with intuition and feeling, and their communication, at its heart, contrary to the view of the church as an institution of doctrine and ritual, as held by religion’s despisers.

**Fifth Speech – On the Religions**

Thus far, we have observed that Schleiermacher’s argument deals with intuition and feeling as experiences of the infinite generally, and not of God specifically. The final speech has a much stronger focus on the concept of God, and particularly as God is presented in the incarnation in human (i.e. finite) form, which Crouter describes as ‘the essence of religion in particular, embodied form.’ In this sense, the fifth speech continues Schleiermacher’s conviction that religion may only be reached through finite objects. While Schleiermacher concentrates here on Christianity in greater detail, it is evident that he does not consider this, nor the concept of God itself, as the essence of religion, and thus there is room within Schleiermacher’s argument for religious plurality. As ever, intuition and feeling of the infinite, albeit discussed here in terms of God, is central to Schleiermacher’s model of religion.

**Intuition and feeling**

Schleiermacher uses his final speech to reiterate and emphasise some of the key points he has made about intuition and feeling throughout his discussion. It is asserted again that ‘every intuition of the infinite exists wholly for itself, is dependent on no other, and has no other as a necessary consequence,’ that no two intuitions and necessarily related and that each intuition may be viewed in a multitude of different ways. Intuitions,

---

190 Ibid.
191 Ibid., 97-8.
192 Ibid., 100.
therefore, are not only unique to an individual but are completely unique even within that individual’s experience. ‘Individual,’ however, is not to be taken to mean ‘isolated,’ and Schleiermacher points out that one intuition can ‘lead to every other one through a thousand accidental combinations.’¹²⁻¹⁹³ This creates a somewhat fluid model of religion that is ‘exhibited only in an infinite succession of waxing and waning forms.’¹²⁻¹⁹⁴ While this does not demonstrate a necessary connection between separate experiences of intuition and feeling,¹²⁻¹⁹⁵ it does perhaps suggest that the more one intuits, the more and the better one is able to continue to do so. There is no definite connection because ‘each individual intuition has its own character,’¹²⁻¹⁹⁶ and thus we begin to understand why Schleiermacher prioritises intuition and feeling of the infinite over the concept of God– whereas intuitions and feelings provide a multitude of different and unique experiences of religion, a model of religion that relies too heavily on the concept of God attempts to standardise these experiences and bring all believers into the same experience of religion. An analysis of Schleiermacher’s Speeches that places too great an emphasis on God is therefore problematic. In an attempt to move away from representations of God that are only negative – for example, ‘God is not finite’ – Gamwell considers that ‘as a reality reflection can designate literally in positive terms, God as an intentional object in common human experience must be, in its own way, given.’¹²⁻¹⁹⁷ That God could be the given object of religious feeling seems implausible since, as we have already observed, religion as feeling and intuition does not refer to the nature of God or the infinite but to their action.¹²⁻¹⁹⁸ Accordingly, Gamwell goes on to suggest that ‘what is immediately present must be God in relation to the world,’¹²⁻¹⁹⁹ implying that it is not God but this relationship that is the given object in feeling. However, Schleiermacher does not view God as being in relation to the object the goal of religion, but the infinite more generally, though we might agree that the idea of a relationship is important, as we will discuss below. While we have seen that intuitions and feelings of the infinite can be expressed and communicated to others, and that others can be thus directed toward the infinite, Schleiermacher does not propose that all should be made to experience religion in precisely the same way. Rather, since religion proceeds from intuition, each person’s

¹⁹⁴ Ibid., 104.
¹⁹⁵ Ibid.
¹⁹⁶ Ibid., 102-3.
¹⁹⁸ Vial, “Anschauung and Intuition, Again,” 45.
‘religion is determined by this moment,’ and its individuality ensures that religion would not ‘take shape in all alike.’\textsuperscript{200} Therefore, just as every intuition has its own character, so too does each person’s religion. This is also why Schleiermacher argues that intuition and feeling should not be measured quantitatively, since it is the nature and not the number of intuitions that constitutes religion.\textsuperscript{201}

However, this is not to say that there are any intuitions of the infinite and experiences of religion that are opposed – this ‘cannot be the case.’\textsuperscript{202} Furthermore, though he stresses the individuality of intuitions (so as to advise against generalising experiences of religion), Schleiermacher also emphasises once more the importance of viewing one’s intuitions and religion as part of a whole – ‘the universal concept.’\textsuperscript{203} To divide concepts and experiences, he says, is to lose ‘the particular essential character’ of religion.\textsuperscript{204} Here, Schleiermacher reiterates his conviction that only a recognition of one’s finitude in relation to the infinite, brought about by a realisation that one is just a part of a much larger and partially hidden whole, might lead to intuition and feeling, and thus to religion. He considers this to be ‘the instinct they do not understand’ which ‘guides them [to religion] more correctly than their understanding,’\textsuperscript{205} highlighting once more the prominence of intuition and feeling over knowledge and doctrine. As always, intuition and feeling must be at the centre of all religion, regardless of whether or not that religion includes a God, and all experiences of religion must relate to an original intuition – this is ‘a truly positive religion.’\textsuperscript{206}

The infinite

The notion of the infinite remains the focus of Schleiermacher’s religion – even with the added consideration of a God and of Christianity – and its presence signifies that ‘no one can possess religion completely,’ since humanity, in contrast, is finite.\textsuperscript{207} Arguably, as is shown throughout the speeches, Schleiermacher’s model of religion is not concerned with attaining or possessing the object of religion, but with striving for it and

\textsuperscript{200} Schleiermacher, \textit{On Religion}, 105.
\textsuperscript{201} Ibid., 101.
\textsuperscript{202} Ibid., 103.
\textsuperscript{203} Ibid., 102.
\textsuperscript{204} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{205} Ibid., 101.
\textsuperscript{206} Ibid., 104.
\textsuperscript{207} Ibid., 97.
reaching out toward it by connecting with finite beings in the world. This is what Gamwell suggests above when he discusses the object of religion ‘in relation to the world,’ though we have recognised this object not as God but as the infinite. A person ‘whose senses are open to the universe’ is ‘permeated by the influences of the universe and has become one with it.’ 208 Schleiermacher draws attention to the significance of sensory perception in the development of religion – the sense for the infinite, he says, may be ‘brought to life through a singular stimulation and is now forevermore set in motion.’ 209 The infinite, therefore, is not something that a person may have, but it is something with which a person may interact and ‘become one’ through intuition and feeling. Consequently, a person’s religion is shaped and determined by each moment of connection with the infinite. 210

It is stressed once more in this final speech that the infinite, though beyond our full comprehension, is not completely beyond our grasp. Schleiermacher argues that the infinite is present to us in every finite object, it ‘reveals itself in unique and varied forms’ 211 and is given in ‘an unending multitude of thoroughly determinate forms.’ 212 He emphasises that only the recognition of one’s finitude and the desire to search for the infinite can lead to an intuition of it, and highlights yet again the activity of the infinite in our world – it is ‘ever in motion and flowing.’ 213

Schleiermacher’s intuitive religion

We have noted that Schleiermacher’s fifth speech restates many of the ideas that he has introduced throughout his work, particularly those concerning the essence of religion, its formation and development, and its infinite goal. He discusses these ideas in relation to the notions of God and Christianity here not because he feels that they are central to religion, nor because they should take precedence over intuition and feeling, but rather to demonstrate that institutional religion is not incompatible with a model of religion based on intuition and feeling. Hence God and Christianity, while present in his argument, are

208 Schleiermacher, On Religion, 95.
209 Ibid., 106.
210 Ibid., 105.
211 Ibid., 97.
212 Ibid., 100.
213 Ibid., 101.
not the primary focus of the final speech, and so nor are they the primary focus of this analysis.

Rather, Schleiermacher illustrates again some of the key aspects of the way in which intuition and feeling may lead to religion, and why they are so crucial to its development. His discussion shows the infinite to be ever-present to humanity through the multitude of finite forms with which we are able to connect. It is not specific only to a certain type of belief or practice, though it may be intuited in this way, but is universal in human experience. Schleiermacher thus emphasises the ongoing activity of the infinite on the finite, the recognition of which may lead to an intuition of it. Furthermore, it is suggested that a person’s sense for the infinite, once it has been awakened, has an eternal quality – Schleiermacher argues, as we have seen above, that the process of intuition and feeling is ‘forevermore set in motion’ by an individual’s very first moment of contact with the infinite. This is a significant idea because it highlights once more one of the central notions of Schleiermacher’s theology, that is, that religion must proceed from intuition and feeling and not from knowledge and doctrine. Thus Schleiermacher rejects a religion in which knowledge leads to observance and belief, and presents us with a model of religion in which the initial individual and unique moment of connection with the infinite – the intuition – is the basis of a person’s entire religion. Knowledge, doctrine, and ritual may follow from this intuition, or they may just as equally not – this is of no importance to Schleiermacher as they do not constitute religion’s essence.

THE CHRISTIAN FAITH

The Christian Faith is recognised as the culmination of Schleiermacher’s thinking on Christian doctrine, as it proceeds from the religious self-consciousness and what he describes as the ‘feeling of absolute dependence.’ The first part of this text is dedicated to the explanation of how Schleiermacher conceives of the feeling of absolute dependence, building in many ways upon his first construction of the religious feeling in the Speeches. He outlines how the religious self-consciousness and the feeling of absolute dependence
might be developed, and how these two concepts express the relationship between God and humanity.

In the opening sections of *The Christian Faith*, before he moves on to discuss Christian doctrine in more detail, Schleiermacher considers what it is that constitutes ‘religion’. His argument continues many of the ideas already put forth in the *Speeches*. Here, however, we notice that many of his key terms have altered – the notion of ‘intuition’ can be recognised in what Schleiermacher refers to as ‘self-consciousness’ (or variously ‘God consciousness’ or ‘religious self-consciousness,’ which he seems to use interchangeably), and the resulting feeling is now referred to as a feeling of ‘absolute dependence’. These are the two key concepts on which Schleiermacher builds his discussion of Christian doctrine, and so it is to be expected that the opening sections of this work are more concerned with God as an object of religion than are his *Speeches*. Nevertheless, there are notable similarities between the ideas in the *Speeches* and those put forth here, which might be viewed as a continuation of Schleiermacher’s earlier work.

*Religious self-consciousness*

Religious self-consciousness is an important term in Schleiermacher’s thinking because it emphasises the fact that religion is ‘a conscious relation to God.’ The term, as we have suggested, appears to occupy a similar meaning in *The Christian Faith* as ‘intuition’ does in the *Speeches* – Vial agrees that these terms are closely linked and perhaps even interchangeable. Schleiermacher’s use of ‘religious self-consciousness’ in *The Christian Faith* certainly does not seem to differ too greatly from his earlier use of intuition and arguably we can understand it, in the language of the *Speeches*, as an awareness of human finitude in relation to the infinity of the infinite, and also an awareness of the activity of the infinite on and in finite things. Feeling, intuition and self-

---

215 Ibid., 142-193.
216 Ibid., e.g. 131.
217 As outlined above, Schleiermacher uses a number of terms to describe this concept, such as ‘God-consciousness’ or simply ‘self-consciousness.’ For ease, this analysis will use ‘religious self-consciousness’ to encompass all of these terms, which Schleiermacher seems to think of in the same way.
218 Gamwell, “Schleiermacher and Transcendental Philosophy,” 139.
consciousness all appear in Schleiermacher’s thought as predispositions of human nature toward the infinite. Crucial here is the idea that religious self-consciousness suggests that religious feeling cannot be unconscious – instead, it is an intentional state that refers to an object or concept.\(^{220}\) As before, we may note that Schleiermacher thinks of religion as immediate only insofar as it does not involve self-reflection; it need not be separate from objects and concepts and indeed should not be.

In much the same way as intuition, religious self-consciousness is an awareness of God that is ‘brought into existence through sense perception,’\(^{221}\) it is an ‘excitation of the sensuous self-consciousness,’\(^{222}\) a stimulation of the ‘sensory consciousness… from without.’\(^{223}\) Therefore the religious self-consciousness depends on some other event, i.e. of perception, yet it always ‘maintains its identity’ as a distinct form of experience.\(^{224}\) In fact, sense perception, the ‘sensuous self-consciousness,’ is connected with every Christian or religious feeling.\(^{225}\) Moreover, nothing should be excluded from this stimulation of religious self-consciousness – everything is to be thought of as a possible route to religion.\(^{226}\) It follows naturally, then, that ‘world-consciousness’ is an integral part of every religious moment, since ‘such an excitation [of the sensuous self-consciousness] is an impression of the world,’\(^{227}\) and that such a religious moment may occur at any time when a person interacts with the world around them. Schleiermacher therefore argues for the co-existence of God-consciousness with the consciousness of the world,\(^{228}\) demonstrating a crucial link between the human and the divine. Notably, while religious self-consciousness reaches outside of itself, through finite being toward the divine, there is also an element of inwardness connected with it which prevents it from being ‘something accidental’ or ‘arbitrary’ and connects it with ‘One’ as well as ‘All.’\(^{229}\) Religious self-consciousness, it seems, involves a process of internalisation similar to that found in the *Speeches* so that the religious moment constitutes not only a reaching out to the infinite but a drawing it in to oneself.


\(^{222}\) Ibid., 233.

\(^{223}\) Ibid., 134.

\(^{224}\) Ibid., 131-2.

\(^{225}\) Ibid., 138.

\(^{226}\) Ibid., 170, 172.

\(^{227}\) Ibid., 233.

\(^{228}\) Ibid.; see also 236.

\(^{229}\) Ibid., 234.
We can see immediately that, though the concept of God is much more prevalent here, this discussion concurs with Schleiermacher’s ideas about intuition in the *Speeches*. Once again, we are presented with the idea that we might only reach beyond ourselves to the infinite if we connect first with the world around us, if we are aware of our finitude in relation to the infinite.230 Schleiermacher’s argument here emphasises again the universality and limitlessness of religion and the religious self-consciousness, so described because of the multitude of ways in which the religious self-consciousness may be stimulated through sensory perception ‘in every moment.’231 Thus we recognise our closeness to the infinite, to God, through our closeness to our finite world. This is why Schleiermacher reiterates his argument that self-consciousness, or intuition, must precede dogma and doctrine, and not vice versa232 – hence the significance of these first sections of *The Christian Faith*. Like in the *Speeches*, it would seem that the religious self-conscious is inherent in humanity – Schleiermacher claims that humanity has an ‘inner creative disposition towards God-consciousness.’233

Schleiermacher makes some interesting comments on the nature of the finite world that are particularly pertinent, as we will see, to our exploration of the relationship between music and the religious moment. He recognises humanity and ‘all finite being’ as being ‘in continuity,’234 and notes that religious self-consciousness may only recognise finite being as continuous with ‘no consciousness of a beginning of being.’235 In this assertion, Schleiermacher refers to creation and preservation as actions of God that may be perceived by religious self-consciousness, which, he argues, should always be viewed together as aspects of the same action.236 Consequently, it is not appropriate to think of creation solely as ‘origination,’237 since the creation and preservation of finite beings is continuous and ongoing.238 Particularly interesting are Schleiermacher’s ideas about new beginnings, ‘re-emergent ideas that exist through God,’ and the development that follows from these, which are elements of religious self-consciousness and which he regards as aspects of creation.239 Therefore we understand creation in Schleiermacher’s thought to

231 Ibid., 173.
232 Ibid., 136.
233 Ibid., 200.
234 Ibid., 142.
235 Ibid., 148.
236 Ibid., 142-3.
237 Ibid., 150.
238 Ibid., 147.
239 Ibid., 146-7.
refer not to a single event at the beginning of time, but an ongoing process within the religious self-consciousness which relates humanity directly to God. Perhaps we might relate this understanding of creation to musical works, in which new beginnings, ideas, and development play a key role in the construction of a piece (as examined in the following chapters).

Though the religious self-consciousness is inherent to human experience, Schleiermacher points out that it may be experienced to a greater or lesser degree at different times of one’s life.\(^{240}\) This, he says, is due to the fact that the actual ‘moment of experience’ of religious self-consciousness is dependent, as we have seen, on ‘some other fact of consciousness,’ on something in the world around us.\(^{241}\) He introduces the notions of pleasure and pain as experiences of religious self-consciousness, identifying them as ‘Grace’ (which comes from God) and ‘Sin,’ (which originates in humanity) respectively.\(^{242}\) This is an attempt by Schleiermacher to reconcile both pleasure and pain, Grace and Sin, within the religious self-consciousness, which encompasses all of human experience – that is, he must here explain why it is that pain and Sin are as much expressions of the relationship between human and divine as pleasure and Grace. He asserts that these two conditions are unopposed\(^{243}\) and not to be separated in the religious self-consciousness, claiming this on the basis that both ‘arrestment’ (Sin) and ‘development’ (Grace) of religious self-consciousness are ‘the act of one and the same individual.’\(^{244}\) This argument and the notions of development and arrest also appear in Schleiermacher’s construction of absolute dependence, outlined below.

Given that the ‘relation between the world and God is expressed in’ the religious self-consciousness,\(^{245}\) we might not be surprised that religious self-consciousness actually leads to the feeling of absolute dependence, just as intuition leads to feeling in the Speeches.\(^{246}\) The religious self-consciousness actually contains a feeling of absolute dependence as well as a feeling of freedom which, though apparently contradictory, cannot be separated from absolute dependence, as we will see.\(^{247}\)

\(^{241}\) Ibid., 259.
\(^{242}\) Ibid., 262.
\(^{243}\) Ibid., 263.
\(^{244}\) Ibid., 264.
\(^{245}\) Ibid., 142.
\(^{246}\) Ibid., 173.
\(^{247}\) Ibid., 190.
Absolute dependence

What Schleiermacher has previously described simply as a feeling of religion appears in this work as a ‘feeling of absolute dependence,’ a notion that arises out of his stronger focus here on the concept of God. Once again, Schleiermacher presents us with a feeling of the world in relation to God, and not only this but an ‘awareness that our activity itself depends on a world not of our making.’ This feeling has at its heart the idea that nothing is or has ever been independent of God, and it is therefore a ‘universal condition of all finite being.’ For this reason, Schleiermacher maintains that finite being exists solely in absolute dependence. As with feeling and intuition in the Speeches, the feeling of absolute dependence is ‘immediate,’ and though Schleiermacher does not elaborate we can understand this term along the same lines as in the speeches. Like the religious self-consciousness, Schleiermacher implies that absolute dependence and the feeling of it are intrinsic to human experience; equally, he claims that it is part of the ‘general nature of man.’ As with the feeling of the speeches, the feeling of absolute dependence is ‘contained within every religious… self-consciousness’ and proceeds from it, though here Schleiermacher emphasises particularly the Christian nature of this self-consciousness. Accordingly, it is a feeling that has God, and not the world, at its centre – since worldly things are ‘in reciprocal interaction with each other’ they cannot be dependent upon each other. Absolute dependence does not derive from feeling; rather, Proudfoot argues that both feeling and the term ‘God’ are products of absolute dependence. Though it is difficult to conceive of absolute dependence without having a feeling of it, it would seem to be the case that a feeling of absolute dependence must necessarily proceed from the existence of something on which to be dependent. On the other hand, ‘self-conscious existence without this feeling cannot be so much as possible,’ so while we may concede that feeling is a product of absolute dependence, it is also clear that the two may not be separated and are central to religion.

249 Vial, “Anschauung and Intuition, Again,” 49, my emphasis.
251 Ibid., 175-6.
252 Ibid., 131.
253 Ibid., 133.
254 Ibid., 134.
255 Ibid.
256 Ibid., 132.
257 Ibid., 33.
258 Gamwell, “Schleiermacher and Transcendental Philosophy,” 139.
Despite its expression of a relationship of dependence upon the divine, Schleiermacher argues that the feeling of absolute dependence does not denote a lack of freedom or is opposed to freedom.\textsuperscript{259} Humanity is free because God has created it as such – ‘we are conscious of our freedom as something which is received’\textsuperscript{260} – and so Schleiermacher’s assertion here may be read as the co-existence of a feeling of freedom with the recognition that we are free at the will of the divine, on whom our creation and preservation is dependent.\textsuperscript{261} This is one sense in which the feeling of absolute dependence is expressed and experienced through the action of God in the world – ‘for it is only by describing God as the sole original activity that the relation of absolute dependence can be expressed.’\textsuperscript{262} Similarly, we are to understand that all moments – even those of pain and sadness – come from God and are just as dependent on God as moments of pleasure and joy.\textsuperscript{263} Schleiermacher recognises that this is a difficult notion with which to come to terms and explains that the ‘fluctuation’ between ‘progress and arrest’ (i.e. development and regression of religiosity) is to be seen as a natural part of human life and not separate from the feeling of absolute dependence. ‘Both obstacles and progress,’ he says, ‘are equally ordained by God… no one can find difficulty in the fact that even what appears to him an evil… exists as a consequence of absolute dependence, and therefore is to be regarded as ordained by God.’\textsuperscript{264} In other words, we recognise ‘progress,’ goodness, ‘grace,’ in the same way as freedom, as given. Schleiermacher seems to suggest that we recognise ‘arrest,’ sadness, ‘evil,’ and ‘sin,’ as deviations from what is given by God, and so they are included in absolute dependence because we recognise them in relation to it. Schleiermacher is not arguing that God wants evil, but that it is connected to absolute dependence insofar as it is ‘related to the good and as one condition of it.’\textsuperscript{265}

Schleiermacher maintains, therefore, the idea that intuition and feeling, religious self-consciousness and absolute dependence, do not grasp the precise nature of the infinite or God but express a relationship between the infinite/God and the world that it perceived by the former’s ongoing activity toward the latter.

\textsuperscript{259} Schleiermacher, \textit{The Christian Faith}, 132-3.
\textsuperscript{260} Ibid., 190.
\textsuperscript{261} Ibid., 133.
\textsuperscript{262} Ibid., 144.
\textsuperscript{263} Ibid., 184-5.
\textsuperscript{264} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{265} Ibid., 189.
In order to demonstrate this, Schleiermacher highlights a number of attributes of God that refer to God’s activity in the world and therefore are related to religious self-consciousness and the feeling of absolute dependence ‘so far as it expresses the General Relationship between God and the World.’ God is claimed to be ‘eternal’ insofar as God ‘conditions not only all that is temporal, but time itself as well,’ and is unchangeable. Schleiermacher also asserts God’s omnipresence, which features more prominently than God’s eternity in experiences of religion because ‘the majority of religious people are bound up in their consciousness with the present.’ Omnipresence exists in religious self-consciousness as an awareness of the ‘power of the Highest directly near to [one] in all finite causality,’ and so we recognise omnipresence as an activity of God toward us and not the precise essence of God. Nevertheless, ‘the everywhere-ness of God must, of course, be related equally to His essence and His power,’ meaning that each experience of God or of religion that a person has through these attributes connects that person as closely as possible with the divine. God is ‘infinite,’ being ‘timeless and non-spatial,’ and omnipotent, since ‘everything… is absolutely willed by God.’ As the being that creates, preserves, and conditions all others, God is also independent of all other beings, and Schleiermacher also asserts God’s omniscience, which is linked to the activity of God. Schleiermacher also lists other attributes which do not necessarily express the relationship of absolute dependence but are related to religious self-consciousness. These include the notion of unity, which Schleiermacher understands not as an attribute of God but an attribute of the world, ‘to be ruled by One God only.’ Crucially, he emphasises once more that these attributes do not describe the exact nature of God, only how humanity is able to recognise and relate to God.

---

267 Ibid., 203.
268 Ibid., 206.
269 Ibid., 207.
270 Ibid.
271 Ibid., 210.
272 Ibid., 211. Schleiermacher takes ‘infinite’ to mean not ‘that which has no end’ but ‘that which is in contrast to the finite.’ (See 230-1).
273 Ibid., 211-2.
274 Ibid., 216.
275 Ibid., 218
276 Ibid., 219.
277 Ibid., 228-9.
278 Ibid., 229.
279 Ibid., 232.
The feeling of absolute dependence includes within it ‘the belief in an original perfection of the world,’ a perfection which refers to the enabled continuity of religious self-consciousness -- in other words, the feeling of being absolutely dependent on God also includes the recognition that we are able to perceive and be in relation to God through religious self-consciousness. Therefore, while we have acknowledged that the feeling of absolute dependence proceeds from a moment of religious self-consciousness, the fact of absolute dependence makes possible the ability and will to strive for God through religious self-consciousness. Clearly, absolute dependence and religious self-consciousness are two aspects of one experience of religion in much the same way as feeling and intuition are in Schleiermacher’s previous work, where each provides a way to the other. The difference here is that Schleiermacher argues for humanity’s ‘original perfection’ to be found specifically in relation to God, and not the more general concept of the infinite.

Activity

Activity remains an important aspect of Schleiermacher’s conception of religion and of the moment of religious experience or self-consciousness. He refers here both to human activity as well as God’s activity toward humanity.

Humanity’s activity should never be ‘self-initiated’ -- that is, without God, which appears to ensure that our ideas and activity are always connected to truth. Moreover, it would seem that, despite the fact that there is no lack of freedom in either religious self-consciousness or absolute dependence, all our activity occurs nevertheless ‘according to [God’s] own causality,’ which is ‘distinguished from’ and ‘contrasted with’ any cause that arises in the finite world. It is perhaps the case, therefore, that our ability to connect with the infinite through intuition or the religious self-conscious is because that relationship is divinely willed. Finally, Schleiermacher restates the idea, which first appears in the Speeches, that intuition or religious self-consciousness motivates humanity to further action -- here we understand that religious self-

281 Ibid., 237.
282 Ibid., 135.
283 Ibid., 138.
284 Ibid., 192.
285 Ibid., 200.
consciousness causes us to act either toward God (that is, toward another moment of religious self-consciousness) or toward others, which we may take to mean an act of communication.\textsuperscript{286}

God is also active in Schleiermacher’s thought; indeed, God cannot be inactive.\textsuperscript{287} This is particularly pertinent when we consider that humanity is only able to recognise God through God’s activity, displayed in a variety of attributes as outlined above. We have already noted that God is active in the creation and preservation of the world, and that this activity is not ‘momentary’ but ongoing.\textsuperscript{288} Schleiermacher points out that while this creative action is responsible for the temporal world, it is not itself temporal\textsuperscript{289} – this would threaten the feeling of absolute dependence because ‘the antithesis between [God] and finite beings would be lessened.’\textsuperscript{290} Schleiermacher also notes that being ‘absolutely timeless and non-spatial’ is a mark of God’s infinity as it is in complete contrast to finite being.\textsuperscript{291}

Therefore, continuing his argument in the \textit{Speeches}, activity remains an important feature of the way in which we are able to perceive God and of how the relationship between God and humanity is formed and maintained. Notably lacking here is language of receptivity, though we could perhaps suggest that this is implied in the notion of absolute dependence.

\textit{Religion based on experience}

It would seem, then, that the model of religion put forth in \textit{The Christian Faith} is essentially a continuation of Schleiermacher’s discussion in the \textit{Speeches}, though in this later work we have noted a much greater emphasis on the concept of God as the focus of religion. Nevertheless, Schleiermacher remains concerned primarily with religion as an experience, which is prioritised above knowledge and doctrine and from which knowledge and doctrine should proceed.\textsuperscript{292} Whereas the \textit{Speeches} construct this experience in terms of intuition and feeling, \textit{The Christian Faith} considers the notions of

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{286} Schleiermacher, \textit{The Christian Faith}, 232.  \\
\textsuperscript{287} Ibid., 198.  \\
\textsuperscript{288} Ibid., 147-8.  \\
\textsuperscript{289} Ibid., 152.  \\
\textsuperscript{290} Ibid., 155.  \\
\textsuperscript{291} Ibid., 211.  \\
\textsuperscript{292} Ibid., 265. 
\end{flushleft}
religious self-consciousness and the feeling of absolute dependence, which we understand to correlate to intuition and feeling respectively.

The moment of religious self-consciousness is described as ‘communion with God’ which ‘rests on an act extraneous to it.’ Throughout this first section of The Christian Faith, Schleiermacher emphasises the importance of finite being in enabling an experience of the infinite, and, though he does not outline in any detail how this may occur, he does mention especially the significance of ‘hymns and other lyrics’ as expressions of God.

Ultimately, religious self-consciousness and the resulting feeling of absolute dependence should be present in ‘every Christian religious life-moment,’ and, though he does not say so explicitly, there is the suggestion that Schleiermacher considers it possible for any object in any moment to be a stimulus of religious self-consciousness. Inherent to religious self-consciousness is the relationship between humanity and divinity – ‘there is no general God-consciousness which has not bound up with it a relation to Christ, and no relationship with the Redeemer which has no bearing on the general God-consciousness.’ Religious self-consciousness is crucial in forming this relationship as well as being shaped by it. While Schleiermacher’s focus on the concepts of God and Christianity is not particularly significant to our subsequent examination of how his theology might be applied to music, it does especially highlight the relation between humanity and divinity, finite and infinite, which is at the heart of Schleiermacher’s model of religion as experience.

A HOFFMANNIAN-SCHEIERMACHERIAN APPROACH TO MUSIC AND THE INFINITE

Examining Schleiermacher and Hoffmann side by side has revealed a notable similarity in thought between the two writers, in that they construe religion and music respectively as, first and foremost, experiences of the infinite. Hoffmann’s writing,

---

293 Schleiermacher, The Christian Faith, 263.
294 Ibid., 194.
295 Ibid., 232.
296 Ibid., 261.
though undoubtedly expressive in many ways (particularly evident in his frequent use of natural imagery to describe the infinite), often leaves the reader in some doubt as to precisely what he means in terms of some of his most important concepts. We have noted that he uses the notion of the infinite in an ambivalent way, sometimes using it alongside imagery in what appears to be a metaphorical sense, and at others in a rather more literal way. He also places a great deal of importance on his notion of yearning, which is integral to his notion of how music conveys a sense for the infinite but which also lacks clarity. This is not necessarily a flaw in Hoffmann’s work, nor is it to say that he has failed in his attempt to discuss the infinite; indeed, he writes in this way purposefully in order to highlight the infinite and ineffable quality of the experience that he describes. Additionally, we must remember that this text of Hoffmann’s is, first and foremost, a review of Beethoven’s symphony, and as such was never intended to express any particular argument about the nature of the infinite or the role music may play in expressing it. When we claim that Hoffmann’s writing lacks clarity, therefore, it is not a criticism but rather an acknowledgement that his thoughts on the infinite and its relation to music need some further development in order for us to make use of them in our discussion.

Despite this difficulty in interpreting his discussion, Hoffmann has something significant to teach us as regards the relationship between music and the infinite. To express these insights fully it is helpful to draw on Schleiermacher’s work. In particular, the way in which Schleiermacher highlights and explains the relationship between humanity and the infinite, and understands each of his concepts in terms of this relationship, can help to illuminate the various areas in which Hoffmann’s writing requires more development. For this reason, we will now examine Hoffmann in light of Schleiermacher’s work, with the aim of bringing more clarity to Hoffmann’s concepts, which we will then use to explore the ways in which music is able to create the context for its listeners to experience something of the infinite.

*The infinite*

Hoffmann has many useful thoughts on both the nature of the infinite and (to some extent) how it can be accessed. We understand the infinite, in his writing, as something essentially higher than human life but that may be perceived and reached out to by
humanity. It is, as we have seen, an ‘unknown realm,’ though one so connected to imagery of the natural world in his writing that we can conclude that Hoffmann considers the infinite to be in relation to the finite; it is removed but not completely separate from the finite world. It would seem, then, that the infinite, or at least a sense of it, can be sought by humanity. In order for this to be possible, the infinite must be different, though not completely removed, from finite things, and we have noted that Hoffmann considers music to be a finite entity that is especially revealing of the infinite. In this way, Hoffmann’s description of the infinite parallels Schleiermacher’s, in which connection with the finite in order to grasp the infinite is crucial. As we have seen, Schleiermacher outlines a conception of religion that is based primarily on an awareness and perception of the infinite. These moments of contact with the infinite are characterised by the distinct yet interlinked nature of intuition – by which the individual becomes aware of their finitude in the face of the infinite – and feeling – that of being in relation to the infinite. Intuition and feeling are very much dependent on sensory perception which is perception of something finite, since we have noted that, for Schleiermacher, the senses ‘mediate’ the connection between the finite object and the infinite. In fact, we have noted that finite ‘form’ is described by Schleiermacher as ‘the holy essence itself.’ Schleiermacher maintains that, though the precise nature of the infinite is beyond human understanding, it is nevertheless accessible in some way to humanity through intuition and feeling, which must interact with the finite so as to highlight the existence of something infinite and express a sense of it. Both thinkers therefore express a notion of the infinite which is ‘higher’ than the finite world but nevertheless must interact with it in order to be accessible, at least in part, to humanity.

Both writers assert that each individual must seek out the infinite and an experience of it for themselves. They also agree on the idea that art may function as a vehicle of the infinite – in fact, Dahlhaus says of Schleiermacher, ‘the theologian of feeling… was simultaneously… the theologian of the art religion.’ It would seem that, though Hoffmann does consider religious music, it is the infinite as a notion not specific to any religious tradition or dogma that remains the focus, which echoes Schleiermacher’s

297 Hoffmann, “Review,” 236.
299 Ibid., 32.
understanding of religion as ‘the sensibility and taste for the infinite’ insofar as he posits that religion derives from feeling and intuition rather than any kind of practice or dogma.

Hoffmann’s lack of clarity in relation to the infinite particularly concerns how individuals are able to perceive it. He does provide, as we have already noted, examples of moments from Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony that he considers to be especially evocative of the infinite. He suggests that these are connected to or even are themselves moments of yearning and it is thus that Hoffmann sees them to be revealing of the infinite. He is also clear that perception of the infinite must somehow derive from interaction with the finite. Using these ideas alongside Schleiermacher, however, provides a useful perspective on how individuals are able to perceive the infinite, which is inseparable from sense perception. We have pointed out that both Schleiermacher and Hoffmann outline the importance of the finite in engaging with the infinite, though Schleiermacher’s argument is significantly more developed in this respect. Humanity’s ability to grasp the infinite, Schleiermacher says, is dependent on its recognition of its own finitude, and that of the world. This recognition must come about through engagement with the finite world, and specifically with some finite entity that points beyond itself to the infinite. The link between this finite entity and the infinite is such that the finite may ‘stimulate [the senses] in various ways and produce a change in your inner consciousness.’ Just as Schleiermacher outlines a perception of the infinite that relies upon an engagement with the finite and recognition of its limitations, Hoffmann equally expresses the view that finite things may act as mediators of the infinite. Specifically, he discusses music – a simultaneously infinite and temporal art form, as we have seen – as a finite entity that acts as a vehicle of the infinite. Crucially, as Schleiermacher explains, the finite is not a representation of the infinite ‘but [its] action upon you,’ which includes the notion of being in relation to it. This is why, as we have discovered, engagement with the finite and recognition of its limited nature is necessary for an experience of the infinite, although it is important to note that neither thinker, though both suggest that finite entities (and works of art in particular) may be used as vehicles of the infinite, suggest that such an entity either is or evokes a precise representation of it. Rather, both discuss the finite as a stimulus of an experience of the

302 Schleiermacher, On Religion, 23.
303 Ibid., 31.
304 Ibid., 5.
infinite, a recognition of something beyond the finite world (what Schleiermacher refers to as intuition). Such a recognition naturally leads, according to Schleiermacher, to a desire to seek the infinite, much like Hoffmann’s yearning. So we see that it is possible to link Hoffmann’s musical moments specifically with perception of the infinite with the help of Schleiermacher’s own ideas of how humanity might perceive the infinite and their similarity to Hoffmann’s concept of yearning.

**Yearning**

Much of Hoffmann’s understanding of how humanity is able to come into contact with the infinite rests on his notion of yearning, which is a central and necessary part of an experience of the infinite. Yearning is, therefore, not to be seen as unpleasant or problematic (as we might think of finite yearning) but rather as an essential part of the process of perceiving the infinite, which is to be savoured. Yearning creates a ‘state of tension’ in the listener,\(^{305}\) and this is a positive state which also leads Hoffmann describes it as ‘the essence of romanticism’\(^{306}\) Thus it is also a desirable state insofar as it leads to and is essential to an experience of the infinite – it is only the presence of the feeling of yearning that alerts the listener to the possibility of that which is yearned for. As we saw in chapter 2, it is characterised by its somewhat ineffable, ‘unbestimmt’ nature and is seen to be stimulated by, expressed through, and perhaps intrinsic to music.

Though Hoffmann gives a clear sense of what yearning is, and perhaps also how it is made manifest in music, he is less clear as to how yearning relates specifically to the infinite (other than to say that music expresses a yearning for the infinite), and is not simply a yearning for something in and of the world. For Hoffmann’s notion of yearning to be useful we must recognise a clear link between it and the infinite, distinguishing it from any feeling of yearning that relates only to a person or entity of the finite world. Here we may draw on Schleiermacher yet again, understanding his notion of feeling in much the same way as Hoffmann’s yearning. The two concepts have a number of similarities that make this feasible, in that both derive from an initial perception of the infinite and both also express the desire to experience something more of the infinite. Just as Hoffmann’s feeling is the ‘one lasting emotion’\(^{307}\) of an experience of the infinite.

---

\(^{305}\) Hoffmann, “Review,” 250.

\(^{306}\) Ibid., 238.

\(^{307}\) Ibid., 250.
brought about by music, which fills ‘the human breast with infinite yearning,’ Schleiermacher’s is derived from an intuition of the infinite resulting from engagement with the finite – ‘in the act of intuiting, you must necessarily be seized by... feelings.’ Crucially, in both cases, these feelings cannot be fulfilled since the infinite cannot be grasped in its precise nature, which is why we understand them in terms of tension or yearning. However, both writers agree that these are not feelings to be avoided but are feelings that aid individuals in an experience of the infinite by directing them toward it in a more focused way and causing them to strive to experience it more fully; moreover, they are essential to it. Only by experiencing such a feeling of yearning are individuals motivated to strive to experience more and more of the infinite. Crucially, though the finite is able to point individuals toward the infinite, it cannot express the precise nature of it, and so the feeling of yearning is not fulfilled but intensified.

Though Hoffmann is clear about the importance of the feeling of yearning, we must again look to Schleiermacher’s work to explore further his thoughts on its relation to the infinite and how it may point individuals toward the infinite. Schleiermacher’s feeling is based on the recognition of something above and outside of worldly life – it is this feeling (brought about by intuition) that leads to a desire to seek and experience the infinite (which is what we understand Hoffmann to mean by yearning). Later in his writing, Schleiermacher goes on to refer to this recognition in terms of a relationship of absolute dependence between the finite and the infinite, demonstrating an even stronger link between feeling and the infinite and emphasising the state of the finite as being in relation to the infinite. Feeling is ‘produced directly by the universe,’ is accessed through intuition, and so must give the individual some inkling of the infinite. It is a feeling that prompts individuals to ‘represent for others what they have encountered as poets and seers, as orators or as artists,’ which agrees with Hoffmann’s assertion that such a feeling might be expressed in music. Whereas Hoffmann is not entirely clear about where yearning comes from – except to say that it is expressed in music – or how it proceeds to the infinite, his concept of yearning is so similar to Schleiermacher’s notion of feeling that we may reasonably suggest that it could function in a similar way. Therefore we understand Hoffmann’s yearning as a feeling generated by an initial

308 Hoffmann, “Thoughts,” 94.
310 Ibid., 49.
311 Ibid., 7.
moment of sense for the infinite. This initial sense bears a notable similarity to Schleiermacher’s notion of intuition (as we have outlined) and requires a recognition of the limited nature of the finite in comparison to the infinite, which Hoffmann asserts is present in music’s features. The feeling of yearning (which we will examine below in terms of how Hoffmann understands it to proceed from musical features) is a positive one because of the role it plays in expressing a sense for the infinite – it encourages the individual to strive to experience more of the infinite, a complete representation of which is not present in the finite world.

Essentially, both Schleiermacher and Hoffmann write about a feeling of not being completely at home in the world (albeit under different names) brought about by a recognition of the limited nature of humanity and the world. This feeling, which may be encompassed in the term ‘unheimlich,’ (‘unhomely’) is a product of the relationship between the finite and the infinite in that it places the individual between the two – they are aware of a world beyond the finite that they may grasp in some way but not access completely. In this way, the unheimlich feeling proceeds from Schleiermacher’s feeling of the infinite, which describes the recognition of the infinite, the individual’s relationship to it, and the yearning to experience it. To understand this feeling as Schleiermacher does, in terms of the relationship between the finite, infinite, and works of art as a mediator of the infinite, and particularly a relationship of finite dependence upon the infinite, arguably gives greater meaning to Hoffmann’s concept of yearning as it describes it in terms of a yearning for the infinite and not only for finite things. We understand better how the feeling of yearning derives from music through a recognition of its limitations as a finite entity in relation to the infinite and how that feeling speaks not only of one experience of the infinite but also strives to create others.

A HOFFMANNIAN-SCHLEIERMACHERIAN APPROACH TO MUSIC AND THE INFINITE IN PRACTICE

We have established two essential concepts common to both Schleiermacher and Hoffmann that are involved in an experience of the infinite – the idea that such an experience depends on the recognition of the limited nature of the finite in relation to the infinite, and that this recognition provokes a feeling (which Hoffmann describes as
yearning) both of being in relation to the infinite, perhaps in a relationship of dependence (as Schleiermacher suggests) and of striving to experience something of the infinite once again. These concepts necessitate engagement with the finite world and both thinkers suggest that art (and music in particular in the case of Hoffmann, though we have also noted that Schleiermacher, too, displays a clear preference for music as a vehicle of the infinite.) We have seen that, where Hoffmann requires further understanding, Schleiermacher may be used to inform several of his concepts. From Schleiermacher, we gain a clearer notion of how individuals might perceive the infinite through engagement with the finite world. Though Hoffmann suggests that finite entities, and particularly music, can mediate the infinite, it is Schleiermacher who explains in greater detail how the finite world points beyond itself to the infinite and how it in fact relates to the infinite. Schleiermacher also sheds some light on Hoffmann’s notion of yearning, which aids our understanding of this feeling as a yearning for the infinite and not simply some finite entity, and also of how it points individuals to the infinite. Ultimately, we have arrived at an understanding of Hoffmann’s concepts which (with help from Schleiermacher) sees music, its processes, and the feeling of yearning it creates as evocative of the infinite in such a way that it places humanity in direct relation to the infinite. In particular, we have used Schleiermacher’s work to emphasise the link between Hoffmann’s concepts and the infinite specifically and to expand upon how these concepts demonstrate a relationship between humanity and the infinite. For Hoffmann’s discussion to be in any way useful for examining how music is able to express and bring about an experience of the infinite we must view it in terms of this relationship.

Notably, both Schleiermacher and Hoffmann present encounters with the infinite that have a strong focus on the experience of the individual. We have followed Schleiermacher’s model of religion, which prioritises a personal moment of contact with the infinite through intuition and feeling over the specificity of dogma and religious practices. Similarly, Hoffmann argues for an experience of the infinite that derives primarily from instrumental music, and not that with any kind of religious text. As we have already seen, it is instrumental music’s lack of specific meaning that would be conferred by a programme or text, he says, that makes it best able to express a sense for the infinite. Both writers, therefore, outline an experience of the infinite and a vehicle for that experience that relies on a lack of specificity. As we have noted, Hoffmann in particular emphasises a quality of instrumental music that we have described as
unbestimmt (rather than vague), which implies something very real to be experienced though something inexpressible through language or perhaps even, as Hoffmann suggests, except through music.

Having read these two complementary writers alongside each other, and particularly having used Schleiermacher to elucidate and elaborate upon Hoffmann’s insights, a method for examining how music might be able to create the conditions for an experience of the infinite begins to emerge.

It understands that music is able to spark an initial intuition of the infinite, awakening the listener to the sense for the infinite and, consequently (following Schleiermacher’s thought) a sense of religion. Just as Schleiermacher proposes a model of religion (whose goal is the infinite) which is based on experience and feeling, so too must our analysis of music focus on the ways in which it evokes experience and feeling, as does Hoffmann’s. This means, therefore, that our subsequent analysis of music should not simply discuss the art form as a whole, but rather centre on case studies as they would be experienced by a listener. To do this, we will focus on particular pieces contemporary with Schleiermacher and Hoffmann and which belong to the Romantic culture within which they were writing – this will enable us to use both writers’ ideas to explore more fully how music is able to mediate the infinite and thus make assertions that may extend to music of other styles, genres, and periods.

Our understanding of music’s relation to the infinite states that it may act as the finite entity by which intuition of the infinite occurs, as required by both Schleiermacher and Hoffmann’s arguments. It evokes in us both a feeling of being in relation to the infinite and a yearning to experience more of it, and it may do this only because of its finitude. However, we have noted that music also has an arguably infinite quality that also makes it suitable as a mediator of the infinite. How, then, are we to reconcile the finite and infinite natures of music and examine how these natures contribute to an experience of the infinite?

Crucially, music must evoke a feeling – which Hoffmann characterises as yearning – of being in relation to the infinite. Given that Hoffmann claims in his review that it is best able to do this without the use of text or narrative, we may assume that it is music’s forms and features that express this feeling. As we have observed, much of Hoffmann’s review of Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony concentrates on an analysis of features that he
claims are especially evocative of the feeling of yearning and therefore of the infinite. We have already highlighted Hoffmann’s particular emphasis on Beethoven’s use of themes to convey a ‘restless yearning,’ as well as techniques such as repetition that delay closure and a cadential resolution. Following Hoffmann, we will look for these and similar features in our case studies in order to explore how they function outside of Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony (i.e. can they similarly be said to evoke a sense of yearning and the infinite?) and the means by which they are able to do that. Though we will once again refer to specific case studies rather than music more generally as an art form, it is with the aim of discovering ways in which music can create the context for an experience of the infinite which might then be observed in and applied to other pieces.

Identifying Yearning in Beethoven’s Seventh Symphony

In his review of Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony, Hoffmann claims a kind of special significance for Beethoven as a composer and for this symphony in particular; they are for him the composer and piece best able to direct the listener toward the infinite. However, the reasons Hoffmann outlines in his review, most notably the highlighting of features that create a feeling of tension and subsequent yearning, do not seem limited only to the Fifth Symphony but, we might argue, permeate many other of Beethoven’s works. Not only this, but we will go on to suggest that these features are also commonplace and equally effective in works by other composers. To begin with, and to examine the idea that it is not only Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony that has such an infinite effect, we will turn to another of Beethoven’s Symphonies, the Seventh, in order to discover whether the same feelings that are so present for Hoffmann in the Fifth are also made present here. We will begin with Beethoven so as to remain close and faithful to Hoffmann’s original conception of how music might point the listener toward the infinite, as well as to answer his claim of the somewhat unique nature of the Fifth Symphony. The choice of the Seventh Symphony for analysis here has no real significance other than the fact that, like the Fifth, it is unattached to any program or narrative content and so in that sense is purely instrumental. It is hoped that the following analysis will demonstrate that, without using any words, the Seventh Symphony might direct the listener to that which is beyond words, through the creation of tension, anticipation, and resolution and the resultant feeling of yearning that the listener experiences. In this analysis, we will be looking to identify how musical features such as melody, harmony, rhythm, instrumentation, texture, and dynamics are used to create tension or anticipation in some way, and how this subsequently creates a feeling of yearning in the listener for their resolution.

Whereas the Fifth symphony conjures a mood of foreboding, with a clear trajectory from solemn to triumphant, the Seventh is overtly much more pleasant in mood and creates many more nuanced moments of tension and resolution. Kinderman notes that ‘the Seventh Symphony, unlike the Fifth, does not involve a struggle against adversity,
even if a darker, contrasting range of character emerges in the A minor Allegretto.¹

While we might not therefore expect a similar move from darkness to light in the Seventh Symphony as is presented in the Fifth, it nevertheless remains plausible that the features and qualities of the Seventh Symphony might create in the listener a feeling of yearning in a less linear way. In particular, we aim to investigate how the lighter nature of the Seventh Symphony is able to accommodate the feeling of excited anticipation more so than the darker Fifth, and thus also view this in terms of a yearning for fulfilment.

**FIRST MOVEMENT**

The first movement of the Seventh Symphony is in sonata form with a long introduction that precedes a lively Vivace. Its length and slow rhythmic tempo – it depends entirely upon a legato four-note motive comprising only minims – catch the listener immediately off guard. This is not a strong opening statement as we are presented with in the Fifth Symphony, but rather a mysterious one in which the listener is unsure about its eventual destination or goal. This is intensified by the way in which the idea moves through different keys – Grove notes how, after only eight bars, it arrives in ‘the remote key of F major.’² Although the tonic key of A major is strongly asserted in the opening bar of the movement, it seems not to have been able to develop; instead, the listener is hurried through a musical landscape that is harmonically unstable and constantly shifting. Although this kind of harmonic development is fairly standard for a slow introduction, it is nonetheless a clear example of how harmony can be used to create a feeling of tension in the listener. Moreover, Dahlhaus comments that ‘the way the harmony roams from A major via D major to C major – together with the irregularity of the harmonic rhythm – creates the impression of a state of suspension, in which there is no discernible direction to the harmonic and motivic changes.’³ Even the way in which the minim motive is passed around between instruments highlights the restless yearning of this opening; it is not allowed to settle but is rather taken up first by oboe, and then

---

clarinets, horns, bassoons, and finally flute, before being adopted from bar 15 by the strings. The motive appears to be seeking some kind of resolution, and the listener seeks it too. There is a feeling here of expectancy, of building toward some climax that is, as yet, unknown to the listener. This expectancy and anticipation is emphasised further by staccato semiquavers in the strings climbing ever upwards – though without avail - ‘like gigantic stairs.’ As we will see throughout this movement, it is rhythm that provides the basis for this forward motion, which ‘derives in part from the music’s ‘synthesis of three rhythmic levels, which subdivide the basic slow pulse of the chords… The tension generated by these relationships depends on the fact that Beethoven’s second rhythmic division doubles the proportions of the first. We can hear this taking place even in the first eight bars, where minims, crotchets, and quavers co-exist to create a sense of purposefulness. Unlike the opening of the Fifth Symphony, which creates tension through the dramatic introduction of a tempestuous theme, the opening of the Seventh Symphony creates tension in the anticipation that builds up throughout its opening, from which the listener yearns to find some respite and fulfilment.

After a brief melodic interlude – an idea that will not be heard again and that is interrupted constantly by the restless striving of the strings’ semiquavers – the movement proper can begin. It is, as much of the symphony is, relentlessly rhythmic. The listener immediately notices the difference in drive – whereas the introduction provided anticipation and expectancy without momentum, the buoyancy of the new rhythm at the Vivace suggests progress and goal-directedness. In fact, the dotted idea that characterises the Vivace ‘is first given on the single pitch “E” in a high register in the winds, so it is heard first as a purely rhythmic motif before it emerges as part of a melodic phrase or is even harmonized.’ By bar 89, it is all-powerful, dominating not only the melody but also the accompaniment in basses, trumpet, and timpani. Its importance is highlighted by the prominence it gives to the horn, reaching ever upward in its register. The pause in the preceding bar is particularly effective, suspending the onward momentum for a moment before resuming with renewed and increased energy and fortitude. Its presence here at the beginning of the exposition, delaying as it does the fulfilment of the opening theme, challenges the listeners’ expectations of the musical form, in which the theme would

---

4 Grove, Beethoven and his nine symphonies, 242.
5 Kinderman, Beethoven, 154.
usually play out without interruption to a concluding cadence. The dominance of the dotted rhythm here demonstrates Lockwood’s assertion about the treatment of rhythm throughout the symphony as a whole: ‘the streaming flow of rhythmic events sometimes overshadows other elements that shape the work… it animates the discourse at every level, and becomes a principal source of its organic unity.’ The *Vivace* demonstrates precisely this animation and propels the listener forward in a yearning to discover what the climactic moment that this rhythm is driving toward will be. We have already, therefore, two examples of yearning that differ from the kind that characterises the dramatic opening of the Fifth Symphony but are no less significant or effective: they are the restless searching for fulfilment of the introduction, brought about by its roaming through instruments and key areas, and the excited anticipation created by the relentless momentum of the *Vivace*’s central dotted rhythm. Demonstrated here is the idea that tension and yearning need not only derive from dramatic passages such as the opening of the Fifth Symphony, in which the minor key, repeated quavers, forceful dynamics, and full *tutti* moments create a feeling of unsettlement. Instead, we have noted different ways in which the listener might experience a feeling of yearning, albeit created by music that is arguably lighter in character.

Not only does this movement create excitement and anticipation through its rhythmic momentum but also through its dynamics, which are varied and dramatic. Whereas the dominance of the dotted rhythm is asserted in bar 89 by a *sempre fortissimo* dynamic, as the melody begins to move again away from A major so too do the dynamics echo this loss of stability. For instance, in bar 109 the melody begins to assert itself once more but hesitates, dropping to *piano* as it begins to modulate. Where once certain of forward momentum and progression, the listener is now unsettled; the texture is reduced, the dotted rhythm has almost disappeared, and the orchestra is uncertain and quiet. The sudden change in dynamic emphasises a change in mood from established to unsure and leaves the listener not in anticipation but in a yearning to return to the stable musical landscape that the *Vivace* and its dotted rhythm represent. This is not a gentle move from one passage to another but an abrupt change that leaves the listener a little lost. It is because of such ‘swift and unexpected changes and contrasts’ that Grove considers this symphony to be ‘the most *romantic* of the nine… exciting the imagination in the highest

---

7 Lockwood, *Beethoven’s symphonies*, 151.
degree, and whirling it suddenly into new and strange regions." Perhaps the romantic
element exists in the fact that these dramatic contrasts, in which expectations are
established and immediately subverted, create a feeling of displacement that could not be
generated verbally, or at least not as effectively. In this sense, this use of dynamics
becomes what Bowie refers to as a ‘gesture,’ whereby the listener feels a yearning for
stability more keenly than could have been expressed in words. Moreover, Bowie argues
that ‘the combination of a given musical form’ – or in this case, a feature such as
dynamics – ‘with the feeling that the form may break down or mutate is characteristic of
some of the most important Romantic music.’ This is only one example of how
dynamics are used to indicate and intensify significant moments in this movement, and
many others may also be found. What this illustrates is a kind of yearning that is created
once restless searching and excited anticipation are removed; that is, the yearning for a
more stable musical landscape and a more certain progression toward the music’s goal.

As the dominant force in the movement, indeed, in the symphony as a whole, rhythm
has a part to play not only in establishing and maintaining a sense of goal orientation and
forward momentum but also in breaking down this momentum to create uncertainty and
instability. The buoyant lilting metre of the movement is disrupted in bars 124-127 by
staccato crotchets in the strings combined with quavers in the wind that, together, create
a rocking effect that seems at odds with the familiar dotted rhythm. Having dipped,
momentum is gathered once more by the reappearance of the Vivace theme’s opening
bar, which gradually rises in pitch and is punctuated by semiquavers in the wind and bass
that become increasingly frequent and insistent. The listener anticipates a climax and,
surely enough, the music draws toward a cadence in E major. However, the listener’s
yearning for stability is not satisfied as once more the rhythm dissolves and the harmony
is unable to settle. Instead of the neat and clear cadential figure for which the listener
yearns, Beethoven introduces opposition between the wind and strings in which the
strings play on the beat with an appoggiatura and the wind interject off the beat. Again,
rhythm is used here to subvert the listener’s expectations and quash their anticipation,
creating instead uncertainty and the threat of chaos. This is how Beethoven begins the
development section of this movement, not with a contained rounding-off of the

---

8 Grove, *Beethoven and his nine symphonies*, 245.
Nicholas Saul (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009), 245.
10 Ibid., 252.
exposition and certainly not with any indication of where the music might proceed to next, but rather with fragmented rhythms, unstable harmony, and two two-bar moments of complete silence, which for Lockwood sound like ‘huge black pauses.’ The listener is sustained in the feeling of yearning for stability during these silences as much – if not more so – as during the rhythmic and dynamic tension discussed above; here, it is not only momentum that has been diminished but the entire musical landscape has completely disappeared; the rug has been pulled from underneath the listener’s feet, as it were.

The development actually opens in C major, a modulation that looks back to the introduction and that gives the feeling of having arrived in a totally new and different musical landscape. As Simpson outlines, ‘when the music goes into C or F we invariably have the impression that these are two remote but strangely related worlds; our home planet (A) revolves around the sun, but C and F exist in another part of space altogether… Music in this symphony has become multidimensional.’ In the development, the dotted rhythm reigns supreme and the melody is all but overcome by its dominance. It is reinforced tutti and fortissimo at bar 254, but this is more of an oppressive force that the unity that the earlier tutti at bar 89 suggested. Its obsessive reiteration of the dotted rhythm highlights the absence of the Vivace melody, and the listener yearns for its return. Beethoven ignites the listener’s anticipation once more in bar 275, where the strings’ semiquavers suggest the return of the theme, before relenting in bar 278 with the triumphant return of the Vivace theme. This time, it has an even more urgent feeling of momentum and of pressing forward towards its goal, accompanied by a persistent dotted theme in the bass, running semiquavers in the middle strings, and flourishes in the wind, brass, and timpani that anticipate the next bar. The texture remains generally full during the course of the recapitulation and the whole impression is that a triumphant and emphatic ending must surely be approaching. However, Beethoven once again subverts the listener’s expectation by avoiding a strong cadence in the tonic key, A major, and instead reintroduces the opposition between wind and strings that was used to lead into the development, along with the corresponding bars of silence that were so effective before in increasing tension and therefore the listener’s sense of yearning. We might suggest that this yearning is felt even more intensely here, when the excited

11 Lockwood, *Beethoven’s symphonies*, 158.
anticipation of a strong and triumphant conclusion to the movement is suddenly replaced with uncertainty and lack of directionality. Just as Hoffmann identifies delayed closure as a significant source of tension and yearning in the Fifth Symphony, we experience the same delay here in the coda to the opening movement of the Seventh, by which resolution by way of the return of the tonic key is suggested but not firmly established. The coda therefore is a passage of seeking and striving for the tonic key. The theme is attempted in the strings but not completed, and the dotted rhythm descends in the bass, arriving finally at the dominant in bar 339. The movement is once again poised on the edge of fulfilment, and yet once again fulfilment does not come – instead, the lower strings delay once more with a short idea ‘on the notes D-C#-B#-B#C# (a chromatic turning figure) [repeated] eleven times while the winds and strings… build a crescendo that leads to a climactic new section in which the dactylic figure now fully rules in the whole orchestra.’\textsuperscript{13} Certainly, by bar 423 there is no denying either the re-establishment of the tonic key, highlighted especially by a descending arpeggio idea in strings, or the ultimate supremacy of the dotted rhythm: it permeates the entire orchestra. It is interesting to note that, in this movement, it is the rhythmic idea and not the full theme itself that provides resolution and closure. As the source of the momentum that has characterised much of this movement, the use of the dotted rhythm to provide ultimate fulfilment is sustains the listener in a feeling of anticipation and of yearning to final reach the concluding cadence until the very end.

SECOND MOVEMENT

The second movement begins with a sombre chord, held for two and a half bars, in oboe, clarinet, bassoon, and horn, with a marked diminuendo from $f$ to $pp$. It is in stark difference to the frantic and rhythmic ending of the previous movement. As in the first movement, this movement derives its power from its rhythm, perhaps even more so. It is ‘a prominent rhythmic ostinato, which endows this movement with a processional aura, imposing a strong unifying character that that is felt throughout the variations of the theme and even the contrasting episodes in the major.’\textsuperscript{14} Introduced initially by viola,

\textsuperscript{13} Lockwood, \textit{Beethoven’s symphonies}, 158.
\textsuperscript{14} Kinderman, \textit{Beethoven}, 158.
cello, and bass in a low register, it is measured in character, marked *tenuto* and with a detached quality. The mood from the outset is immediately darker due to the move from A major at the end of the first movement into A minor and the measured and subdued manner in which the strings take up the ostinato. This movement, as we will discover, seems to have about it something of a ‘gradual growth… from quiet contemplation to an exalted state of profound emotional involvement;’\(^{15}\) arguably, the hushed tones, rhythmic unison and close harmony of these opening bars do seem to speak directly to the listener. Beethoven’s use of silence as an integral part of this theme is striking and creates a sense of space in the music; the crotchet rests that permeate the theme create a natural pause that seems comparable almost to breathing space, reinforcing the theme’s deeply personal feeling. It is not a hopeful musical idea; it does not attempt to break out of its strict rhythmic confines and its range is less than an octave.

Emerging from this ostinato in bar 27 is a theme so related to the ostinato that we might refer to it as a counter theme, rather than a second theme. Whereas the ostinato proceeds inevitably and relentlessly forward ‘with a kind of “grim repose,”’\(^{16}\) the counter theme reaches out with more yearning and is perhaps the most emotive of the symphony thus far, primarily because of this chromaticism; the feeling of yearning is present here in the narrow space between semitones, in the protracted time taken for one tone to settle into another. The movement in bars 31 to 32, for example, from C to E (in the cello line) via D and D# provides a delay of closure that the listener yearns for. Throughout this opening section the music grows in intensity, not only with the addition of the counter theme but also with the participation of more and more instruments that gradually take up either the ostinato or counter theme, climbing up an octave each time. In the meantime, the strings propel the music forward, switching to a quaver rhythm that is equal to the ostinato in its persistent effect. By bar 75, the entire orchestra is involved in the theme, with the winds hammering out the ostinato and the first violin carrying the counter theme. This is the ‘exalted state of profound emotional involvement’ to which Lockwood refers.\(^{17}\) The feelings of tension and yearning that are created in this opening are more cumulative than the listener has experienced up to this point in the symphony. We have noted that tension was created in the first movement often by suddenly subverting the listener’s expectations and therefore causing a yearning for stability, or by building up

---

\(^{15}\) Lockwood, *Beethoven’s symphonies*, 160.
\(^{16}\) Grove, *Beethoven and his nine symphonies*, 254.
\(^{17}\) Lockwood, *Beethoven’s symphonies*, 160.
the listener’s sense of anticipation of climax or resolution. In the second movement, the gradual intensification of the ostinato and counter themes, culminating in the *fortissimo* passage from bar 75, creates a feeling of oppression, from which the listener yearns to escape. Moreover, because the ostinato is presented initially to the listener as a deeply personal theme, it comes almost to represent an inner struggle on the part of the listener. This is not an excited, anticipatory yearning or a yearning feeling of loss and directionlessness, but a yearning to break away from the obsessive and relentless rhythmicality of these themes. Hoffmann highlights repetition in the Fifth Symphony which, he says, ‘becomes an irresistible surge – a swelling torrent,’\(^\text{18}\) which also seems relevant here in the relentlessness and persistence of this theme.

These opening themes are not brought to a neat or satisfying end but rather fade away with an ever-reducing texture and are eventually interrupted by a new theme that begins in the latter half of bar 101. It is a ‘beautiful and consoling A major interlude… it offers release from the bleakness of the first section and yet has the original first-bar dactylic rhythm of the primary motif murmuring in the basses.’\(^\text{19}\) We get a sense once more of the ‘grim repose’ of the ostinato rhythm, asserting its presence – albeit minimally – even here in a different tonality and accompanying a very different theme. Here, clarinets and bassoons, marked *dolce*, embark upon a gentle and *legato* melody that feels light-hearted in relation to the restrained, repressive, and solemn opening, dispensing with the chromaticism of the counter theme and instead moving diatonically in step accompanied by arpeggiated triplets in the first violin that highlight the new major tonality of this second theme. Moving easily and gracefully to the dominant, E major, in bar 116, Beethoven introduces another melodic idea in the clarinet, which is echoed in the horn and then passed between all the winds. His use of the winds here to present these new melodies is in contrast to the prominent use of strings from the outset of the ostinato and counter themes, and so is another way in which the difference between the two sections is highlighted. It seems that Beethoven is drawing the listener’s attention to the contrast between the relentless rhythmicality of the opening section and the melodic nature of this new theme and in doing so establishes the second theme as a reprieve from the oppression of the first. The effect of the second theme is therefore to demonstrate to the reader the musical landscape that is possible beyond the repetition of the ostinato and

\(^\text{18}\) Hoffmann and Charlton, *E.T.A Hoffmann’s Musical Writings*, 244.
\(^\text{19}\) Lockwood, *Beethoven’s symphonies*, 160.
counter themes. This is the release that the listener has yearned for over the course of the first 100 bars.

However, this is only a temporary reprieve rather than a complete overcoming, as foreshadowed by the continuation of the ostinato rhythm in the bass. Eventually the optimism of the second theme is exhausted, and its triplets descend through the wind and then strings. Unlike at the end of the first section, where the ostinato theme was gradually thinned out until the second theme could begin, the second theme continues to reach forward until it is abruptly interrupted once more by the ostinato, signalled by staccato, fortissimo quavers that move through strings, brass and timpani, then wind. The listeners find themselves immediately back in A minor; that Beethoven chooses not to develop the ostinato and counter themes in a different key reinforces the oppressive and introspective nature of these themes. The listener is ensnared once again, and the second theme now takes on a new and retrospective significance as the listener yearns to return to its consoling melodies. Instead, Beethoven develops these themes rhythmically and texturally, and so over the following bars we hear the familiar ideas become more agitated through the use of semiquavers in the accompaniment. There is ‘a fugue-like treatment of the primary motive, first for strings, then adding winds,’20 which is far removed from the restraint and solemnity of the opening bars. With the increased rhythmic tempo is an increased feeling or urgency that was not present before, and an intensity that is brought to a climax in bar 214 where the orchestra, which has been divided for much of the previous section, is reunited in a climactic restatement of the ostinato theme. Where there was perhaps a suggestion of variety and multiplicity during the fugue-like section, there is now only resolve and ultimate submission to the ostinato.

Just at this point, where the listener feels completely overcome by the power of the ostinato, the texture is reduced once more and the second theme reappears ‘exactly like a sudden gleam of sunshine.’21 This time, however, its cheerfulness is decreased, and only its first melody is allowed to sound. Before its second triplet melody can be heard, a short passage in wind, brass, and timpani reinstates the ostinato for the final time, appearing to conclude in a final cadence in bars 247-248. The sudden fortissimo swell of the orchestra over these two bars does indeed seem to signal the end of the movement, though, like in the first movement, Beethoven heightens the listener’s sense of yearning by delaying the

20 Lockwood, Beethoven’s symphonies, 160.
21 Grove, Beethoven and his nine symphonies, 253.
true ending. Here, there are multiple false endings, for example in bars 249-250 and 251-252, preventing the music from moving forward toward conclusion and placing the listener in a position of uncertainty and of yearning for resolution. The rests that form a part of this ostinato theme have a particularly prominent role here in hindering the progression of the movement towards resolution. Hoffmann’s comments on the ending of the final movement of the Fifth Symphony could equally describe the music here: ‘The perfect composure of spirit engendered by the succession of closing figures is destroyed again by these detached chords and rests.’ 22 The ostinato theme is heard a final time from bar 255 and appears to be fading to nothing. It is passed every two bars between instruments, neither developing into the theme in its fuller form nor moving toward an ending. Once a persistent, sustained theme, the ostinato is now fragmented and weak.

Finally, the ostinato gathers enough momentum to reach its closing cadence, with the final bar of the theme repeated by viola, second violin, and then first violin over three consecutive bars. It also gains enough energy for a sudden forte dynamic in bar 276, which behaves almost as an accent on the first beat of that bar. This is not, however, a triumphant or strong ending, in part because of the diminuendo from f back to pp by the final bar. Also of note is the final repetition of the ostinato in bar 267, where the motive begins a beat earlier, so that the quavers begin on the first beat of the bar and the final, highest, note of the motive comes on the second, weaker, beat. This also means that the concluding cadence occurs on this second beat. It is a poignant ending to an emotional and introspective movement. The ostinato has neither succumbed to the beauty of the second theme, nor has it asserted its dominance in a final flourish, but leaves the listener with a lasting feeling of emptiness and loss. The lingering impression with which the listener is left is of the final despairing chord, ‘using the same orchestration and in the same unusual sonority as at the beginning… with it, this movement leaves through the same portal through which it has entered, as if in a dream.’ 23 It is a movement that has spoken directly to the listener and required their personal involvement; it has held them in the oppression of the repetitive ostinato and counter themes yet has also offered a glimpse beyond, to the beauty of melody. And yet with the repetition of the ostinato, as Grove points out, ‘the feeling of monotony never intrudes itself’ 24 Instead, repetition can also involve diversity, which we observed in the fugue section, and ‘can be a sign both

23 Lockwood, Beethoven’s symphonies, 162.
24 Grove, Beethoven and his nine symphonies, 252.
for metamorphosis and for stasis; beyond the undeviating repetition of the basic meter we encounter dynamic intensification, transposition of the theme to ever higher registers, and an expressive countermelody that completes the musical fabric, along with crescendos, the fugato, and the final six-four chord. The effect is that the feeling of yearning that the listener experiences during the course of the movement, and of this theme in particular, is intensified at certain points, and does not stagnate through lack of variation. What Solomon describes as ‘metamorphosis’ is what enables this music to affect the listener so deeply, by creating that is more and more absorbing and encompassing. He goes on to say that ‘whatever the movement’s manifold implications, the sense of overhearing and being ineluctably drawn into an undulating ceremonial or ritual activity – an unfolding path to ecstasy or to an implied sacred realm – is not far from the surface.’

THIRD MOVEMENT

The third movement is in Scherzo and Trio form, marked Presto and Assai meno presto. Once more, the characteristic rhythmicality of this movement is present in the staccato crotchets that pervade the Presto theme. The A minor tonality of the previous movement has a lingering effect here, since ‘to this mode of A the pair of alien keys, C and F, are much more easily related than to A major. This allows them to emerge much less obtrusively but more expectedly – so much so that the scherzo breaks out with F as its main key. Now it is A major that is the foreigner; the very first clause of the scherzo makes a modulation to A with a staggering wrench. In this context A cannot sound like a key in its own right – only like the dominant of D.’ So effective was the second movement’s use of the minor tonality that it has transported the listener to a musical landscape that once seemed far away, that is, the key areas of F and C, and by doing so has placed the symphony’s tonic key of A major at a distance. The listener anticipates the return of A major by the end of the symphony, and its removal to a distance at this stage only increases their yearning for its return, and to leave this other musical landscape. For

---

26 Ibid., 113.
the second time during the course of the symphony the listener thinks back to the introduction of the first movement, where these harmonic events were foreshadowed and where the impression of the alien-ness of the keys of F and C was first formed.

Though harmonically the opening of this movement creates in the listener a feeling of yearning that derives from its distancing the listener from the tonic key for which they strive, melodically it is jovial and light-hearted. Unlike the themes of the first two movements, which tend to overlap and borrow elements from each other, the first theme of the third movement is clearly defined by the double repeat bar in bar 24, preceded by a strong arpeggiated ending and a perfect cadence. In particular, the clear four bar phrasing and regular crotchet rhythm give this theme an initial feeling of stability after the tension and emotion of the previous movement. This is a movement in which Beethoven teases the listener’s expectations of how the rhythmic theme might develop next, and ‘one of the many beauties of the scherzo is the ingenuity with which Beethoven maintains the obsessive repetition of a two-note figure moving down one step… for long stretches in pianissimo. His way of deploying it is to state it in three four-bar phrases in succession on different pitches… and then to break the spell with a fortissimo explosion.’

This is the pattern of phrases that we hear from bar 29, where Beethoven uses the minim-crotchet idea that was first introduced as part of the Presto theme to hypnotic effect through its repetition at a low dynamic. The fortissimo ‘explosion’ jolts the listener out of their trance and, by the third repetition of this device, the listener expects and anticipates it. Lockwood points to a further aspect of this device’s charm when, ‘after the first statement of the trio, the scherzo returns in full with the same sequence of four-bar phrases but now the expected fortissimo crash is replaced with a soft pianissimo arrival. It is a moment every listener learns to savor, the more so when the full scherzo comes back for the third time at the end of the movement, and the fortissimo crash returns as well.’ Not only do these fortissimo interjections tease the listener’s expectations but they also seem to foreshadow the return of the theme due to the way in which they mimic the opening two bars of the movement. Its rhythmic crotchets appear once more in B flat, with each four-bar phrase reaching higher and higher in its search for a climax. This signposting by the fortissimo idea and by the ascending line in the sub-dominant hold the listener in a state of anticipation and yearning for the climactic moment.

28 Lockwood, Beethoven’s symphonies, 163.
29 Ibid.
This arrives in bar 91, where the intense rhythmicality of this movement is emphasised by the brass and timpani, fortissimo on one repeated note. Beethoven highlights once again the distance between the listener and their goal of the A major tonic by extending the final arpeggiated bars of the theme to include an excursion by the way of C major, before finally coming to a close in F. Whereas this theme originally included a modulation into A major, here A has been eradicated completely. The listener is firmly situated in an alien world in which the tonic is far away, and they yearn for its return.

As Simpson points out, A is only really able to function in this movement as the dominant note of D major, and it fulfils this function in the transition into the trio which begins in bar 149. It is given the quality of a dominant pedal note in the violins, a wistful and hopeful longing for when it might return as the tonic, emphasised by the drop to the G# leading note in the seventh and eighth bars. It accompanies a graceful and majestic theme that might be thought of as ‘the still centre of the symphony.’ It has an ‘almost static character’ that is quite different to the propulsive rhythmicity that has been present during much of the symphony thus far; instead, rhythm is used to add interest and embellishment rather than as the driving force of the theme. In the second subject of the trio, for example, appoggiaturas and gentle syncopation maintain the themes gliding character. It is not without a sense of direction, however, and this can be heard especially in the horn which ‘soon takes on a more marked part than before, a 2-4 phrase forced into a 3-4 rhythm, and gradually increasing in oddness and prominence… till it brings back the first portion of the tune.’ It is a full, unified, and glorious reiteration of the theme, with the A pedal heard now in trumpet and rolling timpani. It is perhaps because it is so brilliant that it cannot continue, and instead ‘the music seems almost to go out, as if it were a flame,’ dying away as the pedal note disappears and C natural is regained once more.

The returning Presto theme goes through many of the same processes as before, except for the passage described above in which the expectation of a fortissimo interruption is subverted and the music remains pianissimo. As before, we hear the now familiar diversion to B flat major that precedes the emphatic return of the theme in F as

---

30 Kinderman, Beethoven, 158.
31 Ibid.
32 Grove, Beethoven and his nine symphonies 258.
33 Ibid., 259.
well as the modulation into C major. The obsessive drive of its rhythm is made all the more evident now that it can be heard in the relation to the majesty of the trio, which is brought back in bar 409. In some ways this feels like the climactic point of the movement, the blissful state toward which the Presto theme races. It is broad and stately, with heraldic gestures in the trumpet and timpani, and certainly feels as though it consolidates the rhythmicity and often fragmented passages of the Presto. However, the final conclusion of this movement is not to be found in this trio, and so the Presto theme rushes onward once again. The protracted structure of this theme certainly gives the impression that it could go on forever; Beethoven does not give the listener any indication of the nearness – or not – of the final cadence. The listener yearns for fulfilment and for the resolution of this movement, a feeling that is intensified with the hearing once more of the first few bars of the trio in the coda. This, however, is a teasing mis-direction by Beethoven, with the Presto resuming four bars later and racing to an emphatic close with tutti chords in rhythmic unison.

FOURTH MOVEMENT

The final movement opens with a theme that is based on a lively and rhythmic semiquaver idea. Given that rhythm is such a uniting feature of this symphony, being integral to each of its themes, it seems fitting that Beethoven would use rhythm in this final movement to contribute toward its triumphant mood. In contrast to the sombre motive of the second movement, for instance, the semiquavers of the fourth movement are light and energetic, rushing onwards toward the final cadence. Tied notes in the wind, brass, and bass create an emphasis on the second beat of the bar that pulls the music forward toward conclusion. Throughout the opening part of this theme, the suggestion is that fulfilment is near: over the course of the first twelve bars, there is a swift and notable transition from E major, the key in which the movement begins and the dominant key of the symphony, and A major, the tonic key of the symphony. The fourth movement is linked rhythmically to the preceding three, and seems to signal from the outset that the tension and yearning that the listener has experienced over the course of the symphony thus far will be resolved here. The tonality that is so notable at the beginning of this movement indicates clearly that the symphony is returning home, and 'succeeds in
making C and F sound as remote as they did at first, and this dramatic new use of tonality creates a limitless source of energy.\textsuperscript{34} Whereas Simpson describes the use of tonality here as ‘new,’ we might instead suggest that it demonstrates a return to the opening ideas of the symphony, creating a circular effect of completion. As a result, the opening ideas of this final movement hold the listener in a state of excited anticipation of the resolution and fulfilment that it suggests.

The rhythmic energy is sustained through this movement’s opening theme and explodes in triumphant style bar 24 with deliberate, articulated quavers that emphasise the tonic key. After the repetition of the two eight-bar sections that opened the movement, in which semiquavers rush toward their goal, this idea has a joyful and climactic feel. Simpson notes how, ‘if all the repeats in the Seventh are played, the rhythmic insistence enhances the circular effect; it is a kind of paradox – at the same time as the listener is swept off his feet he is subtly impressed by a sense of unity so immutable as to be a static phenomenon. The big repeats in the first and last movements are designed to complete the effect.’\textsuperscript{35} In other words, Beethoven creates music so huge that it seems to encompass the listener, who is aware not of four separate and distinct movements but rather of four linked and unified sections that make up the whole experience of the symphony. In this way, each of the preceding movements is relevant and present in this final movement and the listener is able to recognise that the joyful anticipation of fulfilment that the final movement creates is the fulfilment of all the tension and yearning that has gone before. Though the music at this point is undoubtedly upbeat and excited, yearning still remains in this link to and reminder of the previous movements.

The importance of the opening semiquaver idea becomes clear in the bars immediately after this climax, when it is used as the foundation for an expansive crotchet motive that is passed around the orchestra. The semiquaver idea is ‘like a coiled spring, whose tension permeates the broader thematic idea that circles in quarter-notes around C#, the third degree of A major.’\textsuperscript{36} The listener has an idea of the kind of resolution that they might expect to come in this movement, yet Beethoven maintains the sense of anticipation in this music through the interplay between different rhythmic ideas.

\textsuperscript{34} Simpson, \textit{Beethoven Symphonies}, 48.  
\textsuperscript{35} Ibid.  
\textsuperscript{36} Kinderman, \textit{Beethoven}, 158.
The new thematic idea that begins in bar 52 is equally rhythmic, centred on a dotted rhythm that echoes that which was so prominent in the first movement. The effect is that the music’s momentum appears markedly slowed with the replacement of the rushing semiquavers with clunky, awkward dotted quavers. This awkwardness is emphasised by the music’s tendency to lean on the second beat of the bar – for instance, in bars 74-77 – which here, unlike at the beginning of the movement, gives the music a heavy quality. There is a feeling that the music has lost its sense of purpose and direction, and that the resolution that seemed so clear and achievable to the listener in Beethoven’s use of rhythm and harmony at the opening of the movement is now somehow further away. Yearning returns once more as the listener longs for the certainty, both rhythmically and harmonically, of the movement’s opening.

Uncertainty continues into the development, where whole bars of silence punctuate the theme and halt its progression. The listener recognises the familiar semiquaver idea of the movement’s opening but it appears here in an altered form, with an additional bar that provides an echo to the end of the phrase (for example, bars 129-132). Beethoven does not allow the listener to feel comfortable in this music and assured of its fulfilment, instead maintaining the sense of tension and yearning all the way to the end of the symphony by implying resolution that is to come, and then removing the clear path to that resolution. Notably, after having firmly established A major at the beginning of the movement, Beethoven reintroduces the remote key of C major once more from bar 146. Throughout the symphony, C major has been indicative of a musical landscape that is distinctly other and removed from the home landscape of A major and its related keys. Its appearance here is a reminder to the listener of the musical landscape from which the music is trying to return and of the nearness, nevertheless, of the strange and other. C major has been associated with yearning during the course of this symphony and remains so here, even so close to resolution and completion.

A major is eventually regained at the beginning of the long recapitulation section from bar 224. Its reinstatement renews the listener’s excitement for an anticipation of the ultimate fulfilment of the tension and yearning not only of the middle section of this movement but of the symphony as a whole. After the return of the familiar semiquaver ideas, a full tutti in bar 405 signals the final return of the first theme, this time without its first or section sections. Instead, the third triumphant section takes over and is sustained until the end of the movement. This is the fulfilment of tension that the music has been
striving for and the listener yearning for, whereby any tension in the music is completely overcome by the joy of this theme. Here, from bar 421, semiquavers dominate, descending like bells in the violins and building upwards in bassoon and viola. This contrary motion does not introduce tension but rather a feeling of striving forward, with each bar starting and finishing higher and higher by moving one note up the scale. Flute and clarinet join these ascending and descending figures in bar 435, contributing to the feeling that the music is near to reaching its goal. This addition of the winds coincides with a sudden drop in dynamic from sf to p, with a crescendo over seven bars to fff, the loudest dynamic used in the movement and heard only once previously to this moment. By suddenly dropping to piano at this point, Beethoven creates a sense of anticipation for and of reaching toward the conclusion of the piece – it is arguably more effective for a piece of music to crescendo in this way from a quiet dynamic than to be consistently and persistently loud.

The fourth movement has, as the listener expects, a much more emphatic ending than that of the preceding movements. Repeated notes over the last seven bars reinforce the harmonic sequence here, and the final cadence is particularly emphasised by the repetition of the final chords. The semiquaver motive that has united the themes of the entire movement returns for the final time in the last three bars, though its placement here, finishing on the first rather than the second beat of the bar, creates a much stronger impression. Its use here is a consolidation of all of the themes of the movement which have been asserted to be linked rhythmically, and we are reminded once more of Hoffmann’s assertion that it is the unity between themes that sustains the listener in a feeling of yearning and points toward the infinite.

YEARNING FOR THE INFINITE IN BEETHOVEN’S SEVENTH SYMPHONY

Though we have here discussed each movement of the Seventh Symphony individually, it is important to bear in mind that they are, of course, intended to be heard as four related sections that make up the whole. It is also crucial to remember that the moments of tension and yearning that we have highlighted above are not isolated moments whose effect is lost in the following bars or phrases, but rather that they are
signposts toward a sense for the infinite that leave the listener with, as Hoffmann attests, ‘one lasting emotion’\textsuperscript{37} of yearning to experience more of it. It seems, therefore, that in discovering the ways in which Beethoven’s Seventh Symphony might be able to create the conditions for an experience of the infinite, we must consider the effect particular moments and features as we have above as well as reflecting upon how those moments and features contribute toward the overall effect of the symphony as a whole.

Arguably, the great effectiveness of this symphony is due in large part to the unity between its movements, which we have noted above. We have already observed the importance of unity in an experience of the infinite, since the individual must be somehow aware of their relatedness to the infinite and long to be fully united with it. Indeed, Schleiermacher places great importance on the idea of unity, which he describes as ‘sublime.’\textsuperscript{38} He describes how ‘everything human is intertwined and made dependent upon one another,’\textsuperscript{39} just as it is in the symphony in which the whole is dependent on the relation of all the parts. Ultimately, Schleiermacher considers that ‘to be one with the infinite in the midst of the finite and to be eternal in a moment, that is the immortality of religion’\textsuperscript{40} – reinforcing the idea that not only must the parts of the symphony be united, but so too must the listener be united with the music itself.

This ‘wondrous and great unity’\textsuperscript{41} is present in the Seventh Symphony. From the outset of the symphony, in the introduction to the first movement, we hear the beginnings of musical ideas that will unite all of the four movements. After its restrained opening, the introduction proceeds to a new subject in bar 23 with the appearance of a new idea in C which is notably longer than the first and more melodically and rhythmically interesting. We notice that the second bar of this idea connects it to the first idea of the introduction, being similarly based on the notes of the triad, albeit ascending rather than descending. Moreover, this entire idea relates to the first by remaining within a range of less than an octave, between an E and a C. Emphasising this idea of relatedness, Grove highlights Dr. H. Reimann’s suggestion that ‘out of this rhythmical figure is developed the principal subject of the Vivace… and, indeed, that all the movements of this work have the closest relation to this passage.’ Furthermore, he goes on to say that it is ‘the

\textsuperscript{37} Hoffmann, “Review,” 250.
\textsuperscript{38} Schleiermacher, \textit{On Religion}, 35.
\textsuperscript{39} Ibid., 40.
\textsuperscript{40} Ibid., 54.
\textsuperscript{41} Ibid., 41.
solitary thematic tie… which runs through the entire composition in various forms.’

Certainly, we do hear the semiquaver rhythm that appears here as part of almost all of the other main themes of the symphony (excluding those of the second movement), and so the assertion that the separate movements and moments that span the entire symphony are united rhythmically seems plausible. Moreover, we have already highlighted how, in each movement, rhythm has a part to play in evoke something of the infinite, be that through creating opposition, repetition, or triumph.

We have an example here of what Hoffmann highlights in his review of the Fifth Symphony, wherein the close relationship between themes sustains the feeling of yearning in the listener. This relationship is all the more evident in bar 34 of the first movement, where the first idea re-enters in the first violin (accompanied by tutti chords in the winds and semiquavers in the strings); however, here it almost becomes a development of the second idea as it modulates to its new key (in which it arrives in bar 42). It would seem that these two ideas are so related that one may even be used to transition and develop the other.

We have seen above how each movement, though different in character, uses similar techniques to express tension and yearning, and we have also suggested that it is the unity between these movements that sustains the listener in a feeling of yearning for the infinite. However, we have also noted the importance of a feeling of being in relation to the infinite, and so this suggests not only that the various elements of the symphony must be united but also that the listener must be in some way related to or united with the music. Arguably, Beethoven achieves this in the Seventh Symphony through his use of the orchestra. Indeed, Grove describes this symphony as one in which ‘the impression of size’ is felt strongly, quoting Mendelssohn – “How the orchestra is treated! What a sound it has!” – in asserting the significance of the orchestra in this symphony. We might certainly argue that the way in which Beethoven uses the orchestra in this symphony contributes towards the impression of the infinite and of yearning that the listener is left with – it is the orchestra that creates both a feeling of limitless possibility in terms of the size that Grove describes, but also appears limited in terms of what the listener strives to perceive beyond its sounds. Therefore, the orchestra is able to create

---

42 Grove, *Beethoven and his nine symphonies*, 242.
unity between the musical themes of the symphony as well as drawing the listener into the musical landscape and causing them to yearn and strive beyond it.

Analysing Beethoven’s Seventh Symphony in this way demonstrates that, although Hoffmann seems to assign particular power to the Fifth Symphony, the creation of yearning through music and the resultant sense of the infinite is not limited to the Fifth Symphony. We have seen how the musical features of the Seventh Symphony are also used to create a feeling of yearning and evoke a sense for the infinite in the listener. Whereas Hoffmann gives special significance to Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony, the presence of yearning in the Seventh suggests that we may look beyond Hoffmann’s preferences to consider how other musical works might evoke a similar sense for the infinite. With this in mind, we now turn to Schubert’s Ninth Symphony to examine this idea more closely.
Tension, Yearning, and Anticipation in Schubert’s Ninth Symphony

In his review of Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony, Hoffmann claims, as we have seen, that the composer has a special ability to evoke a sense for the infinite through music. We have demonstrated that the tension and yearning that Hoffmann identifies in that symphony is not limited to that work alone but is also present in the Seventh Symphony. However, it seems plausible that the features we have identified in these works as being particularly evocative of tension and yearning should not be particular to Beethoven’s music and that we may equally find them in many different works across a number of periods and traditions. As we have already noted, to attempt to discuss all of music’s different periods and traditions together would be a daunting and difficult task because of the vast variations in style and expression across different types of music. Instead, in order to investigate this claim, we will conduct an additional analysis of Schubert’s Ninth Symphony which, given its closeness in period, style, and form to the two Beethoven works discussed earlier, should allow us to extend and test our model of how music is able to create the conditions for an experience of the infinite.

FIRST MOVEMENT

The opening movement of this symphony is in sonata form, with an introduction that spans the first seventy-seven bars. Given its length and importance in relation to the movement as a whole, it appears that ‘to call the Andante section which opens the movement an introduction to the succeeding Allegro ma non troppo is to use terms which no longer hold good; the two are indivisible parts of one complete conception.’¹ Within this Andante, Schubert presents motives and ideas that continue to be important throughout the movement. Most notably, it begins with a horn solo that will prove to be central to the movement and that introduces the dotted rhythmic idea on which many of the subsequent musical passages are based. Not only will we address both of these ideas

below as they are first heard, but we will also continue to notice them throughout our analysis of this movement as they continue to appear and be of importance.

The melody uses an unusual phrasing that is not intuitive to the listener and this, along with ‘its somewhat ambiguous harmonic implications’\(^2\) (the melody seems based in the key of C, though without harmonisation it is impossible for the listener to be sure) create an ‘extraordinary’ sense of strangeness and tension that nevertheless does not cause the listener to be completely alienated from the music, since the duration of the theme – with its echoes and additional bars – maintains a standard eight bar length that does not break with convention.\(^3\) The use of a solo instrument here to begin such a large work immediately creates a feeling of mysteriousness, since opening a symphony with only a single instrument is somewhat unusual – it certainly presents a marked difference from the openings of both of the Beethoven symphonies we have encountered thus far. The horn in particular is an effective choice; Gingerich notes that ‘Schubert’s famous opening melody avoids, or at least does not obviously invoke, the horn’s long-standing associations with hunting and the forest, and more abstractly with distance, absence, regret, separation, and memory;’\(^4\) rather, the opening motive is present and engaging to the listener. By avoiding any association with a particular image or type of music, Schubert is able to keep the listener in anticipation about the nature and character of the symphony, and challenge their expectations from the very opening bars of the work. Discussing the characteristics of the horn solo – ‘it is a unison rather than a choir of horns, and therefore does not feature the typical close thirds and open fifths of horn harmonizations’ – Gingerich concludes that ‘instead, it functions as a herald, a summons: something momentous is about to occur.’\(^5\) From the outset of the symphony, therefore, the music creates in the listener a feeling of expectancy and anticipation about the kind of music that is come, and the experience that such music might express. Through its mysterious nature, the horn solo seems to be announcing something without providing any particular indication of what that might be, and so the yearning that the listener experiences here is to discover the music that the horn announces.

\(^4\) Gingerich, *Schubert’s Beethoven Project*, 216.
\(^5\) Ibid.
From its mysterious beginnings, this melody becomes much more gentle and playful from bar 9, with double winds and pizzicato string accompaniment. Though this passage opens firmly in the tonic key of C, it begins almost immediately to move around different keys, touching upon G major, E minor – which is used for a secondary melody ‘loosely derived from the horn solo’ in bars 17-29 – and A flat, which is used as the basis for the particularly ‘turbulent’ passage in from bar 48. Here, Schubert establishes the musical landscape on which the movement proper will play out and, as we will see, ‘C major, E minor, and G major will be the stations in the Allegro’s three-key exposition, and A flat will be the central pitch of its development. Here, Schubert uses the listeners’ anticipation of the Allegro as the exposition of the movement proper to create a feeling of yearning for it. Not only this, but Schubert also hints to the listener about the nature of this musical landscape by presenting main thematic material in the tonic and closely related keys and the development of (and deviation away from the familiarity of) these ideas in a less closely related key. In other words, before we even reach the movement proper, the listener may already associate certain keys with particular musical ideas and the effect and feeling that they generate. There are certainly places in the introduction where different keys can be heard to underpin and reinforce music that creates very different moods – for instance, we could highlight the contrast between the passages in bars 9-29, a gentle and lyrical melody and counter-melody in viola and cello/bass, and bars 47-57, where the initial horn melody is overcome and dominated by its dotted rhythm, passed around the orchestra between strings, wind, and trombones. The fragmentation of the theme here is further emphasised by rapid changes of dynamic from ff to p every bar and heavy accents that mark the rhythm. The listener yearns for a resolution to this tension and for a return to the familiar landscape of the horn melody, and the keys associated with it.

The Allegro of the exposition begins in bar 78, prepared by a dotted rhythm in the horn and cello/bass that becomes increasingly shortened and agitated. Gingerich suggests that, the continuation of the dotted rhythm notwithstanding, ‘in all other respects it marks a complete contrast’ from the music of the Andante, though the listener hears that Schubert maintains the tonal landscape that has been established in the preceding section

6 Gingerich, Schubert’s Beethoven Project, 216.
7 Ibid., 217.
8 Ibid.
9 Ibid.
by continuing to associate the dotted rhythm of the opening motive with the tonic key of C. Despite the differences between this music and that of the Andante, notably the change in tempo and the prevalent use of a new triplet rhythm that is driven by the bass instruments (see, for example, the bassoon line in bars 80, 84, and 88) the listener can nevertheless engage with this music because of its relation to the horn melody from the movement’s opening and the musical landscape that proceeded from it. In fact, the first theme of the Allegro, with its reliance upon the dotted rhythm with which the listener is already so familiar, arguably gives greater context and meaning to the music of the Andante by demonstrating the importance of the ideas that were introduced there, and by creating in the listener the yearning to return to those initial ideas and melodies, as well as the expectancy that the music may eventually do just that. The continuation of the musical landscape into the Allegro, albeit with the inclusion of many different and contrasting features, creates an experience for the listener that speaks not only to the present but also to the past – the music that has come before – and the future – the music that is to come – and so might be thought of as having an effect that lasts even after the completion of a phrase or theme.

Though the presence of the dotted rhythm is intrinsic to and causes the listener to yearn for the horn melody that introduced the movement, the first section of the Allegro ends emphatically in C (bars 130-132) without returning to it. Given that we might expect to hear such a central theme at this point in the movement, its exclusion is notable and unsettles the listener. Instead, Schubert introduces a ‘dance-like theme in E minor… then a much more rambunctious version of the dance in G major’\(^\text{10}\) which, in spite of the absence of even the dotted rhythm that has been so prominent in this movement thus far, conjure thoughts of the opening motive by belonging to the same harmonic landscape as was introduced in the introduction. The listener continues to be captivated even by these unfamiliar themes because the musical landscape itself is so familiar and well-established, and the tension created here is that of yearning for the return of an idea that seems not to be far away, though not actually present. In fact, though Newbould considers that ‘it would be an exaggeration to say that in light of [the Andante motive]… the first and second subjects are unimportant,’\(^\text{11}\) it would indeed seem that it is the Andante theme for which the listener yearns, which necessarily requires the themes of the

\(^{10}\) Gingerich, *Schubert’s Beethoven Project*, 218.

\(^{11}\) Newbould, *Schubert and the Symphony*, 225.
Allegro to give way. The Andante music certainly dominates the movement, appearing, as Newbould outlines, at all of the major climax points of each section of the sonata form, and returning to end the movement.\textsuperscript{12}

It seems important to consider, therefore, the role played by the Andante theme when it returns at various points over the course of this first movement. Indeed, the themes of the Andante have not disappeared completely from the exposition, and are reintroduced in striking fashion by the trombones. Gingerich considers that ‘in the “Great” C-major Symphony [trombones] play their most important role,’ used by Schubert ‘not only to reinforce orchestral tuttis, but also taking advantage of their distinctive timbre in pianissimo passages, and involved particularly the alto and tenor trombones in carrying the thematic material.’\textsuperscript{13} Trombones have already played an important role in the introduction, taking over the opening motive from the horns in two of the loudest and most intense moments of the movement thus far (the passages from bars 29 and 40). They are scarcer at the beginning of the Allegro, returning in the second subject in a ‘highly dramatic’\textsuperscript{14} transitional moment in bar 199. With the orchestra hushed, and the dance melody having all but disappeared, the trombones – in unison as were the horns at the beginning of the movement – enter with the familiar dotted motive from the opening theme, in whispered and mysterious tones. Following the claim that ‘trombones had long been associated in church music with hell and spiritual awe,’\textsuperscript{15} Gingerich considers that ‘the trombones’ surprising pianissimo entry here invokes all the supernatural, uncanny, and oracular associations the instrument had accrued’ and ‘conjures up many of the horn associations that the opening had neglected; the softly calling trombones sound as from a great distance to remind us that the portentous opening is not forgotten.’\textsuperscript{16} The implications of this trombone entry are greater than the simple reintroduction of an old theme – it confirms the listener’s expectation that this theme had not disappeared completely, and increases their yearning to hear it in its fullness once more. The trombones continue in this way until bar 224, where the rhythm doubles and the listener’s sense of anticipation for the opening theme to return is increased. Once again, we are reminded of the importance of the dotted rhythm in this movement, as a reminder

\textsuperscript{12} Newbould, \textit{Schubert and the Symphony}, 226.
\textsuperscript{13} Gingerich, \textit{Schubert’s Beethoven Project}, 217.
\textsuperscript{14} Ibid., 218.
\textsuperscript{15} Ibid., 217.
\textsuperscript{16} Ibid., 218.
of and a connection with a theme that, as we have suggested above, contains within it the feelings of tension, potential, and something momentous to come.

This movement is certainly striking in its use of rhythm to create not only tension and mystery but also movement and unity between parts. It would seem that ‘the “Great” is as much a celebration of rhythm as Beethoven’s Seventh is.’ With this in mind, Newbould suggests that ‘both Schubert’s first and second subject are more important as pools of rhythmic cells than for their melodic shape. It is for this reason that the second subject can so readily extend itself to become a continuing background texture for the trombone passage… that elements of the first subject can linger on to maintain continuity during the final reprise of the \textit{Andante} theme at the end of the coda.’ In this sense, the musical material of both the first and second subjects acts as a landscape that moves and points towards the \textit{Andante} theme, and facilitates its return which, as we have said, is announced in quiet tones by the trombones. Its reappearance culminates in a cadential figure first introduced in the \textit{Andante} (bars 59-60) which Gingerich refers to as a “jubilus” theme because of the way in which it releases the tension that has built up over the course of the trombone line. This theme relates closely to the dotted motive last heard in the trombones – ‘both are pre-occupied with the second bar of the \textit{Andante} theme, both develop it obsessively, varying its time-scale in the process, and both are huge harmonic excursions whose homecoming is signalled by the triumphantly expansive [cadential figure].’ Newbould suggests that it is particularly this expansion of the motive heard in direct contrast to its ‘diminution’ a few bars earlier that is effective in ‘respectively easing and increasing tension.’ In terms of the experience created for the listener, we might suggest that this is one of expectancy, whereby the subjects of the exposition pointing toward and enabling the return of the dotted motive of the \textit{Andante}, which in turn increases the tension and anticipation through its repetition and the quickening of its rhythm before eventually bursting forth with the ‘jubilus’ cadence figure. Whereas this idea features only once in the \textit{Andante}, here it repeats three times ‘with joyous variants at the second and third hearing’ that reach ever higher in the register. The variations in this theme remind the listener of the myriad of possibilities.

\footnotesize
18 Ibid., 227.
21 Ibid.
22 Ibid.

159
that exist within the musical landscape, seemingly without limit, and create yearning to experience more of them. The listener also yearns for the return of the opening motive in full, as, though the dotted rhythm and the cadence figure are related to it and suggestive of it, they do not represent a true sense of fulfilment.

Beginning at bar 254, the development moves suddenly to the more distant tonal landscape of A flat major, firmly established by a pedal note in the bass and an arpeggiated figure in the other strings. The listener’s expectations of a gradual modulation to a related key (according to the conventions of the musical form) are subverted, and so the development has an immediate feeling of otherness. Tension and instability are created in this music by the moving through keys, the contrast between ‘stable A flat areas and areas that begin and end in A flat but in the meantime are constantly modulating through common tones’ including F minor, D flat major, D minor, and F minor. The key of A flat may seem quite a move away from the previous tonal centres of C major, G major, and E minor, yet it is not completely new to the listener – it has already been introduced by the trombone (in that effective passage from bar 199) and has become ‘indelibly fused’ with the trombone itself. Therefore, though the listener may be moving away from the familiar musical landscape of the Andante and exposition, it would seem that this is a move toward the mystical landscape characterised and heralded by the trombones. This moving closer is emphasised by the return of the earlier dotted motive (here in A flat minor) in the trombones from bar 304. Unlike its previous appearance in this movement, which was quietly mysterious, this motive now comes to the foreground: ‘instead of a haunting reminder out of the hushed distance, it arrives as the dynamic climax of the development section, fortissimo… with additional accents and forzandi.’ It becomes now a more forceful idea, reinforced by the fact that it is now double-dotted and therefore more urgent and pressing as the quaver at the end of its first bar rushes onwards. In this passage, ‘the trombone scale manages to subsume and give retrospective significance to what had seemed merely an innocuous rising-scale version of the Allegro theme’s dotted rhythm [from bar 268]… which had functioned as just one of several engines driving the gradual build-up to the climax of the trombone scale.’

Here, unlike in the exposition, the dotted rhythm is not only the build-up to the climax...

---

23 Gingerich, Schubert’s Beethoven Project, 220.
24 Ibid.
25 Ibid., 221.
26 Ibid., 221-222.
but the climax itself – this is the musical landscape for which the listener has yearned, which was first introduced from a distance in the exposition. The listener can appreciate, retrospectively, the music in between these two passages as movement from distance towards fulfilment, which is represented by the trombone motive. In this sense, ‘once the trombones enter, their new scale retrospectively confirms the kinship between the introductory horn theme and the main Allegro theme.’ The significance of the trombone’s relationship to this theme is highlighted in bars 326-339, in which it is passed around the wind instruments, unable to settle. The listener recognises that the theme is at its most powerful when played by the trombone (or, occasionally, the horn) and so this remains a musical landscape dominated by the brass.

The development section of this movement demonstrates our earlier argument that the subjects of the Allegro are most effective as signposts and enablers of the Andante themes, and ‘confirms that paramount importance of the opening horn melody and its trombone-based offspring.’ Schubert does use the other ideas that have been introduced in the exposition, such as the repeated sextuplets, but ‘they have the effect of isolated, disembodied traits that cannot conjure the driving vitality of [the Andante] theme.’ We are now firmly in the world of that which was once distant, brought to life in the trombone and the Andante theme in which the music finds its climax. Not only does this theme sound closer and more present to the listener, it also continues to reveal itself – ‘while all the other themes recede to pale shadows, the trombone theme alone grows in complexity, depth, and range,’ moving through a series of modulations. The listener becomes more aware of the strength of this motive; it is no longer a simple solo melody as it was heard at the beginning of the movement but seems now to be the goal of the movement for which the listener yearns and strives. Gingerich emphasises once more the significance of the role played by the trombones in shaping the power and effectiveness of this theme (which is striking even if one is unaware of the connotations of the instruments that are mentioned above); they ‘first made the theme their own in the exposition when they entered by calling softly to each other from a distance, and they reappear in the development playing as loudly as possible and leading an aggressive orchestra charge to A flat major. In the exposition they initiated a rising dynamic and

27 Gingerich, Schubert’s Beethoven Project, 222.
28 Ibid., 223.
29 Ibid.
30 Ibid., 224.
registral arc that culminated in the “jubilus”; in the development the trombones completed a rising dynamic a registral arc that culminated in A flat.\textsuperscript{31} In the exposition, the listener learns of and yearns for a musical landscape that is, both thematically and harmonically, beyond reach, and though the ‘jubilus’ theme reaches beyond its melodic line and trombones suggest A flat, fulfilment does not come. In the development, on the other hand, the listener is granted a glimpse into that landscape suggested at by the Andante and Allegro, where the goal key of A flat is prominent and the trombone motive comes to the fore, completing a journey from the familiar to the strange that has captivated the listener. In this sense, Schubert uses a familiar form that operates in an unfamiliar way – whereas usually the exposition introduces central themes from which the development moves away, here it is the exposition that holds the listener back from themes that are heard in their fullest form in the development.

Thus far, the first movement of Schubert’s ‘Great’ Symphony has used the brass to express a theme, based around a central dotted rhythm, that has created an initial feeling of yearning, distance, and otherness for the listener, culminating in passages in the development in which these feelings are intensified and then, to some extent, fulfilled through the new assertiveness of the trombone motive. This assertiveness and the closeness of the motive to the listener is, nonetheless, short-lived since, as the movement transitions to the recapitulation, the Andante theme is heard separately from the brass, played instead by the low strings without the climactic intensity of its earlier sounding. It is almost as if the landscape into which the listener has been afforded a privileged glimpse has retreated once more. Indeed, the ‘subdued, lyrical repetition of the whole course of the bombastic, clamorous climax also has about it a whiff of chastened resignation, of recognition that the goal of that climax, A flat, has at least for the moment nothing further to offer, and the pre-ordained responsibility of returning to G and the duty of recapitulating must now be accepted.’\textsuperscript{32} In other words, the listener now realises that the time has come to descend from the mountain, as it were, and return to the familiar landscape to yearn for another experience of the mystical Andante theme in its authentic form.

\textsuperscript{31} Gingerich, \textit{Schubert’s Beethoven Project}, 224-225.
\textsuperscript{32} Ibid., 225.
Continuing in muted tones, the recapitulation begins with ‘an air of urgent stealth;’ it is a ‘quiet staging area’ for the drama and tension that is to follow into the Coda and which the listener yearns to move beyond. Indeed, the entire recapitulation is wrought with this tension as Schubert subverts listener expectations in his use of themes and keys – having reached the tonic of C, the listener is then taken away almost immediately to A minor which, as Gingerich points out, is ‘the “wrong” order – the tonic should come last according to the “sonata principle.”’ The effect is that the listener anticipates some sort of fulfilment and resolution of the tension of the movement, an expectation that is quashed by the music’s continuation in a key that will not bring closure. Crucially, closure and resolution are delayed, which only heightens the listener’s feeling of yearning.

It would seem that, despite the return of the ‘jubilus’ theme at the end of the recapitulation, closure can only be achieved in this movement by returning to and fulfilling its most central and lasting theme – the horn melody that opened the Andante and has been shown to characterise much of the movement. We can certainly suggest, as Gingerich does, that this melody not only influences the music of the exposition and development sections that follow it, but also gains retrospective meaning precisely because of its importance throughout the movement. Given that, after its initial appearance in the horns, this melody has been heard only in variations (such as the rhythmic trombone motive or the expanded ‘jubilus’ theme), it seems plausible that the listener should yearn throughout the movement to hear the melody in full once more. Schubert ‘wanted a grand cyclic return – closure by the way of the opening horn music,’ which is what the listener also longs for.

This movement’s lengthy Coda increases the tension and anticipation of the return of the horn melody by way of ‘new harmonic tension and uncertainty’ focused around C#, whose ‘only comparable precedents in the symphony are the trombone passages leading to the “jubilus” as well as in the development, with their strings of common-tone modulations and enharmonic shape shifting.’ Here, although the familiar trombone motive is not present, the listener is reminded of it by way of the harmonic landscape and

33 Gingerich, Schubert’s Beethoven Project, 226.
34 Ibid.
35 Ibid., 225.
36 Ibid., 227.
37 Ibid.
anticipates its return all the more because of the way in which Schubert seems to so closely relate C# with the key of A flat, which has been connected to the motive in other parts of the movement. In this way, the harmonic structure not only increases the tension by delaying the return of the theme, it also represents ‘a last moment tonal reckoning with the A flat trombone variants of the opening horn melody before the final massive return of the melody itself.’

This return finally comes in bar 662, a broad melody that contrasts so completely with the *staccato* crotchets and quavers of the preceding bars that it seems to belong to a different musical landscape altogether. Since its first hearing at the opening of the movement, this theme has become like a distant memory to the listener, existing either in shortened variations on the dotted motive in the trombone part or as an extended motive that reaches out beyond itself – the ‘jubilus’ theme. This is the first time the melody has been heard in full since the opening bars of the *Andante*, and is arguably the fulfilment of the proclaiming, heralding horn melody at this opening as well as the multiple fragmented reappearances in the trombones over the course of the movement. As the fulfilling and closing theme of the movement, it now differs greatly from the opening horn melody (though, as Gingerich points out, both the key and the melody remain the same.) In the Coda, all the instruments of the orchestra participate in the theme, as if the horn of the opening had gathered them here for this very purpose. Where before it was quiet and mysterious, now the theme is strident and powerful, emphasised by *fz* accents, a *ben marcato* marking, and double-dotted crotchets. This dotted rhythm is now no longer an echo (as it was heard in bar 3 of the opening) but an integral and dominant part of the theme. The fourth bar of the opening horn melody is removed here, so that the theme moves ever onward with resolve toward the final cadence. The listener is also spurred on by these modifications to the theme, and, now that their longing for the return of the theme has been fulfilled, they yearn for it to bring closure in the final cadence. Moreover, they yearn for the ultimate resolution of the theme, which is not brought about even on its return in bar 662. There are remnants of other themes also at play here, with the sextuplets of the first subject continuing to play a prominent role in the brass. Nor is it completely fulfilled in the strings, which, though they provide a strong tonic pedal for

---

38 Gingerich, *Schubert’s Beethoven Project*, 227. He notes Schubert’s use of both sharp and flat notes to notate C#: for example, in bar 597.
39 Ibid.
40 Ibid., 231.
the melody, are not in union with it and instead play strongly-accented crotchets. Perhaps most striking, the trombones persist with the dotted motive that has been theirs throughout the movement, and so also remain somewhat at odds with the theme. Though it is this theme in its entirety for which the listener has been yearning over the course of the movement, there is a feeling that its reappearance here does not necessarily provide the closure that is yearned for. Schubert thus holds the listener in a state of anticipation to the very end of the movement.

In bar 672 ‘the monumental block [of the returning theme] is now split both temporally and textually by the responsorial interchange between the strings, punching out the stripped-down essence of the tune,’ before, finally, closure in the form of the 

tutti

response. At this point, all instruments are reconciled to the theme – gone are the crotchet pedal notes and the trombones’ persistence with the dotted motive, and the sextuplets exist only to give momentum to the final cadence. It is a unified and celebratory ending to the movement; the listener is reminded of the uncertainty and mysteriousness of the opening, when this theme first made its appearance, and it seems that, not only is this ending a fulfilment of the opening bars, but it also transforms the listener’s experience of the tension and yearning that has led to this point. Once an obstacle to be overcome, the music that has created such tension and yearning throughout the course of the movement now appears as an essential part of reaching the fulfilment of the final bars. Arguably, without the struggle and tension inherent in the music, the triumphant nature of the theme at the end of the movement would be less apparent – it feels so triumphant precisely because of what it has overcome. In this way, this movement demonstrates how themes can be used to create tension and yearning and how these feelings of tension and yearning can transform an experience of a theme and bring it to fulfilment.

SECOND MOVEMENT

In the second movement, Schubert uses contrasting themes to create two musical landscapes that the listener inhabits simultaneously. Suurpaa identifies these as ‘march’

---

41 Gingerich, Schubert’s Beethoven Project, 231.
and ‘pastoral’ and views them as being representative of ‘order’ and ‘a hoped-for illusion’ respectively. This juxtaposition of order and something-yearned-for places these two themes in clear opposition and is the primary source of tension and yearning for the listener in this movement because it represents the feeling of longing to reach beyond the familiar toward other possible experiences. In terms of musical landscapes, the two themes create different musical landscapes to which the listener relates simultaneously – it is a relationship and tension between the rational, orderly, and the strange, yearned-for. If we are to understand the creation of tension in this movement in this way, we must first understand the musical features that give each theme its distinct character.

The first theme, which opens the movement, is unmistakably march-like, though with none of the grandeur and ceremony of a military march. Instead, a solitary oboe states the theme over a steady quaver accompaniment in the strings that creates a feeling of orderly progression. The theme itself is reminiscent of the first movement, with its dotted rhythm that is, here, spiky and bouncy. It is interesting that Schubert once more uses a solo instrument for the initial exposition of the theme – whereas in the first movement, the solo horn had a heraldic effect, the solo oboe of the second movement has a personal quality, like a voice that speaks directly to the listener. In doing this, it suggests that the music that follows, and in particular the music of this theme as it reappears over the course of the movement, will be somehow entwined with the experience of the individual.

Contrasting the dotted rhythm is a motive of crotchets that intersperses the theme and contributes toward its strident character. With the same note repeated two or four times, this motive reinforces the orderliness and rigidity of the theme despite the jaunty character of the dotted rhythm that also belongs to it. It also emphasises the 2/4 time signature of the movement – this is a theme that clearly illustrates and highlights the music’s temporal time frame, almost as if the music is counting the time that it takes. The effect for the listener is that the music sounds and feels strongly connected to the world that they inhabit, it seems to reinforce rather than transcend their earthly experience. Though this does not necessarily create a feeling of yearning in itself, it provides a clear

---

contrast with the pastoral theme which does in turn, as we will explore further below, generate such a feeling.

In fact, the second subject of the march theme, beginning in bar 24, does attempt to break out of the rigidity of the march itself and gives a hint of what might be possible beyond that musical landscape. Heard in a hopeful A major, it breaks away from the dotted rhythm in legato phrases with gentle crotchets that reach out toward another musical landscape, a music that transcends that of the march theme. The march theme has not been forgotten completely, however, with reminders both in the insistent demisemiquavers in the bass and the crotchets in bar 29 that so closely echo those that form such an integral part of the march theme. After only six bars, the musical landscape of the march intrudes once more with its heavily accented quavers and dotted rhythms. Not only does the crotchet motive return (for example, in bar 33) but it gains a sense of urgency when the rhythm doubles from bar 38, notably in the trombones, which have been seen earlier to have a certain transcendent significance in this music. This, along with the sudden changes and contrasts between dynamics that take place every few bars (including some of the loudest moments of the movement so far), give the impression that the music is striving toward some kind of fulfilment, and in turn intensifies the listener’s yearning to break away from the order and rigidity of the march theme. The second subject has suggested that there is another musical landscape beyond the march and, though it was itself unable to overcome it, this suggestion is central to creating the feeling of yearning that the listener is sustained in throughout the course of this theme.

As we have highlighted above, this march theme, while upbeat and jaunty, cannot plausibly be thought of as being particularly triumphant or fulfilling. Originally heard as a solo, it does build between bars 43 and 82 to include more explosive tutti moments, though these can be heard more as another attempt to break away from the orderliness of the theme than as a reinforcement of it. Ultimately, however, this is not a theme that ends strongly, dying away with a partial recounting of the second subject and eventually reduced only to the crotchet motive, repeated four times on descending notes in the bass.

Immediately following these repeated crotchets we enter the pastoral theme (bar 93) which is in stark contrast to the march. Perhaps the most notable difference is the overall character of this new theme, which is legato and much more lyrical than the march. Introduced by bassoon and double bass at a pianissimo dynamic, the pastoral theme gives
the feeling that it is emerging timidly from some hidden place that is only now coming into view. Unlike the march theme, which sounds clearly and unmistakeably from its first bar, the pastoral theme comes into being gradually, with clarinets and first violins joining in bar 97 and all winds and strings playing from bar 101. The effect is twofold – not only does it sustain the listener in a feeling of yearning for the musical possibilities that this new theme might hold, but it also suggests a level of complexity and a feeling of meandering that is not present in the march theme. The harmonic structure of this pastoral theme contributes to its intricacy; it is in F major, in contrast to the prevalent minor tonality of the march theme, though with a use of chromaticism that enables the theme to stray from its tonal centre. Such chromatic passages as those in bars 101-104 demonstrate the fluidity of this theme in comparison to the march – it is, as Suurpaa claims, the very opposite of the orderliness and rigidity that has come before. The listener therefore recognises this theme as one in which anything might reasonably occur, one that reaches beyond the familiar and orderly to new possibilities. While in one sense the pastoral theme resolves the listener’s feeling of yearning for the overcoming of the march theme by being so notably different from it, in another it sustains the listener’s yearning by providing a glimpse of a musical landscape of freedom and possibility, causing the listener to long to pursue these possibilities. We cannot, therefore, think of the pastoral theme as a complete fulfilment of the tension and yearning that has built up over the course of the march theme, but rather we might view it as a privileged glance into a landscape that offers so much more than the march theme and sustains the listener in yearning to experience more of what it has to offer.

Even the way in which the pastoral theme interacts with time provides an interesting and effective contrast with the march theme. Whereas the march creates the impression of keeping time, moving steadily forward by means of repeated quavers in the accompaniment, the pastoral theme is much more fluid in its interaction with time and the temporal world. For example, the gentle syncopation in the cello line removes any feeling of rigidity that the march has created and goes some way toward removing the pastoral theme’s ties to the temporal world. Of course, this theme does rely upon and exist within time, though the way in which Schubert uses rhythm as well as various melodies and counter melodies here creates an effect that is in stark contrast to the ticking clock of the march rhythms. The listener feels that the pastoral theme exists outside of the familiar time frame that characterises the march and so is somehow other-
worldly, and this recognition of its other-worldliness in turn leads to the increased feeling of yearning to know better and to experience the landscape that the pastoral theme creates.

Mentioned above are the counter melodies that give the pastoral theme so much of its colour and character; they also create a feeling of space in the theme that was not previously present in the march theme. Beginning with a relatively sparse texture using only bassoon, second violin, cello, and bass, other instruments soon join with counter melodies of ever-increasing rhythmic complexity until, by bar 101, all the winds and strings have become involved in the theme. Not only do the counter melodies contribute toward the intricate and mysterious quality of the theme, they also create a feeling of expansiveness through the way in which they are passed around the orchestra. The interaction between different instruments, and particularly the pairing of wind and string instruments as at the beginning of this theme, enfold and encompass the listener so that they feel they are at the heart of the theme itself – Schubert creates this contrast with the clear solo/accompaniment structure of the march theme. The call and response between strings and wind in bars 104 and 105 is a particularly notable example of how the theme is passed around the orchestra to create this enfolding effect. In this way, the listener is able to relate just as much to the pastoral theme, despite its other-worldly character, as to the orderliness of the march theme, which correlates more closely with their own experiences of time and the world. The pastoral theme uses a variety of melodic and counter melodic ideas, each based upon intricate rhythms, to draw the listener into the heart of the theme and therefore feel at home within its landscape. That is not to say, however, that the pastoral theme becomes as familiar to the listener as the music of the march – it retains an element of mysteriousness that is perhaps best demonstrated by the introduction of the trombone and horn from bar 105. In fact, the trombone even takes up the counter melody in bar 113 and, significantly, echoes the last remnants of the pastoral theme as it dies away in bar 145. The prominence of the trombone in this theme and at this key point highlights the “hoped-for illusion”43 that the pastoral theme represents – a glimpse of a musical landscape that looks beyond the strict order and rigidity of the march theme.

Like the march theme, the pastoral theme does not end in fulfilment, nor does it offer the listener any sense of having achieved the goal of their yearning – this remains a ‘hoped-for illusion.’ Schubert does not end the pastoral theme clearly; whereas the march ends when its elements become too dominant for the melody to continue, the pastoral theme simply fades away. In the accompaniment, the rhythmic elements of the march theme have already begun to signal its return from bar 137 with the introduction of a familiar dotted rhythm in the viola line. The winds and, notably, the mysterious trombone, cling to the pastoral theme, echoing a fragment of its opening phrase before the oboe restores order in the form of the march theme in bar 160. As we have noticed, the boundaries of the march and pastoral theme are blurred; neither is neatly contained or marked out. This means that the listener does not feel that either theme reaches fulfilment since neither is allowed to reach a strong cadential conclusion. Yearning is created, therefore, not only in the contrast between the two main themes of this movement that represent the order of the temporal world and the longed-for movement beyond it, but also by the way in which these two themes fade in and out of each other, achieving no cadential resolution.

Both Newbould and Suurpaa comment on the unusual structure of this movement, which might be thought of as sonata form without development. This means that the familiarity, orderliness, and persistence of the march theme is emphasised on its return because it remains in the same key as heard previously. The listener is in no doubt that the musical landscape of striving and possibility represented by the pastoral theme has retreated, and the rigid worldliness of the march becomes present once more. However, despite the consistency in its tonality, the march theme undergoes a variety of simple yet effective alterations on its return, particularly as regards its rhythm. Embellished by a violin line, joined and emphasised from bar 167 by horn and trombone, which features staccato and accented demisemiquavers and dotted semiquavers, the march is given an air of increased urgency and of striving to return to the rhythmic freedom and diversity of the pastoral theme. Indeed, the march theme at this point sounds notably less restrained than in its exposition and feels almost as though it has been affected by the presence of the pastoral theme. There is tension here not only between the characters of the two juxtaposing themes but also in the more pressing and frantic nature of the rhythms when the march theme returns. With this feeling of increased urgency comes a feeling of increased yearning in the listener, who anticipates the fulfilment that the march theme
now seems so anxious to reach. The trombone continues to play an important role in sustaining this feeling of yearning through its connection with the infinite – when the second subject of the march returns, its melodic line that reaches and strives beyond the orderliness of the march proper is harmonised by a smooth legato line in the trombone that reinforces the feeling of yearning to move beyond the march that this second subject represents.

As the march theme continues and its rhythms become more dominant, the pastoral theme feels increasingly distant. For example, from bar 226, the repeated crotchet motive begins to take over, and the dotted rhythms in the strings and demisemiquavers in the brass become more insistent and almost frenzied. The melody is completely lost as the march theme succumbs to its component parts, which become more and more detached with staccato and accented notes. This music could not be further from the pastoral theme, though the memory of the lyrical lines of that theme remain nevertheless, sustaining the listener in a feeling of ever-intensifying yearning for the return of the pastoral and the overcoming of the rigidity and orderliness of the march theme. We might even consider that, although the music here is very different from the pastoral theme, the memory of and yearning for the pastoral theme is at its strongest here, since a similar intensification of the march theme’s rhythms immediately preceded it in the exposition. The listener can reasonably anticipate that the pastoral theme is consequently within their grasp once more. It would seem, therefore, that it is at the points where the contrast between themes and ideas is most marked that the listener experiences yearning at its most intense.

The pastoral theme does make its return in bar 267 in A major, reconciling it to the second subject of the march theme. Whereas its exposition emerged slowly and simply, the return of the pastoral theme has a much fuller and varied texture. Accompanying the gentle melody are bubbling semiquavers in second violin and viola, as well as upbeat offbeat notes in the first violin. Here, the pastoral theme demonstrates once more that it is as a landscape of seemingly endless musical possibilities. The running semiquavers in the strings (joined by the cello in bar 282) propel the melody onwards and cause the listener to yearn to experience more of what this theme has to offer. Once more, the diversity and vibrancy of the pastoral theme highlight and transcend the rigidity and orderliness of the march theme. It has an added excitement in its reappearance here too, particularly in the jovial pizzicato quavers in cello and bass and off-beat semiquavers,
such as those in bar 269, in violins. It has an electricity that maintains the listener in a state of anticipation and yearning for the climax and fulfilment of this theme.

As we have illustrated, Schubert creates tension and a subsequent feeling of yearning in the second movement of this symphony through the juxtaposition of these two march and pastoral themes, which, following Suurpaa, we have understood to be representative of order and something hoped-for beyond that ordered musical landscape. The interplay and contrast between these two themes sustains a feeling of yearning throughout the movement, which is either a feeling of yearning to break out of the rigidity of the march theme or to glimpse yet more of the hoped-for music of the pastoral theme. By the end of the movement, the march theme has taken over once more, and here its rhythmic ideas are at their most emphatic. The theme is truncated and emphasis is placed on its orderly character – in particular, the listener notices that both the crotchet and dotted ideas that belong to this theme are repeated more often than in the original version of the theme, and generating a notable feeling of oppression and domination. Similarly, the gentle joy heard earlier in the movement is eradicated when the second subject of this theme returns but is cut short; it no longer reaches hopefully but instead dejectedly descends (see bars 359-362) and gradually fades back into familiar ideas from the march theme. Here, the listener senses that the end must be near, yet at the same time it seems frustratingly out of reach; the thematic ideas that have earlier been used as cadential figures and seem here also to want to bring the music to a close overlap and interrupt each other, delaying the resolution that the final cadence would bring. Just as the listener longs for the fulfilment and resolution of this movement, so too does the music itself appear to be becoming impatient with triplets in the violin and oboe parts. Ultimately, it is the crotchet motive of the march theme that has the last word in the movement, reinforcing once more of the rigidity of that musical landscape. The dominance of this motive and landscape is emphasised by sudden and unsettling changes in dynamics – the pianissimo dynamic is interrupted in bars 371 and 373 by a forceful fortissimo that again strongly suggests resolution and completion. At this point, it has become clear to the listener that the movement will resolve in the minor mode, with all memory of the striving pastoral theme having been eradicated. The movement ends quietly and subdued with restatements of the crotchet idea in trombones, horns, and wind, dying away each time. The effect is the precise opposite of that of the ending of the first movement – here, instead of a theme transformed and fulfilled by tension it has overcome, the listener encounters a theme that
is so dominated by its rhythmic elements that it is eventually swallowed by them. There is no triumphant restatement of the theme in this movement; instead, it has been defeated and tension, rather than fulfilment, becomes the lasting effect of the movement.

THIRD MOVEMENT

Newbould comments on the sense of scale of the third movement, noting that it ‘ventures a heavier scoring than any equivalent movement in a classical symphony. It is not simply a matter of the inclusion of trombones. In the scherzo itself, Schubert tends to throw the whole weight of the string section, in octave-unisons, against the massed wind forces.’ This is evident from the outset, where the whole orchestra is immediately involved in the theme. The scherzo opens with a conversation between wind and strings, creating a sense of space and vastness in the theme that seems to encompass the listener. Schubert introduces this theme as one of contrast – whereas the strings are unified and strong with a forte dynamic, the wind are more scattered, hesitant, and piano. The contrast between the two instrumental groups gives the scherzo a feeling of playfulness, though the listener longs also to hear the theme united by the full force of the orchestra. By presenting the scherzo theme initially as a conversation between strings and wind, Schubert hints at a unity that might be to come, yet withholds it for the time being, thereby creating tension even in what appears to be a more upbeat movement. Like the themes of the second movement, the third movement’s scherzo contains several strong rhythmic ideas that contribute to its character, chiefly detached staccato quavers and crotchets. Whereas the staccato character of Beethoven’s scherzo in the Seventh Symphony lends the movement a lively and light-hearted quality, in Schubert’s movement the effect is more cumbersome, particularly as heard in unison in strings and with an fz accent on the final bar of the phrase.

The first subject of the scherzo therefore creates a feeling of tension by delaying the unification of the orchestra and using different instrumental groups to portray contrasting variations of the theme, one in the strings that feels heavy and cumbersome and the other in the wind that is more gentle and fragile. The scherzo theme seems to be striving for

44 Newbould, Schubert and the Symphony, 234.
unity and a bringing-together of the orchestra, and the listener too yearns for this and the
resolution it would bring. It is almost as though the theme has not been revealed entirely
because it has only been heard as different parts of a conversation between instruments;
the listener has not experienced its true nature but only grasped at some of its
characteristics. From bar 23, the music becomes more agitated, with the bringing-
together of wind and strings for the first time – albeit with different rhythms – and the
melody ascends chromatically toward an emphatic cadence in G, the dominant key of the
movement and the key in which the second subject is heard. Harmonically, Schubert
does not do anything dramatic that would lead to a feeling of tension and yearning in the
listener. However, as we have demonstrated, it would seem that yearning is a part of this
scherzo from its outset and that is created primarily through the interaction between
instruments and the differing ways in which the theme is presented by these
instruments.

The rhythmic ideas of the first subject are also present in the second as
accompaniment in the winds. The use of these ideas in this way does go some way
toward creating a sense of fulfilment and resolution in that it reveals something more of
the scherzo that was suggested in the opening bars. Whereas the quaver and crotchet
rhythms might previously have been associated with disunity and disjointedness, here
they become part of a new and more exciting and diverse passage. The melody here is
more legato but no less motivated – in fact, we might even consider it to be more
purposeful than the staccato of the first subject. It is propelled forward not only by the
rhythms of the first subject but also by pressing interjections by second violin and viola.
The melody in first violin reaches higher and higher with every phrase, finally reaching
its climax in bar 43 on a D, the dominant note of the scale. It is joined after a few bars by
the full string section in octave-unison, intensifying the
experience of striving for the
goal that is the climactic note. The sense of forward motion and of reaching toward a
goal is intensified by the interplay between violin and cello; the melody is begun again in
the cello four bars after it is heard in the violin, almost like a round, and the effect is of
the cello melody chasing the violin melody, urging it forward. The second subject ends
with a reiteration of the now familiar quaver-crotchet idea, which feels more secure, and
perhaps fulfilled, by virtue of its use as accompaniment during the course of the second
subject, the long crescendo to fortissimo, and the tutti that Schubert employs at this point.
In this respect the second subject resolves some of the tension that existed in the disunity
of the first subject, though it does not overcome it altogether and can still be seen to include musical ideas of striving and yearning for fulfilment.

The theme opens again, after its repeat, in bar 57 in the distant key of A flat, a clear signal from Schubert that the scherzo is moving from one harmonically stable landscape to one that is perhaps more unstable and unpredictable. Immediately, the tension and uncertainty of the opening section of the scherzo returns, emphasised here by the changes that Schubert makes to the phrasing. Whereas the opening of the movement is in clearly marked four bar phrases, here the phrases feel less structured and more irregular. There is a strong tutti at the beginning of this section that quickly fragments once more, dividing wind and strings as at the beginning of the movement. This coming-apart of the orchestra has a great deal to do with the changed character of the phrasing, as the listener notes how, once clearly separated, the wind and strings now interrupt each other’s phrases. The mood as the scherzo develops is consequently one of striving restlessness.

Newbould identifies two distinct parts to the development: the first in A flat, and a second that ‘takes the broken-chord offshoot of the second subject, inverts it so that it sweeps up then down, and extends each cycle of it from four bars to six’ and moves through the tonal areas of D flat major, C sharp minor, A major, D minor, and G major.45 Both the A flat major section and the following, more tonally diverse, section are preoccupied with the scherzo’s quaver and crotchet rhythmic idea and so the character of the scherzo is here repetitive and relentless. There is a brief respite from this repetition in the form of a short melodic theme, previously unheard, that is taken up by flute and then oboe and violins between the two sections of the development. Its lyrical character reminds the listener of the second subject, which represents relief from the relentlessness of the quaver-crotchet idea that now dominates. Initially heard in C flat major in the flute, there is a ‘sudden, magical Schubertian shift up a semitone to C major.’ Furthermore, ‘the addition of an oboe to the violin line… adds edge to the violin tone and makes this second appearance of this new eight-bar theme (which is never to be heard again) seem to inhabit a quite different landscape from the first.’46 Indeed, the unification of wind and strings in this way, and particularly in unison, is quite different from the opposition between these two families of the orchestra that has been commonplace for much of the movement up to this point. The appearance of this new, unexpected idea in

45 Newbould, Schubert and the Symphony, 236.
46 Ibid.
the midst of such oppressive repetition of the quaver-crotchet motive suggests a musical landscape beyond the one in which the listener is currently trapped, one in which rhythmic repetition gives way to lyrical expression and freedom of sorts. It is a reminder to the listener of the kind of music for which they strive, and to which the movement itself seems to be striving to return. This is only a very short passage, yet an example of one in which tension and yearning are perhaps most prominent in the movement; having created tension through the repetition of rhythmic ideas in the key of A flat, Schubert then brings to the fore once more music that is so similar in character to the second subject that it seems to hold the same promise of fulfilment and unification that the second subject brought. There is only a glimpse of this promise, however, before it gives way once again to the relentless rhythmic motive as it moves restlessly through a myriad of different keys. For the listener, the brief glimpse of the musical landscape that exists beyond, and in spite of, the tension of music around it creates the feeling of yearning to experience more of it. It would appear that Newbould is quite right to suggest that this new idea belongs to a ‘different landscape,’ and it is a landscape to which the listener also yearns to belong. This yearning is emphasised from bar 113 where, as the theme begins to rove through different keys, echoes of the second subject can be heard in the strings, reaching upward beyond the quavers and crotchets. There is a feeling that these two subjects of the scherzo theme that were once unified are now fighting against one another as they strive for fulfilment and resolution.

This is indeed a movement of great proportions – we have seen already how instrumentation is used to create a feeling of size, and the scherzo itself lasts for 238 bars (without repeats). The trio immediately follows a strong final restatement of the quaver-crotchet motive, and from its outset creates a noticeably different mood. There is no marking to indicate a change of tempo, yet ‘the immediate impression is of a daring largeness of phrase…the music flows more broadly, in larger conceptual spans,’ and the strong rhythmic music of the scherzo that seemed to mark time is gone. After the staccato repetition of quavers and crotchets, the sustained melodic line of the trio presents a marked difference and a release of the tension and yearning that has built up over the course of the scherzo. The grandeur of the trio theme is highlighted by its introduction in horns and trombones – a take on the repeated crotchets of the scherzo that is transformed into a heraldic dotted rhythm. Given Schubert’s use of brass, and

---

particularly trombones, to denote especially infinite points in the symphony thus far, it does not seem insignificant that they are used here to announce the trio. Though the melodic line of the trio is certainly broader and more tranquil than that of the scherzo, it is not static, but rather is propelled forward by ongoing dotted rhythms in horns and trombones and broken chords in the strings. Overall, the trio represents a much more stable and unified landscape than the scherzo and for this reason could well be thought of as the fulfilment and resolution of the tension created by the relentless repetition of the scherzo theme, and as bringing an end to the yearning that subsequently exists in the movement up to this point. As a result, the trio itself is generally free from the feelings of tension and yearning that have been present during the scherzo and that have also characterised much of the previous movements.

Although it feels much more expansive, the trio is shorter in length than the scherzo at about 115 bars long, meaning that it is the rhythmic repetition and tension of the scherzo that is most prominent in the listener’s experience. This is emphasised by the immediate repetition of the scherzo in full to finish the movement – the respite and fulfilment that the trio represents is ultimately overcome by the obsessive and relentless rhythm that dominates the movement.

FOURTH MOVEMENT

The final movement of Schubert’s Ninth Symphony opens in triumphant unity, with all instruments (except the timpani, which are silent) in both octave and rhythmic unison. Here, the music feels ceremonial and heraldic, with dotted and triplet rhythms that clearly state the tonic key of C with strong and emphatic articulation. This tonic key ‘holds sway for a long period, giving way to the dominant for the second subject only late in the day;’\textsuperscript{48} in fact, so strong is the tonic key at the beginning of this movement that we hear no other chord than that of C major for the first fifteen bars of music. We might recall the mystery and uncertainty of the symphony’s beginnings with the \textit{Andante} of the opening movement, which now appears transformed and fulfilled by the certainty of the fourth movement’s opening bars. This first theme of the fourth movement, built as it is upon the

\textsuperscript{48} Newbould, \textit{Schubert and the Symphony}, 238.
rhythmic elements of the dotted quavers and the triplets that answer them, seems to be announcing something, though what that might be is hidden from the listener for now. Therefore, though this movement gives the impression of triumph and ceremony, tension is present still in the anticipation that is created by this heraldic theme.

Tension is present, for instance, in the passage between bars 36 and 89, where the music seems to be building up toward some kind of goal or climax. An ascending melodic line, quite different to the strongly articulated rhythms that have gone before, strives forward with a chromaticism that delays closure and suggests that achieving this goal will not be a straightforward process. With each repetition of this ascending phrase the experience becomes more intense due to the addition of more and more instruments – first clarinet, then flute, and eventually tutti by bar 85. Whereas in previous movements we have noted that tension exists in the interplay between different themes, here it seems that Schubert relies more obviously on the interplay between different key areas to create tension, as it is finally revealed that the goal of this passage for which the music – and the listener – strives is the tonic key of C, once more delivered and emphasised by the rhythmic opening theme. Of course, Schubert uses harmony to create tension in all four of this symphony’s movements, though whereas in the other movements different keys are used to present various themes, here in the fourth movement it seems that it is the theme that is being used to showcase the key. Such is the importance of harmony in this movement – it is thus that Schubert demonstrates that this is a musical landscape in which the listener may feel comfortable and at home. The kind of tension that the listener experiences in this movement also differs from that which characterises the previous movements (particularly the first and second movements), in which the listener yearns to overcome one musical landscape to experience another. Rather, the fourth movement offers the excited anticipation of the musical possibilities that might exist now that this triumphant musical landscape has been established.

As the music becomes increasingly rhythmic and excited, D major prepares us to move to the dominant, G major, for the second subject, hammered home by timpani and trombone from bar 157. Schubert ushers the listener smoothly through the musical landscape with one exception – a rather surprising two-bar silence that immediately precedes the second subject. After all the preparation and anticipation of the first subject, this silence contradicts the listener’s expectation, effectively shifting the ground under their feet. It is a reminder of the delicate intangibility of the musical landscape; though
the harmony signals stability and certainty, Schubert constructs the rhythmic and melodic material in such a way that the listener is unsure as to what might happen next. Thus this movement presents a juxtaposition of certainty and uncertainty whereby the harmonic structure of the movement functions as a clear signpost to the listener of what the next step might be, yet the themes themselves, being so intensely rhythmic and separated as they are by two bars of silence, provide no clues to the listener about that might come next or when fulfilment might be achieved.

After the silence, during which the listener is held in a state of increased tension and anticipation about how the movement might proceed, the excitable momentum of the first subject is slowed by repeated minims that not only introduce the second subject but form an integral part of it. There is no tempo marking here to slow the music, but nevertheless the second subject has a much more peaceful character simply by way of the slower rhythms. In fact, it has an almost pastoral feel that is similar in mood to that of the second movement, and a simplicity and unity that restores stability once more. Whereas, at the beginning of the movement, unity is created by having all instruments sound in rhythmic and octave unison, here Schubert harmonises the melody in thirds, ‘as a means of strengthening the line, as though paralleling the melody in thirds as an alternative to, and has a comparable effect to, “doubling” the melody at the unison or at the octave.’ Rather than simply doubling the melody at the unison or the octave, Schubert’s use of thirds here creates a stable unity while also demonstrating variation, multiplicity, and, crucially, potential for growth and for the revealing of yet more of this musical landscape. Once more, we might recognise that, instead of presenting contrasting musical landscapes and causing the listener to yearn for one to overcome another (as is the case in previous movements), Schubert guides the listener safely through a musical landscape that illustrates diversity and anticipation as a means by which fulfilment might be achieved.

Although on the one hand, this gentle melody might represent some fulfilment of the heraldic announcements of the first subject, it is also clear that the second subject does not provide total and ultimate resolution of the yearning and anticipation inherent in the movement’s opening. Unlike the first, whose entire purpose and being revolves around the tonic key of C, the second subject explores a variety of different key areas and

---

49 Newbould, Schubert and the Symphony, 239-240.
includes more announcing gestures that heighten the anticipation of the listener. For instance, in conjunction with the movement through keys is a swelling and dying away of dynamics, at times piano and then suddenly forte or even fortissimo with crescendi and diminuendi accompanying almost every new reiteration of the theme. Here, we have an example of how music might generate tension and yearning without being necessarily ‘tense’ – that is, that yearning is present even here in this gentle melody in the expected dominant major of the movement’s key. In this case, tension derives from the multiple suggestions and announcements of a climax that is delayed time after time. When it eventually arrives, the climax, ‘marked by the only triple forte in the entire exposition, is a crowning cadential statement [of the final bars of the second subject]. At the resolving tonic the same four-bar idea falls away in the bass, becoming the subject of a long decrescendo and thinning-out of the instrumentation.’ Newbould continues: ‘It is worth noting that when, immediately after this, the development begins with the two clarinets intoning in E flat major a theme which can be easily associated with the joy theme of Beethoven’s Ninth, that theme is – in this context – a direct descendant of the four-bar idea from the second subject.’ We have seen the increasing significance of this four-bar idea in the build up to the climax where, along with the repeated minim idea, it has become the overriding element of the second subject. The fact that Schubert uses this idea to open the development emphasises its importance in creating momentum in the music – it has driven restlessly forward toward the climax of the exposition, and the listener now hears it as the first theme to develop and grow in its striving to reach the ultimate climax of the movement. Already, therefore, the listener associates this theme with their feeling of yearning, since it not only expresses the fulfilment and resolution of a cadence but also the reaching out and moving toward such resolution.

The development, concerned as it is with the second subject, is noticeably lacking in musical ideas from the first subject, the opening heraldic tones of the movement. Instead, fragments of the first subject’s dotted rhythm can be heard as accompaniment in the strings while the melody remains preoccupied with the two strongest ideas of the second subject, namely, the four-bar cadential motive and the four repeated minims. Here, the familiar four-bar motive is transformed into something new and takes on the new characteristic of reaching upward beyond the simplicity of its original form in the exposition toward ever more musical possibilities. It gives the impression of a music that

---

50 Newbould, Schubert and the Symphony, 240.
is growing, from its beginning in the two closely harmonised clarinets, gradually adding instruments until, by bar 401, all of the winds and the trombone are involved in this theme. This is not a triumphant coming-together of the orchestra, however, but rather a confusion and complication of the theme on which this passage is based – note the way in which each instrument interrupts the previous as it enters, and particularly the contrary motion between instruments, such as that in bar 401 between flute, bassoon, and trombone. The listener has known this theme to be restless before in its moving through different key areas, but here in the development it becomes even more so, pushing beyond its previously maintained boundaries of pitch and neatly defined four-bar phrasing in its striving for fulfilment. Contributing to the feeling of searching is the dynamic, which remains generally quiet and mysterious. For the first time in this movement, perhaps since the two-bar silence that punctuated the first and second subjects in the exposition, the listener begins to feel less certain about the music’s trajectory and where they might be taken next. Their yearning here reflects that which is inherent in the theme, which longs to return to the triumph of the movement’s opening.

The four-bar idea makes one final attempt to reach a concluding cadence with a sudden \( fz \) burst in bar 459, but its efforts are interrupted by the second main idea of the development, which are the four repeated minims that also make up part of the second subject, reintroduced \( fortissimo \) by horn and trombones. Again, we should not overlook the significance of these particular instruments at important moments in the movement; having been given a special, mysterious and almost supernatural quality in the first movement, they retain in this final movement the same quality, signalling the way ahead to resolution. The repeated minim motive is heard at first alongside ‘the four bars which originally followed them… and these are extended and developed. But when they are exhausted, all is reduced to the four notes alone.\(^{51}\) The listener might note the emphasis that is placed on the dotted rhythm of this theme when it reoccurs here, heard \( tutti \) and accented, a suggestion that such rhythms might soon be prominent in the music once more. This emphasis might even be thought of as a reminder of the \textit{Andante} theme of the first movement, which also featured a prominent dotted rhythm and held within it the promise of fulfilment. Yet, as Newbould highlights, this melody does not have enough energy to continue, and gives way to the repeated minim idea, against which ‘are heard

anticipations of the initial upward spring of the first subject. After the development and complexity of the four-bar cadential idea and the interruption of the repeated minim idea, both of which give the listener the feeling of striving for some as yet uncertain goal, the reappearance of the dotted rhythms at this point in the development provide a glimpse once more of the goal toward which the music is moving and for which the listener yearns.

The listener does not have to wait too much longer for the return of the first subject, though this is not quite the resolution for which the listener has yearned – instead of the triumphant return of the tonic key of C, the first subject resumes in E flat, the initial key of the development. Schubert increases the listener’s sense of anticipation here by delaying the release of tension that a return to the tonic would bring. In fact, the remainder of the recapitulation and much of the coda use previously heard musical ideas in such a way that the climax and resolution of the movement seems very close and yet cannot be grasped. The coda focuses on harmonic rather than melodic ideas in much the same way as the first subject does, though here it is to avoid rather than establish the tonic key. The repetitive nature of the coda, using similar musical material moving through a number of different key areas, serves to heighten the listener’s yearning even more – it is ‘a part of the inevitable and unstoppable growth of one of the finest pieces of climax-building in all music.’ The key of C is suggested throughout by way of the repeated minim idea, yet Schubert immediately moves away again on what Newbould refers to as an ‘“excursion” through different keys.’ Not only does the delay in returning to the tonic increase the listener’s yearning for it, but it also lends an extraordinary quality to the climax when it does come – it takes on the characteristic of a particularly special musical moment that was worth waiting and yearning for. Its arrival is emphatic: ‘C major is attained anew, and the thematic goal is reached – the first four notes of the second subject hammered out, on the home tonic, in bare octaves. The motive’s urge for dominance is fulfilled.’ As before, Schubert announces the climax with a triple forte dynamic and a full texture. Now that the climax and the tonic key have been achieved, the music builds the listener’s anticipation of the final cadence, using ideas from the first subject to increase the rhythmic tempo and thus the excitement of this

53 Ibid., 242.
54 Ibid., 241.
55 Ibid., 242.
passage. This is a celebratory and triumphant ending, with a strong tonic-dominant harmony (for instance, in the trombone and timpani from bars 1134 to 1143) that ends powerfully in octave unison.

The coda demonstrates that, unlike in the first movement where the listener yearns for the return of the first mysterious theme to which they are introduced, in the final movement it is actually the second subject that is the central and climactic theme. Not only is the second subject central but, more specifically, it is its last four bars, the closing idea of the theme, that ultimately dominates. The coda therefore gives retrospective meaning to the movement’s opening: it confirms once and for all the theme that the first subject announces. The listener is not disturbed by the realisation that it is the second subject’s final bars that form the climactic idea in this movement but, rather, pleasantly surprised, since Schubert had guided them so gently through a reasonably stable musical landscape. Whereas the tension in the first movement transforms the mysterious Andante theme in a triumphant recapitulation, the tension and yearning that exists over the course of the final movement works toward this revelation and, moreover, it is the revelation of something not necessarily expected that takes on a special and climactic quality.

YEARNING FOR THE INFINITE IN SCHUBERT’S NINTH SYMPHONY

Having examined in some detail each of the four movements of Schubert’s Ninth Symphony, we can identify two types of yearning that are created throughout the work. The first is a yearning for something absent, while the second type is a yearning for or anticipation of something not yet revealed. In the case of the first type, this seems often to be a yearning to overcome or move beyond one musical idea or passage to reach fulfilment in another. This is most clearly exemplified in the first movement, in which the listener yearns for the return of the Andante theme, and the second movement, in which the listener yearns to overcome the rigidity of the march theme in order to reach the pastoral theme. Often, and certainly as regards the first movement, this relies on the listener already being familiar with the music for which they yearn – surely, the great effectiveness of the Andante theme in this movement derives from its initial introduction and subsequent absence. The second movement illustrates this type of yearning slightly differently, in that, rather than presenting the listener with a theme that is then removed
(causing the feeling of yearning), Schubert begins the movement with the music that is to be overcome, and introduces the theme that reaches beyond it – i.e. the pastoral theme – later in the movement. The effect is that the march theme is established as the starting point and main idea of the second movement, a musical landscape from which to escape. The difference is subtle but evident – the first movement creates a yearning to return to that first, prominent theme, whereas in the second movement the listener yearns more strongly to move away from the march theme that is so rigid and orderly.

The second type is illustrated in the fourth movement, where the prominence of musical ideas that seem to be announcing something important to come create a yearning to discover what that might be. Unlike the first movement, which creates yearning by introducing and then removing a theme that is strived for throughout the movement, the fourth movement suggests an important idea yet only confirms its true importance at the movement’s climax, sustaining the listener in a feeling of yearning and anticipation about what the central and climactic idea of the movement might be. This is a more excited feeling of yearning than the first – rather than a longing for something that is lost or absent, it is better thought of as a seeking out of some new possibility outside of current experience, yet to be realised. These movements best exemplify the two different types of yearning we have identified, the yearning for something absent and the yearning for new possibilities yet to be discovered, though of course these types of yearning are also present at many other points in the symphony.

Just as we can identify two types of yearning in Schubert’s Ninth Symphony, we can also identify two corresponding types of fulfilment or resolution; a triumph over tension, and a revelation through tension. The first can be clearly seen over the course of the first movement, whereby yearning for the return of the Andante theme is fulfilled by its ultimate triumph over the other thematic and rhythmic ideas of the movement. It is related to the first type of yearning we have identified, in which something seems to be absent, and similarly relies of the listener’s familiarity with that music that is yearned for. This type of fulfilment demonstrates that tension can be overcome, but also that, as James MacMillan so eloquently points out in chapter 1, tension and yearning are essential to the ultimate realisation of triumph. The second type of fulfilment relates accordingly to the second type of yearning, and can be identified as a kind of revelation that emerges from tension and yearning. It is a revelation in the sense that it does not rely on a familiar main theme to quite the same extent; instead, it transforms a once
seemingly insignificant musical idea into the central and climactic idea of the movement. In the case of the fourth movement, it is the four bar cadential idea belonging to the second subject that is revealed as the climactic idea and in turn reveals the climactic moment of the movement – that is, the final establishment of the tonic key. Whereas, in the first movement, a feeling of triumph is created by the reinstatement of a familiar and yearned-for theme after a period of tension, in the fourth movement fulfilment comes in the form of the revelation of a theme that resolves all of the announcing gestures of the movement.

Though it seems that there are some differences between the Beethoven and Schubert symphonies in the way musical features are used to create a feeling of yearning and how that yearning is experienced, it is clear nonetheless that Schubert’s Ninth Symphony does evoke a sense for the infinite through the expression of yearning. As we have demonstrated, much of the yearning evoked here relies upon the introduction of themes and ideas that return time and time again and that form the basis for the listener’s expectations of how their yearning will be resolved. This suggests, as we explore in further detail below, that anticipation has a role to play in music’s evocation of the infinite. Such a feeling of yearning and anticipation also echoes Hoffmann’s assertions about the effectiveness of Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony and illustrate further our notion that not only Beethoven’s music but also music by other composers might open the door to an experience of the infinite through the creation of yearning.
Conclusion: Yearning for the Infinite as a Path to Transcendence

Using the ideas of Hoffmann and Schleiermacher, we have outlined a set of concepts for exploring music’s capacity to direct its listeners to something beyond their immediate experience. We have demonstrated the way in which they relate to each other – in so far as we understand transcendence as articulated by the notion of the infinite which is emphasised through the experience of yearning and tension – and also identified how they may be related to music through the examination of our two case studies.

We have seen how yearning is integral to both Schleiermacher and Hoffmann’s thought; for Schleiermacher, it is a yearning for something beyond our finite experience, an awareness of the limited nature of finite existence, which prompts the individual to strive to intuit the infinite. For Hoffmann, as we have already noted, musical sounds create in the listener a feeling of yearning that in turn points toward or expresses an experience of the infinite. The question is whether this yearning can provide a basis for an encounter with the infinite. Hoffmann’s argument presents a clear and uninterrupted path from yearning to the infinite. In his review of Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony, perhaps the aspect of his work most pertinent to this study, he identifies the features of music that express a ‘restless yearning’\(^1\) in which the listener is sustained for the duration of the piece. We have seen how the yearning is created by tension in the music – Hoffmann notes how elements of the music, such as delayed closure of cadences, create this feeling of tension that causes the listener to yearn for some kind of fulfilment or conclusion. Hoffmann asserts that the listener’s feeling of yearning enables an experience of the ‘spirit-realm’ of the infinite.\(^2\) For him, music functions as revelation and so he claims (as we have seen) that ‘sound audibly expresses an awareness of the highest and holiest,’\(^3\) that ‘music reveals to man an unknown realm,’\(^4\) and highlights ‘the magical spirit-realm where [the listener is] surrounded by pain and pleasure in the form of sounds.’\(^5\)

However, we might suggest that Hoffmann’s argument in this respect is rather too direct, since it does not seem plausible that there is anything specific in music or its features that

---

1 Hoffmann, “Review,” 241.
2 Ibid., 250.
4 Hoffmann, “Review,” 236.
5 Ibid., 250.
can express anything of the nature of the infinite or directly enable an experience of it. Since the infinite is essentially unknowable in its true nature, it seems too simplistic to suggest that music might be able to say anything directly about the infinite to the listener. Given this difficulty, we have drawn upon the work of Schleiermacher in order to enhance our understanding of how the individual might come to experience the infinite. We have outlined the ways in which Schleiermacher’s theology may be used as a crucial resource for examining the capacity of music to lay the foundations for faith insofar as it understands religion primarily as an experience of something that lies beyond the finite world, rather than knowledge of and adherence to doctrine and tradition. Through engagement with the finite world, which Schleiermacher discusses in terms of his twin notions of intuition and feeling, the individual gains the ‘sense for the infinite’ which is directed toward the infinite. Only by engaging with this sense for the infinite is the individual able to come into a position by which an experience of faith becomes possible. Schleiermacher provides us with the basis for examining how the awareness of the limited nature of the finite world creates a yearning to experience that which might bring fulfilment, that which lies beyond immediate experience.

Our task in the preceding chapters has been to discover how and to what extent the yearning that underlines both Hoffmann and Schleiermacher’s work can be identified in music. In this chapter we will examine the ways in which the yearning present in music can be thought of in relation to the infinite and particularly how it might create the foundation for an encounter with the something beyond immediate experience by awakening the sense for the infinite. We must begin, however, with the clarification that music cannot itself cause a religious encounter, because such an encounter also relies on a response on the part of the individual. This response is faith, which we understand to be the free response of the individual. To be clear, it is for the listener to respond to and appropriate the sense for the infinite that is directed toward the infinite which music awakens through yearning, and not for music to communicate something about the infinite or any particular religious ideas.

Any role that music has in prompting such a response must take the subjective element into account. To help us identify the character of this subjective response within an encounter with the infinite, we will turn to Kierkegaard as a resource. Writing in approximately the same period as Schleiermacher and Hoffmann, as well as Beethoven and Schubert, Kierkegaard discusses in some detail the relationship between the
individual self and religion, which he thinks of in terms of a God-relationship. Crucially, where Schleiermacher outlines the nature of religion as an experience of the infinite and describes how it is that a person first comes into contact with that experience – that is, the sense for the infinite – Kierkegaard goes beyond this to consider how, having been made aware of the presence of the infinite, the individual is able to appropriate religious ideas and make a decision to enter into a God-relationship.

At this point, it is important to remind ourselves of the idea of religion to which we refer, that is, religion as a sense for the infinite brought about by an awareness of the limited nature of the finite world and a subsequent engagement with it. It is an understanding of religion that places a large amount of emphasis on sense perception as opposed to knowledge, doctrine, and ritual, and so speaks to the individual and particularly to that individual’s emotional responses. Moreover, we have noted Schleiermacher’s claim that it is precisely the process of seeking and yearning for the infinite that is an experience of religion.

Our task now in this chapter is to explore how it is that music might be able to point to that which lies beyond thought and how yearning, which is so essential to both Schleiermacher’s conception of religion and Hoffmann’s ideas about the infinite nature of music, might be understood in terms of creating the context for an individual to open themselves to an experience of the infinite. In doing this, we will not claim, as Hoffmann’s analysis suggests, that music is itself or contains religion, or that it directly expresses something infinite, but rather that music creates the ideal conditions by which an individual might begin to seek religion; music itself is not ‘invested with metaphysical significance’ but is instead a vehicle for accessing ‘metaphysical issues.’ As Wurth highlights, ‘musical tones refer to and differ from each other, rather than beyond themselves to a world in waiting,’ and so rather than attempting to uncover any kind of religious significance in the music itself, we will aim to explore how far music may be able to create in an individual the awareness of the finitude of their existence and a need for fulfilment that cannot be found in temporal life. We will go beyond the use of music simply as a metaphor for religious or theological ideas or as a way in which individuals might be able to practise the emotions that apply to spiritual life and instead explore how

---

7 Ibid., 57.
music, and particularly yearning in music, is able to create the context in which a person might come to an experience of religion. In order to consider how the experience of yearning which is present in music can awaken the individual’s sense for the infinite, we will examine more fully some of the effects and implications of musical yearning: yearning as a sensory experience, yearning as a subjective experience, yearning as signifying incompleteness, yearning as nostalgia and hope.

**SENSE PERCEPTION OVER KNOWLEDGE**

An experience of music relies primarily upon the senses and not on any understanding of its parts or how they work. Even examining music’s component parts (as we have done in our analysis) does not diminish its effectiveness as a whole because it does not account for the role of the senses. We may speak at length of the effect of different rhythms, keys, structures, and instruments, but this is not the same as experiencing them aurally. Description of these features is precisely that; it is understanding of the music and not sensory perception of it. Therefore we may distinguish between knowledge of music, thinking about it, and a heard experience of it which transcends thought and analysis. Moreover, ‘sense strives to grasp the undivided impression of something whole,’ meaning that our analysis of music’s component parts does not represent true musical expression. It appears that Schleiermacher is making the same case for religion – that understanding and knowing about different aspects of religious doctrine and ritual does not equate to the experience of reaching out beyond earthly life to discover the infinite. Some might view music as a metaphor for religion in this way, given that both rely primarily on sense over thought. However, music is not simply like religion in this respect but actually creates the capacity for religion since it provides the individual once more with an opportunity to experience and perceive things in a very different way than usual. Where ordinary life demands knowledge, learning, and understanding, music requires only receptivity and sense perception. In this way, it opens up the individual to alternative methods of coming to experience something and therefore removes the barrier to perception that a reliance upon knowledge can bring. It places the individual in the immediate presence of that which they are perceiving, without knowledge or

---

understanding to mediate their experience. As Lundblad notes, ‘sense perception forms a mode of dissolving transcendence: in its immediacy the sensible and intellectual realms of the self become insolubly intermingled as finite humanity merges with infinite reality.’

Schleiermacher is clear that religion should be distinguished from any kind of knowledge or understanding – its ‘essence is neither thinking nor acting but intuition and feeling.’ Knowledge does not inspire a feeling of yearning, nor does it fulfil or answer it. Because religion, for Schleiermacher, is ‘something integral,’ to the individual, it is not something that can be learned but rather something always existing in the individual that must be discovered. Music offers a similar experience that does not require any knowledge or understanding but instead thrives without explanation – indeed, just as ‘we know very well that our words are only shadows of our intuitions and feelings,’ music too evades verbal expression. Indeed, we have argued from the outset of this study that it is precisely instrumental music’s lack of specific and verbal meaning that makes it so able to mediate a sense of transcendence. Yet how is the listener able to appropriate such an ineffable experience, internalise and personalise it?

Here, where Schleiermacher leaves us wondering about how this communication might therefore take place, Kierkegaard can be of some assistance. Like Schleiermacher, he is keen to remove the emphasis on doctrine, particularly because there is ‘a discrepancy between language and the realities it seeks to express.’ Hence, in Kierkegaard’s thought, any kind of direct communication about the infinite is not possible: ‘With respect to the essential truth a direct relation between spirit and spirit is unthinkable.’ Moreover, it would seem that direct communication ‘creates the misguided belief that the individual has done enough when he has acquired objective knowledge of Christianity… a mode of communication must be found which educates him to perceive Christianity not as a doctrine but as an “existential communication” that must be acted upon.’ Kierkegaard thus establishes the idea that the infinite cannot be

10 Schleiermacher, On Religion, 22.
11 Ibid., 21.
12 Ibid., 57.
13 Law, Kierkegaard as Negative Theologian, 59.
15 Law, Kierkegaard as Negative Theologian, 62.
communicated in a direct way but must instead take into account the subjectivity of the recipient, which we will return to later. The parallels between an indirect mode of communication and the kind of communication that purely instrumental music facilitates become clearer – music does not have to be able to express anything essential about the infinite, and it seems that it is all the more effective because of this. Using Kierkegaard’s thoughts on direct and indirect communication, we begin to see how music might indeed function as an indirect communicator of the infinite.

Advocating as he does an indirect, subjective means of communication over a direct, objective one, Kierkegaard reiterates, in Law’s words, that ‘the intention is not to provide the recipient with a series of objective propositions or facts but to enable him to adopt a certain attitude or stance towards himself and his life.’ In other words, the indirect communicator does not present the recipient with any kind of information as such about the infinite but rather aids the recipient in placing themselves in a position to become more open to the infinite. When Schleiermacher comments on the necessity of communication of and about the infinite, therefore, we might suggest that it is this kind of indirect communication, in which the recipient is brought into a position of openness, that best suits his argument. Music therefore provides the listener with the opportunity to come to experience without the need for any knowledge or understanding, demonstrating a way of perceiving that might lead to that which ultimately evades all knowledge and understanding – the infinite. Furthermore, it might seem that instrumental music is almost uniquely capable of being such a communicator, given its lack of any objective material and the feeling of yearning that it creates that is so personal to the listener. It teaches individuals that there is more to experience and perceive outside of the boundaries of their usual existence, if only they are able to shed their dependence upon knowledge and embrace pure sensory perception. As Brown explains: ‘it is a matter of favourable conditions being set under which experience of the divine does at least become a realistic possibility.’ Instrumental music, through the creation of tension and yearning that we have illustrated which awaken the listener’s sense for the infinite, arguably generates such favourable conditions.

16 Law, Kierkegaard as Negative Theologian, 63.
17 Brown, God and Grace of Body, 293-4.
THE SELF AND A SENSE FOR THE INFINITE

Music offers an individual and self-focused experience because, as we have already outlined, it relies so heavily on sensory perception and therefore can only ever be a purely subjective experience. In our analysis of both Beethoven and Schubert, we outlined a vast number of features that can be seen – or rather, heard – to express or create a feeling of yearning. However, this is not to say that those features will elicit an equal response in all listeners, or that there are not yet more features that might generate yearning for others. It seems possible that some listeners will experience yearning during the course of a piece without necessarily being aware of the feature/s that have generated such a feeling; in fact, this is perhaps to be expected since, as we have said, musical perception and engagement does not require any kind of knowledge or understanding. Moreover, due to music’s intangible nature, it exists in a more subjective and less concrete field of the senses than, for example, a physical art work, which exists temporally and more objectively in the individual’s field of vision.

As we have observed, subjectivity also plays an important role in Schleiermacher’s discussion, in which he posits that the sense for the infinite places the self in direct relation to the infinite. Although his speeches do discuss the social and communicative aspects of religion, it is primarily the individual that must discern for themselves their own path toward the infinite and to religion. As such, we have noted Schleiermacher’s claim that it is not possible to teach religion but that it must be sought out by each individual. Since an individual can only seek the infinite through their own experiences of and in the world, it seems plausible to suggest that no individual can come to know the infinite fully, because this would require viewing it from an outside, objective perspective, and this, as Kierkegaard tells us, is not possible. In Law’s summary of Kierkegaard’s argument, ‘objective communication fails to recognize that the subjectivity and inwardness of the communicator... cannot be communicated objectively.’18 We come to see how music’s reliance upon sense perception and its subsequent subjectivity is suggestive of its ability to act as an indirect communicator of the infinite; we are reminded that ‘thought is not objectively accessible but is bound up with the subjectivity of each existing individual.’19 What Schleiermacher discusses is not the individual coming to know the true and complete nature of the infinite – which is

---

18 Law, Kierkegaard as Negative Theologian, 59.
19 Ibid., 52.
unfathomable, in any case – but rather the individual coming to recognise themselves and the world around them as being in relation to the infinite, and being able to relate themselves to the infinite through all things. Kierkegaard emphasises this idea in his discussion of how the individual relates to the infinite, in which ‘the individual is not called upon simply to know the truth, but is required to appropriate it.’ In other words, the individual must relate to the infinite – the ‘truth,’ as Kierkegaard says – as a subjective experience. This is perhaps where the yearning that we have identified in music provides the opportunity for an individual to come to an experience of the infinite by presenting such a subjective, personal experience.

Having discussed the ways in which music’s communication and perception contribute to its ability to provide the context for an experience of the infinite, we will now turn specifically to the feeling of yearning that is so key to both Schleiermacher and Hoffmann’s arguments and consider the ways in which this feeling can also contribute to this ability of music.

YEARNING AND INCOMPLETENESS

The very presence of the feeling of yearning in music suggests something that is yearned for, and so in turn denotes a sense of incompleteness or lack. Writing once more about the infinite, Kierkegaard’s argument asserts that the ‘awareness that he is removed from the truth is the highest truth to which the individual can attain.’ The individual experiences this feeling of incompleteness both in relation to the infinite, from which they are necessarily distinct, as well as in relation to music through the feeling of yearning.

In analysing both Beethoven’s Seventh Symphony and Schubert’s Ninth Symphony, we have identified that yearning is present throughout through their uses of various musical features. However, music more generally may alert the listener to the incompleteness of their existence. Firstly, it expresses a world beyond that which can be seen; there is no doubt that musical sounds exist, but the way in which they occur,

20 Law, Kierkegaard as Negative Theologian, 110.
21 Ibid., 142.
interact with each other, and create emotional responses may only be heard and felt by the listener, and not grasped in any kind of tangible way. This means that, notwithstanding any feeling of yearning generated by particular musical sounds, music presents from the outset an alternative way to experience the world, and one that relies on an experience beyond that which is visibly or tangibly available to the listener. The intangible nature of music’s sounds therefore draws immediate attention to the incompleteness of earthly life because it takes the listener out of themselves, and out of their usual environment. In doing so, the listener must open themselves to the possibility of another kind of experience, one that transcends their everyday existence.

We have also noted a number of features particular to these symphonies in which the feeling of yearning might be interpreted as denoting some kind of incompleteness. Beethoven’s Seventh Symphony opens thus, with a long, rhythmic introduction that searches for fulfilment. As we have seen, its ever-building rhythms and its wandering through keys create the sense that this passage is striving toward some kind of completion. The yearning that this introduction evokes is therefore indicative of a sense of incompleteness – the music has not yet reached fulfilment and does not feel to the listener that it has done so until it reaches the Vivace and the beginning of the exposition proper. In this symphony, the listener is confronted from the outset with an awareness of the music’s incompleteness and is therefore motivated to join in its striving for completion.

Beethoven continues to confront the listener with this sense of incompleteness throughout this movement, and particularly in the development where tonal areas are used to great effect to create the feeling of having arrived in a completely new and different musical landscape. We notice that the listener’s awareness of some kind of incompleteness is not only awakened when something seems to be lacking but also when presented with something that appears to transcend or exist outside of the established framework. In this case, it is the use of the new tonal areas in the development of this movement that awakens the listener to the possibility of the incompleteness of the theme and the tonic key, the musical landscape that has dominated the Vivace until this point. As we have already noted, Beethoven’s use of keys also has an impact in the third movement, where the listener is transported once again to a musical landscape very distant from the one in which they started, suggesting that the tonic key, while it might signify stability, does not necessarily represent completeness. The listener becomes
aware of the music’s incompleteness in this case when presented with the new and unexpected musical material that is generated by Beethoven’s use of keys.

Similarly, Schubert’s Ninth Symphony also contains musical moments in which the feeling of yearning might be interpreted as a sense of incompleteness. Perhaps the most striking example is in the first movement, in which the music seems incomplete without the *Andante* theme and searches restlessly for it. The listener is aware of this incompleteness precisely because the music strives throughout for its return, and because only with its return is the movement able to come to a climax and fulfilment. A similar effect is achieved, as we have seen, in the final movement, where the music is incomplete and unable to come to fulfilment in the absence of the tonic key of C, introduced triumphantly at the beginning of the movement. In both these cases, the introduction and then removal of important musical elements creates a feeling of yearning that can also be interpreted as one of incompleteness, since the music seems unable to reach any kind of fulfilment or completion until these elements that are much yearned for – the *Andante* theme in the first movement, and the triumphant key of C in the final movement – are regained.

The notion of an awareness on the part of the individual of some kind of incompleteness or lack in their existence is essential to an experience of religion for Schleiermacher, as we have noted earlier. He asserts that ‘Man has merely stolen the feeling of his infinity... it cannot thrive for him if he is not also conscious of his limitedness, the contingency of his whole form, the silent disappearance of his whole existence in the immeasurable.’\(^{22}\) In fact, he identifies this as one of the primary reasons that his ‘cultured despisers’ are so opposed to religion, saying to them: ‘You have succeeded in making your earthly lives so rich and many-sided that you no longer need the eternal.’\(^{23}\) Here, Schleiermacher highlights the necessity of an awareness of a feeling of incompleteness in order therefore to strive for something that would bring fulfilment, and this is a ‘soul’ that is able to be ‘stirred by the universe.’\(^{24}\) We are reminded of Schleiermacher’s address to his cultured despisers, in which he remarks that ‘you cannot say that your horizon, even the broadest, comprehends everything and nothing is to be


\(^{23}\) Ibid., 3.

\(^{24}\) Ibid., 14.
intuited beyond it,” emphasising that to reach out toward the infinite is to recognise an incompleteness in one’s being that requires fulfilment. Moreover, in Schleiermacher’s later work *The Christian Faith*, we have observed how the notion of absolute dependence becomes central to his construction of the notion of religion. It certainly seems possible to suggest that this feeling is linked to that of incompleteness, since to be dependent on something is to recognise some deficiency in oneself. It is an extension of Schleiermacher’s comments about the limitedness of finite being and the subsequent need to reach out beyond it and it posits the individual not only as incomplete before the infinite but incomplete and in dependent relation to the infinite, to be completed only by it.

Kierkegaard, too, expands upon the idea of the individual’s incompleteness before the infinite and in his argument there appears the idea of ‘an awareness of a qualitative contradiction between one’s present condition and one’s existential telos.’ Though the term ‘contradiction’ here might imply some kind of irreconcilable distinction between the two, it is not the case that the individual cannot nevertheless reach out beyond their ‘present condition’ toward the thing that they are aware of being incomplete without, and so ‘being… is no longer being but “becoming” – it is not yet complete and remains striving toward fulfilment.’ This is significant because it stresses the importance of repeated encounters with the infinite – that is, the individual’s feeling of incompleteness is not resolved simply by one encounter with the infinite and so must continue ‘striving forward toward fulfilment’ and yearning for the infinite. As we will see toward the end of the present chapter, this idea goes some way toward answering the question of the effect of repeated listenings on an individual’s sense for the infinite and experience of transcendence.

Crucially, we must bear in mind that music does not fulfil the listener's lack but rather points to it and makes the individual aware of it – music names ‘not what I lack; [it names] my lack, my endless, unresolved yearning.’ Of course, in making the listener aware of an incompleteness in their life, music also provokes a response in the listener. The listener must subsequently reflect upon and examine themselves so as to discover

---

26 Law, *Kierkegaard as Negative Theologian*, 37.
27 Ibid., 53.
28 Ibid.
what it is that is lacking, and therefore to address that lack. Wurth discusses yearning’s ‘dependability on lack and absence… what purely instrumental music “wants” or “requires” from its listeners is a penetrating self-insight, a recognition of their “own nameless longing.” It wants involvement, submission, and even faith.’

It would seem, then, that the response this feeling of lack provokes in the listener is not only the yearning to fulfill this incompleteness but also a motivation to achieve resolution in which the individual must step out of their earthly life and everything that is known to them in order to embrace the unknown – this is what Wurth refers to as faith. Music, as an experience of time and reality that looks beyond temporality, demonstrates to the listener their own incompleteness as a purely temporal and finite being, creating an awareness and opening up the possibility of an alternative state of being that is possible if one is to follow their feeling of yearning as it is transformed into faith. It motivates the listener to become aware of their own lack and to address it by self-reflection and examination. In this way, music does more than simply to provide a view or even an experience of an alternative kind of reality that is available to the listener, but it also moves them to discover the nature of their self and the ways in which that self is incomplete, and thereby begin a process of bringing the self to completion.

NOSTALGIA AND HOPE

Thus far, we have examined how the feeling of yearning that music expresses might be thought of in terms of religion according to Schleiermacher’s definition. However, in concluding our analysis we outlined two different yet interconnected types of yearning: one in which the listener yearns for something that is lacking or absent, and the other in which the listener yearns for something that is yet to be revealed. We might also think of these two types of yearning in terms of nostalgia and hope respectively. In this understanding, that which is lacking or absent in the first type of yearning becomes something that was once possessed but now has been lost. We have clear musical examples of this, perhaps none so clear as in the first movement of Schubert’s Ninth Symphony in which the *Andante* theme, the central idea of this music, is lost over the course of the movement. The listener’s yearning for this could be thought of in terms of

---

nostalgia; it is a yearning to regain what was once so intrinsic and pivotal. This notion of loss has parallels in Schleiermacher’s theology. He argues that ‘a person is born with the religious capacity,’ though, given that it is religion’s despisers to whom he speaks, that capacity can often be lost in the course of ordinary life. Schleiermacher does not therefore posit that individuals approach religion from a place of distance but rather that they must regain the religious capacity present inside themselves. In Kierkegaard’s argument, this is a process of ‘recollecting’ one’s religious capacity and subsequently allowing that capacity to permeate one’s life and experience. Yearning seems essential to this recollection, it is the process of actively seeking out what was lost. As we have discussed earlier, part of the power of music in acting as a vehicle to an experience of religion is in its ability to demonstrate to the listener an incompleteness in ordinary life that might only be fulfilled by looking outside of ordinary life. Here, we take this idea a step further by suggesting that that which might fulfil this incompleteness is not something new to the individual but something that has existed there all along: a capacity for religion with which each individual was at one time equipped. This is how we might think of yearning in terms of nostalgia, and how music may play its part once again – it demonstrates that what the individual seeks is not something completely unknown. This is made clear at the end of the first movement of Schubert’s Ninth Symphony, where the theme is reinstated and the listener’s nostalgic yearning resolved.

Like two sides of the same coin, nostalgia and hope are closely linked. Hope refers to the second type of yearning, in which the tension that builds up over the course of the music is resolved by the revelation of a special and climactic musical idea. It is a hope that is not diminished by tension but rather that is motivated and made possible by it, since without tension it simply would not be necessary to hope for an alternative. Crucially, it is not a hope for any kind of planned or foreseen outcome: the listener does not expect, in the final movement of Schubert’s Ninth Symphony, that the ultimately climactic moment will be revealed as the cadential figure of the second subject, but they hope for it nonetheless. Such is religious hope, it is ‘a hope that is only hope, nothing else… it is not deterred by reality’s inscrutability, but can leap into the unknown. Only someone who lets go of all wishes can really begin to hope.’

---

32 Law, *Kierkegaard as negative theologian*, 104.
different from the way in which much of human life is lived, and this is why Sauter
draws a distinction between ‘wishes,’ which refer to some kind of planned future, and
hope, which is open to an unknown and yet possible future. A yearning for something yet
to be revealed can thus be understood in terms of religion because of its character of pure
hope, that which reaches toward a future goal or outcome that is as yet unknown.
Music’s role in creating for the listener the ideal sort of conditions in which to move
toward an experience of religion therefore lies in enacting a version of yearning and hope
that is goal orientated without necessarily saying anything about what that goal might be.
Once again, music awakens the listener to the possibility of other modes of thinking
about and accessing not only the world around them but other aspects of existence that
they feel to be lacking in. As Sauter goes on to say, ‘the way we hope shows whether we
have fallen to the world we hope to bring into being, or whether we, bare and naked and
fully ourselves, are open to God.’

Musical hope, therefore, offers the individual the
opportunity not only to experience a goal-oriented event but to also suspend any
expectations or wishes they may have about that goal. Contrary to the kind of hope that
pervades temporal life, the kind that Sauter describes as ‘wishes,’ musical hope leads the
way to religion by demonstrating that there is something to be gained from a pure hope
that yearns for the unknown, the yet to be revealed.

Given that hope is not deterred by reality, it seems that hope must also prevail where
there is tension. Musically, we have witnessed that hope is able to prevail and even thrive
through tension, and that this is because and not in spite of it. We might suggest that
musical tension ‘acts as a god-given signpost, pointing not from the material world to a
non-material world, but from the world as it is to the world as it is meant one day to be;
pointing, in other words, from the present to the future which God has in store.’

Music gives the individual a way in which to come to terms with this idea, by presenting tension
as an essential part of revelation and of hope. For example, the tension and yearning that
exist in the repeated announcing ideas of Schubert’s final movement of the Ninth
Symphony is eventually resolved by the establishment of the second subject cadential
idea as the climactic idea of the movement. Through tension, the listener yearns for a
move from the musical world ‘as it is’ to the musical world ‘as it is meant one day to be,’
and it is only through the existence of tension that the listener can perceive the possibility

---

34 Sauter, What dare we hope?, 91.
of something other. Though the individual might think of tension as a state to be avoided in ordinary life, music suggests differently and provides an experience of tension that is not negative but rather is transformed by hope. Music introduces a way of thinking about tension that encourages the listener to engage with that tension, as it points toward an outcome for which they yearn. Moreover, this is not a transformation that is removed from the individual but rather one that happens to the individual. Schubert does not introduce a new idea as the climactic moment of his final movement but instead transforms an earlier idea that was then less significant. In the same way, N.T. Wright points out that religious hope transforms something that is already known, and that is the world around us.\textsuperscript{36} Religion therefore is not a state that the individual must reach that is outside themselves, but a transforming of themselves. The presence of a yearning that is presented as hope in the final movement of Schubert’s Ninth highlights this transformative character and in particular the idea that this can be brought about using the already-established musical landscape. It would seem that ‘it is not we who go to heaven; it is heaven that comes to earth,’\textsuperscript{37} a description of the transformative power of hope that music, through the feeling of yearning, enacts for the listener. This is also a pertinent example of the way in which hope and nostalgia are linked, because it is precisely in this hope of transformation that the individual is pointed back toward themselves, and the innate capacity of religion that has always been present within them, waiting to be transformed.

Nostalgia and hope may also refer in music to the interplay of past, present, and future, whereby past ideas take on retrospective significance and all moments strive toward the future. It is ‘an indeterminate feeling that instates the promise of an “about to be,” of hope, it also preserves the promise of a future in which things may yet come to be… in this way, the ungraspable infinite for which [the individual] yearns is already felt in the openness of an impossible, permanent not-yet.’\textsuperscript{38} We have seen in both Beethoven and Schubert the way in which musical ideas relate to each other not only over the course of a single movement but also across an entire symphony – for instance, we might think of the continuity and sustained sense of yearning that imbues Schubert’s Ninth Symphony through the use of repeated similar rhythms across each of its movements. For Hoffmann, some of Beethoven’s most powerful moments in the Fifth Symphony come

\begin{footnotes}
\item[36] Wright, \textit{Surprised by Hope}, 112.
\item[37] Ibid., 116.
\item[38] Brillenburg Wurth, \textit{Musically sublime}, 51.
\end{footnotes}
about as a result of his suggesting yet delaying the ending and closure – we could argue that these passages are so effective because they hold the listener for longer in a feeling of yearning-as-hope. As they relate to the interplay between past, present, and future, nostalgia and hope therefore signify the idea of being orientated toward a goal. Whereas in earthly life, ‘eternity is a never-ending succession of “nows”… time is fragmented, for past and future are dissolved in the present moment,’ for the one who strives for religion, time is ‘no longer a never-ending flux but is a time of decision. The moment is consolidated in the decision. As such, it is not past but is remembered and repeated in the present and future… The aesthetic conception of eternity as an infinity of transitory experiences is replaced with the eternity of ethical resolution.’

This is to say that, unlike in earthly life in which moments relate to each other only arbitrarily (if at all) and do not project beyond themselves, the life of nostalgia and hope connects past, present, and future in such a way that the individual experiences all moments as directed toward the infinite, or, as Schleiermacher puts it, ‘the one and all.’

Nostalgia and hope, where present in music and characterised by the two different types of yearning we have outlined, demonstrate to the listener that finite existence is not the only way of being and of relating to the universe, but that there is also another way that transcends the chronology of earthly time. Once more, we note how music awakens the listener not only to their own incompleteness but to the fact that they already possess the innate capacity to strive for that which will bring them to completeness, and in doing so also awakens them to the possibility of living in a state of being ‘as it is meant to be’ someday. In this way, nostalgia and hope in music are not simply feelings that the listener experiences during the course of a musical work or even a metaphor for the spiritual or religious life, but function in fact as a vehicle by which the individual is awakened to the sense for the infinite. Where Wurth claims that yearning ‘(re)enacts a desire “forward” that is really an impossible desire “backward”,’ we might instead argue that, in the form of nostalgia and hope, it enacts both simultaneously, and that this is not an impossible desire ‘backward’ but rather a reconnecting with the religious capacity of oneself in order to achieve the hoped-for promise of what could be. ‘Let past, present, and future surround us,’ says Schleiermacher, in his vision of religion; music presents this idea not merely as

41 Brillenburg Wurth, *Musically sublime*, 52.
sentiment but as reality, demonstrating a mode of being in which each moment is imbued with another, looking simultaneously backward and forward in nostalgia and hope.

OPENING THE DOOR TO AN EXPERIENCE OF THE INFINITE

In these ways can the feeling of yearning that is created in music be thought to create the context for a reaching out toward or response to religion. Primarily, musical yearning opens the listener up to the possibility of an experience that differs in some way from that of everyday existence. It can be accessed and expressed only by the senses, and therefore remains independent of knowledge and understanding. It also allows for the subjectivity of the individual and allows for an equally subjective response. As we have seen above, this sensory, subjective experience enables music to offer the listener an alternative mode of perception to that which applies to the physical, temporal world and therefore to experience a yearning that arguably cannot be found visually or temporally.

Interpreted as nostalgia and hope, yearning takes on a more complex character and provides a more spiritual context for the listener to respond to religion. Yearning-as-nostalgia understands the listener’s incompleteness not as lack but rather as loss, pointing them backward to something intrinsic that has been lost and is now yearned for. The nostalgic yearning that we have identified in music demonstrates to the listener the possibility that their incompleteness may be made complete through the recollection of that which was lost, and therefore places the listener in a state of self-reflection. Yearning-as-hope, on the other hand, longs for something unknown, something yet to be revealed. It reaches forward toward its goal but with no expectation or planning, relying only instead on a leap of faith and an openness to perceiving and accepting whatever the future might be. Hopeful yearning also has a backwards glance, however, in that it describes the transformation of something already known to the listener – it does not eradicate tension with something new but with the transformation of something that has existed all along. As we have noted, a parallel may be drawn with Wright’s assertion that hope does not refer to the removal of the individual to a new state but the transformation of the state that the individual is already in. Such a hope, experienced through music as yearning, creates the context once more for the listener to examine themselves and to identify their innate capacity for religion that may then be transformed.
Perhaps no characteristic of musical yearning creates a context for receptivity to religion quite so effectively as the way in which yearning is able to demonstrate to the listener the notion of the incompleteness of their being. The very fact of this yearning seems indicative of this incompleteness, which Schleiermacher highlights as necessary for an experience of religion since only by recognising their own lack is the individual aware also of the need for fulfilment. What musical yearning does so effectively is to point to that incompleteness in the individual and create the circumstances for the listener to reach forward into the unknown in order to fulfil this incompleteness.

It is in this sense that the leap of faith on which yearning relies is so important, because it is this leap that bridges the gap between incompleteness and fulfilment. Music brings its listeners to the point of awareness of this incompleteness, and creates the feeling of yearning that urges listeners to look beyond their own existence and everyday experience. Religion and faith follows when this yearning prompts the listener to take this leap of faith and look for fulfilment not in the finite world but in the infinite one. This is how yearning in music creates the context for a listener to become receptive and responsive to religion, firstly by demonstrating alternative ways of thinking, perceiving, and existing that go beyond those that apply to temporal life and reach out toward the infinite, and secondly by enacting for and with the listener the process of reflecting on the self and identifying the need and the capacity for religion within the self. The onus at this point is not on music but on the individual: since music can do no more than to bring the individual to this point, it is the individual that must transform their feeling of yearning into a leap of faith toward the infinite.

What of listeners who have already experienced a piece of music, perhaps several times, or those who have already come to faith? Does music become redundant when the listener becomes a believer? Perhaps not, if we think of music and religion in terms of a process, and not a product. One does not rush through a symphony solely to reach its final cadence; in any case, this would completely eradicate the presence of or need for yearning in the music; as Stone-Davis says, ‘it is only in and through transition that meaning becomes apparent. As a result, truth is an emergent and evolving property that is experienced within events.’ Brown argues similarly, that ‘religious experience is… not

---

about discovering everything about the divine at once, but rather the gradual unfolding of what remains essentially a mystery.'

Music requires tension and yearning to give context to the final cadence and in order for it to be truly satisfying: ‘pain becomes a pleasure, endlessness an end, want a fulfilment – all these distinctions collapse into one another when [yearning’s] peculiar logic reigns.’ In the same way Schleiermacher is clear that it is the process of seeking religion that constitutes an experience of it. Given that knowledge, once gained, no longer requires a process as such, it may only be sense perception that could evoke such a process, since the senses are called into action every time one hears a musical work, or begins to intuit the infinite. Yet the importance of sense perception is not limited to those first coming to an experience of religion but remains important even to those for whom intuition of religion has become a way of life, and therefore music can remain an effective vehicle for an experience of religion even after one has become familiar with a particular work and heard it multiple times – whenever one wishes to glimpse religion one may only do so through the senses. Just as music is a process, so too is religion – the process of engaging with religion and the infinite continues long after the initial moment of faith. As Kierkegaard’s argument highlights, ‘the relationship that the individual is called upon to develop is not finished when the individual has acquired the correct subjective disposition towards the truth… if the existing individual is to sustain his subjective relationship to the truth he must continually reiterate and affirm his initial decision.’ This means that the initial leap of faith that music’s yearning prompts the individual to make must not be the only such leap if the individual is to sustain their faith, and so music continues to have a role to play in creating the opportunity for the listener to make this leap of faith time and time again. To remain in faith is to embrace tension and yearning, since ‘without uncertainty there can be no faith. Faith needs room to “venture,” that is, room to make the passionate leap whereby the individual comes to believe. This room is provided by uncertainty.’ Therefore the experience that music offers, whereby the listener is confronted by tension and yearning, creates the ‘room’ essential for faith not only to be formed but to develop. To return to Kierkegaard’s discussion once again, it seems that ‘if I wish to stay in my faith, I must take constant

43 David Brown, God and Grace of Body, 277.
44 Brillenburg Wurth, Musically sublime, 47.
45 Law, Kierkegaard as Negative Theologian, 113.
46 Ibid., 140.
care to keep hold of the objective uncertainty, to be “on the 70,000 fathoms deep,” but still have faith. Religion is a state in which the individual ‘cannot be, but only be constantly arriving,’ and so the role of music in creating the opportunity for the listener to reach out toward religion is not diminished once an individual has found faith.

AREAS FOR FURTHER STUDY

The aim of this study has been to demonstrate music’s potential for laying the foundations for an experience of the infinite through the feeling of yearning that creates the conditions for a listener’s leap of faith. We have not, however, attempted to ascertain how this religious disposition is articulated. The individual who has undertaken the religious appropriation of yearning may well transform this leap of faith into some kind of commitment to one religious tradition or another, but how and why this might occur is beyond the scope of this study. Nonetheless, it would certainly be interesting to examine in more detail, with this study as the foundation, how the individual who has an experience of faith in this way might use this experience to enrich and further their dedication to a particular religious tradition. Similarly, one might consider the ways in which religious communities themselves might make use of music’s capacity for creating the context for an experience of faith to cultivate a community of faith. For instance, a further study could take into account how the individual might respond to music when participating as part of a community of listeners in a prayer and worship environment.

Moreover, one might seek to discover whether this capacity of music to lay the foundations for an experience of faith might be universal across different cultures and traditions. Schleiermacher, Hoffmann, and Kierkegaard, on whom we have drawn for our understanding of religion as an experience of the infinite and how the individual self is related to the infinite, all write from a Christian, European point of view. However, this is not to say that all cultures and traditions would view religion in this way, or indeed value music in this way, and so a further study might explore whether the capacity that

47 Kierkegaard, Concluding Unscientific Postscript, 172.
48 Ibid., 68-9, my emphasis.
we have discovered in music here can be thought of to be common outside of a Christian and European setting.

Finally, there is the question of which types of music might be suitable or able to create the context for an experience of faith. We have concentrated here on music that is contemporaneous with the writing of Schleiermacher and Hoffmann, and moreover, in the same symphonic form as Hoffmann reviews in his work. The works we have studied belong, as do Schleiermacher, Hoffmann, and Kierkegaard, to the Western canon. This has allowed us to create a coherent model for understanding how music might lay the foundations for faith. This was not a value judgement about the importance of this type of music above any others, but simply a necessary decision in order to treat seriously and in detail the ways in which music’s forms and features contribute to the creation of a context for faith. Nonetheless, it does raise the question of whether this is the only type of music that might function in this way, or whether perhaps other types of music may also have this ability. Though beyond the scope of this particular study, it seems that the next step might be to consider whether the same model of yearning directing the individual toward the infinite can be applied to other genres of music outside of the Western classical canon, for example, to popular music or, of course, to church music. Given the often very different forms and features that these genres use, might we find them more or less effective in creating the context for an experience of the infinite? Additionally, a further study might also consider how the inclusion of language and narrative in a musical work might affect its ability to function in this way.

Even within the necessary boundaries that we have placed on this study, we have seen that music has the power to evoke a sense for the infinite by creating in the listener a feeling of yearning; however, each individual must decide for themselves whether or not to go through the door to the infinite that music opens and appropriate that experience in terms of faith.
Bibliography


